A local model of writing program assessment: fourteen community college faculty define and evaluate writing proficiency.

Richard Anthony Butsch 1956-
University of Louisville

Follow this and additional works at: http://ir.library.louisville.edu/etd

Recommended Citation
https://doi.org/10.18297/etd/190

This Master's Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by ThinkIR: The University of Louisville's Institutional Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of ThinkIR: The University of Louisville's Institutional Repository. This title appears here courtesy of the author, who has retained all other copyrights. For more information, please contact thinkir@louisville.edu.
A LOCAL MODEL OF WRITING PROGRAM ASSESSMENT: 
FOURTEEN COMMUNITY COLLEGE FACULTY DEFINE AND EVALUATE
WRITING PROFICIENCY

By

Richard Anthony Butsch
B.A., University of Louisville, 1979
M.A., University of Louisville, 1984

A Dissertation
Submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate School of the University of Louisville
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement
for the Degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Department of English
University of Louisville
Louisville, Kentucky

December 2005
A LOCAL MODEL OF WRITING PROGRAM ASSESSMENT: 
FOURTEEN COMMUNITY COLLEGE FACULTY DEFINE AND EVALUATE 
WRITING PROFICIENCY

By

Richard Anthony Butsch
B.A., University of Louisville, 1979
M.A., University of Louisville, 1984

A Dissertation Approved on

June 22, 2005

by the following Dissertation Committee:
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I dedicate this work to my wife, Pam, who loves me no matter what. Also, to my parents, Richard L. and Eleanor L. Butsch, who have always supported me throughout my education. To my son, Ben, a constant source of pride, humor, and inspiration.

I thank my colleagues who participated in this project, Dr. Tom Blues for including me in, and guiding me with his work, and Dr. Thomas A. Van, a patient man and the best reader one could have.
ABSTRACT

A LOCAL MODEL OF WRITING PROGRAM ASSESSMENT:
FOURTEEN COMMUNITY COLLEGE FACULTY DEFINE AND EVALUATE
WRITING PROFICIENCY

Richard Anthony Butsch

June 22, 2005

The introduction to this doctoral dissertation is an argument for locating Writing Across the Curriculum programs on the community-college campus for several reasons, among them the proximity of the disciplines on the community college campus, the increasingly underprepared community college student, and movements toward accountability and assessment at the local and state levels.

As an example of what a WAC program may accomplish in the area of program assessment, which developed from WAC proper in the last decade of the last century, Chapters One, Two, and Three present data I collected from fourteen faculty volunteers who gave up a beautiful Saturday in May of 1995 to read and evaluate a set of randomly selected student essays. Chapter One summarizes faculty responses to a ten-minute freewriting exercise, in which I asked respondents to describe or define proficient writing from the perspectives of their disciplines. In their responses, I locate four “global characteristics” used by a simple majority of respondents and 21 “other characteristics” used by at least one respondent. I argue that these characteristics, especially the global ones, constitute our College’s local definition of proficiency. I close the chapter pointing
out that future WAC workshops could include discussions of “global” and “other characteristics” locating them in student work, and discussing how to teach them, both in writing classes and elsewhere. Although the data in Chapter One are incomplete, they provide a starting place for a teacher-researcher who is interested in how colleagues across the campus describe writing. They also prompt questions about whether the respondents know what they are saying when they use terms like *style, purpose, grammar,* and *audience.* Do they really look for the characteristics they claimed to look for in their freewritings? Are there other characteristics to be added to the list?

Chapters Two and Three report and interpret additional data from the workshop. Each faculty member read and evaluated end of semester ENG 102 papers, rating them NP (nonproficient), P (proficient), or HP (highly proficient). These chapters are based on an unpublished study Dr. Tom Blues created at the University of Kentucky in May of 1993. Blues was ahead of his time by several years. In 1996, the Southern Association of Colleges and Schools (SACS) mandated an exit-exam for all students in ENG 102 and ENG 105 at Jefferson Community College. I show that a qualitative program assessment could complement or eventually replace the quantitative outside evaluation we are now using and conclude that in 1995 faculty in areas other than English often confused terms associated with writing, but generally returned to their freewriting definitions and descriptions throughout their evaluations.

Chapter Four summarizes my conclusions and recommendations, discusses the benefits of local, constructivist assessments in a culture that increasingly “truncates and supplants genuine, holistic writing and undermines progress” (Shafer 242). The chapter
ends with practical recommendations mostly for my colleagues in the Writing Program at Jefferson Community College. Where do we go from here? That sort of thing.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ........................................................................................................ iii
ABSTRACT .............................................................................................................................. iv-vi
LIST OF FIGURES ............................................................................................................... viii

INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................... 1

CHAPTER

I. HOW DO COMMUNITY COLLEGE FACULTY DEFINE WRITING PROFICIENCY? ................................................................. 15

II. RESPONDING TO “CALIBRATION ESSAYS” ...................................................... 40

III. RESPONDING TO “GROUP-SPECIFIC ESSAYS” ........................................ 81

IV. MOVING FORWARD A DECADE LATER: GENERAL CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ........................................ 277

NOTES ............................................................................................................................................... 290

REFERENCES .......................................................................................................................... 291

APPENDICES .......................................................................................................................... 294

CURRICULUM VITAE ................................................................................................................. 349
# LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURE</th>
<th>PAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Respondents’ ratings for calibration essays, students’ paper grades, and course grades.</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Respondents’ ratings by discipline.</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Reading groups and group-specific essays.</td>
<td>78-80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Group one ratings.</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Group two ratings.</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Group three ratings.</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Group four ratings.</td>
<td>191</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Group five ratings.</td>
<td>233</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A Local Model of Writing Program Assessment:
Fourteen Community College Faculty Define and Evaluate Writing Proficiency

INTRODUCTION

Confronting Fragmentation: The Case for Writing Across the Curriculum in the Community College

Most reports assessing the undergraduate curriculum mention the lack of unity or even a lack of relationship among the discrete parts. What is often called general education turns out on most campuses to be a series of elementary courses in the disciplines with the student expected to integrate these courses so that they form a coherent pattern.

Edward M. White. Developing Successful College Writing Programs, 87.

The problem of curricular fragmentation is not new. At various times throughout the twentieth century, from a variety of perspectives, educators, educational historians, rhetoricians, and composition specialists discussed this problem in the contexts of American secondary and higher education, and many of these professionals sought ways to return the fragmented curriculum to the state of unity that existed when the modern university was developed near the end of the nineteenth century. Then, David Russell tells us, writing was considered a single generalizable skill taught in elementary schools, and academia was a single discourse community that reinforced “linguistic homogeneity” in that it admitted less than one percent of the population (Curricular History 21). But disciplinary idealists seeking a return to a “golden age” may simply need to accept the reality of a fragmented curriculum. Where we once enjoyed “linguistic homogeneity,” now we have a collection of discrete communities, “an aggregate of competing professional disciplines, each with its own specialized discourse” (Russell 5). Increased
faculty specialization and administrative pressures that lowered academic standards to accommodate less-prepared students—what Paige Smith has called “the general demoralization of the standard non-scientific disciplines”—have caused a general rift between faculty and students. Continual efforts toward remediation and a “startling degree of disarray” as fields have fragmented into more and more subfields reinforce this rift and create additional rifts among faculty, each barely able to communicate with the other, much less with increasingly “substandard” students (Killing the Spirit 9).

Composition theorists, teachers, and administrators have pointed out that curricular fragmentation, coupled with substandard student preparedness, is directly responsible for the incoherent academic experience of our students. E.M. White discusses the fragmentation among the components of the entire undergraduate curriculum in which “writing is separated from most learning” and “general education turns out on most campuses to be a series of elementary courses in the disciplines with the students expected to integrate these courses so that they from a coherent pattern” (Developing successful College Writing Programs 87). Christopher Thaiss echoes White’s concerns but sees the problem of fragmentation as more troublesome for faculty who “have a vision of a coherent general education, one that students can integrate into their lives during and beyond school” (“WAC and General Education Courses” 102-103). After all, Thaiss says, students are used to fragmentation from high school, “where they were also expected to complete courses that other people had chosen for them and that were rarely presented as if they had anything to do with one another” (102).

E.D. Hirsch maintains that literacy has declined, even among students from literate families, as the school curriculum has become more incoherent (Cultural Literacy
Declining literacy levels are related to “horizontal fragmentation” across subjects and “vertical fragmentation” within subjects: “For one student in grade nine, social studies may focus on family relations; for another, the focus may be on ancient history. In an American history course in one school, students may focus on industrial America, but in another school, the focus may be on westward expansion” (116). An emphasis on diversity requires us to accept educational formalism, which prohibits, for Hirsch, “the opportunity of teaching young (and older) children the traditional materials of literate culture…” (113). Hirsch believes that educational formalism assumes that the content used to teach “language arts” matters little so long as that content is related to what a child brings to the subject. As a result, textbooks teach learning to read and write as “process[es] of skill acquisition…better served by up-to-date ‘imaginative literature’ than by traditional and factual material” (113). Although Hirsch has been attacked for “What Literate Americans Know: A Preliminary List,” the appendix to Cultural Literacy, he does confront the fragmented curriculum, provide terms of classification to differentiate types of fragmentation, and place the blame for the incoherent educational experiences of our students squarely on educational formalism.

Composition research has found a correlation between the fragmented curriculum and college students’ failing to see that what they learn in writing courses carries over to other courses. Regardless of similarities among writing tasks for separate courses, both within a discipline and across disciplines, the freshman writer interprets tasks differently. A product of the fragmented curriculum, the student focuses “so fully on ways of thinking and writing for the teacher in each setting that commonalities with previous writing tasks become obscured” (McCarthy 245).
How have fragmentation of faculty and subjects and administrative pressures to bring about equity affected the teaching of writing? According to Russell, faculty proponents of the “research ideal” always held that extended writing “be reserved for the best students” (80) and be conceived in the image of faculty writing, while mechanical drills were forced upon the majority of students. Thus, writing instruction became more and more marginalized, more and more separated from learning, as increasing numbers of under prepared students gained admittance to our colleges and universities. Also, faculty traditionally have been dissatisfied with student writing. Instruction in academic writing is now part of the student’s general education, which suffers from a lack of unity and relationship among its discrete parts. Is it any wonder that the writing problems of students have remained the responsibility of the English Department, while “the rest of the institution is free to go about its business of teaching ever more narrowly defined subjects” (White 87)?

All writing-across-the-curriculum programs have tried to make faculty throughout the curriculum aware of the advantage of including writing in their classes to enhance learning. However, I find that community-college faculty in areas other than English still believe in what Mike Rose calls “the myth of transience” (“Language of Exclusion”). These faculty remain faithful to the definition of writing derived from the linguistic homogeneity that was common in the early days of the modern university: writing is a single generalizable skill. There are three reasons for this belief: (1) it is simply convenient to believe that teaching this “skill” is the responsibility of writing teachers, (2) community-college faculty typically focus on teaching rather than publishing; therefore, they feel insecure about requiring and teaching writing, even in their own disciplines, and
(3) they are unaware of current rhetorical theory and composition research which suggest that writing must be relearned in new contexts throughout the curriculum. Therefore, English programs on community-college campuses must initiate and maintain WAC dialogues with other faculty, encouraging them to use writing to enhance learning and sharing with them the research on WAC.

At several times during the past century, administrators and educators concerned with fragmentation and the marginalization of writing instruction, attempted to broaden the responsibility for writing instruction by including as teachers of writing faculty from across the curriculum. The Cooperation Movement, an attempt at language instruction through remediation that surfaced during the first three decades of the twentieth century, was the first in a series of such attempts. However, this and subsequent attempts eventually failed due to our inability to unite disparate discourse communities in a system in which knowledge and work were becoming increasingly specialized (Russell 136). Even though reformers assumed that general education should improve student writing, there was little agreement on where or how it should:

Thus, reforms in writing instruction were effectively marginalized into certain courses or programs or specialized institutions instead of becoming truly general. In the end, secondary and higher education retained the fiercely reductive misconceptions which had grown up in the late nineteenth century... The myth of transience endured. (Russell 138)

The Writing Across the Curriculum Movement appeared in the 1970s with the birth of open admissions on university and college campuses and racial integration in secondary schools. In the past 35 years, the movement has gone through various phases. WAC advocates have attempted to overcome administrative and faculty complacency and have persuaded administrators to provide incentives for those faculty interested in the
WAC dialogue. We have assured our colleagues in English that their roles as teachers and scholars of literature will not disappear if they assist in the movement toward more writing instruction. We have comforted those who accepted arguments for WAC programs when they began to recognize the degree to which definitions of good writing are specific to given fields. Despite unresolved problems and controversies within the WAC Movement,\(^2\) and in light of continuing obstacles that hinder our attempts to establish successful WAC programs,\(^3\) WAC specialists predict a positive future for the movement (Walvoord; Soven; Thaiss; Bazerman), echoing James Kinneavy’s claim that Writing Across the Curriculum may well be “the most important change in teaching writing in America...as well as the shape of the future” (353). Recent books such as WAC for the New Millennium (Susan McLeod et al. eds.), Assessing Writing Across the Curriculum (Kathleen Blake Yancey and Brian Huot eds.), Electronic Communication Across the Curriculum (Donna Reiss, Dickie Selfe, and Art Young eds.) and articles entitled “Clearing the Air: WAC Myths and Realities” (Susan McLeod and Elaine Maimon College English May 2000), “Writing beyond the Curriculum: Fostering New Collaborations in Literacy” (Steve Parks and Eli Goldblatt College English May 2000), and Art Young’s “Writing Across and Against the Curriculum” (CCC Feb. 2003) all indicate that we are experiencing that positive future.

How will WAC succeed where other cross-curricular movements have failed? Barbara Walvoord maintains that we must constantly clarify goals at both the national and local levels, enlarge the dialogue beyond writing specialists, and become more active in other national debates about educational reform. Above all, we must avoid “schism,” resulting from factions “naming themselves separately,” while at the same time realizing
that a multitude of education reform movements must "coexist in a shifting kaleidoscope" ("The Future" 69). In other words, WAC must avoid the temptation to see itself as the unifier of academic disciplines but work within the context of separate discourse communities, with faculty, student, and administrative representatives, as a coordinating council. It must disseminate tactics or personnel so that it may become a network through which other movements form without subsuming the individuality of each constituent ("The Future").

Charles Bazerman has noted that the "first stage of WAC" was driven by the "missionary zeal of composition and the institutional designs of administrators looking for broad structural fixes" ("Second Stage" 209). WAC will succeed only if we develop stage two, an "assessment of the roles written language actually takes in disciplines and disciplinary classrooms" (209). Recent scholarship, according to Bazerman, has only begun to reveal the "substantive knowledge" that we must have in order to make WAC more than an administrative arrangement. Now that we understand that "writing varies with subject, classroom, and student knowledge," we must explore "the dimensions within which difference can be revealed and the structures of each situation's particularity" (210). I would add that the voices of two-year schools must be included in the dialogue. At two-year schools, we have our own dimensions within which difference can be revealed; we have our own structures and particularities to reveal.

Christopher Thaiss claims that one reason Writing Across the Curriculum has become so popular is that faculty recognize writing instruction as too useful to remain marginalized:

They [faculty] affirm that written words are the glue that hold the fragments together....The WAC workshop can help faculty see how
writing can help bring about the ideal of the coherent general education. Years of experience have taught us that merely making interdisciplinary courses does not mean students will perceive the interconnectedness of their courses. If we want to substitute the paradigm of connectedness for the paradigm of fragmentation, we have to explicitly stress connecting in how we teach. (103)

Elsewhere in the nation, institutions of higher education have developed and maintained successful WAC programs based on the general ideas that (1) the traditional faculty attitude about writing being an elementary, generalizable skill must be changed if faculty in areas other than English are to reverse what amounts to a 120-year tradition of complaint about student writing; (2) “wide-ranging change will occur only if the academy redefines writing for itself...and sees instruction in writing as one of its central concerns” (Rose, qtd. in Russell 9); and (3) scholars must study the rhetoric of academic disciplines on a case-by-case basis, analyzing the interactional rules, tactic and explicit, which govern the knowledge-making activities of various discourse communities (Russell 13). Only by acting on these ideas can we “advance the activities of specialized communities” and begin to construct “meaningful generalizations” about how writing works and how students learn to write in various areas of the curriculum. Thus, successful WAC programs seek not to transcend specialization but work with professionals in all areas of the curriculum, studying how meaning is negotiated in contexts in which the rules change in response to a wide range of intellectual, material, and political forces within and outside each discipline.

At local institutions, however, we need to bring faculty from across the curriculum together to address the problems of student writers and to begin using writing as glue to hold the fragments together. Recent developments at the
elementary-and secondary-school levels suggest that Writing Across the Curriculum may be necessary if we are to succeed in teaching writing at the college level, especially if our community college students—who come to higher education from impoverished backgrounds, educational neglect, limited opportunities, and with limited motivation—are to complete with students at four-year institutions.

In addition, if colleges and universities are to serve better-prepared high school students who have reaped the benefits of educational reform, WAC seems a likely option. The Kentucky Education Reform Act requires a high school student who scores at the “proficient” or “distinguished” level to perform tasks that involve problem solving, evaluating and synthesizing data, and writing both creatively and analytically in English classes, as well as content areas other than English. An emphasis on open-ended questions, performance events requiring students to apply what they have learned, and writing portfolios including works of fiction and poetry, prose pieces across the curriculum, and position papers means that if Kentucky schools reach KERA’s goal of full proficiency college and university writing programs may find themselves in the awkward and outdated position of teaching rhetorical modes and literary analysis to students who have been accustomed to interdisciplinary, collaborative assignments in high school. On a local level, we should position ourselves to teach a better-prepared college freshman by acting on the advice of Barbara Walvoord, Charles Bazerman, and Christopher Thaiss, who suggest that we need wider and more intensified
networks of support if WAC is to be fully successful. Simply, it is time to recruit community college support.

The case for WAC is even greater in community-college general education programs, where the marginalization of writing instruction and pressures to bring about educational equity are most severe. At the community college, increasing numbers of the students Paige Smith calls “substandard” enroll in general education courses. Here, the responsibility for teaching writing is squarely on the shoulders of the English Program. There is no pressure on faculty to publish, so those in areas other than English think little about writing, especially as it strengthens thinking and learning. If they assign writing tasks to students, they do so only so that students may demonstrate mastery of content. Most faculty think little about what these tasks require of students and what criteria they will use to evaluate their students’ work. If they do think about such things, it does not occur to them to take class time away from course content to explain them from the perspective of their discipline. In their view, writing skills are universal skills students should have learned in their composition classes. As a result, students in areas other than English may never be exposed to the writing done in other disciplines. Motivated students who wish to transfer to four-year institutions typically learn by trial and error, as they chart their course through the general education curriculum, how arguments change from one discipline to the next and how writers within the disciplines go about satisfying the universal need to support claims with evidence. In my experience, it is not uncommon to find community college professors in the Social and Behavioral Sciences who assign
research papers, yet they possess only limited knowledge of APA documentation. I suspect the criteria they use to evaluate written work are also, from the student’s perspective, a mystery. But I do not intend to place blame on any one discipline. I suspect the same is true of some English teachers, and we are supposed to know better.

Locally, the case for Writing Across the Curriculum at the community college becomes even more pertinent in light of the University of Kentucky General Education Ad Hoc Committee’s Fall 1992 revision of general education requirements. The committee’s report outlines competencies expected of all students who complete the requirements for the Associate in Science, Associate in Arts, or the Associate in Applied Science degrees, as well as the courses or learning experiences required to meet these competencies.\(^4\) The committee recommends that, upon completion of any associate degree program, the graduate must demonstrate abilities that include communicating effectively using standard written English; analyzing, summarizing, and interpreting a variety of reading materials; and thinking critically and making connections in learning across the disciplines (U of K Community College System General Education Report 1). While we may be attempting to meet some of these competencies, in 1992, only Southeast Community College housed a writing across the curriculum program. Even though our state community colleges are no longer affiliated with the University of Kentucky, an excellent way to assess ourselves would be to develop WAC programs on all campuses. These programs would address general education competencies by providing “a congenial climate for discussion about
the nature of writing instruction, fully admitting the collaborative nature of this
endeavor and acknowledging that the teaching of writing across the disciplines is
a complex activity still in its early stages of development” (Soven 13).

The profession at large and our local community college system agree about
the need for composition courses and writing assignments in content courses that
will make students aware of commonalities and differences among the writing
tasks we assign (Thaiss 103; McCarthy 245). Perhaps then students will perceive
consistency and relevance as they move beyond freshman composition courses
and are asked to write in other disciplines and at four-year institutions. Twenty­
one years ago, Judith Kirsch and Emily Golson recommended that faculties of all
disciplines seek the assistance of composition faculties in order to improve the
quality of their students’ writing. They stressed the need for a common
vocabulary to define “good” writing, diagnose problems, and recommend
teaching methods. It is time to address this need at the community-college level
by examining our faculty’s attitudes toward writing and describing how we define
writing proficiency.

Assuming that fragmentation is both permanent and necessary, proponents of
Writing Across the Curriculum gained on the national level tremendous support
and influence. Inspired by the work of James Britton and the Writing Across the
Curriculum Project of the London Institute of Education in the early 1970s, early
WAC advocates such as Elaine Maimon at Beaver College and Toby Fulwiler and
Art Young at Michigan Technological University developed comprehensive
approaches to writing among the disciplines. However, as early as 1983, after
WAC had been praised with nearly religious fervor, disagreements began surfacing concerning the relationship between writing and learning, how English teachers might advise colleagues to integrate writing into their courses (Herrington 404-413), and how English teachers might effectively integrate reading and writing of other disciplines into their writing courses (Comprone 112-113; Jones and Comprone 59-68).

These debates continue, but mathematicians, historians, philosophers, sociologists, and ESL specialists at the elementary, secondary, and university levels presently join writing specialists. The dialogue on WAC has become a truly interdisciplinary enterprise, further evidence of the movement’s success. A CD-ROM ERIC search of articles published on WAC between 1982 and 1996 revealed close to 1000 items. Nearly 25% of these articles reported successful WAC approaches to content areas across the curriculum.

Yet, the research on WAC specifically in community colleges is missing in databases and major composition journals. In 1990, Helon Howell Raines reported that one area of commonality among community colleges is the absence of Writing Across the Curriculum programs, despite the large numbers of students in writing classes. Raines bemoaned the fact that while “two-year schools are the largest sector of higher education in the United States, with approximately one half of all students taking composition in two-year colleges…, no major study has been published since the 1965 NCTE and CCCC report, English in the Two-Year College” (151). And while the community colleges, in many ways, can best provide those classrooms that “enact what others only talk about” (Lunsford 76),
we have been limited in our opportunities “to explore and articulate the strength in diversity among two-year institutions…” (Raines 151).

In 1991, Jossey-Bass published Writing Across the Curriculum in Community Colleges, edited by Linda C. Stanley and Joanna Ambron. This book is one of only a few to deal with WAC in community colleges, and the publication date, nearly twenty years into the movement, indicates that we have just begun to explore WAC as a community college phenomenon. In the “Editors’ Notes,” Stanley and Ambron state that although there is “ample and growing information about Writing Across the Curriculum (WAC) theory and practice in higher education, very little has been written about WAC programs in community colleges” (1). In Chapter One, Ambron discusses the suitability of WAC to our nation’s community colleges (3-8), which are becoming the centers of general education for college students (Ambron, Raines, Stahl, McCartan, Smithson and Sorrentino, and McLeod). Locally, nearly half of all community college freshmen are nontraditional students—educational equity once again (Robert Lawrence, Jefferson Community College Academic Advising Coordinator, telephone interview, Summer 1995). Because 40% of JCC’s students transfer to local four-year institutions, our Writing Program, indeed our College, should be as interdisciplinary and “connecting” as possible. We are experiencing the administrative pressures Russell discusses. I hope the following chapters will be a step toward providing for our students the most appropriate general education.
CHAPTER ONE

How Do Community College Faculty Define Writing Proficiency?

“In every act of conscious perception, we at once identify our being with that of the world without us, and yet place ourselves in contra-distinction to that world.”

Coleridge “On Method” 364-365

In May of 1995, at the beginning of a WAC/English 102 Assessment Workshop on Jefferson Community College’s Downtown Campus, I asked fourteen faculty readers—four from the Natural Sciences, four from the Social Sciences, and six from the Humanities—to freewrite for ten minutes on the term writing proficiency. I told the faculty they could use the freewriting exercise as a way to focus their own—or their discipline’s—notions of writing proficiency by defining or describing, from their perspectives, proficient writing. I told them they need not be concerned with grammatical correctness or proper punctuation, just as English teachers advise students who allow concern for standards to interfere as they generate and record their ideas. I explained that I was interested, at this point, in the language they used to describe writing, rather than in any “right”-or “wrong” answer. The freewriting “assignment” follows:

Focused Freewriting

Think about the term writing proficiency. Write continuously, for ten minutes or so, your ideas about this term. You may describe a proficient piece of writing; you may define writing proficiency. Do both if you like. Do not worry about grammatical correctness or proper punctuation. You don’t need to write complete sentences. Phrases will do. If you run out of ideas, write about having run out of ideas until an idea comes to you.
Following the freewriting exercise, I encouraged the faculty to refer to their freewritings throughout the remainder of the workshop as I asked each to evaluate a random sample of eighteen end-of-semester ENG 102 papers, rating them highly proficient (HP), proficient (P), or nonproficient (NP) and explaining in writing their reasons for assigning a particular rating (see Appendix A). Prior to the evaluation part of the workshop, we had reviewed the English Program’s syllabi for English 101 and 102 and objectives for each course in the mandatory 101-102 sequence (see Appendix B). Once I had asked the faculty to define or describe proficient writing, and I had made available to them these course descriptions and syllabi, I asked them to read ENG 102 papers and rate them. Their compliance would allow me to compare their reasons for assigning particular ratings to the ideas they generated in their freewritings. Because I had asked all ENG 102 instructors to submit essay grades and course grades for all 102 students—working from a study conducted by Tom Blues and UK’s Writing Program in the Summer of 1993 (July 1994) (see Appendix C)—I could also compare faculty ratings with those of the ENG 102 instructors on our campus and, finally, my conclusions to those of Blues.

Blues found that “there exists a general agreement as to what constitutes proficient writing” (6) and concluded his study with the following recommendations:

(a) Future writing assessment initiatives can be based on the consensus definition of proficient writing that emerged from this exercise.
(b) ENG 101-102 are courses that attempt to teach the reasoning-reading-writing skills valued by UK faculty.
(c) UK faculty members have no reason to doubt their capacities to assess and hold students accountable for the quality of their written work, with reference both to content and presentation.
(d) Faculty members across the disciplines should build upon the foundation set in ENG 101-102 in designing writing assignments for their courses. (6-7)
The freewriting exercise is a useful indicator not only of the language the respondents used but suggests their attitudes about their own writing processes and using writing to invent and what they consider characteristics of proficient student writing. There is a potential for danger here: In making their responses known, I may alienate the faculty who were willing to work with me, and who took the workshop seriously. My purpose in this chapter is to report the contents of the freewritings, breaking them down by common terms—what I call Key Proficiency Indicators—and disciplines, to summarize the definition of writing proficiency that emerges from the freewritings, and to infer faculty attitudes based on my analysis of the freewritings. I will do the latter with as much tact as I can muster. I hope that my discussion of what one respondent called “global characteristics” of proficient writing, those that seem to transcend disciplinary distinctions, might prove helpful to other community college faculty, in particular Writing Program Coordinators who entertain the notion of establishing WAC programs on their campuses.

Although I intended the faculty readers to be organized according to discipline, with five readers per discipline, cancellations and last-minute replacements resulted in the following distribution: There were four Natural Science faculty, all from the Allied Health Division, one of them a Division Chair and a Ph.D. in Rhetoric and Composition. The group included three Social Science faculty, one from Psychology, one from Sociology, and one reader from the Education Transfer Program, who doubled as a teacher of ESL classes for the Writing Program. We also had one faculty from the Business Division (in this study, I include data from Business with the Social Sciences).
One faculty from the Reading and Study Skills Program, whose data I examine among those of five Humanities faculty, also participated. Finally, there were: one faculty from Philosophy, four from English, and one from the Communications Program. All fourteen faculty required writing of their students; some had expressed a desire to use writing assignments more effectively in their courses, and a few had been openly critical of the instruction students received in their Writing courses.

The average response to the freewriting assignment was 172 words. A member of the Allied Health Division wrote the fewest words, eighteen. The largest number of words (265) came from an English teacher who wrote a short essay (for all responses, see Appendix E). Although the instructions told them not to worry about grammatical correctness, spelling, and punctuation, most respondents, ten of the fourteen, wrote complete, properly punctuated sentences. Several of them drafted essays. Only four respondents seemed comfortable with the “free” part of the freewriting exercise. Two Natural Science faculty composed brainstorming lists that were, sadly, much shorter than they might have produced in ten minutes. They failed to follow the instructions, which asked for freewriting. Two Humanities faculty, one a philosopher and the other a Writing teacher, let their ideas come naturally and did not dwell overly on grammatical rules. Their freewritings are messy, playful, and questioning, exactly as an English professor might expect from students at the start of a writing process. On the other hand, one respondent, a sociologist, began her well-organized “freewriting” by questioning the “assignment”:

"I find myself reacting somewhat emotionally to our “assignment,” wondering if I am out of tune in some way. All too often, in my opinion, students will respond on paper and essays in just the way the directions
say—with phrases, incomplete sentences, and with no concern of [sic] grammatical correctness. This not writing proficiency in my opinion.

The following list indicates the four most commonly used Key Proficiency Indicators, the 21 used less frequently, and the number of faculty who used them. Often there are synonymous terms for an indicator, so I note that. Again, for the sake of this study, I put the Business Division faculty with the Social Sciences and the Reading and Study Skills faculty with the Humanities. A discussion of each Key Proficiency Indicator follows. I used the faculty freewritings to decide which terms to include in the list. Terms are listed starting with most references across disciplines. For example, nine of 14 faculty mentioned style, purpose, and grammar. These were the indicators mentioned most, so I classified them “Global Characteristics.” One fewer respondent mentioned audience, but eight respondents are still a majority, so I included it as the fourth “Global Characteristic.” All 25 terms are called “Key Proficiency Indicators” because at least one respondent thought them important enough to mention.

The value of this freewriting exercise is the same as any freewriting exercise: to invent material, something written to work with in drafting something significant. This chart records a local community-college definition of writing proficiency, derived organically from an analysis of the respondents’ freewritings.

### GLOBAL CHARACTERISTICS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Proficiency Indicator</th>
<th>Natural Sciences</th>
<th>Social Sciences</th>
<th>Humanities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Style</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Purpose</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Grammar</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Audience</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #1 STYLE

Alternate Terms: To present ideas in a clear and concise manner, to demonstrate economy of language, succinctness, elements of style, to be engaging.

Nine respondents mentioned style or the synonymous terms listed above in describing proficient writing. Two Natural Science faculty, all four Social Science faculty, and three Humanities faculty referred to style, either explicitly or in reference to reporting content in a particular way. The Natural Science faculty stressed that proficient writing should contain coherent expression of ideas, should be concise yet make a point. The Social Science faculty, in particular the respondent from the Business Division, discussed an appropriate style and format as dependent upon audience and purpose. The psychologist, in a response similar to those of the Natural Science readers, defined writing proficiency as “the use of facts, data, and research in a clear and concise manner.” The other Social Science faculty wrote that proficient writing demonstrates “the ability to state clearly” and “to get across ideas or facts in a way that is clear and easily readable.” Finally, “students must write clearly and concisely... They must understand that more is not necessarily better.”

The Humanities faculty responses combined the Natural and Social Science faculty’s emphasis on coherence and conciseness with the Business Division faculty’s emphasis on clarity of expression and a style that is dependent upon audience and purpose. The Humanities respondents differed in that they included a “creative” or “engaging” style and writing that is “full of energy harnessed by intelligence and humor.” For the respondent from the Reading and Study Skills Program, style was process and product. He distinguished between a professional’s style and a student’s style: “An audience may
be a grant reviewer who needs specific information in a specific style. In this case, product rather than process is paramount.”

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #2 PURPOSE

Alternate Terms: persuasive intent, to accomplish a goal, to make a point

Nine of the respondents discussed purpose. All four Natural Science faculty said that proficient writing must be persuasive, and the intent must be obvious in order for the author to make his or her point. According to these Natural Sciences, writing proficiency refers to the writer’s ability to produce a text that will accomplish a particular goal.” The two Social Science respondents who mentioned purpose discussed the ability to write for “numerous purposes” and to include “information that informs, persuades, or influences the reader to some type of action or opinion.”

There was little differentiation in the three Humanities responses that mentioned purpose: writing proficiency is the ability to achieve a purpose or accomplish a goal.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #3 GRAMMAR

Alternate Terms: grammatically correct, grammatical correctness

Nine of the respondents mentioned grammar in connection with proficiency: all of the Natural Science faculty, all of the Social Science faculty, and one faculty from the Humanities. The Natural Science faculty’s responses emphasized that letters must be “grammatically correct, spelled right, and diplomatic.” One response, from a physical therapist, continued: “My greatest concern and personal gripe is when noun/verb agreement does not exist. This destroys an entire reading experience for me.” Other Natural Science respondents mentioned that “neither a poem nor an annual report would be proficiently written if the composer, or composers, did not have control of grammar
and punctuation rules” and that a friend “writing a personal letter to another friend may ‘know’ grammar and punctuation” but may understand that the letter-writing context does not demand following grammar and punctuation rules that closely. The other Natural Science respondents listed “grammatically correct” and “correct grammatically” but did not elaborate.

The Social Science respondents insisted on grammatical correctness as part of writing proficiency. The Psychologist wrote that, in addition to respecting facts, students’ respect for the generally accepted rules of English grammar is “at the heart of my concept of ‘good writing.’” The Sociologist, as I mentioned earlier, complained about students approaching writing assignments with “no concern of [sic] grammatical correctness…If sentences are not complete, if the material does not read easily, then the main thrust of the paper or essay is lost.” The Education Transfer respondent wrote, “Grammar errors most frequently focus around [sic] number and gender agreement and regional expressions.” Finally, the respondent from the Business Division wrote that proficiency in writing includes “appropriate style, format, content, and grammatical correctness.”

The one English teacher who referred to grammar elaborated:

People who break serious grammar rules should be punished as criminals. Really, Think about it. Fine language structures intelligent behavior. If we controlled—no if we emphasized—excellent language, then we wouldn’t even begin to want to externalize the violence created in us.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #4 AUDIENCE

Alternate Terms: reader, a person, persons, others

Eight respondents expressed a concern for audience. Two of the Natural Science faculty, two of the Social Science faculty, and four of the Humanities faculty used the term. The two Natural Science responses included an awareness of one’s audience as
necessary in order to make one’s writing interesting. One Social Science faculty responded that written communication is necessary for numerous purposes and a variety of audiences. This respondent also mentioned style and format as being dependent upon the purpose and audience: “The message is supported by relevant information which informs, persuades, or influences the reader to some type of action or opinion.” A second Social Science respondent wrote: “The reader should not have to plow along trying to read between the lines to see where the author is and what the author is trying to say.”

The Reading and Study Skills faculty member discussed audience as follows:

Proficiency is directly related to author and audience; both components are always there, although the balance between the two may change. Also, the author is always at least one member of the audience. If I’m writing to discover what I’m thinking, the product is important but my mechanical proficiency is not...I am the only audience.

The member of the Communications Program wrote that writing proficiency involves:

Being able to write so a person can read what you write and understand the meaning of what your writing is trying to accomplish, state, say, or convince (persuade). Proficiency means you have demonstrated the ability to write (to an audience) and have them understand what you have written enough to explain your writing to someone else (or back to you).

The Philosopher of the group discussed “giving skills to enable persons to express themselves clearly so that readers do not lose the message in the writing mess...mov[ing] others to action (or inaction).” Finally, one English teacher defined proficiency as the ability to write “effectively and efficiently in different contexts for different audiences, and with different writing styles in mind.”
OTHER CHARACTERISTICS

The other 21 indicators follow. Note the instances in which respondents lose focus, dwelling on how to change unhealthy student attitudes, on a writer’s persona or practices rather than characteristics of writing.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Proficiency Indicator</th>
<th>Natural Sciences</th>
<th>Social Sciences</th>
<th>Humanities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. Context</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Content</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Research</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Spelling</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Mechanics</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Logic</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Punctuation</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Organization</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Format</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Courtesy</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Diplomacy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Relevance</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Problem Solving</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Critical Thinking</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Development</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Attitude</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Play</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Sentence Structure</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Six of the respondents—two Natural Science faculty, one Social Science faculty, and three Humanities faculty—discussed context as a significant aspect of writing proficiency. One Natural Science respondent defined a proficient writer as one who is able “to convey his meaning in any format and is able to write specific to the situation.” Another described proficiency as context-specific: “For example, proficiency as it relates to composing a poem may differ from proficiency as it relates to composing a business’s annual report.” For the Social Science respondent, a member of the Business Division, “writing proficiency is dependent upon purpose and audience.”

The first and third of the following comments were from English faculty, and the second was from the representative of the Reading and Study Skills Program. These Humanities faculty mentioned (1) “global aspects” of writing proficiency that may or may not be required in certain contexts; (2) author and audience, therefore context, influencing proficiency; and (3) “different contexts, for different audiences and with different styles in mind,” determining how to write effectively and efficiently.
Five of the fourteen faculty—one of the Natural Science faculty, three of the Social Science faculty, and one from the Humanities—referred to content in their freewritings. In no case, however, did anyone mention a specific content or type of content. Instead, all five faculty discussed content in terms of general characteristics: Any content, point, meaning, or message should be presented in a clear, organized, coherent manner. The content should be creative, original, intelligent, and should demonstrate thought, even dedication, on the writer’s part. There should be, as a Humanities respondent put it, “a person behind the pen,” regardless of the content.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #7 RESEARCH
Alternate Terms: properly referenced/document, evaluation of research

Two Natural Science faculty and two Social Science faculty, 27% of the total, mentioned research. The Natural Science respondents believe a proficient piece of writing should be “properly referenced,” and a writer must reach “valid conclusions” from evaluation of research. In the Social Sciences, the psychologist wrote that “good student writing often seems the product of a good deal of research.” The Education Transfer faculty member wrote, “students must know where to find information about their subject. Sometimes this requires reseach [sic] skills.”

Oddly, the Humanities faculty, four of them teachers of ENG 102 (a class that stresses research skills), failed to include research in their responses.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #8 SPELLING
Alternate Terms: N/A

Four respondents—one of the Natural Science faculty, two from the Social Sciences, and one Humanities faculty—included spelling in their responses. The physical therapist
who mentioned letters that “have to be grammatically correct” added “spelled right” as another requirement. One Social Science faculty who was concerned with correct spelling stated that “credibility of the written word is maintained when correct grammar, spelling, punctuation, etc. are present.” The second wrote: “Most students now have access to computers and this tool has greatly reduced spelling errors except in cases such as there, their, they’re, principle, principal—etc.”

One Humanities faculty, a member of the Communications Program, added: “Spelling should also be a part of this proficiency as well as a level of vocabulary equal or above the level of the assignment.”

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #9 MECHANICS

Alternate Terms: mechanical proficiency, mechanical control

Four respondents, one from the Natural Sciences, one from the Social Sciences, and two from the Humanities, referred to mechanics. They comprise 27% of the group. The Natural Science faculty member stated, “There are, I believe, some ‘global’ aspects of writing proficiency, those being primarily related to mechanical control…Although mechanics and grammar skills are global proficiencies—applicable to all writing contexts—certain contexts may not require that these skills be used to achieve writing proficiency.”

The Sociologist of the group wrote that the mechanics of writing “should be so smooth and problem-free that the vehicle does not become more visible than the ideas or facts it is trying to impart.” One member of the Humanities wrote: “I have found that a student’s ability to write proficiently is always related to mechanics.” The member of the Communications Program added that academic writing contexts require “control of
mechanics to communicate ideas (and org. them) proficiently.” The faculty from the
Reading and Study Skills Program maintained that “If I’m writing to discover what I’m
thinking, the product is important but my mechanical proficiency is not as important, as
long as I can understand what I have written. I am the only audience.”

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #10 LOGIC

Alternate Terms: sound reasoning, valid or logical conclusions, coherent expression of
ideas, logical “followthru” [sic]

Logic was a concern of two faculty from the Natural Sciences and one from the
Social Sciences. One member of the Allied Health Division listed terms related to logic
three times in her brainstorming list: “sound reasoning,” “valid conclusions when
evaluating research,” and “coherent expression of ideas.” Another listed “logical
followthru” in her list. One Social Science respondent wrote: “The content/message of
effective writing is clear, organized, accurate, logical, and courteous.”

The term logic appeared nowhere in the responses of the Humanities faculty.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #11 PUNCTUATION

Alternate Terms: N/A

Three Humanities faculty referred to punctuation specifically. Two of them, the
philosopher and an English teacher, mentioned particular marks of punctuation: periods,
commas, semicolons, etc.” and “splicing sentences with commas.”

Another English professor recommended a sentence of “several years in the
communication ward” for the crime of comma splices. The member of the
Communications Program included punctuation among the “basic elements” needed “to
sustain the meaning.”
KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #12 ORGANIZATION

Alternate Terms: N/A

Two of the respondents mentioned organization. One of the Natural Science faculty wrote that proficient writing contains “well-organized content,” and one Humanities faculty said, “Organization needs to be addressed.”

No one in the Social Sciences mention organization specifically.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #13 FORMAT

Alternate Terms: N/A

Two of the respondents considered format a concern of the proficient writer. A member of the Natural Sciences wrote: “A proficient writer is able to convey his [sic] meaning in any format…, and a Social scientist mentioned that “Writing style and format are dependent upon the purpose and audience.”

No one in the Humanities mentioned format specifically.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #14 COURTESY

Alternate Terms: N/A

One of the Social Science faculty, the member of the Business Division, included courtesy as a characteristic of proficient writing.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #15 DIPLOMACY

Alternate Terms: N/A

One of the Natural Science faculty, a Physical Therapist, mentioned diplomacy as characteristic of letters written in his field.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #16 RELEVANCE

Alternate Terms: N/A
The member of the Business Division indicated that the message of a piece of writing must be supported by “relevant information.”

**KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #17 PROBLEM SOLVING**

Alternate Terms: N/A

One of the respondents, a psychologist, related writing proficiency to a student’s ability to solve a problem:

In my experience, our students most often lack data or the general conceptual framework that is needed to bring to bear upon a problem. Good student writing often seems the product of a good deal of research, an attempt to view different sides of a question and the ability to state clearly the core of a problem.

**KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #18 CRITICAL THINKING (viewing different sides of a question)**

Alternate Terms: N/A

The aforementioned psychologist included in the quoted passage “viewing different sides of a question” as a requirement of proficient writing.

**KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #19 DEVELOPMENT**

Alternate Terms: N/A

One member of the Humanities faculty, from the Communications Program, listed development among the concerns of a proficient writer: “Not only do errors count, but the content, structure, and development of ideas.”

**KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #20 CHANGING STUDENT BELIEFS**

Alternate Terms: N/A

One of the English faculty based his response on the necessity of changing student myths in order to be successful as a teacher of writing:
On the one hand, students believe that they are competent writers to begin with, who by their existence deserve to pass a college transfer writing class. On the other hand, those few who excel are perceived as “naturals”...born that way. Both are myths.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #21 PLAY
Alternate Terms: N/A

The Philosopher of the group was the only respondent to mention play as a characteristic of a proficient writer. Interestingly, his freewriting provides an example of this indicator: “Writers should know—how to play—with ideas and words; dialogue with self and others in the word box; open up horizons of possibility; challenge and affirm the human spirit; individually and corporately.”

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #22 SENTENCE STRUCTURE
Alternate Terms: N/A

The member of the Communications Program was the only respondent to mention sentence structure specifically: “This [writing proficiency] should include basic elements in order to sustain the meaning, such as punctuation, sentence structure...”

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #23 NUMBER OF PAGES
Alternate Terms: N/A

The Communications Program faculty member was also the only respondent to include number of pages as a characteristic of proficient writing:

Perhaps 3-6 pages might be enough to demonstrate this ability [writing proficiency], however, enough pages need to be generated as to examine completeness of ideas and subject as well as contain the elements of style and construction such as thesis statement, body with inclusion of transitional sentences, and conclusion.

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #24 FOCUS
Alternate Terms: N/A
One member of the Social Sciences, the Education Transfer respondent, indicated that students who are proficient writers have the ability to “focus an idea into a paper of manageable proportions.”

KEY PROFICIENCY INDICATOR #25 READING ALOUD TO HEAR ERRORS

Alternate Terms: N/A

The same respondent included that practice of reading aloud to hear errors as an additional characteristic or ability of the proficient writer. She added, “This seems to help.”

Conclusions

What do the respondents' freewritings suggest about their attitudes concerning their own writing, their notions of correctness, and the knowledge or lack of knowledge of writing processes? Such information is invaluable to a Writing program coordinator, or Writing Center coordinator, who might like to build on an initial WAC workshop to maintain a dialogue among faculty of other disciplines.

Some teachers need clarification about what a freewriting is, why it is useful, and how it should be evaluated. As I noted earlier, only four respondents were comfortable with producing freewriting, even though I tried to make it clear that I wanted as many ideas as they could produce in ten minutes. Perhaps the respondents, like many of our students, distrust a Writing teacher who says, “Don’t worry about grammar, spelling, or punctuation. Just write.” I don’t blame them. If the Math Department asked me to work a few problems but don’t worry about the numbers, I too would be distrustful. Most of them wrote complete, punctuated—not always correctly—sentences. Even those who tried the be spontaneous added SP? above words they had possibly misspelled, indicated
in the margins that they were changing their minds as they wrote, and added disclaimers such as "I hope you don’t mind a list of characteristics. I’m more likely to write in sentences [sic] and paragraphs when using a word processor than when using a pen and paper.” Clearly this respondent, apologizing for doing what I asked her to do, missed the point.

The freewritings also reveal that the faculty of a community college produce many of the same errors that they and English teachers find in their students’ work, and they produce these errors regardless of whether they are consciously trying to avoid them, limiting their creativity, or consciously trying to produce a record of their thoughts. The following are a few of these errors: unidiomatic expressions, i.e. “no concern of grammatical correctness” and “Grammar errors most frequently focus around number…”; misspelled words, i.e. “sentances,” “reseach,” “assumtions,” “grammer,” and “sterotypes;” comma errors, i.e. “Perhaps 3-6 pages might be enough to demonstrate this ability [writing proficiency], however, enough pages need to be generated as to examine completeness of ideas…."

Perhaps the best general lesson to be learned from the freewriting activity, for both the Writing Program and the faculty of other disciplines, is that we should withhold generalizations about our abilities and our students’ abilities as writers until we allow ourselves and our students to behave as writers. All of us need opportunities to revise, edit, and proofread our drafts. I recommend that the English Program (1) educate or re-educate all English faculty about process approaches to composition, (2) allow our students to participate fully in process approaches to composition before we evaluate their work, (3) hold additional WAC workshops to share with faculty of other disciplines
our knowledge of process approaches to writing, and (4) encourage faculty of other disciplines to assign writing and to develop process approaches to their writing assignments. If just these fourteen respondents who spent ten minutes writing about writing proficiency were to maintain such pedagogical consistency in courses across our campus, we would all see marked improvement in our students' work, and our students would learn to develop effective writing processes of their own,

More specifically, the data created in the exercise suggest significant areas of agreement and differentiation among the academic disciplines on JCC’s Downtown Campus.

If an agreement of 50% or more of the total respondents constitutes a consensus across disciplines, we would include the following Key Proficiency Indicators in our definition of writing proficiency: clear and concise style (64% agreement), knowledge of purpose/ability to write for different purposes (64% agreement), correct grammar (64% agreement), and the ability to write to different audiences (57% agreement). While there are certainly other characteristics of a proficient writer, these provide some common ground on which to begin building or re-building a WAC program. We might label these four proficiency indicators “global characteristics”; they are the closest criteria we have to transcending disciplinary boundaries.

If we list the characteristics for which there was the most agreement in each discipline, we have for the Natural Sciences grammar (all four respondents), purpose (all four respondents), style, audience, research, context, and logic (two respondents each). For the Social Sciences, we have grammar (all four respondents), style (all four respondents), content (three respondents), audience, purpose, research, and spelling (two
respondents each), and for the Humanities audience (four of six respondents), style, context, and punctuation (three respondents each).

These data also suggest some differentiation among the disciplines. Such information is just as useful as areas of agreement to a Writing program concerned with providing for community college students the best general education. For example, all the Natural Science faculty mentioned purpose as an important component of writing proficiency. We have just seen that purpose and grammar were the indicators for which there was the most agreement among the Natural Sciences. In contrast, the word purpose appeared in only half of the Social Science responses (one of these is the respondent from the Business Division) and in three of six Humanities responses, where one of the three is the respondent from Reading and Study Skills. We cannot infer from these statements that purpose is any more important to the Natural Sciences than to either the Social Sciences or the Humanities. One of the Natural Sciences respondents was a Division Chair who held a Ph.D. in Rhetoric and Composition.

Half of the Natural Science faculty mentioned logic in describing writing proficiency. The word appeared in one of four Social Science responses, and never appeared in the responses of the Humanities faculty. Claiming that the Humanities value logic less than the sciences would be an over-generalization if based on the responses of 14 faculty. However, when we notice punctuation appearing in neither the Natural Science nor Social Science responses and three times in the Humanities we might infer that the Humanities distinguish between punctuation and grammar, while the sciences do not.
Two of the Social Science respondents discussed *spelling*, while one of the Natural Science respondents and one of the Humanities respondents used the term. Perhaps *spelling* is not all that important to faculty these days. Maybe we have given up on this one.

The Natural Science faculty (one of four) was the only group to mention that a proficient writer should demonstrate *diplomacy*. The Social Sciences were the only group to include that a proficient writer exhibits *courtesy*, is able to *view different sides of a question*, and produces writing supported by relevant sources. The Humanities were the only group to discuss *development, changing student myths, play, sentence structure, and number of pages*.

Regardless of our thoughts on the preceding issues, these discipline-specific characteristics provide the English Program with a sense of where differences lie.

I am aware of the danger in what are perhaps huge generalizations, but we might say that the Natural Science faculty are more concerned with *logic* than either the Social Sciences or the Humanities. In fact, the Humanities appear not to value *logic* at all. In English at JCC, we know, however, that any ENG 102 class that involves argumentation must be concerned with logic. Maybe we prefer the term *coherence*. At any rate, if our work with logic has been ineffective, we should work with Natural Science faculty to ensure that English teachers better prepare students to write logically in different disciplines. In a future workshop, we should discuss contexts in which logic or coherence matter and others, like freewriting or brainstorming, in which it does not.

Only the Social Sciences—in particular a professor of psychology—mentioned the writer's ability to consider different sides of a question. The Humanities faculty are
concerned with this ability, also. Obviously, this critical thinking skill is essential in any philosophy course and in any writing course that stresses persuasion and argument. The English Program should approach the psychologist about how he goes about teaching critical thinking in Introduction to Psychology or Developmental Psychology. These areas are his specialties. There is much to be shared in future WAC workshops.

Finally, are the sciences really so much more concerned with grammatical correctness than the Humanities? All Natural and Social Science respondents referred to proper grammar in their responses, while only one in the Humanities used the term. Analysis of the data suggests that faculty in the Sciences use the term grammatical correctness as a catch-all phrase for any problem that might appear in a piece of writing. On the other hand, the Humanities, especially the English faculty, distinguish between grammar, punctuation, and mechanics. It is highly likely that when faculty in other disciplines complain about improper grammar in their students’ written work, they are talking about anything from subject and verb disagreement, to vague language, to misplaced quotation marks. The only specific grammatical error mentioned in the freewriting of the Natural Science faculty was subject and verb disagreement. The Social Science faculty discussed sentence fragments and number and gender disagreement. Future workshops might work from this commonality.

I recommend that, as a starting point to future work in this area, concerned faculty who include or want to include writing assignments in their courses structure assignments, instruction, and evaluation around the “global characteristics” of proficient writing located herein. Future WAC workshops might address questions such as (1) What exactly constitutes correct grammar from each discipline’s perspective? (2) What are the
characteristics of a clear and concise style? and (3) How do we teach students in courses across the curriculum to write for different purposes and audiences?

In addition to educating ourselves and our colleagues about the value of process approaches to writing, the English Program might include grammar reviews in both ENG 101 and 102, especially since faculty in other disciplines tend to see proficiency in terms of the absence of surface error. The English Program could also sponsor additional workshops for faculty of other disciplines to ensure that we all use the same language when we are discussing errors among ourselves and with our students. Eventually, we might see a day when handbooks for writers are on the syllabi of faculty in other disciplines.

A Problem Emerges

All faculty respondents produced articulate ideas about what writing proficiency is from their perspectives. I can say with certainty that a common vocabulary emerged from the freewriting exercise. However, do faculty in other disciplines know what they are saying when they make comments like “proficient writers have the ability to focus an idea into a paper of manageable proportions” or a proficient piece of writing is supported by “relevant information”? Do they know how to help students develop such discipline-specific characteristics? Do the disciplines distinguish between terms like grammar and mechanics when they evaluate a student’s writing? In order to answer these questions, we must, first, determine how closely a respondent follows his or her definition of writing proficiency when evaluating actual student papers and, then, continue the dialogue initiated in the WAC workshop. For example, the English Program must determine whether the grammar advocates are really concerned with grammar when they evaluate
an essay as proficient, highly proficient, or nonproficient. If research skills are a large component of proficiency, do we focus on these skills or the absence thereof as we determine whether the writer is proficient or nonproficient? These are questions to be addressed in Chapter Two, in which I examine how the fourteen respondents rated a random sample of end-of-semester ENG 102 papers.
CHAPTER TWO

Responding to Calibration Essays
“Rhetoric is concerned with the state of Babel after the Fall.”

In May of 1993, the UK Writing Program, under the direction of Dr. Tom Blues, attempted to establish an undergraduate writing assessment mechanism and to develop “a procedure by which we could gain some idea of how the University faculty describes writing proficiency (is there a consensus across the disciplines?)” (Blues 1). The UK study involved ten groups of three faculty readers who read twenty-five essays—eighteen group-specific essays and seven calibration essays. According to Blues, “The purpose of the calibration essays was to determine the extent to which all readers agreed on their ratings and on their criteria of judgment” (2). Blues used the term *calibration essays* to show an attempt to standardize the gradations of an undergraduate writing assessment mechanism, establishing local criteria for highly proficient (HP), proficient (P), and nonproficient (NP) essays.

Nearly two years later, I asked four groups of three and one group of two JCC faculty readers representing the Natural and Social Sciences and the Humanities to evaluate eighteen essays—eleven group-specific essays and seven calibration essays. I had trouble convincing Jefferson Community College faculty to give up a Saturday in May to evaluate English 102 papers. To make the workshop more attractive, I reduced the total essays per group from twenty-five to eighteen but kept the number of calibration essays the same. I halved the number of groups and respondents to account for
significantly fewer JCC faculty and students. Following Blues, I asked the respondents to rate the essays highly proficient, proficient, or nonproficient and to explain in writing their reasons for assigning a particular rating (see Appendix A).

I chose JCC essays using a randomization chart from the appendix of a sophomore-level psychology text after English 102 students had given me written permission to use their work (see Appendix D). From 300 essays submitted by the students of full-and part-time faculty, I narrowed the sample to 62 essays.

In this chapter, I analyze respondents’ explanations of and ratings for the calibration essays in order to determine the “degree of consistency in evaluation criteria and judgments” among the faculty readers (Blues 3) (see Figure 1). I also include a breakdown of calibration essays by discipline (see Figure 2). An additional concern in this chapter—based on the freewriting exercise reported in Chapter One—is to determine the degree to which JCC respondents returned to their freewriting definitions of writing proficiency as they explained their ratings.

The seven calibration essays follow. I reproduce them as students wrote them, except for my single spacing. Following each essay, I include a breakdown by discipline of how the respondents rated essays. Following the breakdown, I summarize the written responses, again by discipline, and use the data to answer two research questions: (1) Is there consistency in criteria and judgments among the faculty readers, and (2) Did the JCC respondents return to their freewriting definitions and descriptions of writing proficiency as they explained their ratings?

The calibration essays clearly show the variety—or lack of consistency—among the JCC faculty’s assignments. They range from argumentative or persuasive essays on social
issues to traditional research papers on literary figures. One includes a formal outline, one includes a Works Cited page, and only a few show the writers’ attempts to edit and proofread. Several seem plagiarized in that sources are clumsily integrated and cited.

Four of the seven received grades of B or higher (I asked teachers to provide paper grades and course grades). Two of the seven were graded below average, one a D paper and the other an F. All the students who wrote the calibration essays passed English 102.

RESULTS: CALIBRATION ESSAYS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ESSAY</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>221</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>193</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>167</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>026</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>236</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>A-</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>153</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>020</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>D-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1. Respondents’ ratings to calibration essays, students’ paper grades and course grades

RESULTS: CALIBRATION ESSAYS BY DISCIPLINE

NATURAL SCIENCES – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ESSAY</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>221</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>193</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>167</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>026</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>236</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>A-</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>153</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>020</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>D-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOCIAL SCIENCES – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ESSAY</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>221</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The one thing I consider myself an expert at is using my imagination. If there is such a thing as being an expert with imagination I believe I’ve got the corner stone on that one.

I don’t use my imagination with drawing or dreaming like a lot of people do. I use mine with writing. I love to manipulate words to say what I want them to say.

I like to write and imagination goes well with that. If I imagine a picture in my head I can’t draw it but I can write about it in a way that whoever reads it could and will get a clear and precise picture of whatever I am thinking about.

Everybody who has read anything I’ve ever written that I have had to use my imagination in says I’ve got a strong voice when applied to writing. I think I can better express myself with a pen and paper than I can actually having a conversation with a person.

When I was in high school they made me use a book to learn and kept me from using my imagination. Instead of letting me go and become mature with my writing and imagination, which by the way they ended up expelling me over, they pushed me to write about books and things.

Ever since high school I’ve hated doing book reports and research papers. I know they just wanted me to learn, but whatever happened to
letting a young person become an individual, and letting that person find themselves, and their place in the universe?

I believe everybody has a good imagination. If they were only given the opportunity to use and develop it and to nurture it as if it were child the people giving that opportunity may find out that they have a good artist, writer or poet on their hands.

The imagination is a powerful tool if used right, but in the strict society of today it just doesn’t pay to have an imagination and show it.

Society wants people to learn what is in a book and not what is in the mind. As we all know the mind is a very powerful thing. I understand that we need to learn and books are a good way to learn, but at the same time people should be secure in their environments to be able to use their imagination and not worry if they are going to get into trouble for doing it.

I’ve used my imagination to write short stories, essays, and poems. Now I’m secure enough in life that I can use my imagination to do those things. I don’t have to worry about being persecuted for my writing as I did in high school.

Now that I’m older and look back on those days in high school I’m glad they tried to stop me from using my imagination because instead of stopping me they just pushed me to use it more and more.

My imagination is my expertise, and they can never take it away, nor will there ever be anyone that can use my imagination better than me.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NATURAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOCIAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HUMANITIES – TOTAL READERS: 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SUMMARY OF RESPONSES

Natural Sciences

44
Three of four Natural Science faculty rated “Imagination” nonproficient. Their reasons included the author’s inability to persuade, that no sources were used, and that the author failed to prove the thesis. One respondent wrote that although “the paper was free of glaring spelling and punctuation errors….the paper did not demonstrate the student’s ability to ‘analyze, interpret, evaluate’ [referring to 102 course objectives] and it was not well-organized.” Another reader thought the essay included run-on sentences. These he defined as, “Every paragraph is one sentence.” Furthermore, the author “repeats the same thought over and over.”

The respondent who found the essay proficient added the work low, wrote that the thesis was logical and the essay demonstrated “good tone and level of diction.” She found the generalizations substantive, although she mentioned the lack of “documented support.” She questioned whether the essay demonstrated the student’s ability to be “analytical, interpretative, and evaluative,” stating that “it would have been far better to illustrate his/her great talent for imagination than to discuss it.”

Social Sciences

The four Social Science respondents were split evenly on this essay, with two of them rating it highly proficient and two rating it nonproficient. One of the respondents commented that it was sound structurally,” but it was difficult to rate because “I have no idea what the purpose of the paper was.” Also, one respondent found it to display highly proficient writing, “assuming that this is not a research paper but a free floating essay on imagination.” She added that she would like to help the student see more broadly, but “he/she was able to communicate his/her ideas well…."

45
One of the respondents who found the essay nonproficient objected to its not being typed, added that it was “rambling – confusing,” and wrote that it was not a college-level paper because it included no research. The second respondent who found the essay nonproficient wrote, “The thesis statement is acceptable; however, the remainder of the paper is basically an opportunity for the writer to express resentment.” In addition, she noted that the essay included poor sentence structure, comma errors, and “no substantive generalizations.” She stressed, “Imagination was not used in this paper!”

**Humanities**

Three Humanities respondents rated “Imagination” proficient, and three found it nonproficient. All three who found the essay proficient indicated some hesitation in assigning the rating. One wrote that it was proficient as an exit paper for ENG 102, but “ordinarily” it would require much more development to support the thesis. A second reader found the writing skills “acceptable” but would have liked “clarification of terms (such as imagination).” He added that the paper was “not extremely convincing.” The third reader changed his rating from nonproficient to proficient and wrote: “Without knowing the assignment, it is difficult to say how closely this writer has achieved the purpose and occasion for this piece.” He also discussed the writer’s having failed in objectivity, attribution, and the “avowed purpose of demonstrating imaginative writing.” Rather than the essay demonstrating imaginative writing, this reader found the writer’s assertion to be that “he or she is proficient by self-definition….Here’s one who prefers self-absorbed narcissism to real proficiency.”

The three readers who gave the essay a nonproficient rating cited the writer’s having “no sense of what it takes to persuade,” no sources to back up claims, incomplete ideas,
and a “meandering” organization. One respondent wrote, “If this writer has such a great imagination, this paper would be more imaginative, don’t you imagine?”

CALIBRATION ESSAY #2 (Essay 193 of Sample)

Thesis: A mandatory uniform dress code adopted by the public school system would redirect our children’s priorities, well as, help establish a value system for our youth.

With the conditions we live in the school should assist society in establishing a value system for what is obvious a generation with no value system. Self respect is on a decline. Respect for others has become a fad of the past. Our youth are in dire need of a moral transformation. The school should be a source of direction in aiding the children to becoming an asset to society.

Popular name brand apparels and jewelry have become number one priority in the minds of most youth. Many of them are going to hazardous extents to possess these fashionable items. The compromise their integrity and put their lives at risk by selling drugs, selling their bodies and committing robbery, only to have a popular fashion. A mandatory uniform dress code could redirect the attention from fashion to academic studies.

Someone will argue that they have the right to dress themselves or their child as they please. Many feel that they have worked hard all their lives to provide the finer things in life for their child, and this provision should not be altered for any reason. Someone will say that if their child was abducted, being different in apparel could be as significant factor in solving the case.

Now, all those are very good arguments. But the fact still remains that there are more reasons to adopt a mandatory uniform dress code in the public school system than there is not to. Sure everyone has the right to choose, but right ends when it infringes upon my right. Each institution has the right to establish it’s individual rules and guidelines. An institution that strives to impose ethical ideas and provide a higher education should not have to endure a student exposing his or her intimate body parts at school. Nor should the school have to endure a student’s pants hanging down across and many times under the buttock. Yes, we have the right to choose, but we do not have the right to impose unethical lifestyles on learning institutions.

Our children need to learn in pre-school that wearing more expensive clothes does not make you a better person. Our youth’s value system is so warped that they go through school denying themselves of good healthy relationships because a person’s attire doesn’t come up to the standards of the majority. A mandatory uniform dress code could very well suppress discrimination. From a very young age children learn to discriminate. I believe that the school is where discrimination first raised it’s ugly head. For a child not to be able to afford the more popular name brand clothes
and gym shoes puts the child in a position of being teased and taunted for being different from the majority. Many parents who cannot afford the more expensive fashions, often struggle in providing these fashions for their child to prevent them from having to endure teasing and mockery. I remember my son not wanting to return to school because he was teased about his generic gym shoes. There is no doubt in my mind that a mandatory uniform dress code in the public school system would be an asset to all mankind.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NATURAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOCIAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HUMANITIES – TOTAL READERS: 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SUMMARY OF RESPONSES

Natural Sciences

Two Natural Science respondents found the preceding essay nonproficient due to a lack of library sources and evidence and “distracting” grammatical errors. A third respondent rated the essay proficient but added low once again. She mentioned that some generalizations were very effective while others were illogical, that a “couple of points” were stated “very well,” and the tone and level of diction were fairly good. Is the essay analytical or interpretive? This respondent was “not sure: a lot of personal feelings” came through. She listed “singular subject/plural verb” as a major grammatical concern and advised the writer to spend more time editing.
The respondent who gave the essay a high pass wrote that there were “few errors, no incomplete sentences” and the author “makes a strong point/organizes thoughts.”

**Social Sciences**

As with the “Imagination” essay, the Social Science faculty were split, only this time two found the essay proficient and two nonproficient. The two who assigned a rating of proficient pointed out the “technical problems.” One mentioned the student’s failure to “back up the thesis” and added that “this is an opinion paper and I don’t agree w/ the opinion. Maybe that clouded my evaluation.” The other reader attributed the writer’s “skipping around a little” to the “high emotional content” and suggested that the essay would have greater impact with better organization. She added that the essay “crosses the line in places from solid argument to emotional over-involvement where irrational statements pop up and get in the way of persuasion.”

One of two readers who found the essay nonproficient cited a lack of “summary/conclusion,” three spelling errors, “omission of text,” poor sentence structure and “no title.” The other objected to its lack of facts and its problems with “grammer” [sic].

**Humanities**

In evaluating the essay on a mandatory dress code in the public schools, four of six Humanities respondents assigned a nonproficient rating. One additional respondent found the essay highly proficient, and the final respondent gave the essay a proficient rating. Those who rated the essay nonproficient did so on the basis of lack of development and grammatical errors. One questioned whether the real issue was value systems or dress
codes. One found the conclusion illogical and lacking in structure. Another reader focused on “marginally competent” mechanics and a weak thesis.

The respondent who rated the essay highly proficient excused its lack of sources, transitions, and its brevity in favor of vocabulary, which was “fairly high,” and a thesis, which was “clear and followed pretty well.” The respondent who found the essay proficient said he would have had difficulty “deciphering this piece” had it not been for the formal announcement of a thesis at the beginning of the essay. He commented that the voice and tone were inappropriate for the topic, “puffed-up language for a modest issue,” but found the essay “pedestrian” and “minimally proficient.”

CALIBRATION ESSAY #3 (Essay 167 of Sample)

Where are the American women of the nineties, concerning employment? They are predominately in service related jobs. According to Naomi Wolf, “Women in the United States are clustered in twenty to four four hundred and twenty occupations listed by the Bureau of Labor Statistics. Seventy Five percent of American women are still employed in tradition womens jobs most of which are ill paid. American women work with low pay and little chance of advancement. The percentage of American women that live like this, is two thirds” (50). Two thirds meaning the vast majority of American women in the nineties are in jobs that are service related. A teacher, secretary, factory and day care worker are a few examples. These women live with poverty level incomes.

For example, Connie, a girl I grew up with has a job in a factory. She born in the fifties, into a “so-called normal” family who had a Victorian value system. They live in Louisville, Kentucky, in a lower middle class neighborhood. Connie was taught to be subserviant and passive toward the dominant male figures in her life. First the father and then the husband, even the sons, after she had her family. She learned a woman’s place was in the home with complete caretaking given to husband and children. Connie’s family had a Victorian set of values. She saw her mother work in the home with no pay, completly dependent on the father. No one in the family was allowed to talk back to the father. His word was law and the absolute authority in the home. Her mother taught her the domestic skills she would need in her own home, which included cooking, sewing, cleaning, and pleasing. While doing all this the woman was also expected to be attractive and interesting, and above all she was expected to be cooperative, sweet and not make waves for her husband.
Ruth Sidel states, "Fifties mothers, were encouraged by the culture to stay home, bake bread, grow herbs, and raise emotionally healthy children, often felt responsible for every aspect of the family well-being" (45). I salute the homemakers of American but not the role of the homemaker of fifties. The concept of the fifties homemaker did not prevent my mother, Connie or myself for employment outside the home. My mother, Connie, and myself had to find jobs outside the home. I have lived with my mother in poverty because our homemaking skills were not worth enough money to provide us anything but service related jobs with poverty level incomes.

Even though Connie had a service related job in a factory she soon discovered books and the lovely myth of Prince Charming. She soon found that most all the other girls were picking up on this "rescue the Princess" idea that was very much a part of the fifties culture. Speaking from personal experience, as I grew up in the fifties, all my girlfriends shard the same Victorian set of rules that we were expected to live by. Also, all the mothers stayed home to take care of their families. Connie’s mom taught her the lessons of subserviance. After learning these lessons Connie found "Prince Charming" in High School and they got married. But all did not go well, after a few years, "Prince Charming" died, and Connie had to go to work in a factory. The skills Connie had learned in High School had left her ill prepared for the job world.

Fairdale High School in Louisville, Kentucky, strongly encouraged Home Economics for girls in the fifties. Popularity dominated life in this school for many girls. Popularity was determined by the amount of friends a girl had, her physical appearance, and dates. This was my experience at Fairdale High. My best friend, Judy was classified as a "bad girl" because she wore a lot of make-up. Miss Sweetheart was a title I received, and I am convinced that my looks had a lot to do with this. Because of my Victorian background and my physical appearance the only message I got from this school was, "You’ve got it made because you’re pretty, and you’ll have no problem finding a husband, “Prince Charming”. Focus in the fifties was directed towards being financially supported by the male and to live emotionally through the male. Sidel asks a very interesting question, "Does emphasis on fashion, consumerism, and the lives of the rich and famous, create the illusion of choice while diverting attention from serious decision of policies that would give genuine options" (277). I can verify this because I spent entirely too much time focusing on fashion verses more serious matters such as higher wages for American women. I am not alone with this diversion because, "parental leave, a raise of the minimum wage and expansion of the child care system were defeated at the 1988 presidential campaign legislation" (Sidel 277). This proves to me that American women could pay more attention to the serious issue of voting.

On the subject of diverting attention, what about Connie's training to be passive, pretty and sweet? What happens to her mental health? Susan Douglas best summarizes this with, "no matter what girls did behind
closed doors, in front of their mirrors, they were never supposed to act
self-absorbed in public. We were supposed to be as self-negating as
cheerful about it as Cinderella. This message to women and girls in the
fifties was not just, ‘be passive, be dumb, keep your mouth shut, and learn
how to make Spam and Velveeta croquettes’. It was worse, it was to really
have it all be a martyr” (27). Be a martyr and be the fairest of them all.
This, from one of the most popular films for little girls, Snow White. What
is America’s idea of beauty? Cinderella and Miss America fit the mold of
what is known as Western Beauty. Wolf says, “in 1989, Miss America
earned $150,000, a $42,000 scholarship, and a $30,000 car.” (50). Wolf
compares this amount to other wages for women that are remarkably
lower.

Wolf states, “beauty is not universal of changes, though the West
pretends that all ideals of female beauty stem from one Platonic Ideal
Woman. The beauty myth is not about women at all. It is about men’s
institutions and institutional power. Competition between women has been
made part of the myth so that women will be divided from one another.
Aging in women is “unbeautiful” since women grow more powerful with
time, and since the links between generations of women must always be
newly broken. Older women fear younger ones, young women fear old,
and the beauty myth endures for all the female life span. Most urgently,
women’s identity must be premised upon our “beauty” so that we will
remain vulnerable to outside approval, carrying the vital sensitive organ of
self-esteem exposed to the air” (13,14).

America’s definition of beauty needs to be revised. America’s idea of
beauty is based on youth and a certain mold of physical appearance. To
me, real beauty goes much deeper than skin. Aging with a development of
inner qualities is beauty and deserve great respect. To fear one another
only causes unhealthy obstacles. American women need to develop
personal self esteem that does not depend on men. American women could
gain moe financial power if they would rely more on each other, such as
increasing “networking skills”.

Television and film, in the fifties and the nineties, send consistant
messages of dependency on the male to girls. In her book, “Where the
Girls Are, Susan Douglas says, “messages in the films Cinderella, Snow
White, and Peter Pan, give the primal images about good girls and bad
girls and about the kind of boys who found them most irresistible” (21).
Cinderella was forced by her stepmother to be subserviant to her
daughters. Cinderella was made to do all the household chores while her
stepmother and stepsisters relaxed. The stepmother and her daughters
abused Cinderella with their constant yelling and commands. Cinderella
never heard a “thank you” from her stepmother or stepsisters. Cinderella
was a victim in her stepmothers house. She sang, smiled, and never talked
back to her stepmother of stepsisters (Douglas 29).

Disney the man that created the film Cinderella gives little girls a very
unhealthy message. A message that says, be sweet, pretty, never complain,
work hard, even though you are being abused, and Prince Charming will come riding up on his horse and rescue you from pain and poverty. Cinderella was dependent on the Prince for her financial stability.

Not only in film could these messages of dependency be heard they were also on T.V. A popular television show in the fifties was Leave it to Beaver. This was a show about a family of four. June Cleaver, the mother was extremely dependent on Ward Cleaver her husband, both financially and emotionally. A housewife, June is sweet, passive, and lets Ward make all the decisions about he children because she does not think her decisions are wise. Through the mass media bombardment, in the fifties promoting male dependency to girls, women who grew up during this time are now, in the nineties working outside the home.

One source reveals, that an unskilled mother working full time is likely not to earn more than $10,000 a year (Jencks 104). Sidel talks about the shortage of jobs for single mothers. More than 210,000 women of working age, live in poverty, in New York City. They are all single mothers (186). Many of these women have inadequate education. Senator J. Dodd says, “In this nation today there are 87 million women as sole providers of their families.” (qtd in Sidel 232).

Another source revealed that people in their thirties and early forties were homeless “baby boomers”. This was in the Chicago area. “Baby boomers” included that people born in the fifties. This source goes on to say that women are predominate among the extremely poor, 56% (Ross 120).

In order for Connie to increase her income, she has returned to school. Connie is learning new skills to increase her employment potential in the nineties.

According to one source, women are trying to change their roles as secondary workers receiving inferior wages and inadequate benefits (Sidel, 23). With networking and education, women can improve their conditions, Gordon declares, “in 1989 there were 18,416,000 administrative support workers in the United States, 80% of whom are female. Of these workers, 4,010,000 were secretaries, and 99.1% of these workers are women. The Feminist Movement has helped to guide women toward a much greater sense of self worth” (171). In addition women have the skills to nurture and empower others. Connie used these skills to improve her life. Gordon points out that “women have historically defined, defended and substained a set of insights, values, and activities which, if never dominant at least provided a counterweight and attracted to the anomie, disconnectedness, fragmentation and commercialization of our culture” (5).

There exists the problem of secondary jobs with low pay for the American women in the nineties. With education and new skills these problems are being eliminated. American women will not be limited to service related jobs. Women in America need more networking. Now, that
there are more American women working outside the home, networking is easier because women are not as isolated.

The Prince Charming myth still exists for American women. Although, I think the myth is a little more realistic in the nineties. More attention could be given to the social problems that exist for American women instead of allowing ourselves to be diverted by the American beauty myth.

All problems considered American women have made a little progress in the job market of the nineties. I think the progress has been much too slow but that too in changing.

### Summary of Responses

#### Natural Sciences

Three of the four Natural Science respondents found the essay on American women of the Nineties proficient, although one of the three added that it was “very low.” Positive characteristics that they mentioned included adequate development, good generalizations, “some good documentation,” and “good thought construction.” Negative traits included the student’s needing to learn to paraphrase and summarize, inconsistent spelling and grammar, the student’s inability to stay focused, and the fact that the thesis changes from women’s employment to the issue of beauty and subservience.
The respondent who gave the essay a nonproficient rating wrote that although support was given for generalizations and the essay was readable and "somewhat" coherent, the paper was not well-organized and included several spelling, grammar, and sentence-structure errors.

**Social Sciences**

Two Social Science readers found this essay proficient and two nonproficient. One who gave it a proficient rating pointed out "some jumping around on topics within the paper," incorrect spelling and punctuation, sentence fragments, and problems with clarity. The other said it was "an ok paper" with some support of ideas "by quotes," although there were spelling and typing problems. He added, "needs a retype for a B."

The first reader to find the essay nonproficient objected to its lack of a references page but commented on the favorable aspects of the essay: "The writer of this paper has done a very good job, in my opinion, developing a thesis statement and providing substantive content." She went on to say that the paper "loses credibility/readability" due to its many errors: "spelling, punctuation, number usage, sentence structure, sentence fragments, run-on sentences etc." The second reader who rated the essay nonproficient wrote that the paper was "completely unfocused." She said the writer had "at least five discussions here," each of which could be developed into a paper. She added that personal experiences were inappropriate in a research paper and pointed out the writer had taken "bits and pieces from various sources: without providing connections between them. She concluded, "This paper frustrates the sociologist in me."

**Humanities**
One Humanities faculty rated this essay highly proficient. Four found it proficient, and one thought it nonproficient. The reader who found it highly proficient praised the writer’s ability to “develop an argument from personal and objective sources.” He liked the persuasive thesis but commented that surface errors barred it from being truly excellent.

Of the four who rated the essay proficient, one found it adequately developed but thought the writer needed to work on paraphrase and summary skills. Another thought some parts were “obviously clear and HP,” while errors, including subject/verb problems, fragments, misuse of the apostrophe, and comma splices brought the essay to a proficient rating. This reader especially liked “the Connie motif,” which unified the concept of a woman in the 90s improving her lot in life, though she was raised in a traditional 50s lifestyle. The third reader faulted the author for a lack of organization, a tendency toward wordiness, and too many quotations, but praised the spelling, vocabulary, and a conclusion that covered all the points. The fourth reader found the essay barely proficient, stressing that although the idea “is a worthy one,” it was too broad, and although the research was appropriate, it was not well integrated. She admitted, “The thesis, I think is fresh and original, so I gave some credit for the risk this student has taken.”

The reader who rated the essay nonproficient was more critical. He thought the thesis weak and incomplete, and, although the rest of the paper introduced interesting ideas, they were “not developed, analyzed or pulled together.” He concluded, “This would be a good rough draft. The writer has a lot to say but doesn’t develop her ideas. The paper reads like a brainstorm or free-write session.”
CALIBRATION ESSAY #4 (Essay 026 of Sample)

Race Relation in The Leather-Stocking Novels

Outline

Thesis: Cooper’s Leather stocking novels show that Pearce, Hazard, and Lawrence are mistaken about the “Red” and “White” man’s ability to mingle in a human relationship.

I. Biography
   A. Family Background
   B. Knowledge of Indians (Kieser)
   C. No “Red” and “White” mix
      1. Civilized (pearce)
      2. Superiority (Hazard)
      3. No mix of race (Lawrence)
   D. New human relationship
      1. Love of fellow man (Fiedler)
      2. Lawrence’s and other critic’s error (Thesis)

II. Race relation in the Leather-stocking novels
   A. Interest in each other
      1. Calling each other friends
      2. Having trust in each other
      3. Uncas death
   B. Respecting each other
      1. Listening to each other’s opinions
      2. Giving advice
   C. Working as a team
      1. Tracking Magua
      2. Rescuing Cora and Alice
   D. Risking life for each other
      1. Rescue of Chingachgook’s lover (Deerslayer)
      2. Rescue of Deerslayer (Deerslayer)
      3. Carries Chingachgook from the fire (Pioneers)
      4. Hawkeye saving Chingachgook (Mohicans)
      5. Uncas saving Heyward (Mohicans)
      6. Rescue of Alice, Cora, and Heyward (Mohicans)
      7. David saving Uncas (Mohicans)
      8. Uncas saving Alice and dying in an attempt to save Cora (Mohicans)

III. Justification of race relations in the Leather-stocking novels
   A. Lawrence and other critic’s error (Thesis restated)
   B. Race relations in the Leather-stocking novel (Summary)
   C. Race relation today

57
James Cooper was born in Burlington, New Jersey, 1789. His family moved onto property that later became their estate, and named for them, Coopertown, New York. Cooper received private tutoring, and at the age of fourteen he entered Yale University, but was expelled in 1806 for unruly conduct. Cooper served on a merchant ship, followed by service in the U.S. Navy as a midshipman from 1808-1811. After departing from the Navy, Cooper married Susan De Laney the daughter of a wealthy New York family. Soon afterward his father died leaving him an inheritance of more than $50,000. By 1819 his inheritance had dwindled, he was severely in debts, and he had a wife and children to support. Cooper, according to his daughter Susan, began writing by chance when his daughter wife laughed at his claim he could improve an imported novel he was reading. He added his mother's maiden name in 1826, during the same time he began to have financial gain and security, James Fenimore Cooper took his family abroad, and he toured Europe for seven years. Upon his return to the United States, he finds a country that is not as he remembered. Cooper wrote five “Leather-Stocking Tales”: The Pioneers, The Last of the Mohicans, The Prairie, Pathfinder, and The Deerslayer. Cooper admits he has few opportunities for communication or acquaintance with “Red” men; nevertheless, he was not ignorant of the of Indians: “Cooper used every opportunity of becoming acquainted with the natives short of studding them in their savage grandeur...Frequently met Indian families, either traveling, or proceeding to some village, with their wares.” Native Americans are not considered civilized according to settlers and other visiting Europeans.

“...all nature, all the future, waiting sublimely yet supinely to be informed by the civilized American intelligence; and he was aware.” equally that in this Western future, there stood somehow as measure of what civilization really was not, creatures possessing his land, creatures whose way of life was, as any man could see, not civilized.”

The question of their society is whether they are civilized is combined with another, are these people inferior? Lucy Lockwood Hazard comment on this inferiority is:

Haweye frequently apologizes for the boasting or the barbarity of his Indian comrades by remarking that these traits are “a red man’s gifts.” No one holds more dogmatically than Haweye that red man and white man are fundamentally different, with the superiority decidedly in favor of the white.

D.H. Lawrence says in Studies in Classic American Literature, the “Red” man and the “White” are not blood-brothers:...even when they are most friendly. The red life flows in a different direction from the white life. You cannot make two streams that flow in opposite directions meet and mingle soothingly. There is a new human relationship between the “Red” and “White” man. When two individuals are as close as Natty Bumppo in their friendship there is not usually anything that could come between them.
They not only had a love that was build between them, but also a love for fellow man. Leslie Feidler says... they have forsaken all others for the sake of the austere, almost inarticulate, but unquestioned love that binds them to each other. Lawrence and other critics are not right when they say that the “Red” man and the “White” man can not mix Cooper’s “Leather-Stocking” novels show that Pearce, Hazard, and Lawrence are mistaken about “Red” and “White” ability to mingle in a human relationship.

The race relationships in the Leather-Stocking novels are ones those many could envy. Because of the great lengths Natty, Chingachgook, Uncas and the others go through to secure and maintain their freedom. They do this without question, and without request of debt from one another. In Mohicans they are frequently calling each other friend:

...Heyward says to Alice, “He was brought among us, I have heard by some strange accident in which your father was interested, and in which the savage was rigidly dealt by—but I forgot the idle tale: it enough, that he is now.” (20) “I can not permit you to accuse Uncas of want of judgment or skill,” said Duncan: “he saved my life in the coolest and readiest manner, and he has made a friend who never will require to be reminded of the debt he owes.” (68)

There is also trust among them. Natty, Chingachgook, and Uncas served as sentries while they were avoiding capture during the night from the Huron’s. “Should we distrust the man because his manners are avoiding capture during the night from the Huron’s. “Should we distrust the man because his manners are our manners, and that his skin is dark?” Cora asked Alice. No greater example of bond between family and friend than the expression over the loss of a love-one; This is expressed in the words of Haweye, and the gestures of Chingachgook:

He was your son, and a redskin by nature; and it may be that your blood was nearer—but if ever I forget the lad who has so often fou’t at my side in war, and slept at my side in peace, may be our color our gifts, forget me! Chingachgook grasped the hand that, in the warmth of feeling, the scout had stretched across the fresh earth, and in that Attitude of friendship these two sturdy and intrepid woodsmen bowed their heads together...

In a time of struggle one should be able to listen his or her comrades to support their endeavor, just as in Mohicans They worked as a team:

“Here, then, is one who can undeceive you,” said Duncan: ‘Tis the horrid shriek that a horse will give in his agony; oftener drawn from him in pain tough sometimes in terror.” “I cannot deny your words,” said Natty. Advice was given by Heyward to Uncas: “I tell you, Uncas, you are wasteful of your powder, and the kick of the rifle disconcerts your aim!”

Working as a team to track Magua who have gotten away from them and seem to be headed back to his tribe: “Look at this sumach; its leaves are red, though everybody knows the fruit is in the yellow blossom, in the month of July, tis the blood of Le Subtil! he is hurt, and may yet fall!” Although they found the trail of blood, Natty thought it would be wise not
to follow this trail because it would only lead them to be captured. They continued on with their journey, but it was too long before they would have to work as a team. Uncas and Heyward worked as a team to save Alice and Cora: “But Uncas, denying his habits accompanied by Heyward, to the assistance of the females, and releasing Alice, placed her in the arms of Cora. Natty for the love of his friend risk his life and freedom: “His closest friend...Chingachgook, who is engaged to an Indian girl named Hist. The girl has been stolen by the Hurons and adopted into their tribe. In attempting her rescue, Deerslayer has himself been captured by the Hurons.” Chingachgook does not leave his friend to be tortured to death by their enemy, but returns the favor to save his friend from an eventual death:

Suddenly a young Indian came bounding through the Hurons ranks, leaping into the very center of the circle in a way to denote the utmost confidence or a temerity bordering on foolhardiness. I am Chingachgook, the son (sic) of Uncas, the kinsman of Tamenund. That paleface is my friend. In Pioneer, Natty carries C'ingachgook to safety:...seized the strips of the blanket, and with wonderful dexterity strapped the passive chieftain to his own back...More than once has Uncas risked his life to save a friend:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NATURAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOCIAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HUMANITIES – TOTAL READERS: 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SUMMARY OF RESPONSES

Natural Sciences

All the Natural Science respondents labeled “Race Relation in the Leather-Stocking Novels” nonproficient. One of the readers cited a lack of documentation and no flow of
ideas to support her rating. A second found “many good thoughts” but mentioned awkward integration of sources, awkward sentence structure, the need for editing, and the paper being “extremely hard to follow.” The third reader listed “incomplete sentences, grammatical mistakes, tense changes, and spelling errors.” He also found the “train of thought” difficult to follow and concluded, “I missed the point of this paper.” Finally, one respondent wrote, “This paper appears to have been written by two people, one of whom is not proficient in writing in English.” She cited incomplete sentences, poorly integrated quotations, and “several grammar and usage errors,” as well.

**Social Sciences**

One Social Science reader awarded this essay a rating of highly proficient because the writer made a point and continually worked to support it. She considered the writing skills “pretty good,” although she did find several “problem areas”: grammatical errors, carelessness, student’s lack of pride in his or her work, and taking too long to state the thesis. In addition, this reader found it confusing to start a research paper with biography: “Important points of an author’s life as they influenced the work should be included in the body of the paper.”

Of the three readers who rated the essay nonproficient, one did so on the basis of its being incomplete: “A fairly good paper A- to B+ that just ends.” A second discussed “too many quotes and not enough content, poor referencing, spelling errors, misplaced verbs, and nonsense phrases.” The third reader stated that the paper was difficult to read, contained far too many errors to be considered proficient, and lacked a references page. She added: “The content of his paper did support his thesis; however, it appears the writer
pulled sentences or passages from the sources and put them together as paragraphs. The writer used little of his/her own composition.”

**Humanities**

One Humanities faculty rated this essay proficient. The remaining five thought it was nonproficient. The proficient rating was assigned on the basis of the paper seeming fairly good “superficially,” but the reader found that “on closer examination, it lacks the conclusion and analysis promised in the outline.” In addition, the reader noticed “poor control of tenses and agreement.” The reader concluded, “It seems mostly an undocumented fusing together of quotes from criticism and from too wide a variety of Cooper’s works. It is a low pass.”

One of the other five respondents brought up “seriously flawed mechanics, to the point of damaging communication,” and a thesis “buried” in the essay, although he found a solid outline, fair development, and good examples. Another faulted the essay for its lack of documentation and its incoherence. A third found the essay “rather confusing and unclear in structure and content.” She also mentioned incorrect in-text citations and a variety of errors: “possessives, verb shifts, spelling, fragments, and sentence structure.”

The fourth reader assigned a nonproficient rating because of the lack of bibliography, inadequate in-text citations, and “poor use of language, grammar, form, etc.” A fifth reader found “garbled sentences, terrible coordination and balance.” This reader originally assigned a proficient rating because she thought the student made some effort at setting a thesis, giving support, and putting ideas in order. She changed the rating to nonproficient, however, “after realizing Works Cited and the conclusion were missing and that the thesis and outline are probably not the student’s own.”
Racism in England

The World Book Dictionary defines racism as “1. the belief that a particular race, especially one’s own, is superior to other races; 2. discrimination or prejudice based on this belief; 3. a political or social policy or system against a race or races based on this belief.” That is exactly what is going on in England right now. “Foreigners,” as all non-whites and/or immigrants are often referred to by the majority of the British/English, basically have little or no chance of gaining social equality, and a very difficult time even acquiring social tolerance.

Since around the late 1950’s immigrants have been arriving in England from all around, including such places as the West Indies, Pakistan, India, and Turkey (Almond Powell 140). These people come to England for many different reasons but are usually attracted by English jobs. Immigrants come looking for and acquire work, housing, and education for their children. This causes much resentment among the English when their “own” people can’t seem to do the same. English community activist Rita Bensley says, referring to municipal officials allegedly favoring immigrants in awarding housing, “They’ll rehouse everyone else, but it’s very difficult to find housing for the sons and daughters of local people” (Quoted in Phillips 38).

And Miss Bensley is certainly not alone in these negative opinions. More and more of this widespread resentment is leading to violent releases of frustration and anger. Statistics show that just between 1989 and 1992 the number of racially motivated attacks on immigrants in Britain doubled to an estimated 8,000 occurrences (Phillips 38). Homes of immigrants have been fire-bombed (Kureishi 29), bricks have been regularly thrown through windows of immigrant homes and businesses (Platt 19), as well as vicious riots and physical attacks on non-whites taking place (Phillips 38). Even when matters aren’t quite that severe there are still day-to-day social tensions that are eventually vented at the expense of the foreigners. Hanif Kureishi, a Pakistani immigrant, tells us, “I took my washings to a launderette and gave it to the attendant, only to be told she didn’t touch the clothes of foreigners; she didn’t want me anywhere near her launderette” (Kureishi 29). Another immigrant in England was quoted as saying, “Liverpool is a very racist city….you think twice before you go to the all-white areas of the North End. Racism? It means shopkeepers don’t even place the change in your hand, but throw it down on the counter” (Quoted in Seabrook 16). Toahod Ali, an Asian immigrant, was offered housing at a 1,000 flat Stepney estate, but when he went to look at the flat, he was approached by a man who told him, “Fuck off—we don’t want Pakis here,” so he turned down the apartment (Platt 19). The same trend seems true throughout most all of England. One section of England called the Isle of Dogs, for example, is now over twenty percent non-white, and few
people there deny that extreme racism is dominant. Non-whites there are often taunted, mistreated, and even spat at in the streets (Phillips 38). Helen Menezes, a half-Indian resident and community organizer of the Isle of Dogs, say, “Racism isn’t hidden here….If a person here is racist, he’s quite likely to tell you so” (Quoted in Phillips 38). Rita Bensley, also an Isle of Dog resident, said in justification of these actions, “People are fed up with being kicked around….It’s their way of saying enough is enough” (Quoted in Phillips 38).

But is violence really the solution to the problem? Are the immigrants even the real problem? No. One Pakistani immigrant noted how interesting it was to see the British working class using the same contemptible vocabulary and actions towards the immigrants that they themselves were receiving from the British middle class. It seems that racism goes “hand in hand with inequality” (Kureishi 28). Even the present Queen of England is not truly English, but descended from German royalty, who came to England from Hanover in 1714 to assume the throne in succession to the Stuarts of Scotland. The surname of the royal family remained Saxe-Coburg-Botha up until the outbreak of anti-German sentiment during World War I. It was then in 1917 that King George V changed the family name by royal proclamation to Windsor (Almond and Powell 140), no-doubt to avoid the “embarrassment” of being so closely associated with foreign blood. I do believe that is the pot calling the kettle black.

Nevertheless, feelings of racism and resentment and the public display of these feelings is definitely on the rise in England. Just in 1993 an avowed racist and neo-Nazi beat the mainstream parties for the first time ever and won a seat on the municipal council. 47-year-old Derek Beackon, the neo-Nazi winner of the byelection and head of the very small British National Party, won a solid and uncompromising platform of “Rights for Whites” (Phillips 38). This platform focused on restoring capital punishment, outlawing homosexuality, and above all forcibly deporting all non-whites from England. Beackon himself openly declared, “I am a racist….I prefer to live with my own people” (Phillips 38).

Unfortunately, things are not much better from a legal standpoint, either. Of course there have been anti-discrimination laws passed, but what good does it really amount to if these “laws” are to be enforced by racist police officers?! As of 1993, only 1.5 percent of the English police force was made up of minorities, which is much less than the six percent those minorities make up of the total population (The Economist 78). Even the government-appointed Chief Inspector of Constabulary, Trefor Morris, personally complained of “unacceptable levels of prejudice” in the police (The Economist 78). These factors, along with the fact that there is no British Bill of Rights to adequately protect all citizens, leave England’s oppressed immigrants in a rather oblique situation.

It has been often said that, “love is instinct; hate must be taught.” If this is true then there is hope for peace among the races in England, as
well as the world entire, but it must start with the hearts of the people. Until people really want peace, there will be none. Only when we follow the basic human truths and put away the malice in ourselves will things begin to get better. And only when we teach our children to do the same, so that they teach their children to do the same, will the hatred and prejudice fade away. Then we will do better things, as better people, with many many more friends to boot.

Works Cited

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>A-</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NATURAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOCIAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HUMANITIES – TOTAL READERS: 6

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SUMMARY OF RESPONSES
Natural Sciences
Three Natural Science readers rated “Racism in England” highly proficient. One praised the thesis, which was “presented in such an interesting manner.” She went on to mention the “substantive generalizations” and “great documentation.” She called the level of diction “eloquent” and concluded that this essay was “a pleasure to read.” A second reader stated that the paper was “generally well written with few errors.” The third respondent found evidence of “good logical gathering of thoughts,” few grammatical mistakes and “no spelling errors (that I found).”

The fourth reader rated the essay proficient and stated simply, “good use of sources.”

**Social Sciences**

All the Social Science readers gave this essay a highly proficient rating. They found it clearly written, well researched, well documented, well organized, fairly thoughtful, interesting, to the point, and well edited. Minor problems included paragraphing problems, inclusion of writer’s feelings (facts should speak for themselves), and a few minor errors.

**Humanities**

Three Humanities faculty rated “Racism in England” highly proficient, and three thought it proficient. The highly proficient rating was due to a clear thesis and excellent support, solid structure, and mechanical proficiency. One of the readers wrote, “After reading the previous essay, I was pleased to read this one.” Another praised the “lean language, logical argument, well-documented research, appropriate voice, and compact summary.”

One of the three who found the essay proficient had difficulty locating a thesis statement and thought better transitions and “a slightly better vocabulary” could be used.
He wrote, “This piece is fine for a general college audience and addresses a current problem with appropriate quotes and evidence.” Another reader was more critical, questioning the difference between social equality and social tolerance. The biggest problem for this reader was lack of depth. He said the essay was mostly “a string of examples.” Mechanically, the paper passed, for this reader, but the content was too shallow. The third reader who rated the essay proficient liked the author’s use of sources.

CALIBRATION ESSAY #6 (Essay 153 of Sample)

Effect of Television on Young Children

Eleven year-old boy shoots and kills younger brother after watching Ninja Turtle series on television.

This is the type of report that we frequently read and hear about in the media. Children should not be exposed to excessive television because it creates a tendency toward violence.

Overexposure to television promotes violence among children. Children are very malleable, especially young children who are easily influenced by what they see and hear. The constant repetition of violence seen on television causes them to become immune to pain. Unfortunately the child’s eyes lights up with excitement as he imitates his favorite cartoon character’s act of violence. Mom’s eyes light up in disbelief as she comes in unannounced and finds him, standing on top the chest of drawers, dressed in his Batman cape attempting to fly. Children find it difficult to differentiate between what is real and what is make-believe.

The child sees the cartoon characters fight with swords, and they come out unharmed, so it just seems logical that they would want to fight with swords, too. They see toy guns being used and they too want a toy gun. What the child does not realize is that these cartoon characters are only make-believe and that is why it doesn’t hurt them to bleed. They become very comfortable with the sight of blood, and that can pose a real danger.

Long hours in front of the television are also damaging to children’s health, and it deprives them of much needed exercise and education. The various junk food commercials encourage the children to grab a bag of potato chips and munch down, often resulting in the child becoming an overweight couch potato. Too much television may also take up much needed study time, ultimately resulting in the child’s developing poor study skills. Above are but two of the reasons why television is not the ideal baby sitter.
The opposing side would say television is good therapy for the youngster but it depends on whether or not the television program is being monitored by an adult. Well rounded television can be both entertaining and educational for the child, when its programming is closely monitored by an adult. On the other hand, cable television, left in the hands of an eight-year-old, is dangerous. Parents may leave them unattended for five minutes and come back to find them watching a rated R-movie.

Once again, children are so vulnerable, they need Mom and Dad to help shape and mold them. Because the first few years of the child’s life are the most impressionable ones, it is extremely important that we adults set good examples for them to follow. Limited time of well-monitored television can be beneficial to the child, providing there are no potato chips in front of the television, no rated R-movies and no violent cartoons for them to watch.

### SUMMARY OF RESPONSES

**Natural Sciences**

One of the respondents rated “Effect of Television on Young Children” a high pass. His reasons were the writer’s ability to gather thoughts, few grammatical errors, and “noun/verb agreement.” A second reader gave the essay a proficient rating but added that the essay would receive a “low grade probably.” She found the presentation excellent and included “wording, sentence structure etc.” under presentation. A serious fault of the
essay was its lack of documentation. She wrote, “Doesn’t look like it took much time to construct—no research but good ideas.”

Two of the readers found this sample nonproficient, one solely on the basis of its lack of sources. She added that it was well organized and contained good examples. The final reader found the thesis adequate; in fact, she agreed with the thesis. However, the writer did not develop the thesis adequately. She wrote, “The paper was lacking in substantive, documented support but sentence structure, grammar, and spelling were good.”

**Social Sciences**

Two Social Science readers rated this essay highly proficient and two proficient. One who gave it the top rating stated that she did not agree with all the arguments but found them well stated. In addition, she found gender problems and verb agreement problems. The second reader wrote that the essay was well written, well organized, and the points were well stated. She added: “The writer’s position is erroneous as sociological studies don’t support this position but I assume support was not part of this assignment.”

The two readers who found the essay proficient cited the student’s satisfactory job of analysis, successful inclusion of examples, a short and straightforward introduction, and an adequate conclusion. Faults included a few comma errors and no use of research.

**Humanities**

Two Humanities faculty found the essay highly proficient, two proficient, and two nonproficient. The essay received highly proficient ratings for a variety of reasons, among them a strong argument, good thesis, good organization, consistent voice, appropriate tone, and “almost clean” mechanics. Those who found the essay proficient
thought the writing was clear, and the support was good, "if not extensively developed." Also, the opposing side was refuted; the essay had the structure of an argumentative essay and few errors.

Nonproficient ratings were assigned on the basis of no thesis statement, no transitions, no sources to back up claims, and a poor conclusion. One of the readers wrote, "The arguments appear weak at best and there is no thoughtfulness to the piece in terms of posing questions, probing, etc."

CALIBRATION ESSAY #7 (Essay 020 of Sample)

Criminal Behavior Can Be Traced to the Criminal's Childhood

Many children in America are in serious trouble. The economy has forced both parents to work. Many parents draw only minimum wage. Day Care cost prohibit proper child care. Many American children are raising themselves, and their younger siblings. Our children are on the streets. Some children are in serious trouble. Many children are hungry, cold without proper clothing, or guidance. Many parents have no idea where their children are. Some parents are unable to be parents. Children are being ignored. Children at risk must be rescued. Money must be spent to properly nurture our children. A safe childhood should be the right of all children. Parents should be a positive image, trying to raise their children properly. We must spend time with our children, teaching them right from wrong. Some parents feel that all they must do is work hard to be good parents. Children must have parents who are good role models. Honesty, Integrity and Love are important in raising children. Parents who work long hours but fail to spend time with their children risk problems. Our children need our attention every day. Parents should be involved in their child's school, church, friends.

When your child has problems the whole family should come together to work it out. Finding money to build new prisons dominates the news. We must find money to help parents raise their children, before these children turn into criminals. If our children are raised properly, we may not need to keep building prisons. Faith, prayer, and love must be abundant in raising your children.

Many parents seem to want their children to be seen and not heard. Children have problems and need adult help to solve them. Parents must know where their children are at all times. Children should be given rules and guidelines. Our children should not be expected to raise themselves.
Nancy R. Gibbs writes about Yummy Sandifer age eleven. Yummy was killed by his own gang. Yummy killed a girl just to be accepted by his gang but with the heat on, the gang killed yummy. This child had no hope when he was born. Welfare Workers had little hope for his mother Lorina as a parent. Lorina Sanders was not able to meet her own needs, let alone meet the needs of her children. Lorina would continue having children she could not care for. Yummys mother stated that he always blamed her for his problems. Yummy finally went to live with his Grand Mother, who was not much more promising. Yummys life from birth to death by murder at age eleven was trouble. We must wonder what went wrong with our system.

Our court system believes that children should be with their families. There are Children who have families whom they should not be exposed to, and they should never be made to live with a dysfunctional parent. Phillip Clareke writes that children under the age of eighteen are fast entering the violent criminal class. Records show that between 1987 and 1991 they increased fifty percent. That’s twice as fast as the arrest rate of those over eighteen. Research tells us that childhood abuse, mental and physical figures highly in these grim statistics. Parents must begin to use proper parenting skills. Deborah Yetter writes of Aquan Nebletts childhood. Neblett and the other children in his house would huddle together to stay warm because no one had paid the utility bill and there was no heat. Neblett would hustle two or three dollars to go buy food at the gas station, which he would share with the other children. Neblett did this because there was no food and no adult around to provide any. Neblett remembers the violence of his neighborhood, on the street-shootings, stabbings and fights, at home-beatings dealt out as “discipline.” Neblett now seventeen, remembers murdering a cab driver in 1993. Neblett was born to a dysfunctional family, his mother admitted to putting beer in his baby bottle to calm him down. Around the age of seven Neblett forced to undress and his father beat him with an exention cord when he was unruly. Neblett had no supervision as a boy and at the age of eight began supervising his five year old brother. At the age of eight or nine Neblett would rob stores break into houses and assault people. Neblett and his gang would throw bricks from overpasses at car windshields for entertainment. Neblett bought his first gun at age eleven. Neblett sold drugs to buy food and clothing for himself and his brother. Nebletts mother confirmed his beer and drug use and said “he was fun to be with when he was high.” Neblett sends this advice to parents: “You can’t have a baby and expect him to survive on his own.” He said. “I was able to do that, but look where it got me.”

Parents have a great responsibility raising their children. It should be their primary goal in life to be good parents. Children deserve the best they can get. Paul Mones writes of abused children who kill their parents. Research shows that many children have the battered child syndrome, characterized as a clinical condition in your children who have received
serious abuse from a parent or a foster parent. This condition has been described as unrecognized by radiologist, orthopedist, pediatricians and social worker. This condition is a significant cause of childhood disability and death. Unfortunately, it is frequently not recognized or, if diagnosed, is inadequately handled by the physician because of hesitation to bring the case to the proper authorities.

A report in the New York Times September 1989, shows how children are being raised and how the laws of the land can do little about the mistreatment of some children. An article from Muskogee Oklahoma (AP) reads that the grandparents of a four-year-old boy have been keeping the child in a caged pen during the day outside their motor home. The child had no toilet and only a bottle of water. The grandparents stated they built the pen to keep the child from roaming out onto the nearby highway. The grandparents face a misdemeanor charge, if they are convicted they could serve a year in jail or a five-hundred-dollar fine. The prosecutor said it was the only charge available. Child abuse statutes require an injury or maiming of the child. Parents cannot condone children being left in a cage. Our children are our most important asset. Tonia K. Shamoo and Philip G. Patros, write on parenting skills being highly complex and totally confusing. Being a parent is one of the toughest jobs and the most important job in the world today. The job requires patience, wisdom, diplomacy, and love. Most people become parents without any training and no special skills, small wonder so many fail miserable. Parenting seems to be a trial and error approach. Parents don’t know where to turn for help with raising their children and the sad fact is many care less. Parents will argue that they can care for their children. Some parents feel you just beat them into submission and they will be good children. Society today will not tolerate parents who beat their children. Children need all the advocates they can muster. It is hard to be a child today. The peer pressure is great and if a parent raises a child to adulthood without major problems he has done a good job. Parents certainly need a religious belief to help them with the problems involved with child rearing. Children will test your patience at every turn and you must remain strong. Always show your child your best face because he will mold as the person you are.

Parents in America we must wake up. Our children’s future is in our hands. We must raise our children properly. Criminal behavior can be traced to the criminal’s childhood. We must seek laws that will take children out of abusive homes. Our schools should try to teach parenting skills. Society must assist in determining children at risk. Parents should be helped if possible to learn proper parenting skills. If parents cannot or refuse to be proper parents then the children should be removed to a safe situation. The children should be cared for given what they need to thrive, taught right from wrong. Perhaps adoptive parents could be found. Certainly, all children love their real parents but if they do more harm than good than children should not be left to be abused by parents who will not
care for them. Some parents actually encourage their children to commit crime. Some parents don’t know right from wrong and couldn’t be good parents if they tried. Children deserve the right to grow into responsible adults but the fact remains that they can’t raise themselves. Legislation must be passed to protect our children from parents who fail their children. We can’t continue to allow our children to get into serious trouble because their parents don’t care enough to try to raise them right. We must find money for child care for the family that can’t afford proper care while the parents work. Children can’t be left on their own to run the streets while their parents attempt to provide the necessities of life. The money the Government will spend for the purchase of day care will surely be less than it would spend to continue to build new prisons. Hopefully if our children are raised properly they won’t end up in prison.

NATURAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

SOCIAL SCIENCE READERS – TOTAL READERS: 4

HUMANITIES – TOTAL READERS: 6

SUMMARY OF RESPONSES

Natural Sciences

Two readers found the essay on criminal behavior proficient, although one of the two indicated that it would receive a “very low” passing grade. They cited the paper’s “good” thesis, clear ideas, and the fact that the author got the point across “but awkwardly.” One of the two found “lots of potential” and stated that the paper was “interesting too!” On the other hand, there were grammatical errors, spelling errors, and choppy sentences. One
respondent wrote, “Commas are a mystery to this writer... barely proficient, difficult to decide.”

One of the two who labeled the essay nonproficient said that there was no documentation, “can’t pass 102 without that skill.” The other wrote, “The paper seems to be a series of opinion statements divided arbitrarily into paragraphs interspersed from time to time with illustrations from reference materials.” In addition to “many punctuation, grammar and spelling errors,” she lamented the writer’s inability to organize thoughts in a “logical, cohesive manner.”

Social Sciences

One of the Social Science readers assigned this essay a highly proficient rating, one gave it a proficient rating, and two found it nonproficient. The reader who gave it a highly proficient rating said it would earn a B- to B+ if he were to assign a letter grade. He thought the writer made good use of research and suggested a rewrite to clear up problems with “choppy organization,” ideas broken up by personal opinions. The reader who assigned the essay a proficient rating found the ideas presented logically, “even if I don’t agree with some statements” and listed problems with possessives, commas, paragraphing, and editing.

One of the two readers who rated the essay nonproficient said that the content was weak, the paper lacked transitions, and included run-on sentences and numerous mechanical errors—spelling, capitalization, punctuation. The fourth reader found the grammatical part fine and the student’s point focused. However, “assuming this is a research paper, it is problematic.” She discussed improper footnoting and the student’s
inappropriate use of opinion. She said the essay needed more statistical support, although such material may not have been available to the student.

**Humanities**

Four of six Humanities readers thought this essay was nonproficient, while two rated it proficient. One reader assigned a nonproficient rating solely on the basis of a lack of documentation. One found no thesis statement, while two others saw a thesis but thought the writer failed to support the thesis. One reader noted, “In one place the author says there were no parents to feed them. Yet, in the next paragraph there is discussion of parents.” “Little analysis and interpretation” were mentioned; the essay was “basically a string of anecdotes.” All four readers brought up mechanical and grammar problems.

Of the two who rated the essay proficient, both said it was only marginally so. One called the writing “wordy, ungraceful, abrupt,” noted the weak grammar, weak logic, poor supporting ideas, but found good details and “decent” sentence and paragraph structure. The second reader also praised the detail but questioned the lack of a single citation. In addition, he wrote, “Topics are mixed in long chunks of paragraphs containing series of aphorisms for which there are no warrants.” He concluded, “This is more litany than argument, but it is marginally proficient.”

**Conclusions**

**Natural Sciences**

Analysis of the calibration essay ratings reveals considerable consistency in evaluation criteria and judgments among the Natural Science faculty. For example, there was universal agreement that calibration essay number four, the research paper on James Fenimore Cooper, was nonproficient. In addition, the Natural Science respondents
reached considerable agreement on calibration essays one, three, and five with three of four respondents assigning the same ratings. Three faculty assigned a nonproficient rating to number one, and even the respondent who found the essay proficient added that it was a “low” pass. To the third essay, three faculty assigned a proficient rating, although one of the three added that it was “very low,” and one assigned a nonproficient rating. Likewise three faculty assigned a highly proficient rating to number five, and one assigned a proficient rating, solely on the basis of its “good use of sources.” Clearly, there was a predominant reading for Essays One, Three, and Five.

There was agreement between two of the four readers on the remaining essays: number two, number six, and number seven. To number two, half of the group assigned a rating of nonproficient, one a proficient rating, and one highly proficient. For number six, the same ratings were assigned. Finally, two found number seven nonproficient and two proficient, but there was universal agreement that this essay was not highly proficient.

Although the respondents from the Natural Sciences numbered only four, these data indicate agreement in each case with two or more of the respondents assigning a particular rating. Possible grade inflation is present in four cases: Essays One, Two, Three, and Five. In each case, the respondents’ ratings were considerably lower than teachers’ grades.

The respondents’ written responses show that Natural Science faculty did return to their freewriting definitions of proficiency. As far as the global characteristics located in Chapter One, Natural Science faculty consistently mentioned grammar in assigning ratings. Unlike the freewritings suggest, however, these readers demonstrated considerable knowledge of grammatical terms as they explained their ratings. For
example, they mentioned run-on sentences, sentence fragments, singular subjects and plural verbs, and tense inconsistencies. These specific “grammar and usage errors” they used to support HP, NP, and P ratings. That is, a student’s ability to write complete sentences was included as support for assigning a proficient or highly proficient rating, while the student’s sentence fragments might support a nonproficient rating. All four Natural Science faculty mentioned the term grammar in their freewritings, and the term appeared consistently throughout the faculty’s discussions of ratings.

In contrast, other global characteristics never appeared. Purpose, for example, and audience never appeared. However, style appeared several times, as well as tone and diction. Other Key Proficiency Indicators common to the freewritings of the Natural Sciences were logic, research, and context. The first surfaced in their responses to five of the seven calibration essays. Research, or the lack of it, figured as a factor in the evaluations of all seven calibration essays. However, context, like audience and purpose, was never mentioned.

Additional characteristics of proficient writing that appeared in the respondents’ written responses but not in the freewritings were the following: thesis and support, substantive generalizations, subjectivity and objectivity, and sentence structure. Two final indicators, organization and spelling, initially appeared in the freewriting of only one Natural Science respondent, but appeared consistently in the faculty’s written evaluations of calibration essays.

**Social Sciences**

Among the Social Science faculty, there was universal agreement that Essay Five, “Racism in England,” is highly proficient and partial agreement in only one additional
case, with a predominant rating of nonproficient for Essay Four, “Race Relation (sic) in
the Leather-Stocking Novels.” In all other cases, the respondents were split, with two
either assigning a NP or HP (Essay #1), P or NP (Essays #2 and 3), HP or P (Essay #6),
and 1 HP, 1 P, and, 2 NP (Essay #7). Surprisingly, despite lack of consensus among
respondents for five of the seven essays, they concurred with teachers’ ratings in exactly
the same number of cases, with possible grade inflation indicated in the case of Essays
Two and Three.

Like the Natural Science faculty, those in the Social Sciences consistently brought up
terms mentioned in their freewriting as they provided written reasons for assigning
ratings. All four respondents brought up style and grammar in their freewritings, and,
indeed, returned to these terms in their essay evaluations. Purpose, audience, content,
research and spelling were consistently mentioned, as well. Key Proficiency Indicators
listed in Chapter One that no Social Science faculty mentioned in their freewritings are
punctuation, organization, and sentence structure. These were mentioned consistently,
however, in their written responses to the calibration essays. New terms we might add to
our list from Chapter One include thesis statement, substantive generalizations, and run-
on sentences. Other matters to consider include whether personal experiences and
opinions are appropriate in research papers, whether “re-writes” should be allowed, and
whether spelling, capitalization, and punctuation are “mechanical errors” or “grammer”
[sic] errors.

**Humanities**

Although universal agreement appears nowhere in the responses of the Humanities
respondents, there is a predominant reading in four of seven cases: four respondents rated
Essay Two and Seven nonproficient and Essay Three proficient. Five of six readers found Essay Four nonproficient, also. The respondents reached little consensus with the teachers, however. In only two cases are there agreement between readers and teachers: Essay Four, the one about James Fenimore Cooper, and Essay Seven, the one about childhood and criminal behavior. In both cases, readers and teachers found the essays nonproficient. Possible grade inflation appears in three instances: Essays One, Two and Three. In all cases, respondents’ ratings were considerably lower than teachers’ grades.

The Humanities faculty consistently returned to their freewriting descriptions and definitions in providing written reasons for assigning ratings. However, their responses to calibration essays indicate a far broader vocabulary than either the Natural or Social Sciences. In Chapter One, I located five Key Proficiency Indicators that three or more Humanities faculty mentioned in their freewritings: style, purpose, audience, context, and punctuation. Additional terms located in their written responses to calibration essays include the following: thesis statement, clarification of terms, attribution, objectivity, logic, transitions, voice, tone, paraphrase, summary, subject/verb problems, misuse of the apostrophe, comma splice, wordiness, brainstorming, freewriting, coordination and balance, lean language, depth, clean mechanics, claims, warrants, analysis, interpretation, and aphorisms.

**Final Thoughts**

In 1994, Tom Blues reported that thirty University of Kentucky faculty from across the curriculum had reached “substantial agreement” in rating and responding to a sample of end-of-semester ENG 102 papers (3). Specifically, Blues found a “predominant reading” for each of seven calibration essays in his random sample. I now make a similar
claim among fourteen community-college faculty. A year after Blues’ study appeared, JCC faculty representing three disciplines reached “substantial agreement” in rating a random sample of essays from ENG 102 classes. Specifically, our faculty reached a “predominant reading” for six of seven calibration essays. The only anomaly was Essay Six, for which no predominant reading occurred. In fact, the ratings were split three ways, with five faculty rating the essay (“Racism in England”) highly proficient, five rating it proficient, and four finding it nonproficient. Perhaps closer analysis of this essay and the respondents’ ratings would reveal why our faculty were not as substantially in agreement as the UK faculty, who reached a clear consensus in all seven cases. A detailed analysis such as this would entail is better left to a WAC workshop of the future. For now, I conclude by saying that community-college faculty are as capable of assigning and evaluating student writing as faculty at a four-year research institution. WAC initiatives in these areas should be continued. We should begin as we expect our students to begin, by clarifying terms.
CHAPTER THREE

Responding to Group-Specific Essays

"Where there are commonalties [sic] in experience, there are ways to communicate."

According to Huot and Yancey, triangulating data is one of the “grounding assumptions” of WAC program assessment. It provides the ability “to see a program through the lenses provided by different kinds of data, so that we understand it from multiple perspectives” (10). Although my respondents read the same seven calibration essays, an additional eleven essays were read by interdisciplinary faculty I had divided into five reading groups (see Figure 3). I included the additional 55 essays to triangulate my data, to see them from different perspectives. I wondered, “Would an interdisciplinary group of readers reach a consensus in assigning ratings, on the strengths or weaknesses of a particular essay? Would a particular respondent consistently rate essays higher or lower than the other respondents in his or her group? Blues had successfully collected responses from representatives of 20 “disciplines or fields”; however, I faced difficulties including one member of the Social Sciences, one member of the Natural Sciences, and one member of the Humanities in each group, especially when several last-minute cancellations occurred. I arranged the respondents in groups, nonetheless, so that I might obtain a representative sample of community-college disciplines and perspectives.
The five groups of readers were the following: Group One—a Humanities Division Chair and member of the Philosophy Program, a member of the Psychology Program, and a member of the Elementary Education Program (whose responses I never received); Group Two—a member of the Communications Program, a member of the English Program, and a respondent from Allied Health; Group Three—a member of the English Program, the Coordinator of our Institute of Banking Program representing the Business Program, and a respondent from the Physical Therapist’s Assistant Program; Group Four—a sociologist who runs our Prison Program, a member of the Reading and Study Skills Program, and an English teacher who had become the Allied Health Division Chair; Group Five—a member of Allied Health, an English teacher, and the Coordinator of the Education Transfer Program. There might not be anything particularly distinct about the perspectives of each group, since I was working with only those faculty who had agreed to participate in the study, including several last-minute replacements.

Nonetheless, I divided the fourteen respondents into interdisciplinary groups in order to locate as many different perspectives as possible on a single essay. For example, Group Two and Group Three contained only one member of the English Program. I tried to include one member of the Natural Sciences and one from the Social Sciences, as well. It is important to note that, although respondents were divided into reading groups, no discussion occurred among group members. They were not aware of who in the workshop shared their eleven group-specific essays. Thus, like Blues, I ensured that any common ratings and responses were uninfluenced by other group members.

**READING GROUPS AND GROUP-SPECIFIC ESSAYS**

**Group One**—Philosophy and Psychology
**Essays Titles**

044 "The Reflections of *The Scarlet Letter*
249 "Time for Juvenile Justice to Grow Up"
137 No Title
096 No Title
204 "Victims of Reform"
071 "To Some Rap Music Causes Some Teens Be Violent"
185 "Tobacco Companies-----Liable or Not?"
004 "Children Who Kill"
125 "Research-Final Draft"
012 "MATER AND A NEW WAY OF SEEING"
106 "Monet’s Illuminating Art Series"

**Group Two—Allied Health, English, and Communications**

**Essays Titles**

202 "Passive Smoke: The Debate"
128 "Research Paper"
187 "Smoking in Public Places"
083 "Can We Tell Them What to Say?"
008 "Moderation and Mythology"
132 "WOMEN and MEN: how they communicate in the job workplace"
110 "Picasso and Cubism"
183 "Should Condoms Be Distributed in Schools?"
232 "THE TURN OF THE SCREW: A Book Review"
099 No Title
063 No Title

**Group Three—Physical Therapy, Business, English**

**Essays Titles**

129 "Research Final Draft"
228 No Title
217 "Looking at a Hero"
100 "Monet: The True Impressionist"
028 "Nathaniel Hawthorne: The Scarlet Letter’s Scaffolds"
156 "The New Welfare System"
043 "The Leatherstocking Tales: A Mixing of the Races"
262 "Gun Control"
021 "Choose ‘Janus’"
097 No Title
219 "Shoeless Joe Jackson"
Figure 3. Reading Groups and Group-Specific Essays

Each section of data for this chapter includes, first, a breakdown of ratings for the eleven group-specific essays presented in a chart. Following the chart, I include the essays the readers evaluated. Following each essay, I present the comments each group member included to support his or her rating. As I reported in the first chapter, the only prompts I gave respondents were the English Department syllabi for English 101 and 102. In order to encourage them to rely on their own definitions of writing proficiency, I
offered no additional information on what to look for in calibration or group-specific essays. As far as they knew, each respondent had a completely different set of essays.

**Group-Specific Responses from Group One**

The first group of respondents was the philosopher, the psychologist, and the faculty member from the Early Childhood Education Program, whose file was never returned. Therefore, I report only two sets of responses for this group.

**Group One Results**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essay Number</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>044</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>249</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>137</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>B-</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>096</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>204</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>A-</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>071</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>E</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>185</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>004</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>125</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>012</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>106</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4. Group One Ratings

Clearly, the readers agree in three of the eleven cases (096, 071, and 106). Further, the readers and the teachers agree in all three cases, whether the essay was rated a high pass (equal to a teacher’s grade of A or B) or nonproficient (equal to a teacher’s grade of D or E). The readers and teachers partially agree the rest of the time, rating 044, a B paper, a high pass and a pass; 137, which received a B-, they assign a pass and a nonproficient rating. The readers maintain this pattern consistently for the rest of the essays, generally agreeing with instructors’ grades as well. There is questionable consensus in two cases,
one might argue, in that one reader assigned an NP to essay 137 and the paper received a grade of B-. Also, essay 004 received one NP, and the teacher awarded it a C.

**Group One Essays and Comments**

**Group-Specific Essay #1 (Essay 044 of Sample)**

**The Reflections of The Scarlet Letter**

Outline

Thesis: The reflections in mirrors in *The Scarlet Letter* serve an important purpose: To reveal what is hidden within.

I. Nathaniel Hawthorne
   A. Use of symbolism
   B. Concern with human soul
   C. What reflections reveal

II. Reflections: The Scarlet Letter
   A. Hester Prynne
      1. First reflection
         a. Superficial
         b. Inner truth
      2. Second reflection
         a. Superficial
         b. Inner truth
      3. Third reflection
         a. Superficial
         b. Inner truth
      4. Fourth reflection
         a. Superficial
         b. Inner truth
   B. Arthur Dimmesdale
      1. First reflection
         a. Superficial
         b. Inner truth
      2. Second reflection
         a. Superficial
         b. Inner truth
   C. Roger Chillingworth's reflection
      1. Superficial
      2. Inner truth
   D. Pearl
      1. First Reflection
         a. Superficial
         b. Inner truth
      2. Second Reflection
         a. Superficial
b. Inner truth
3. Third reflection
   a. Superficial
   b. Inner truth
4. Fourth Reflection
   a. Superficial
   b. Inner truth

III. Hawthorne’s revealing reflections
   A. True feelings
      1. Hester
      2. Dimmesdale
      3. Chillingworth
      4. Pearl
   B. Why The Scarlet Letter is still significant

A famous nineteenth century American novelist, Nathaniel Hawthorne, was native to Salem, Massachusetts in 1804. He was of Puritan ancestry. Critics say he writes his stories with underlying messages using symbolism. The famous American critic, D.H. Lawrence says, in Studies in Classic American Literature, that American writers use symbolism, and Hawthorne uses it deviously. Lawrence also says, in Studies, “That blue-eyed darling Nathaniel knew disagreeable things in his inner soul. He was careful to send them out in disguise.” Supplementary, Robert Spiller, the famous American critic says, in Cycles of American Literature, “...he [Hawthorne] was an explorer of the dark recesses of the human soul, and he used his art to reveal rather than to resolve the dilemma of human destiny.” Because of his evil ancestors, like his father, who burned Indian villages during King Phillip’s war. Next, his grandfather, who whipped Quakers through the streets of Salem. Finally, his great-grandfather, who was the only non-repenting judge of the Salem witch trials. It can be said that Hawthorne’s obsession is due to his ancestors. Therefore, it is not surprising that Hawthorne is concerned with the human soul. Malcolm Cowley, in his article “Hawthorne in the Looking-glass,” says that Hawthorne’s mirror images can be viewed not only in relation to their sources, Hawthorne himself, but they serve a function in his stories. Due to his concern with what is hidden within people and his devious use of symbolism, it is not surprising that the reflections in the mirrors in The Scarlet Letter serve an important purpose: To reveal what is hidden within. Hester Prynne’s reflections reveal what is hidden within her. On the “scaffold of the pillory” she sees her first reflection:

She saw her own face, glowing with girlish beauty, and illuminating all the interior of the dusky mirror in which she had been wont to gaze at it. There she beheld another countenance, of a man well stricken in years, a pale, thin, scholar-like visage, with eyes dim and blearied by the lamp-light that had served them to pore over many ponderous books.
On the surface she sees her own face, gleaming with youthfulness. The inner truth of her reflection is that she is seeing the well respected Puritan minister, Arthur Dimmesdale. Her second reflection come from her daughter’s, Pearl, eyes.

Once, this freakish, elfish cast came into the child’s eye’s, while Hester was looking at her own image in them, as mothers are fond of doing; and, suddenly--for women in solitude, and with troubled hearts, are pestered with unaccountable delusions--she fancied that she beheld, not her own miniature portrait, but another face in the small black mirror of Pearl’s eye. It was a face, fiend-like, full of smiling malice, yet bearing the semblance of features that she had known full well, though seldom with a smile, and never with malice, in them. (97)

As mothers enjoy doing things such looking in their daughters eyes to see their own reflection, Hester does too. On the surface of her little Pearl’s she merely sees her own reflections. The inner truth is that she show evil in Pearl and mischief. She felt as if “an evil spirit possessed the child” (97). Next, Hester is keeping her daughter in high spirits by looking into the armour in the hallway of the Governor’s Hall. She sees a reflection in the armour:

Mother, cried she, I see you here. Look! Look! Hester looked, by way of humoring the child; and she saw that, owing to the particular effect of this convex mirror, the scarlet letter was represented in exaggerated anf gigantic proportions, so as to be greatly the most prominent features of her appearance. In truth, he seemed absolutely hidden behind it. Pearl pointed upward, also, at similar picture in the headpiece; smiling at her mother, with the elfish intelligence that was so familiar an expression on her small physiognomy. (107)

Superficially Hester saw an overwhelmingly large representation of the scarlet letter. The inner truth is that the scarlet letter has covered over Hester’s self-identity. Finally, Hester sees here ghostly reflection in the inter mist of “a glade forest”:

...but now stood coldly shuddering, in mutual dread; as not yet familiar with their state, nor wonted to the companionship of disembodied beings. Each a ghost, and awe-stricken at the other ghost! They were awe-stricken likewise at themselves; because the crisis flung back to them their consciousness, and revealing to each heart its history and experience, as life never does, except at such breathless epochs. The soul beheld its features in the mirror of the passing moment. It was with fear, and tremulously, and, as it were, by a slow, reluctant necessity, that Arthur Dimmesdale put forth his hand, chill as death, and touched the chill hand of Hester Prynne. The grasp, cold as it was, took away what was dreariest in the interview. They now felt themselves, at least, inhabitants of the same sphere.

88
On the surface Hester sees a loving mother and a women who is will to admit to her sins and suffer the consequences. On the other hand, her inner truth of the reflection is that her and Dimmesdale are alone and feel as if they are already dead. It shows death through the use of the word “disembodied being”, which means ghost, a sign of death. Clearly, Hester Prynne reveals what is hidden within her through her reflections.

Arthur Dimmesdale’s reflections reveal what is hidden within himself. His first reflection is “...viewing his own face in a loing-glass.” In this “looking-glass” he finds a well respected Puritan minister in his sight on the surface. Know he finds himself being “tortured” and not “purified”:

In these lengthened vigils, his brain often reeled, and visions seemed to flit before him; perhaps seen doubtfully, and by a faint light of their own, in the remote dimness of the chamber, or more vividly, and close beside him, within the looking-glass. Now it was a herd of diabolic shapes, that grinned and mocked at the pale minister, and beckoned him away with them; now a group of shining angels, who flew upward heavily, as sorrow-laden, but grew more ethereal as they rose. (150)

Being a well respected Puritan minister, it is hard for Dimmesdale to bring himself to admit to his sin. So, the inner truth of his reflection shows a hypocrite and everyone is now seeing the of his sin. Know that everyone sees him, they are slowly descending from his presences. At this point he starts to reveal the scarlet letter upon his own breast. Michael L. Lasser, in “Mirror Imagery in The Scarlet Letter”, says “Tortured not only by his but by his inability to confess, by hypocrisy, Dimmesdale often keeps private vigils before a mirror.”6 Followed by his “inability to confess” him and Hester are reflected in the forest, which was mentioned earlier in the reflection of Hester. Dimmesdale, on the surface is a regular hypocrite that feels alone in the world. The inner truth is that he is scared of himself to the point of death with Hester as his only way out. Clearly, Arthur Dimmesdale reveals what is hidden within himself through his reflections.

Roger Chillingworth reveals what is hidden within himself through his reflection. On the surface he is a elderly physician who is scared by what he thinks he sees in the glass. It is shown when Hawthorne says “The unfortunate physician, while uttering these words, lifted his hands with a look of horror, as if he had beheld some frightful shape, which he could not recognize, usurping the place of his own image in the glass” (179). The inner truth of his reflection in the glass shows some kind of beast within him that is evil and horrid. According to Michael L. Lasser, in “Mirror Imagery in The Scarlet Letter”, “Chillingworth is boasting with an evil passion...” This is a view in which he had never been confronted with before and it terrified him. Clearly, Chillingworth’s reflection reveals what is hidden within himself.

Pearl’s reflections reveal what is hidden within her. The first reflection is reveal through a shiny suit of armour in the Governor’s Hall. Hawthorne says she is overwhelmed with joy just staring at it (107). The superficial
meaning of this reflection is Pearl seeing the scarlet letter displayed very large on her mothers chest. The inner truth is that Pearl is show her knowledge of what it means and her mischievousness, which is show through a "...smiling at her mother" (107). The second reflection come in the sea while playing with the "shell and tangled seaweed":

So the child flew away like a bird, and, making bare her small white feel, went pattering along the moist margin of the sea. Here and there, she came to a full stop, and peeped curiously into a pool, left by the retiring tide as a mirror for Pearl to see her face in.

Fourth peeped at her, out of the pool, with dark, glistening curls around her head, and elf-smile in her eyes, the image of a little maid, whom Pearl, having no other playmate, invited to take her hand and run a race with her. (107)

On the surface Pearl just sees her mere "elfish" image. On the other hand she sees a new playmate in which she had never had before. Next, she is standing by the brook looking at a nearly perfect image of herself in the brook in amazement. On the surface she see "the brilliant picturesqueness of her beauty, in its adornment of flowers and wreathed foliage, but more refined and spiritualized than the reality. The inner truth shows that Pearl stood there looking the good in everything and saw herself as good. A little later she stumbles by the brook again and points at her mothers breast with her forefinger, in which is the superficial view of the brook. Then they looked into the brook and saw the inner truth of beautiful flowers and sunshine surround her mother in the dim forest by the brook. That show the goodness that Pearl really did convey in her heart. Clearly, Pearl reveals what is hidden within through her reflections.

In The Scarlet Letter the reflection serve an important purpose: To reveal what is hidden within. Hawthorne saws in The Scarlet Letter how Hester, Dimmesdale, Chillingworth, and Pearl reveal the hidden within themselves through reflections in mirrors, the sea, the armour, glasses, and the brook. Hawthorne shows from his Puritan ancestors how important it is to show what is hidden within and that is why The Scarlet Letter should still be read today.

Notes

The Philosopher’s Responses:
RATING: P

problem w/subject/verb agreement
awkward sentence structure
paper not as developed as the outline
lack of proofreading prior to final submission

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“This paper has some excellent reasoning [sic] and logical connections - B- -But has also
some poor grammar [sic] and a confusing ending.”

Group-Specific Essay #2 (Essay 249 of Sample)

**Time for Juvenile Justice to Grow Up**

On November 8, 1992, Jeremy Gipson, then fifteen, lured a seven-year-old girl into the basement of his home and raped her. Jeremy Gipson was not convicted of rape; his case was pleaded down and because he was under eighteen if he attended his counseling sessions charges against him would be dropped. He did not attend his counseling sessions as ordered, and no further steps were taken to correct his criminal behavior. On March 30, 1995, Jeremy Gipson again committed rape. This time, the victim was twelve-year-old Jessica Thornsberry, her body was found in Iroquois Park the next morning; she had also been beaten and strangled to death. This is a prime example of violent juvenile crime. No one was aware of Jeremy Gipson’s previous rape. This secret helped to provide him with future opportunities of raping again. He has now raped and murdered a twelve-year-old girl. “Violent juvenile crimes have become so commonplace that I think we have to come down on the side of protecting the innocent,” said Representative Charles Geveden, a co-chairman of the Kentucky subcommittee studying reforms to the state juvenile code (“Unveiling” A7). Larry Forgy, a Republican candidate for Kentucky Governor, stated, “rape and assault by a 15-year old are as serious as if they were done by a 35-year old” (B6). Because of the Jessica Thornsberry tragedy and too many other examples like it, secrecy laws in Kentucky concerning juvenile crime should be changed.

One reason the laws should be changed is to allow the people close to the juvenile offenders to take necessary precautions. According to Republican Bob Gale, a candidate for Kentucky Governor, “the offender
was well-known to the court system but not at all to the community” (B6). By keeping a juvenile’s crimes secret, the people around the juvenile offender are not aware of potential dangers. The murdered girl’s mother, Diana Thornsberry, insists “If I’d known [about Jeremy’s past rape offense], I would never have sent my daughters over there [Jeremy’s house to stay with his sister]” (“Slaying” A1).

Another reason the laws should be changed is to help prevent juvenile offenders from committing the same crimes again. This is Jeremy Gipson’s second known raping of a young girl, and this time he also murdered the girl. If people had known about his previous rape, maybe Jessica Thornsberry would still be alive. According to The Courier-Journal, “only a fraction of juvenile sex offenders ever get treated” and “treatment experts estimate 60 to 80 percent of adult sex offenders start as juveniles” (“Slaying” A8). Hiding the prior offenses of minors belittles the seriousness of their crimes and prevents anyone from correcting the minor’s criminal behavior because no one is aware criminal behavior exists.

Finally, changing the secrecy laws would put the court system under scrutiny to do a more competent job of punishing and rehabilitating juvenile offenders. As correctly stated by Kentucky Lieutenant Governor Paul Patton, “under our current system nothing of any substance is done to the children and that is the wrong message we are sending” (TV news). Confidentiality concerning juvenile crime allows too much room for incompetence. David Richart, executive director of the Kentucky Youth Advocates, concurs “confidentiality also helps cover the mistakes of institutions that deal with juveniles” (“Unveiling” A7).

Juvenile proceedings need to be more open to enlighten the citizens of our state to the seriousness of juvenile crimes and to allow our communities the opportunities to confront this growing problem. Juveniles who commit violent crimes should be treated no differently from adults who commit violent crimes. If a person is capable of committing a crime, then that person should be properly punished for that crime, regardless of age. A juvenile’s name should be published in newspapers and aired on evening news programs when he or she is convicted of a serious crime. The public has the right to know what is happening in its community.

Works Cited


The Philosopher’s Responses:

RATING: HP
“spelling, grammar, punctuation, etc.--all used proficiently”

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: P+

“The points made by this essay were well supported by quotes, however [sic] no real scientific research was used. The argument was clearly made but unremarkable--C+ to B-grade.”

Group-Specific Essay #3 (Essay 137 of Sample)

I have a strong belief that in today’s society young people need to reach out to the elderly. The elderly love to see a young person reaching out. People need to realize that just because people are old, they are still human and deserve to be treated as such. One never knows, their best friend could turn out to be over the age sixty-five.

In the article, “Aging in the Land of the Young”, Sharon Curtain explains the results of aging. Having gray hair, having hearing, seeing; and memory loss, also their money situation is unstable, have enforced leisure. She also explains one day she was in the park sitting across from a nursing home. One side of the park was young mothers and their children, on the other side were the people from the nursing home. Curtain explains that whenever a child would cross over to the other side, the mother would run over apologize and take her child away to the “right side”. (Curtin 100).

I think people have an unhealthy attitude about the elderly. I feel we as young people should interact and be afraid of talking or being seen with an “older person”. I have always been associated with older people. My grandmother is 71 years older than myself. I have always been very close to my grandmother. Every Saturday my family would go to my grandmothers house, eat lunch, and my mother would curl grandmothers hair. I always looked forward to going and visiting her. She always told stories about her childhood growing up on the farm. She is such a sweet, and neat lady. She always is looking out for others and putting others first. My mother and I use to go shopping and take my grandmother with us. I always went shopping, because she did not drive. I look back and wish I was not so selfish. She can no longer go shopping anymore because of her health, and I miss those times. She always told me I was her favorite grandchild, although I think she told all of us that; but I did get more at holidays. When she began to get ill I realized I needed to spend as much time with her as I could because I never knew what the next day would bring. When she was in the hospital I would stay with her for six hours at a
time. When she stays at my aunt’s I stay with her when my aunt needs to run errands or go to work. I value the time we spend together. She never wants to take a nap when I am there because she wants to spend her time with me. We play cards, watch T.V., look at photographs or just sit and talk.

I love my grandmother very much. There are not a lot of teenagers that would do this for an elderly person. Because of fear, annoyance, or lack of access, whatever the reason young people should not be so selfish and close-minded.

When I was in high school we had to volunteer a number of service hours each year. Well, I visited, The Little Sisters of the Poor, which is a retirement home. The people there were great. They talked, laughed, played games, and told stories about their families, traveling from different countries and their experiences over the years. They liked having someone to talk to and spend time with. They liked spending time with me and I liked spending time with them. I never thought I would have fun at a retirement home, but I did. I had a positive attitude and had faith that I would have fun.

I think there should be more activities for young and old to participate in and have more positive attitudes about being willing to participate in these activities. In the article, “Home Buddies”, deLeon explains an arrangement for the young and old. Free room and board in exchange for cooking, companionship, and some help around the house. From that it has grown into lifelong friendship. deLeon explains that through the city of Seattle elderly people are opening up their homes to take in strangers. The homesharing program started in 1980 to help senior citizens stay in their own homes and to provide alternative and affordable housing.

Last year 108 matches were made under the program. Some people choose home sharing to relieve the silence of their empty homes and lonely lives. Others apply for help around the house. Some others apply for security.

The program is funded through a city community development block grant and the Senior Services of Seattle/King County. When the needs and interest of homeowners match, they are put in touch and they decide whether they are compatible. The homeowners are responsible for checking the references.

The pairing of an elderly person with a young person works well because the young person can often provide more services to the elderly person. What starts out as an economic arrangement often turns out to be an emotional attachment. One woman explains the elderly man she lives with is her “adopted” grandfather. This is one way to bring the young and elderly together.

There should be other programs like this. Maybe a chess, card, Ping-Pong tournament or anything to get young and old together. This helps the young understand the experience and meaning of life.
In the article “They Shut My Grandmothers Room Door”, Andrew Len explains how his grandmother lives in a nursing home and everytime a patient dies the nurses close all the patients room doors. I believe the elderly need more arrangements like the homebuddies system. With a system like this the elderly can live at home and get the care and companionship they need, instead of a nursing home.

I believe with more projects between the young and the old their attitudes towards the elderly would become healthier. It is just what we need.

Work Cited


The Philosopher’s Responses:
RATING: P

“overall, effective use of language

some punctuation, spelling, grammar errors”

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: NP

confusing, rambling --
poor grammer [sic] and sentence structure
reads like a stream of consciousness piece
with few connected ideas

Group-Specific Essay #4 (Essay 096 of Sample)

Very few works of art, even among the greatest and most widely appreciated masterpieces, have entered into the general consciousness and become, in a certain sense, the spiritual possession of the whole world. Leonardo da Vinci’s The Last Supper is among the exact few that stands supreme among them. The perfection of work lies not only in the formal or purely artistic parts of the painting, but also in Leonardo’s expressive
mastery, in his deeply human and profoundly felt exposition of the subject (Heydenreich 4).

The Last Supper is located in the refectory, or dining hall, of the Saint Marie of the Graces in Milan. The monumental painting of The Last Supper occupies the entire wall of the north end of the refectory. The picture in the painting is a continuation of the refectory itself. Belleranti reports that the three dimensional perspective that Leonardo created, made her think that she was actually with Christ and the other apostles (59).

Commissioned in 1494, The Last Supper was completed in 1498. Unlike the beliefs of many people, Leonardo’s mural is not a fresco painting (Shulman 83). Fresco painting is a particular technique of art that does not allow the artist to take his time on the painting. Leonardo da Vinci wanted to spend time on The Last Supper not only to make corrections, but also because the painting was on such a profound subject. Thought and skill took up the major part of Leonardo’s time with doing the painting. Leonardo was very devoted to the subject of his painting, The Last Supper, in which shows his own interpretation of Christ. The Last Supper gave Leonardo the opportunity to portray a dramatic interplay between Christ and his disciples. Leonardo felt that The Last Supper let him eject a new dramatic tension and emphasis on the painting’s sacramental significance (Smart 116). I concur because The Last Supper has been spread into many homes and churches all over the world. Also, whenever we think of The Last Supper, it is usually Leonardo’s painting that we capture in our mind.

Even though Leonardo’s The Last Supper is not all his own due to restorations through the centuries, we have an understanding of what Leonardo painted in the fifteenth-century. The event in which The Last Supper depicts is when Christ says, “Verily, I say unto you, that one of you shall betray me.” Gazing at the painting, I can see a wave of feeling passing through the scene as Christ says these words with the apostles agitated reactions. The spiritual beauty is revealed through the depth and detail that is depicted of every element through Leonardo’s devoted hand. One source writes that each character in The Last Supper is taken from life (Ellis 16). Taken from life means that the characters portrayed in the painting were very lifelike being rounded and three dimensional in shape and form.

When viewing The Last Supper, it is very important to understand or have an idea of the technique that is used. Leonardo da Vinci spent many hours trying to avoid monotony, or everything in the painting looking the same. His time was well spent because he portrayed every figure in the painting in a different manner. The characters in the painting are on one side of the table which is open to view. The table pictured is one that was used in the dining hall during Leonardo’s time. Also, from Leonardo’s time is the tablecloth which is knotted at the corners. One critic points out that Leonardo should have recreated the physical setting of the room in Christ’s day (Armstrong 164). Leonardo made no attempt because he
wanted to capture the act of betrayal more than what the scenery looked like in Christ’s time. Behind Christ and the disciples, the windows are open to symbolize the air coming through and relieving tension that is created when Christ says his words, “one of you shall betray me.” The fact that Leonardo placed Christ at the center of The Last Supper is not only interesting, but appropriate. The lines of perspective converge on the Savior which include the floor, ceiling, and walls all meeting with Christ’s face (Ellis 17). The questioning gestures of the disciples carry the pictorial movement back and forth across the measured spaces which are divided into five equally portions. Also, the gestures in the painting all lead to Christ. Leonardo portrays Christ with his arms freely laid upon the table while his disciples are moving about in a violent manner that shows no trace of vulgarity of resentment against good order. Payne suggests that the hands which point in the direction of Christ seem to possess a life of their own, as if their hands are candles lighting the table (117). The disciples are arranged according to their importance and are grouped in three, or unities. Technically, The Last Supper was sketched, edited, rearranged, and studied years before Leonardo ever started work on the refectory wall. The arrangement that we view today was actually designed by trial and error (Ellis 18).

Since The Last Supper is a profound painting known for its depth and detail, one must go beyond the surface of the mural and actually look inside the painting. Each disciple’s personality is revealed in The Last Supper. Many are troubled and shocked with the prophecy of betrayal by asking if it is he who will betray Christ. Even though the twelve disciples are pictured with their own reaction to the prophecy, the gestures still flow into one another connecting the reactions as one. Ellis reports that the genius and insight of Leonardo da Vinci are nowhere better demonstrated than in the character study of each disciple (20). The face of Christ was hard for Leonardo to portray, but he did discover a face which is tranquil. The position of Christ is expressively accented by the empty space around him. To the right of Christ are John, Judas, and Peter. John is accented with a tender face and does not protest the prophecy. Judas, the betrayer, has a deep, dark face. He holds a moneybag in his hand which represents his undoing. Rather than setting Judas off by isolation, the artist sets him apart psychologically. Peter is leaning over to John in which he is holding a bread knife that is almost in Judas’ back. The disciples to the left of Christ are James (the greater), Thomas, and Philip. James has the utmost of horror expressed on his face because he is very much disturbed of Christ’s announcement. Thomas’ disposition of doubting is brilliantly captured by the artist in the painting. Next to Thomas is Philip. Philip is pictured on his feet and Leonardo has emphasized the confusion in the gestures and face of Philip. Andrew, James (the lesser), and Bartholomew are at the opposite end of the table. Andrew has a significant expression of horror that no other displays in The Last Supper. James (the lesser) is pictured with a look of desire to know more about what has been said,
“one of you shall betray me”. Speechless, Bartholomew wants to know who the betrayer is. At the other end of the table sits Matthew, Simon, and Thaddeus. Matthew shows astonishment at the master’s prophecy while Simon indicates that he is troubled with his gestures. Surprise, doubt, and suspicion have engulfed the face of Thaddeus (Ellis 50).

Not only do the apostle’s faces tell a story, but also their hands. The hands help pull up the painting together (Heydenreich 104). For instance, Christ’s right hand is palm downward suggesting, “If it is possible, let this cup pass from me.” His left hand is upturned possibly suggesting, “Nevertheless, not as I will, but as thou wilt.” (Smart 112). The apostles all have different hand gestures which can tell a story of what is going on in The Last Supper. Each hand gesture flows with the other which can then be referred back to Christ. Leonardo da Vinci has skillfully expressed the disciples emotions by their hands. I am sure that anyone who views The Last Supper will have different stories of the hands, since we all perceive things in a different perspectives. When I look at the hands, I can see the question of: who was it?

The emotional content of The Last Supper is overwhelming. The emotions are successfully portrayed through the hands, facial expressions, and also by the way that each character is placed in the painting. Each character has a different gesture that describes an emotion that they feel while at the same time, all the different emotions come together in unity to form one.

People have different views on whether or not The Last Supper is of great significance. Personally, after I studied the painting, I could account for things not noticed when just looking at it. To understand The Last Supper, one must go beyond the surface and look deeper into the subject. There is not a wrong or a right way to interpret the meaning of The Last Supper, or any piece of art. I consider The Last Supper to be a very moving piece of art work which suggests that the flow of the gestures throughout The Last Supper are actually moving. Everyone has acquired Leonardo’s expressive painting of The Last Supper in their mind to be the universal symbol of Christ. The artist profoundly makes the observer part of The Last Supper. Although I did not travel to Milan to see the monumental mural, the pictures I studied made me shiver just because of the thought of the act of someone betraying Christ which is the moment that The Last Supper depicts.

Works Cited
The Philosopher’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“Good work.”

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“I would talk to this student one on one. This is either a [sic] A+ paper from a gifted student or one with a college degree coming back to get a [sic] RN or a plagiarized paper [sic].”

Group-Specific Essay #5 (Essay 204 of Sample)

**Victims of Reform**

As a society, can we always assume that children will be provided for? The focus on welfare reform has gained a great deal of attention by congressional leaders, and the American taxpayer desire an effective welfare system. Whatever the alternatives to the welfare system that might be considered, should children face the burden of welfare reform by cutting payments to poverty ridden families? “Keep in mind that when American politicians talk about getting people off welfare, they’re mostly talking about women. Poor women” (Diebel, 1994, June, p.34). Therefore, children will become the victims of welfare reform. Welfare reform legislation has come before the congressional leaders, and the taxpayer want welfare reform, but at what cost? The steps taken need careful consideration, so that children do not become the victims.

But first, how did poor mothers support their children? In 1911 a mother’s aid law was introduced to reinforce home life. To receive payments, the mother had to have a suitable home, and if she failed she would lose her pension and child. Then in 1935 Aid to Dependent Children (ADC) was designed to release from the wage earning role; the person whose natural functions is to rear children into capable citizens. Eventually in 1950 ADC was changed to, Aid to Families with Dependent Children (AFDC). Mothers were required to stay home and rear the children, and if she worked, for each dollar earned then a dollar was deducted. In which case the family would become poorer, and they could not become independent unless they cheated the system. By the end of the
1960s, the program began to demand that women on welfare would work and were required to register for training. So by 1971, AFDC requires for the first time that women with school age children should seek employment. To function as an incentive, mothers could keep the first 30 dollars and one-third of the remainder of monthly earnings. Because of low wage jobs, the lack of health insurance, and high cost of child care, today mothers’ turn to AFDC (Polakow, pp. 51-62).

“While public myths implicate mothers as nonworkers, recent studies indicate that 90 percent of welfare mothers have worked, many recently, and that they apply for public assistance only when men and the labor market fail to provide income support for family maintenance. The tragedy is that AFDC fails dismally as a back-up support and serves to disempower and humiliate such mothers further, as the welfare bureaucracy creates modern-day paupers of them and their children” (Polakow, p.62).

To end welfare as we know it, would cause a panic in this nation. The determination to create a more effective system to benefit the taxpayer and the families who receive tax dollars has become apparent. Few would dispute the need for change, and Americans “are appalled to be subsidizing out-of-wedlock childbearing, and they resent the abuse of their goodwill” (Zuckerman, 1995, p.68).

Zuckerman “reports that welfare programs have devoured more than five trillion dollars since 1965. But the staggering cost is only part of the story. If all this treasure had given us happy, healthy families in our low-income neighborhoods, millions of hard-working Americans would have judged the sacrifice a badge of honor” (p.66).

However, everyone should have the opportunity to succeed in this nation with whatever ambition desired. Education and job training should be a Criterion that welfare receipts follow to receive support, and their children attending school. In December 1994 “the U.S. General Accounting Office reported that only 11 percent of the 43.6 million parents on AFDC participate monthly in any of the education, training or job search programs set up in 1988” (Whitman, 1995, Jan, p.30) Before judging an individual’s requirements, the facts concerning each families’ situation needs to be obtained. The poor have dreams like everyone else, but to live without hope destroys all ambition. The system should encourage single parents to achieve the highest possible goal. Yet, the boundaries are so limited, that the system punishes instead of helping those who are willing to help their self, facing obstacle after obstacle. Polakow’s (1993) book, Lives on the Edge, describes countless stories of single Mothers and their children on AFDC. “Joey Welter, an honor’s student in her senior year became pregnant at the age of seventeen” (p.63). After Joey’s twins were born she resided with her mother, and obtained a job working forty hours a week and continued her education. Support was cut off because Joey’s earnings were above the monthly limit by “38 dollars” and she was living
with her mother. Joey moved out and continued to work full time, and continued her education. However, she became overwhelmed by her bills as they pile up. Joey’s description of the system is, “no matter how hard you try you’re always going to be two steps behind, because whoever the force is, never wants you to succeed” (Polakow, 1993, p.64). Polakow states, the system as Joey “sees it ‘the force’ is there to keep her down; a work ethic, a job, and strong motivation to succeed are insufficient to pull someone out of poverty who is young, female, and a mother” (p. 65).

Toni at the age of fourteen, pregnant and homeless becomes incapable of obtaining help from social services by her lack of knowledge of how and where to receive help. But, she continues to fight to survive, moving from family member to family member until “she finally locates a teen-parent center, a source of strength for Toni” (Polakow, p. 67). Anna’s husband deserted her without any support, and then Anna is punished for trying to become self sufficient working full time without health care for the baby. She cuts back on her hours so she can obtain Medicaid and AFDC for her baby. “There are few opportunities for advancement, particularly as she has to reduce her hours to protect her child’s health coverage through Medicaid. She is thus all but condemned to being a permanent part-time, low-wage worker” (Polakow, p.69). So for the money to be available to feed or provide health care for a child, the single parent becomes held back by guidelines. The child does not control the outcome of his/her social environment, then where does welfare reform start and end? There’s no reason for children to be neglected in this great nation of wealth and power, and children should not be held responsible for the actions of the adults in control.

The need for change is obvious, but at what cost? A baby will not become addicted to the welfare system because the strict guidelines protect the taxpayer from any further burden of welfare payments to parents. The American taxpayer deserves the greatest return on the dollar, so instead of cutting all welfare payments to poverty ridden children and parents, restrictions could be enforced, for one, the parent would work for welfare dollars in the community, only after the child has been placed in a safe environment, in a day care center or left with a suitable baby-setter. Secondly, the father would be held responsible for the support of the child when possible. Next, education for children and parents to instill the provisions set forth for welfare dollars such as, job training, family valves, and incentives for their improved status. Therefore, the encouragement given by the programs to the family would support their needs until they were capable of dependence. The hope of the end result would be to influence individuals to help themselves.

On the other hand, there are a selected few receipts that will not try, either they are drug abuser, or have some other made-up excuse. In some cases the monies received are not being spent on the children, but in reality food stamps, and AFDC payments are spent on drugs or some other extravagant items. So children become the victims regardless, on or off
welfare. Then the penalty seems harsh, but unfortunately they would be cut off from further payments and if the children were neglected further, they then would become wards of the state.

Children having children has become a major problem in the United states.

Dewitt’s (1994, April) “reports that one-fourth of U.S. babies live in families with annual incomes under the federal poverty level. Much of the trouble may be related to the breakdown of the traditional family, because of divorces and births out of wedlock. The U.S. has one of the highest teenage-pregnancy rates in the world, and almost one-fourth of children live with one parent” (p.68).

The teenager would remain at home under the supervision of her parents, and the teenage father would also be responsible for the support of the child, working within the provisions of the child labor act, and also remaining in school. Parents’ of the two teenagers would also be responsible for the support of the child born before receiving any type of welfare payments. So, if the child is neglected, the newborn would become a ward of the state, and punishment for all parties involved to the extent of the law. The requirements seem unfair, but responsibility of children should rest with the parents, regardless of age until emancipated by law. The result would be that parents would take the initiative to teach family values, in hope of preventing teenage pregnancy.

“We should enforce the legal responsibility of fathers and relatives and the obligations of parents to support pregnant daughters. Teenage mothers should not have the incentives to continue out-of-wedlock childbearing by getting their own apartments and living their own lives on subsidy” (Zuckerman, p. 68).

Indeed, parents have a legal responsibility to support and rear their children. The future of this nation should not be neglected with all the resources available; children have become the true victims of irresponsibility of our leaders and parents alike. The efforts to educate teenagers should be implemented in the school systems, so that they will understand the consequences of childbearing without financial support, and how that will effect their future. A single parent who desires to succeed meets many obstacles that are unnecessary, and instead of prosperity, the recipients are held back. The future of this nation is at risk without some type of reform, but not at the expense of our children.

References
To Some Rap Music Causes Some Teens Be Violent

Here in the 90's there is a lot of hip-hop, bi-bop, and hard-core rapp which is encouraging teens to be violent. Most teens think it is a big deal to learn the words to the hard-core rapp songs, but that is not necessarily true. Some teens feel that some of the rap music might pump them up to dance, and might even put them in the mood to do mature things, other then being violent. There is a lot of different rapp that get people in the mood to do things like shop. When teens or even adults go into a music store like Camelot, VRM, Joe's Music Vault, or Circuit City that encourages some teens also in department stores that sells TVs stereos, and ACR's. There rapp songs played in that department. Some rappers have become infamous for executing the “By All Means Necessary” motto, which some times means the use of violent and vulgar language to conquer the obstacles of the day and also to sell their music. Because of the absence of parental guidance and lack of family values, teenagers are easily lead astray, which leaves them vulnerable. Without parental guidance the artists like 2-Pac Shacore, who is a rapper that a lot of teenagers look up to, that has a lot of violent songs that can lead teens astray, but on the other hand he has some positive songs that parents shouldn’t mind for their teens to listen to, for example, Brenda Got A Baby. This song is telling about a girl that has a baby and did not tell her mother. Brenda came from a single family and it was hard for her mother to raise her, so Brenda felt that it would be hard for her to raise a child, so she had her child outside the hospital and then put the baby in a trash bag and threw it in the dumpster. When the father of Brenda’s baby finds out about this he goes and gets the baby from the dumpster and gets legal custody of the baby. He also has a song by the name of “Keep Your Head Up”. This song is stating that, no matter what you can SURVIVE with
your child or even several children. I think these songs present positive messages to single mothers and fathers. With these examples, I would just like you to note that despite the negative things in 2-Pac’s past and present, he still has some positive things to say. He was harassed by two California plain-clothed cops, and because of this harassment he ended up in jail. In the past 2-Pac had always had to immediately defend himself when approached by strangers, even if it meant a fight to the death, which was the case with one of the cops that harassed 2-Pac. In a similar incident with a teen in Chicago that was being harassed by plain-clothed cops in the summer of 1993, the teen reacted just as his idol, 2-Pac, and the teen feels that his and 2-Pac’s charges should be dropped. He feels that they were only acting in self defense, as they had been brought up, since the cops did not identify themselves. Both teens now face charges of murdering a police officer and with carrying a stolen concealed deadly weapon. 2-Pac got off with a “light” sentence, but the boy that idolized him is facing being tried as an adult, which may mean life in prison.

There are other rappers like D-Shock that lave songs titled “Crockit Cops”. The song goes something like this...Crockit cops, don’t give a dam, they kick in my door with a batoram, I snap to my head, I know that they want me d’nead (dead). Knowing that I am skid’ned (scared), this is what they s’ned (said)...Now, with this song being phrased like this, it gives teens ideas, especially if this is their idol, that street slang is cool. To teens without parental guidance this artist may become a parents worst nightmare, or to the teen that idolizes him a ticket to self destruction. Songs like, Snoop Doggy Dog’s, “Murder Was The Case That They Gave Me” or Dr.Dre and Ice Cube’s “Natural Born Killers, Born to Kill It’s In The Blood”, I feel, were contributing to the encouragement of groups like Bloods and Crips, which are/gang. These gangs have since, in 1991, united and made their own hard-core rapp song entitled, “Pirue Love” which, I feel, told the tales of their killing and others wearing certain colors in each neighborhoods. These new gangs started killing one another and before they realized it a lot of people were dead and nothing was conquered. This type of music that teens really do not understand. The teens take this type of hard-core rap the way they want to instead of listening and realizing. I feel some of these type of hard-core raps might be, or is the life that the musician may be trying to get away from or words that they sing just to sell music. The teen has taken all that is sung to heart, and the violence and disobedience become a way of life. Violence and disobedience become the cool and “In Thing” to do.

Some of the hard-core rapp gives women a bad name. Often times in artist’s raps they call women “Bitches” and “Whores”. They speak of sluts giving them head (sucked my penis). Things are said like, I fucked her so hard, she called me daddy. All of this type of slang makes women feel like it is normal/all right to be called out of their name. “In January of 1994 there was an issue of black women’s crusades against “gangsta rap music”” by Daniel Smith.
Now keep in mind that I have left one stone unturned. That is the stone of physiological illness. There are some teenagers that have not taken to violence and disobedience because of the lack of parental guidance, but because there minds will not allow them to learn any better. These teens may suffer from anything from birth defects to illness caused by mental or physical abuse. A physiological aspect was done by Carolyn Caywood in June 1993. Presumed influenced by certain raps or music can turn teens into psychopaths. These are the teens that society needs to take under their wing, and not point and laugh at or count off as no good to us. These teens count also. There are some teen that do not get violent, they might take it as a joke or just to be listening to music, or maybe even sitting around with a bunch of friends and makes them want to get up and dance and have a good time. So sometimes this violence is what a teen wants to do or it is all in the mind, even sometime just to fit in with the crowd and make themselves look good and tough. In a since, these teens are given some guidance and insight on how life is in general, the some music may have a very different effect on them. They may recognize that the musician sings as a form of expression, to express a time and a place that he never wants to return to. Even though the violent actions are made light of just to poke fun, not to exemplify or to duplicate. Do not get me wrong, there are some rappers that sing about positive things like the ‘69 Boys (group). A song also a dance called Tissie Roll. This is the kind of song that makes you get up, and get down, telling you how to do this dance (The Tissie Roll). Another artists with positive things to say, is L.L. Cool J. He has a song entitled, “Cars Ride By With The Booming Systems” meaning, that there are several teens driving around in cars constantly playing music non-stop. This an artists the has a song published that is telling teens to stay in school, and get an education, do not be a fool. This artist goes by the name of M.C. Hammer. I feel that is telling teens to be self-supportive. There are a lot of religion, responsibility, reality, and most of all a need for a good education. A lot of hard-core music that teens listen to could be kept out of the hands of teens if certain CDs or tapes could be kept in an area where you have to be eighteen or older or have parental supervision/permission in order to purchase these items. Radio stations are not allowed to play curse word or derogatory phrases, that are version edited for their use. Even sometimes the videos that are shown on BET or MTV show every obscene gesture or violent scene without any edits. If these videos were edited it may reduce the amount of violence and disobedience displayed by the teens that watch them.

The musicians that I mentioned above, I have a lot of respect for. I respect them because they sing about the things that are a reality for me. My parents have instilled in me the values that I need to survive in this world, not only to exist here. We all as a society, must nurture our teens and show them the way and teach them right from wrong. Also let them know that they should not try to live their lives trying to be something or someone they are not, they need to be their own person. They lyrics in
music is not the basis on how to live your life, but a way for the artists to express him/herself and make a life for themselves. Teens are our future, so invest all the time and effort in them that you can. Some people often wonder if the expression of popular culture and attitudes has gone too far in aggressiveness. But most people think that the attitudes are not the cause, but rather mirror the deep divisions and anger within parts of our society.

Works Cited
Caywood, Carolyn. “Presumed influence.” School Library Journal June ’93, 44.
Marriott, Michael. “Rhymes of Redemption.” Newsweek Nov. 29 ‘93, 60

The Philosopher’s Responses:
RATING: NP
No Comments.

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: NP
“too many grammatical errors to pass at the 102 level—this student needs to take 101 again. This student writes like he/she talks—proper English is what is accepted in college and in the professional world —”

Group-Specific Essay #7 (Essay 185 of Sample)

Tobacco Companies------Liable or not?

Tobacco companies should not be held responsible for deaths of individuals who use tobacco products. It is the responsibility of the individual.

When a person chooses to use tobacco products, it is that person’s choice. No one is making you smoke. Tobacco companies put warning labels on their products, such as “The Surgeon Generals Warning”, which states that cigarette smoking can be hazardous to your health. It is the
individuals’ responsibility to read and consider the outcome of their actions. If they choose not to read the labels and consider what might happen, they are doing so at their own risk. The tobacco companies cannot be held responsible for what someone does on their own free will.

As with any drug, each has its own addicting qualities. There are numerous medical reports that state, “smoking is addictive.” It is the responsibility of the individual to heed the warnings! When a person chooses to ignore the fact that the nicotine in cigarettes is a drug and very addicting, they are, in a sense, releasing the tobacco companies from being liable. The tobacco companies have to make public the fact that cigarette smoking can be hazardous to your health and is a drug with addicting qualities. As an individual, it’s up to you to make the decision to smoke and when you do, the responsibility for all possible outcomes is yours!!

Unfortunately, tobacco companies put a lot of money into advertising for their products. Of course, they want to make money, so they make smoking look inviting. As with every company, they are trying to sell their products. No one can be blamed for that. However, it is up to the individual to resist the temptation and to see that smoking will not make you look like the model in the advertising nor will it get you the attention.

It is the responsibility of the individual to heed the warnings, consider the possible consequences, and ignore the advertising that makes smoking look so inviting or use tobacco products at their own risk.

I don’t think that tobacco companies should have to compensate the families of deceased smokers. Losing a loved one can be devastating, but putting the blame on the tobacco companies is just unfair. No one is to blame, but the person who suffered the consequences!! The warnings are clearly stated, and they chose not to pay attention to them. They used tobacco products at their own risk!

The Philosopher’s Responses:
RATING: HP

No Comments.

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: P

“Clear and fairly average use of grammar [sic] and language—weak logic and poor use of Facts or research—I would probably give this student a C- or D+.”

Group-Specific Essay #8 (Essay 004 of Sample)

Children Who Kill

There are record breaking numbers of children who murder in the United States. The average number of killing children is about ten for
every one hundred thousand citizens. There are many circumstances that
surround children’s lives that are violent and that causes them to commit
murder. Many of these influences begins within the family. Family forms
the first impact on a child; in fact it can produce an effect on a child that
will alter the development of the child’s life. Many families today are not
traditional; they are single-parent, adoptive, homeless and homosexual-
parent families. Often the family is confronted by the juvenile-justice
system when the child has become uncontrollable. Than juvenile-justice
system do not always serve its purpose, many times it is a revolving door
for the children and their families. During this time when a child is first
introduce to crime and becomes apart of the juvenile justice system, the
child along with their parent must be accountable for their actions. It is the
juvenile-justice system responsibility to examine all circumstances and
determine what reforms are necessary for fair justice. The family along
with other influences such as environment, abuse, drugs and mental illness
is the upmost important and must be confronted when addressing the
issues of fair justice for children who kill.

Most violence do not begin in the neighborhoods, but starts in the home. Often child murderers begin their lives in an environment of constant
verbal, mental, physical, and sexual abuse. Much too often the violence in
the home destroys the life and hopes of the children who murder. For
example, in a study by the American Academy of Child and Adolescent
Psychiatry, Dr. Dorothy Otnow Lewis found that 12 of 14 juveniles on
death row in four states had long histories of severe beating and sexual
abuse, sometimes by drug addicted parents (Minerbrook, Scott 37).

Studies show that the young killer cross racial, social, economic and
geographic boundaries. They are males as well as females who have a
common thread, they have seen and experience acts of violence most of
their young lives. Children who are expose to neighborhoods that are
infested with drug users and dealers, drive-by shooting, stabbing and
fights every day. According to the psychologist James Gregorian, coauthor
of *Children in Danger*, has studied children in the war zones of
Mozambique, Northern Ireland, Kuwait and Israel’s Occupied Territories,
as well as the children of American cities. He says “We haven’t begun to
address the issue of kids who see violence everyday” (qtd. Ronald
Henkoff 65). He says that children that live in these places show many of
the symptoms that includes post-traumatic stress, emotional
numbness, depression, anxiety and rage (Minerbrook33). Violence
become an integral of the child life, and possibly can causes changes in the
child’s brain chemistry and prompts violent behavior as the child grows
older (Minerbrook 37).

The opinion of many developmental specialist’s is that these children are
more than trouble, they are dangerous. They will express their anger in
several ways: cruelly to other children and animals, often they will steal
and threaten to kill themselves or others. The specialists agree that
growing up surrounded with violence only hinder the usual growth of
empathetic feelings that is essential for moral judgement. Usually such thinking begins at the first three to four years of a child’s life. But violent behavior can be learn in the first year of life. If children do not form a bond to parents, family members or other people who will teach them to trust, love and understand other people and themselves. They will not learn moral values or know the limits of their own behavior, which then causes the young offenders to not know the difference between what is right and what is wrong.

Child murderers seldom kill because of a single incidence. Instead, it is often the peak of numerous hostile acts. Generally these children will demonstrate changing behavior. It is common that they express stubbornness and exercise no self control in the home and school, becoming a major discipline problem. Their behavior escalate to lying, stealing, truancy fighting with others. Eventually they become drug user, with a growing relentless to violence to gun packing gang member. According to Steve Valdivia, director of a out reach program called Community Youth Gang Services states “The wannabes are starting to do target practice and get used to holding a gun. The next level is a gang-involved youth who wants to make his stripes. But he’s not yet seen by his peers as a hard-core crazy person. If they get to that final level, they don’t care about themselves or the victim” (Witkin, Gordon 30).

Too many children are caught up in violence as victims, witnesses and perpetrators. Countless experts claim that some children are stone cold murderers and beyond help, because violence is an essential part of their life. These children have seen few alternatives to violence, and violent acts becomes a way of survival. These children are in and out of the juvenile justice system numerous times before they actual commit murder. The trend to this entire approach to juvenile judiciary system is misguided. The courts are acting after a child commits a murder or other horrendous crimes. The formal Surgeon General C.Everett Koop and journal editor George Lundberg, in Kids Are Killing, Dying, Bleeding states “We must address violence against youth the way we treat other pubic health threats like smoking, drunken driving or drug abuse: We must focus our efforts on prevention (in qtd. Henkoff 63)

So what is fair justice for young killers, who has live in abominable conditions all their young life? There are various answers to the question of fair justice for juveniles. On a televise community town hall meeting, in Louisville, Kentucky, this question and others were addressed. It provided an opportunity for community leaders, educators, parents, youths and others to express their concerns about the outburst of murders and other violent crimes in the community. The broadcast enable the audience and panelist to receive factual information and realistic suggestions, which indicated that a positive change is possible.

Fair justice is prevention, by producing methods that will deal with young offender that are at risk of committing violent crimes at an early age. Children must be protected and allowed to experience a better life.
The whole aspect surrounding the young offender’s life must be examined closely, when the child enters into the juvenile justice system. Starting with the family, parents and families members need support from the court to help them help their children. Today parents are young themselves who often haven’t been taught morals, determination, perseverance, or self-confidence. According to Dr. Alvin F. Poussaint, Psychiatrist, Harvard Medical School and The Judge Baker Children’s Center states in “Should Children Be Tried As Adults” that:

We do very little to educate people on how to be parents, so you have young and old people who haven’t the slightest idea how to bring up children. A lot of children who went on to commit violence at the age 13 were damaged in the first years of their lives by parents who were smacking them around for little things or because of abusive treatment or just outright neglect. In trying to help young people with conduct problems, the parents should be included in the program. (qtd. LaVelle, Avis 88).

When the child’s family and parent falls into the high risk category they are emotionally, socially or physically disadvantage causing a major disturbance to the family. These children and families should be identify in the beginning. There should be social service programs that will support the high risk parents as well as children. There should be mentors that will be apart of the family’s life once they have entered the juvenile system. These consultants would be willing to act as an all-purpose advocate to ensure the well-being of families. This action could encourage, direct, and insure the high risk child and family that there are people who care about them. These advocates could offer hope for the future, and also allow society to become actively involved with the young offender at an early age. Also for the child who is out of control there must be a solution for their particular situation. It could be a need for reformatory institution that would be strict, with rules and consequences along with understanding and compassion. This would help guide the juvenile offender to be aware of their responsibility to themselves and to society. These solutions can only result in a positive effect that may determine the child’s life on to adulthood.

The lack of social skills is not the only prime cause for the violent juvenile criminal who commits murder. We must challenge society responsibility for the disadvantage child and family. However if society refuses to deal with the larger contribution to violence like abuse, poverty, drugs and the easy availability to guns. According to the report “Children in Danger” the Children’s Defense Fund said “ With every major federal, state and local reform and budget change, citizen should ask our leaders whether it helps or hurts children, and which children” the report also ask “Will it make more or fewer children poor, hungry and homeless? Will it make parents and families more or less self-sufficient(qtd. O’Brein, Nacy Frazier 4)?” Society must hold our public leaders accountable to polices that implement fair justice to all children.
Works Cited

The Philosopher’s Responses:
RATING: NP

No Comments.

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: P

“a lot of grammer [sic] problems like verb tense –

some excellent use of research and a fairly well organized paper logically. I would probly [sic] give a C- and send this student to the writing center.”

**Group-Specific Essay #9 (Essay 125 of Sample)**

Society has exploited the differences between man and women. It has taken biological differences and used them to dub women inferior in some aspects. However, instead of trying to understand these differences many people blame one side or the other; the famous nature versus nurture controversy. The two sides of this argument need to realize that with new research the two are more intertwined now than ever. It is possbile that society has taken biological differences and nurtured them to yield what we think of as inferior and superior qualities. After all, it is society that dictates what we hold as inferior and superior. Therefore, we must understand the biological differences in order to see where some common misconceptions come from.

Men and women are physically and biologically different. Our brains have a different structure. We have differences in muscles. We each have different hormones coursing through our bodies. Has society misused these differences, especially in favor of men? Yes, it probably has.
The statement that men are physically superior to women is a common misconception. “The difference in strength is due to muscle size, not quality.” reports Lori Miller Kase. Dr. Wayne Westcott found in his study that men could lift 50% more on a leg extension machine. However, when he made adjustments for differences in size and amount of lean body tissue there was almost no difference (Kase 65). Unfortunately, in real life we cannot make these adjustments. Men excel physically in some areas due to larger hearts, longer limbs, more muscle, and effects of testosterone (it encourages muscle growth). Women, on the other hand, are more flexible and have a lower center of gravity, which provides better balance (Kase 65).

Society has encouraged men to be more physical in appearance and duties. When I was younger, and even today, I was never encouraged to do physical things. My brother played in little league, mowed the yard, took out the trash, and any other physical job was designated to him. What made my mother think I could not do these things? I do them today. It did make me feel inferior to my brother, I always thought that when I married my husband would do these things. That was what society was teaching me. I have learned different since. I mow the yard because my husband has allergies. I take out the trash because I am home first on the night before garbage pick-up.

The differences go beyond muscles to include our brains. One difference can be found in the cerebral cortex. In women the cerebral cortex is larger. Therefore, women have a larger area devoted to verbal skill. The difference in size causes a man’s brain to be more specialized in spatial reasoning (Berger 16). This difference offers an explanation to the fact that men will out perform women on math tests and why women communicate better than men.

I think it is possible that society has nurtured this difference. For example, look at the toys that are made for boys and those that are made for girls. My brother had an erector set, models, and other construction like toys. These toys would encourage better spatial ability. I doubt my dolls and dishes did much to encourage me. We all want to give society what it expects of us. I felt compelled at times to do things like enjoy home economics. I can not cook to save my life. I always thought that my brother’s ability to take things apart and put them together again was a gift. Today I believe that his brain is responsible too.

Brain differences may be caused, or enhanced, by hormones. It is common knowledge that testosterone, the male hormone, has been linked to aggressive behavior. Female rats injected with testosterone display both sexual and nonsexual male behaviors. Castrated male rats displayed female behaviors (Keeton 13-14). In another study by Hampson and Szekely women with higher levels of estrogen in their systems scored lower on spatial ability tests. Hormones are also linked to differences in male/female behaviors in sexual behaviors, eating habits, and cognitive abilities (Pool 174-181). Hormones actually make us male or female from
birth. Testosterone causes the growth of a penis and estrogen the growth of ovaries. Much ado has been made about women’s menstrual cycle. What is not common knowledge is that women’s brains act differently at different times of the cycle. This causes variance in performance on spatial ability, manual dexterity, articulation, and verbal fluency (Pool 185). Estrogen can also affect a woman’s mood.

It is O.K. for boys to play rough. Boys will be boys. He is all boy. These phrases probably arose due to the fact that males have testosterone. Men were always more aggressive so that was to be expected. Society said it was fine for males to be that way, but not girls. Women are expected to behave themselves. Everyone is just doing what nature programmed them to do. This is all encouraged by society too. There have been several studies to try and determine why boys do better, in general, in math. Some say it is because of the fact that boys are expected to do better. If it is hormonal, then are we wasting our time trying to get girls to the same level?

Society has given birth to the equal rights movement. There are extremist who argue that men and women are the same. It is not true. What society needs to push for is equal opportunities and treatment. As a society we need to realize that each person is an individual who has their own talent to contribute. This movement has made it seem unrespectable to be a housewife. Some women excel at the challenge, others cringe at the thought of having to raise a family and take care of a home. It may be that there is something in our brains that programs us to head towards a certain goal. These goals may be the same for men and women, we can not let society dictate what is female and what is male.

We cant change what we are. The differences between the sexes are real. Society needs to fight to keep these differences from being exploited to deny one sex an opportunity. Neither sex is superior to the other, simply differences in nature and nurture cause us to be different. One word that kept popping up during my research was average (i.e.- “the average woman”). There are those who excel, women who out do the average man. As a woman I don’t want to be the same as a man. I want the freedom to be given the chance to be what I am. Society is made up of individuals who need to learn to complement each other.

In closing I would like to say that I never used to put much stock in what was traditionally expected of girls and boys. I have a four year old daughter who only has barbies because of her grandmothers. I bought her a toy garage for her last birthday, thinking that she would really love it since she always wants her brother’s toys. Well, she liked it at first, but she is now back to cooking and playing with dolls. I don’t think it has anything to do with how she was raised. I think her brain is programmed to lead her certain directions. I always thought I could raise a child without giving them clues on how to behave and not letting society dictate what they should be, but I was wrong. Up until a few months ago when you asked her what she wanted to be, she replied “A daddy.” If you ask her
now though she says, “A mommy.” I don’t blame myself. I divide my blame equally on society and her female brain.

Works Cited

The Philosopher's Responses:
RATING: P
No Comments.

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP
“I would give this paper a B-. No flaring problems in grammer [sic]. Some good logic and research. Some good organization. No outstanding leaps in Logic or Reasoning.”

Group-Specific Essay #10 (Essay 012 of Sample)

MODERATION AND A NEW WAY OF SEEING
“A myth is a traditional story originating in a preliterate society, dealing with supernatural beings, ancestors, or heroes that serve as primordial types in a primitive view of the world” (American Heritage Dictionary 827). All current stories, films, and essays contain mythological themes because these themes are universal. Campbell states:
“Throughout the inhabited world, in all times and under every circumstance, the myths of man have flourished; and they have been the living inspiration of whatever else may have appeared out of the activities of the human body and mind.” (336) The film Dead Poets Society contains mythological themes: The ideas of living life in moderation and the value of always looking at things from a different perspective.

In the movie Mr. Keating is an alumni of a private Catholic boarding school for boys, and he has now returned to teach an English literature class. Most of the young boys' parents do not care who their children are they only concern is that the children have prestige in society. All the instructors are very strict and give astronomical amounts of homework. However, Mr. Keating has a very different method of teaching. He encourages the students to open their minds and experience life. For
example, The first day of class he has his students open their books and tear out the introduction because of its scientific way of rating poetry. One approach that he uses to teach his class to feel poetry is to make them cite lines of poems while listening to music and kicking soccer balls. This leads to controversy among his colleagues. A colleague named McLester suggests that teaching should be in moderation based on reality.

Mr. Keating continues to teach his students in his own way, and encourages his students to seize each day. A student named Neal Perry has a father who is very controlling, he does not want his son to take any elective classes because he wants him to be a doctor. However, Neal wants to be in a play, but he knows if he asks his father he will not be allowed, so he signs his own permission slip and gets the leading role. His father finds out about the play and demands that Neal drop out. Neal goes to Mr. Keating and asks what he should do. Keating tells him to explain to his father his love for the play. Neal knows his father will not change his mind, so he lies to Mr. Keating about talking to his father and does the play anyway. Neal’s father finds out and shows up at the play. After the play is over, Neal’s father makes Neal leave immediately. Mr. Keating goes up to Neal and his father as they are leaving. Mr. Keating is telling Neal what a wonderful job he has done.

Meanwhile, Neal’s father steps between them and tells Mr. Keating to stay away from his son. Mr. Perry blames Mr. Keating for Neal’s defiance. When Neal gets home he tries to tell his father how he feels, but he cannot bring himself to do so. While Neal’s parents are sleeping; Neal shoots himself in the head because he cannot live his life in moderation like his father wants him to.

Mr. Keating is fired because he does not teach in moderation and the administration believes that the only methods of teaching is moderation. They do not understand Mr. Keating’s method of teaching, and they believe that it was the reason that Neal committed suicide. Therefore, I believe that Mr. Keating did suffer because he would not teach in moderation. I also believe that people who live in moderation suffer consequences, and when they demand others to live up to their standards it is very unproductive. Mr. Perry’s consequence is that he loses his own son because of his standards of moderation.

In the myth “Daedalus and Icarus,” Daedalus is a father, a teacher of sorts who teaches moderation like the methods used in Mr. Keating’s school. Icarus is similar to Mr. Keating because neither one of them can conform to moderation. For example, Icarus’ father wants Icarus to not fly too high or too low; he wants his son to fly in moderation because of the consequences that will result if he does not. The administration wants Mr. Keating to teach in what they consider reality. They believe that moderation is the only way to teach, and they never stray away from it because of the fear of the outcome if they do. Icarus does not listen to his father and falls to his death, and Mr. Keating does not listen to his colleagues and he is terminated at the school (Ovid 341).
Another important point this movie makes is no matter what a person should always try to look at things from a different perspective. Mr. Keating challenges his students to look at life in a different way, but the students do not understand what he means. Mr. Keating jumps up on his desk and tells his students to follow him. After they are all standing on top of their desks, Mr. Keating says to his young students, “we must constantly look at things in a different way. It might seem silly and wrong, but you must always do it.” Mr. Keating believes that a person must challenge oneself to do this at all times because it helps the person make better decisions.

An essay that relates to this point is “The Trouble with Architects” by Andrew Ward (427-29). In the essay a woman who is an architect decides to look for the building that she spent so much time designing. She believes that she will know the building from sight, but after looking for it for hours while driving around the city she runs out of time and must catch a plane (427). While boarding she thinks that maybe they changed the design. However, the building had not been changed. She realizes this when she looks out the window of the plane and spots her design. At that instant she came to the realization:

I think my friend may have stumbled upon what’s wrong with modern architecture: It is best appreciated from a couple of thousand feet off the ground. It is conceived from an aerial point of view, from the Olympian perspective of a god, an angel, a chairman of the board. (427)

Ward writes that if an architect wants to accommodate people, he or she should look at his or her design of buildings from a different perspective. Architects should design their work in the same way that they are built. The perspective that they should use is starting from the ground up. Then when the building is finished the people that enter it can appreciate the work (429). The same point is made in the essay and the movie, it is always better to challenge the mind so that a person will always make a better choice, and it should be done before the decision and not after.

Now that we have discussed these sources we understand that if the gift of self worth and the thirst of life that we received at birth were not removed at an early age, we would have the understanding that there are ways to live life freely in moderation. Therefore, In my opinion, we would not have lost our self worth and our morality. Now that we are older, we know this is done by always looking at all the things in as many ways as possible. It is done by asking as many different people for help until the decision is right. Right, in that it will not hurt any person or oneself’s worth, respect, or love. It is probably the hardest thing a person must do. I wish that I could have understood this concept ten-years ago. The concept of understanding that life can be expressed without moderation in a productive way, and all that has to be done is looking for the best way to express life.
The Philosopher’s Responses:
RATING: P

No Comments.

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“An excellent paper, well organized with good use of theory and Logic. A-.

Some problems in English usage [sic]—again this student seems to sometimes write like
he is talking—to a friend.”

Group-Specific Essay #11 (Essay 106 of Sample)

Monet’s Illuminating Art Series

Vivid landscapes, seascapes, and other scenes of nature are synonymous with the French painter Claude Monet. In the late 1800’s, the artist displayed his illuminating impressions of nature individually or in a series. Contingent on the duration of stay at a residence or while travelling, Monet would portray a singular scene or event, or paint extensive views of the city and surrounding landscapes. And example of a single painting is “View of Paris World’s Fair,” and a selection of a series is Monet’s historical recording of “Grainstacks” in Giverny, France. This paper will analyze Monet’s “Grainstack” series, and especially his introduction of the portrayal of various elements from the specific series. To understand the critique and analysis of the series, a brief description of the art standards will be discussed.

Impressionism is a specific era in the history of painting that describes the recording of the artists’ first response to a subject and includes a form of preparation for this specific style of painting. Impressionistic paintings
are less rigid in the portrayal of a subject. Armand Silvestre’s review listed the works of the impressionists as having a deficiency of selection of their subjects (Bernard 28). The artists before them chose specific fragments of nature or society. Generally if the upper class was not depicted, the critical reviews and public outrage would hinder future sales of the art work. From the academic preception of that era the manual dexterity in copying nature, demonstration of tasteful selection, and a display of more polished art were the criteria for public acceptance. Art juries, exhibitions, and auction sales were important for public recognition and a means of supporting themselves and their trade.

Claude Monet and various artists travelled, painted, and exhibited together. They disclosed an unknown style of painting realistically. The realistic style affirmed that the total effect of the artistic translation was more important than the object or setting being painted exactly as it appears. To support earlier statements, Bernard cites critic Jules Cstagnary as stating his enjoyment of the impressionist art and their representation of nature, yet he “found fault in what he considered their intellectual stance” (28). While critics were publishing their disapproval of the impressionistic art, many American and French art collectors were not as discriminating. Some exhibitions were not prosperous, yet Monet often succeeded in selling his art for enough cash to support his upscale lifestyle and buy more canvases.

Some artists were painting nude models and important society members in lavish clothing, but Monet and other artists studied winter landscapes with snow coverage. The rays of sun playing against the snow bestowed Monet and the others a unique opportunity to observe and analyze colored shadows, acknowledges Leymarie (62). Seitz further explains that Monet did not study the objects in nature, but instead focused on individual shades of color in light and shadows until the canvas developed to form his impression of the landscape (28). I maintain that Monet and the others were not only utilizing their technical expertise, but were also enhancing their visionary and imagination skills.

Monet’s first series of paintings was over twelve canvases, displaying various seasonal and light effects on grainstacks and the surrounding landscape. Seitz observes that as subjects, the grainstacks are totally neutral, and Monet painted them more as an architectural form (38). The grainstacks are not symbolic as a theme, and the study of the color and style of illustration is more impressive.

The grainstacks in a field are the focal point of the painting. In the background of each canvas is a vague hill. After one notices the subjects and the landscape, the color effects are a feast for the eyes. De Vries contends that the series is painted in short energetic brushstrokes, and most of the canvases vibrate with sun-drenched color (47). The series is best viewed from a distance for a more dramatic cascade of images and emotions.
It is commonly known that Monet was attracted by the grainstacks that glowed in the sunlight, and when he began to paint them he noticed the effect had changed. Originally Monet thought he needed only two canvases to document sunny and grey weather, but he was in an “almost continual torture to display effects of the weather, atmosphere, and ambiance” (Seitz 38). It is apparent that Monet painstakingly transcribed shadows and illuminating colors of the grainstacks and the landscape. He continuously painted from canvas to canvas as the light effects changed from sunrise to sunset. An alternative examination by Seitz reiterates that Monet shifted from canvas to canvas, similar to a photographer adjusting his compositions (42).

Kapos agrees with Seitz that there is no formal interest in the painting, and the grainstacks are truly unremarkable as a subject (296). Kapos delves further by comparing the “Grainstack” series to music. Monet shows a pronounced ability in color associations, causing them to be harmonious with emotions and images. He adopted a theme and explored countless variations with a minimum of landscape because “he felt impelled to create the most astounding sonatas of modern paintings” (Kapos 296).

Monet’s celebrated “Grainstack” series suggests the effects of light and color in painting represent the true appearance of nature, affirms Hoopes (58). Upon viewing the series, I found it evident that Monet made very subtle distinctions of sunlight, shadows, and color. He discovered certain brushstrokes interpreted shimmer and glow, and he recorded a cycle of alterations in light, weather, and seasons. The paintings that emit an ethereal glow are almost hypnotic. Kapos emphasizes that Monet never grew tired of following any object during the phases of the day, capturing changes as the hours go by, and “contemplating the magic wrought by light” (297).

Summarizing the series, Seitz describes that Monet was “never in closer perceptual, spiritual, or poetic rapport with nature than when he was painting the grainstacks” (38). In my opinion the series works of Monet resemble a scientific experiment in the Impressionist era of painting; however the spirited beauty and radiant colors are expressed in all of his paintings. Monet definitely was one of the most ingenious and most inventive of all the impressionists.

Monet left a portfolio of other highly acclaimed paintings that vividly portray glimpses of life in the late 1800’s. Also included are small villages, streets in Paris, and post-war celebrations. Although Monet recorded a remarkable account of society, his masterly study of the effects of light and shadows on the grainstacks was the most prolific of the Impressionist era. Monet exceeded the acceptable standards of art by presenting neutral objects to reveal what was the most astounding features of painting-illuminating effects and colored shadows.

Works Cited


The Philosopher’s Responses:
RATING: HP

No Comments.

The Psychologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“This is an outstanding paper. Excellent use of research and highly literate--one would only be concerned here of the possibility of *plagiarism* [sic].”

**Group-Specific Responses from Group Two**

One faculty from Allied Health, another from English, and a third from Communications comprised Group Two.

**Group Two Results**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essay Number</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>202</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A-</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>128</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>187</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>B-</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>083</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>C+</td>
<td>B-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>008</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>132</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>B+</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>110</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>A-</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>183</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>232</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>B+</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>099</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>063</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Respondents reached complete agreement in three cases, two essays rated proficient (202 and 008) and one they all rated nonproficient. But there is little consensus between readers and teachers for all three, with the teachers’ ratings considerably higher than the respondents’ in two cases and lower in one.

Respondents reached partial agreement (still a consensus) for essays 128 and 110 in that all three at least found the essay clearly proficient or highly proficient. There is questionable consensus in the responses to essays 187, 132, 232, and 099 because, first, one respondent found the essays nonproficient and, second, one respondent qualified her proficient ratings by adding “low pass” in all four cases. The respondents are split three ways on essays 083 and 063, which indicates no consensus among them, but there is possible agreement between respondents and teacher for 083 because the teacher assigned a C+ and if we were to “average” an HP, a P, and an NP we’d get a C. Unfortunately, missing data about the essay grade for 063 make it impossible to compare the respondents’ three-way split with the teacher’s assessment. Responses for essay 008 are interesting. In this study, this is the only case in which a teacher’s grade is lower than the respondents’. Although we can’t really say Group Two reached a consensus on essay 099 because one respondent found the essay nonproficient, we can claim an agreement between the two respondents who found the essay proficient and the teacher, who assigned a grade of C. We seem to have only a clear agreement between respondents and teachers with essay 110; two respondents gave the essay an HP, and the teacher awarded it an A-. Group Two data suggest considerable grade inflation in that the respondents consistently rated the essays lower than the teachers. Of course, the respondents were
more objective than the teachers, who assigned grades after working with their students for sixteen weeks. Perhaps grade inflation is to be expected.

Group Two Essays and Comments

Group-Specific Essay #12 (Essay 202 of Sample)

Passive Smoke: The Debate

"Involuntary smoking can cause lung cancer in non-smokers" (Surgeon General’s Report 1986, Berger). The physical and psychological effects of passive smoke give the nonsmoker Constitutional rights over the smoker. Due to findings and reports, nonsmokers have certain rights when it comes to a conflicting situation of smoking versus not smoking. Studies have been conducted that prove that non smoker’s health is effected physically and psychologically by second hand smoke. What is second hand smoke?

Environmental tobacco smoke inhaled by a nonsmoker is “second hand” or “passive” smoke (Horrigan 28-34). The actual cigarette produces two types of smoke: mainstream and sidestream. Mainstream is what the smoker inhales from the cigarette which contains carbon monoxide (CO), nicotine, and other additives. Sidestream smoke is what coils into the air from the cigarette which the nonsmoker inhales (Berger 86). This type of smoke contains five times the CO, three times the tar and nicotine, and up to fifty times the number of carcinogens of mainstream smoke (Berger).

Not only is sidestream smoke harmful but is more harmful than mainstream smoke. When a cigarette is not being smoked it burns at a low temperature, thus leading to much dirtier smoke. The reason is that smoking the cigarette draws oxygen through the lit end and increases the burning temperature (Glantz and Daynard). The hotter burning is cleaner when drawn through the cigarette filter than just escaping into the air. Many nonsmokers choose not to smoke because they care about their health and their loved ones around them. All of these pollutants from passive smoke affects the nonsmoker both physically and psychologically.

The physical affects of passive smoke have been a debating issue for centuries. Let us discuss the basics. Nonsmokers who have health problems are easily aggravated by passive/second hand smoke. Problems such as allergies, bronchitis, asthma, or emphysema are agitated even more by polluted tobacco filled air. Heart rate, blood pressure and CO levels increase when breathing smokey air (Berger 87). Not only does the CO level increase but it stays in the blood for long periods of time after exposure. CO is a colorless, odorless poisonous gas that binds to hemoglobin, the oxygen-carrying element in red blood cells, and reduces the blood’s ability to carry oxygen (Glantz and Daynard). Nonsmokers who already have respiratory problems should be able to breath clean air.
When exposed to second hand smoke, current evidence suggest the increase of developing lung cancer (Surgeon General’s Report, Berger).

Those that do not smoke and do not have preexisting health problems are at risk for developing respiratory problems or lung cancer. In the April 1,1981 issue of the Journal of the Isreal Medical Association it summarizes some health effects of second hand smoke that raises questions non smokers should consider when in public and around smokers. (1) Reduced efficiency of lungs. It becomes harder to inhale deeply. (2) Increased risk of disease of the air passages and bronchial tubes. The small airways in the respiratory tract are narrowed by passive smoke. (3) Increased blood pressure and faster heart rate. (4) Decreased motor abilities. Passive smokers who have CO in their blood, rises from 1.6 to 2.2. A CO level of over 2 percent interferes with motor function. (5) Irritation of the eyes, nose, and air passages which is a physical discomfort. (6) Increased tearing, sneezing, runny nose, dry mouth, tiredness, and dizziness (Nat’l ISOSAH). Keep in mind this is the person who chooses not to smoke. Consider the health risks the nonsmokers are exposed to from smokers. Passive smoke also effects nonsmokers psychologically.

It has been documented in studies of college students that passive smoke effects their performance and their grades (Berger). Nonsmoking students exposed to smoking students in college classrooms were effected by the cigarette in their proximity. With what has been presented thus far, passive smoke can definitely affect a nonsmoker’s physical health and psychological state of mind. Due to the poisonous gases and additives that tobacco companies put in the tobacco, when making their special brand, clean air is almost impossible to breath when around someone who smokes. Nonsmokers agree that there are dangers in passive smoke while smokers disagree. There are those that feel that environmental tobacco smoke (ETS) is harmful but not as much as the media and anit-smoking groups claim.

The point a view of tobacco industry representatives and other public merchants are claiming that tobacco smoke is harmful to nonsmokers but only in large doses. Some tobacco industry representatives claim that the conclusions of some scientific studies are not well documented and therefore have untrue conclusions (Berger). They also agree with nonsmokers that pollutants and carcinogens are in the environment, but pointing the finger on tobacco smoke as a leading cause of physical and mental harm is going too far. Everyone agrees that passive smoke is harmful, how harmful? Of course the tobacco industry is not going to admit that their product can cause serious damage to an innocent child or an adult who does not smoke. They would go bankrupt. Although studies have shown that lung cancer in active smokers does not always develop, the more someone smokes the higher the risk of developing lung cancer. Is there a “crossing the line: for nonsmokers who inhale passive smoke? John Bazhaf, executive director of Action on Smoking and Health, and
anti-smoking group in Washington, D.C., says that no amount of passive smoke is safe. Cancer can be caused by a single molecule. (Horrigan 28-34) But contrast to that, Steve Bayard, a bio-statistician who headed a ETS study says, “My feeling is that’s really overstating the case, small does aren’t going to kill you” (Horrigan 28-34). The debate will go on. But the fact still remains that there are studies that have proven that passive smoke does cause lung cancer. As American citizens we have the rights that were established in laws.

The Ninth Amendment and portions of the Constitution states that the enumeration of rights does not deny that other rights are retained by the people (Nat’l Interagency Council on Smoking and Health). Legal scholars found constitutional protection for the right to self-preservation, right to be left alone and many others (Nat’l ICOSAH). These rights give nonsmokers the opportunity to a clean and healthy environment and it gives them the right to stop the other citizens who pollute the environment. So when it comes to the argument of nonsmokers versus smokers in certain situations, the nonsmoker has the right over the smoker. Smoking does not contribute to the well being of society. The smoker has the right to ruin his/her own life but to the life of the person who chooses not to ruin theirs. The nonsmoker should and does have rights over the smoker.

Passive smoke has been discussed and has been shown to be harmful to one’s physical and psychological well being. But what can the nonsmokers do to enhance a smoke free environment? One proposal is to get involved neighborhood by neighborhood and organize public pressure groups on the merchants and restauranteurs that do not have a smoking policy. Another is to sponsor factual lectures in schools and community centers. Still another, petition for a smoking policy in the work place or where one would gather for leisure. The question is not to ban the smoker, but the smoke. The nonsmoker has a right to a healthy non polluted environment and the right to live longer than someone who smokes.

Works Cited
National Interagency Council on Smoking and Health: Luther, Terry L. A Summary of Proceedings (Sept. 9,10, 11, 1970). New York, New

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P
When listing arguments, #d items are not sentences. Awkward wording
--a few spelling errors
Good job overall

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

A. The essay is an attempt at a debate on Passive Smoke:
   1. Student does present argument to show that passive smoke can be deleterious to
      one’s health.
   2. However, student does not present clear arguable statements of opposing side.

B. Paper has some structure in discussing pro and con side--a plus. Paper also has -
   - Introduction w/ a thesis
   - Development pro
     - con (though weak)
   - Conclusion—projections on eliminating problems
   - Works Cited Page though not done correctly even using APA
   - errors, consistently confused effect and affect

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P “Low Pass”

The thesis statement is a little unorganized and the paper does not flow in accordance.
Example: The author starts with physical and psychological effects of passive smoke and
constitutional rights, but he/she begins defining passive smoke and how it is created,
ever addressing constitutional rights until page 5.
However, the author addresses all the points eventually and does a good job with
transitional sentences, fair with spelling and structure and is readable to a general
audience [sic]. The vocabulary is fine and the central issue of two types of smoke are
[sic] discussed in a [sic] understandable fashion.

Group-Specific Essay #13 (Essay 128 of Sample)

Peer pressure isn’t so bad nowadays. When I go out on the weekends I
want to look cool and have a good time, and believe me I’m doing both.
Listening to by friends was the best thing I ever did.
I used to never drink alcohol but my friends talked me into it one night
and it was so great. That night I slammed seven or eight beers as fast as I
could and was so drunk. I can drink that many now and still only have a
slight buzz. That night I was running around, spinning, and acting like a
little kid. After running around for an hour and drinking at the same time, I
started to feel like crap. The room was spinning so fast and the walls were moving in on me. I ended up puking and hugging the toilet for forty-five minutes. Man, when I woke up the next morning I felt worse than I did the night before. I had the biggest headache ever, and I hate headaches, and I could barely stand up since I was so hung over. But hey, it was worth it since I was fitting in with my buddies, although I can hardly remember it.

Although the night I was drunk was excellent, it doesn’t compare to the night some friends and I were high and went out and vandalized some property. One of my buddies had some pot and we passed it around while we were all out driving around town. It was so awesome. The car was absolutely filled with smoke and we were all stoned as hell. We had a couple of beer bottles left in the car from the weekend before, so we decided to put them to good use. We began pitching them out the window and hitting cars and busting their windows. A cop spotted us and we tried to out run him and get away. I had never been so scared before in my life, since we were driving so fast and being chased by a cop. He finally pulled us over and took us downtown. Eventually our parents had to come and get us out of jail. It kind of stunk though, because we had to pay $500 apiece for the broken windshields and I humiliated my parents, but I can’t forget how much fun it was getting high and being in a cop chase.

My friends always said “your first time is the best”, and were they right. One night after we all got stoned again I had my buddy drop me off at my girlfriend’s house since her parents had gone out of town. We were watching a movie and we started kissing. We started going at it and the next thing I knew we were going at it, we had our clothes off, and we were having sex. My girlfriend is four months pregnant now, but my friends were right it was the best thing I had ever done.

If this scenario sounds like you or someone you know, stop and think for a minute. Too many people I know have listened to their friends and found themselves in more trouble than they ever imagined. But why as a teenager, do you give into peer pressure? Do you feel you are an outcast and have the need to fit in somewhere? Some friends I knew felt they needed to look “cool” or had to impress someone. Other people I knew found it hard to say no because they were afraid of being different or being made fun of. In any case these teens were very insecure in who they were. Being a teenager is very difficult, especially in the 90’s, but as a teen you need to realize that by giving into peer pressure you are letting someone else make decisions for you, and you need to take into consideration the consequences that may develop from letting someone persuade you into something you may not want to do.

Many teenagers today are pushed into having sex at an early age. Some hear stories from those people with whom they hang around and sometimes feel pressured to have sex to fit in. The United States has the highest rate of teenage pregnancy of any Western industrialized country (Larson 152). Some teenagers become pregnant or contract some sort of disease. This results mainly because 2/3 of the sexually active teens
in the United States do not or rarely use any form of contraception (Larson 152). Another statistic many of you as teens may not know is \( \frac{1}{2} \) of teenage pregnancies occur six months after becoming sexually active (Larson 152). The disease most Americans are worried about today is AIDS. AIDS is mostly transmitted through unprotected sexual practices. From June 1981 through June 1990, more than 140,000 Americans were diagnosed as having AIDS. Of this group, more than half died, most within four years of showing symptoms of the disease (Larson 849). As sexually active as you as teenagers are, you need to take into consideration some of these facts and statistics before you are pressured into having sex. Is having sex at an early age worth having a baby as a teenager or catching a disease --- possibly AIDS?

Another problem many teenagers are pressured into is the consumption of alcohol. Some teenagers when out with friends or people of their age, often feel pressured to drink alcohol. Whether they just want to look cool or keep from feeling out of place, many teenagers drink alcohol in large consumptions without considering the consequences. When asked by he drank alcohol and gets drunk, Chris Winfield said, “I don’t even know why I drink and get drunk, I always feel like crap the next day.” Ashley Craig said, “When you drink it’s just like poisoning your body,” as he was talking about why he did not understand why teenagers drink and get drunk. When teenagers drink and don’t think about the possible consequences bad things can happen. For instance, every year in the United States, more than 10,000 young people ages 16 – 24 years old, are killed in alcohol-related automobile accidents (Larson 428). If you would listen to those who agree that drinking is wrong and also take into consideration possible consequences of drinking, hopefully you won’t have to experience an alcohol related death, and the number of teenagers who drink may decline.

Another problem among the teenage youth today is violence and crime. Whether some of you teens are under the influence or some sort of drug, or you want to feel good carrying a gun, or whatever reason, violence among teenagers rises every year. In 1989 there were 952 murders committed by offenders under the age of eighteen (Kids 26). Just last week in Louisville there were two incidents where students were found with guns at school --- one of which was only five years old. Some teens are also pressured into other crime such as vandalism. What many of you as teenagers don’t realize about vandalism are the consequences. If you are caught vandalizing you may have to pay a fine, participate in community service, or possibly serve some time in a juvenile detention center. “It was the worst feeling I ever felt, especially since I humiliated my parents . . . I just never considered the consequences,” is what Scott Galkin responded after he was arrested for vandalism. Many teenagers need to realize that carrying a gun, vandalism, and other crime is not cool --- period.

Many teenagers of the 90’s find themselves falling and giving into pressure. Some teenagers may just give into sex, crime, alcohol, or other
drugs; but there are many teenagers who give into all of these things not knowing or realizing the consequences they will have to pay. I have seen too many make the mistake of giving into peer pressure and I hate seeing others make the exact same mistakes. I hope you can realize that giving into peer pressure shows a lack of self confidence, security, and the need to fit into a group.

Works Cited
Craig, Ashley. Personal Interview. March 28, 1995

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

1. thesis well stated and is interesting
2. documented
3. tone/level of diction good
4. analytical etc.
5. few subject-verb problems
   spelling?
   couple of grammatical problems but some good ones too

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

- The essay has structure: Introductory paragraphs (though lengthy), development paragraphs with problems, and a conclusion.
- Fairly good use of transitional expressions
- Few errors.
- Problem with essay--mixed audience. At times the audience is teens; at other times, the teacher or adults, so to speak
- Logic in paper and evidence presented not clearly given.
  Note continuing paragraph page 5: Student uses examples of two incidents in Louisville to show increase in violence in 1995. The two sets of evidence are not justifiably correlative and logically given. Other instances abound similarly in essay.

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

The thesis statement is too brief to show what the paper is about. The examples as narrative[s] are useful and attention getting. In addition, the stories are not followed in sequence when analyzing the behavior (P.3).
There are no serious mistakes in language use or spelling, although the author switches from first to third person several times. The paper lacks serious sources for documentation, relying too much on personal interviews. The overall goal is accomplished. The conclusion is weak in areas, but sums up the paper.

Group-Specific Essay #14 (Essay 187 of Sample)

**Smoking in Public Places**

Do you smoke or know someone who does? If you do then you are probably aware of the controversy that has surrounded smoking in public places. Smoking should be banned in public places.

Researchers say that secondary smoke causes cancer. This means if you are around someone who is smoking you have a chance of getting lung cancer. Everyone should have the right to choose if they want a chance at getting lung cancer. If smoking is allowed in public places then it is unavoidable.

I am a non-smoker; however, I have friends who smoke. I have to deal with it all of the time. The main reason I am against smoking in public places is that it is very irritating. I wear contact lenses, and every time I am around cigarette smoke my eyes dry out and my contacts stick to my eye lids. I do not think it is fair to people who wear contacts to have to tolerate smoke. I am also allergic to cigarette smoke. When I am around someone who is smoking my nose gets runny and I begin to sneeze. Cigarette smoke also irritates those who have asthma and other respiratory problems.

Adults have a chance to avoid cigarette smoke but small children and infants do not. If there were a ban on smoking in public places this would reduce their chance of developing lung cancer and other illnesses from secondary smoke. McDonalds recently banned smoking in their restaurants, because of the large number of children who visit and eat at this establishment.

On the other hand smokers feel they have the right to smoke anywhere they please. They claim that it does not bother anyone. Most smokers are rude by not asking you if you care if they smoke.

Tobacco companies are scared that a ban on smoking would reduce the number of smokers. They feel that this would hurt their industry. This would especially affect Kentucky. I feel that a ban on smoking in public places would not affect tobacco sales much at all. The main reason being that smoking is very addictive. It is hard for people who already smoke to stop smoking.

Non-smokers have been fighting for a ban on smoking in public places for a long time. I feel that a ban on smoking in public places will enable non-smokers to totally eliminate smoke from the air they breathe. The ban will also give children a chance to avoid dangerous second-hand smoke. Everyone should support something that would make things better for small children.
The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P, “very low grade due to brevity and lack of documented support”

1. thesis obvious - awfully brief
2. generalizations but no documented support
3. good tone and level of diction
4. probably has analytical, interpretative, etc. ability but too brief
5. For the most part, good grammar, punctuation, spelling, sentence formation etc.

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

For a short, non researched essay the essay passes. The thesis suggests that the essay will focus on arguing against smoking in public places. However, the essay attempts to present a con side and doesn’t succeed here. The essay does have structure w/ Introduction (plus thesis), development, and conclusion. Content is mediocre and fairly predictable.

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Good general arguments used in this paper, however [sic] the lack of a substantive thesis and a weak conclusion hamper this paper considerably. Additionally, the lack of [in-] text citations (and works cited page) impaire[sic] the credibility of not only the paper, but the arguments[sic] as well.

The level of writing is below freshman level and is focused more on the author and his/her opinion, than on the issue of smoking.

This paper—while not bad and reletivity[sic] clear, is not college level writing, too short, and not well developed in light of the subject. The paper should be more focused and the author have used a higher level of writing style and vocabulary.

Group-Specific Essay #15 (Essay 083 of Sample)

Can We Tell Them What To Say?

The subject with lyrical content in songs has only recently become a matter of national attention. It has been considered controversial as far back as the 50’s with Elvis and his “sexual” lyrics about lovin’ accompanied by the shaking of his pelvis but only recently has it tried to have been linked to the rise of crime and violence.

A big complication comes from trying to define censorship. A good standard definition is “the agency by which unpleasant ideas, memories, ect. are kept from entering the consciousness…” But, as Ira Glasser, the executive director of the American Civil Liberties Union, says “What strikes one person as offensive and obscene does not strike another person as such” (24). But with that as our standard definition we have to realize
that artists and musicians are trying to get ideas, memories, etc. to enter our consciousness. If they didn’t, nobody would care, and there wouldn’t be a problem. They don’t seem to care if these ideas or memories are unpleasant or not. And they have good reason or, to say it better, good protection.

These singers and musicians are backed by the first amendment of the Bill of Rights. It states that “Congress shall make no law respecting an establishment of religion, or prohibiting the free exercise thereof; or abridging the freedom of speech, or if the press; or the right of the people peaceably to assemble, to petition the government for a redress of grievances.” Now, the key point in that is the “freedom of speech” part. Those with explicit and dirty lyrical content in their songs say that laws cannot be passed to stop them from saying what they want on their and in their songs. This is the story for many groups such as Snoop Doggy Dog, Dr. Dre, Ice Cube, Too Short and Tupac Shakur. They are mainly part of the of the music scene called rap. More specifically, the “gangsta” form of rap, which originated in Los Angles and tends to have a grittier, harder-driving sound. Usually the songs contain lyrics about sex, drugs and gangs, and often glorify violence toward women and homosexuals (Myers 26).

So, while it stands that we can’t make laws telling these artists what they can and can’t say, Steve Rabey tells us that early in the spring of 1990 as many as 18 states were debating bills mandating some sort of warning stickers on offensive albums. These states were using a Missouri bill as a model for their bill under consideration. This bill calls for a fluorescent-yellow warning sticker under the recording’s cellophane wrapping. This sticker would alert buyers to the presence of “lyrics promoting, advocating or encouraging suicide; explicit sexual acts including but not limited to rape, sodomy, incest, bestiality, and sadomasochism; murder; morbid violence; or the use of illegal drugs.” The bill would also require retailers to refund the purchase price for any product not marked correctly and prohibits anyone under 17 from going to any concerts where they might hear violent or pornographic performances (42). In his article, Rabey talks with Dana Key whom, as a Christian musician, says that labeling records is the same as rating movies and that “It doesn’t restrict free speech, it merely educates parents” (43).

Let me point out that this isn’t restricted to just rap. Caryl Rivers, a professor of journalism at Boston University, speaks out with her essay against rock lyrics and violence, especially against women. She states how ridiculous it is that we continue to let things go almost unnoticed when we hear of a grisly series of murders in California that were allegedly inspired by an AC/DC ballad. Th is is about the delights of slipping into a woman’s room while she is sleeping and murdering her (206). Rivers goes on to talk about similar songs in which there are “...lyrics about how a man is going to force a woman to perform oral sex on him at gun point.” This is a litter number called “Eat Me Alive” (206).
Rivers says she would like some changes. One of her suggested changes is that “disc jockeys refuse air play to records and videos that contain such violence” mentioned (206). Well, that’s just what happened. In the December issue of The New York Times, Steven Lee Myers talks about WBLS-FM, a popular radio station in New York City, planning to stop playing songs with “lyrics advocating violence or expressing hatred of women” (26). Mr. Carella, a spokesman for the radio station, said that it would “begin to screen all songs played on the air, not just “gangsta rap” songs”, although they are clearly the focus (26). The Rev. Calvin O. Butts, a Baptist pastor in Harlem, says that with this decision “many more young people will get the message and think more seriously about what they’re listening to and what impact it has” (26). That seems to be a step in the right direction if the musicians and artists won’t take responsibility for what they are saying and sometimes allegedly inspiring.

A suggestion of mine, and I’m sure of others, is that we deal with the problem of people using the first amendment as a shield allowing them to say anything they want by reworking the over 200 year old document. I’m not suggesting that much of it be rewritten, just a few bits here and there. It needs to be brought up with the times. A problem I have is that while there are already laws protecting anyone from saying or singing or rapping about killing the president, there is nothing stopping them from glorifying the murdering of a woman or any other person. What makes the president’s life worth more or more valuable than anyone else’s?

On December 4, 1969 a large outdoor concert was held in Altamont, California. It was to a “Woodstock West,” since the front man for the Rolling Stones, Mick Jagger, had been so impressed by the free massive outdoor concert held earlier in 1969 in New York. Security was going to be held by the Hells Angels motorcycle gang in an effort to keep them from causing trouble. When The Stones took the stage they saw a small riot between the Hell’s Angels and concert goers. Seeing the trouble as his band played “Sympathy For The Devil.” Jagger stopped the music to ask the crowd to “cool out”. The violence reached an epidemic in a fight between 18 year-old Meredith Hunter and the Hell’s Angels. Apparently one of the Angels stabbed Meredith in the back and neck. As the Meredith/Angels fight broke out, The Stones finished “Sympathy For The Devil” and began the calmer “Under My Thumb.” Mick Jagger knew that something had happened and called for a doctor not knowing that the boy was already dead. The Rolling Stones didn’t play “Sympathy For The Devil” again for six years after Altamont. The band did play “Under My Thumb” which revealed an instinctive realization that music has the capacity to affect behavior (Stussey 85).

Crime is high. Burglary, rape, vandalism, and violence is at it’s highest right now. One could say that it is due to a higher population in the United States than ever before, and that might be true. But one simply can’t ignore the fact that gangsta’ rap has become more popular crimes have too. Especially when we have teen-agers who have confessed to
attempting suicide because certain rock and roll songs by the group Judas Priest made them feel like they should. These are cases that require action to prevent them from happening in the future. Some great steps are being taken to restrict the sales, involvement, and just general experiencing of violent and “dirty” songs and lyrics. But I am convinced that the only sure way to solving a growing problem like this is to amend some amendments.

Works Cited

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

1. Thesis clear and well stated.
2. Substantive generalizations—clear followthru—get off the topic now and again—but well stated for the most part
3. Good tone and level of diction
4. Great analytical and interpretative qualities overall. Not sure all deductions are sound.
5. Good sentence structure and grammar overall. Occasionally, wording was awkward, but usually for good reason. Interesting too!

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

The printing w/ small, close lettering makes the essay hard on the eyes.
Fairly good essay. Although I had trouble in deciding on HP or P, I decided on P because of the following:
1. printing on page hard on my eyes
2. errors, [such] as fragments, spelling, ww
Good use of intext citations.

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

The thesis sentence is fairly discernable[sic], however[sic] the paper does not really follow it in the manner it is presented. There are several quotes that are effective in the paper—P. 2, Rev. Butts; sticker warning.
However, there are no transitions and several of the paragraphs are cu
“On December 4, 1969....” “A suggestion of mine...”. The conclusion is too short with some careless assessments and gen-
backing of evidence. In sum, this paper is too short for the broad topic
refining and defining. There are parts that need explanations and back
to understand (P. 2)

Group-Specific Essay #16 (Essay 008 of Sample)

MODERATION AND MYTHOLOGY

It’s funny how the human mind perceives things to be track that perception can be from the actual facts. An e-
ception of what a myth, and mythology actually are humans believe myths to be just old tales told by older
children amused, it’s not entirely true. According to th
Heritage dictionary, myth
“is a traditional, typically ancient story dealing beings, ancestors, or heroes, as explaining aspe-
world or delineating the psychology, customs, (1196). The same source defines mythology as
collection of myths belonging to a people and a origin, history, deities. ancestors, and heroes” (As we start into the realm of myths I ask that we allow
so that we can perceive the true meanings that we may dealing with myths. In mythology we analyze how life treated as unimportant events that happen in the course symbolization of flying can be compared to the gods, h
goal can cost, and how moderation plays a role in it al
Some of these characteristics can be analyzed in “De
which shows how a father that wants freedom so bad t achieve that freedom (340- 42). Deadalus sets out to es
imprisonment by making wings for him and his son so escape (340). Deadalus attaches the wings on his son, t
too high because the sun would melt his wings, and no the sea would swallow him up then he kisses his son at
attach his wings to himself (341). They take off on a fl and to freedom, but as the flight starts Deadalus looks l
Icarus going higher than what he told him ( which was as Icarus went higher than midway the sun starts to me
Icarus plunges into the sea (341). Deadalus after seein! the sea reaches his freedom and hangs up his wings as
gods, because freedom costed him the son that he love
Looking at the story of Deadalus and Icarus we find:
who in hopes of escape he tries to make himself and hi creating wings so that they may fly like the gods to rea
Deadalus weighted all the possibilities and felt that he
goal. By creating the wings Deadalus felt that he could be free like the
gods, after all who could imprison a god.

Then there is Flowers for Algernon (352-73) where there is a 37 year old
retarded man who wants to undergo an experimental procedure that will
increase his intelligence. The procedure is experimental and has never
been performed on humans before, but Charlie Gordon will be the first
human to try to the procedure, and he knows that, and just doesn’t care
about the fact that it’s only been done on lab rats because he wants to be
smart.

Charlie undergoes the procedure and over the next few months the
doctors and friends watch as Charlie’s intelligence starts to increase at a
rapid speed (364). For instance, when Charlie starts he is tested on some
ink images and all Charlie sees are ink blots, but as the procedure is
underway Charlie is retested and he starts to see picture images instead of
just ink blots. When Charlie achieves intelligence people start to treat him
differently and the world begins to look strange to him, the only friend
that Charlie has is a lab rat name Algernon who has undergone the same
procedure as Charlie, but as time goes on Charlie watches as the
procedure causes bad effects on Algernon and eventually Charlie watches
as Algernon dies and he knows in his heart that the same thing will happen
to him. In the end Charlie sees how such a rapid change has effected his
entire life and made him feel as a stranger with his old friends, and also a
stranger to himself. Life has become strange to Charlie, and at the same
time death is more forthcoming to him (372).

As we see in these two stories, myths deal with life and death as just
unimportant events that happen in the course of the process and they
shouldn’t stop the cycle nor should it effect the way one exist in this
world. As we look at life and death mythologically we see that the two are
nonstop circles that never ends, because in order to have life or birth one
must have death. In each story death is not an important event, but the
achievement of the goal is the main focus.

The achievement of the goal is the main focus, but that goal will cost an
amount that a person must weigh carefully before paying to see if one can
afford to pay that price. Sometimes one can pay a price that they can not
live with, because that price can totally change them in a way that they
didn’t think was possible. For instance, Deadalus paid the price of a son
to achieve his goal, and it effected the way he looks at life, also looking at
Charlie Gordon we can see that he paid the price of friendships, self
worth, and his world as kind simple world for the achievement of
intelligence. We must weight these costs has we look toward our goals,
and ask ourselves if we are willing to pay the cost, and can we live with
the cost and the way that the cost may change us and the way that we look
at life and the world.

When we look at things such as life, death, and the achievement of
goals we must learn to use moderation in each and every aspect that we
encounter. If we use moderation as we think of the gods and the goals that
we want to achieve we will realize that the sacrifices we encounter will not upset or disturb the way that we look at the gods or the prices that we have to pay to achieve our goals. Then life and death can be perceived as the myths see it, has unimportant events in the big endless process.

We have touch briefly into the realm of myth and mythology and we can look at when using moderation one can take a more realistic look at gods as being something that may be explained but not copied, and because a person can fly it doesn’t mean that they are gods or even supernatural. When we think of symbolism if we use moderation we will be able to make the connection between the symbols and the meaning that the author intended. Also through the use of moderation one can see the possibility of reaching a goal without paying a price that one can not live with, so remember moderation can be the key to all the wonders of life and myths if use it wisely.

Works Cited

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P “low”

1. Thesis fairly well stated
2. Substantive generalizations (Points are fairly clear).
3. Tone and level of diction good except awkward sentence structuring draws away from the theme and interrupts thoughts.
Some run-on sentences
spelling errors
tense changes
singular to plural subject changes
Better editing would be [a] good idea--Thoughts are wonderfully related—the theme continues throughout

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

Again this paper could have received HP or P, but I selected P because of
1.) Errors in grammar and mechanics (as RT, CS, WW, spelling)
2.) Some unclear passages in certain parts.
Essay has solid structure w/ Introd. Dev. para. and conclusion.
Rather difficult topic, but student succeeds in some parts in developing a clear essay.

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

While the thesis is not well-developed, the story is not hard to follow. The stories are effective in developing the ideas and lessons taught by myths. The writing is on the college level and the structure (paragraphing, verb tense, etc.) is fine. The conclusion could have been stronger and some of the concluding ideas (symbolism and moderation) were not introduced until late in the paper. The cites[sic] were weak (two were a dictionary) and the paper somewhat short. The paper is readable by a college audience, the story works and the conclusion is OK.

Group-Specific Essay #17 (Essay 132 of Sample)

WOMEN and MEN: how they communicate in the job workplace
Men and women can get along in the workplace; we just need to respect each others’ views and ways. When we begin to see how our style determines how we communicate at work, I think we will learn to change for the better. Most jobs require people to be assertive, not aggressive. Being assertive means that you can handle problems and give direct orders to fix the situation. Most women don’t give direct orders, because of the way they were raised, I believe. But people have done well at work without direct orders, this can allow people to be creative. We are just learning how to communicate with each other. Pamela Kruger believes that women are increasing at jobs and to understand each other will be helpful for both men and women (41).
I have tried to learn how women communicate at work by partly observing my female coworker and what I have learned is that she is assertive when needed, but talks and greets people more than I do. Men need to learn to be more open like women, but women need to learn to become assertive without going over the line to be aggressive. When people are aggressive they demand things to be done and use strong tone about everything. When some women have never been taught to be assertive they go beyond the line to aggressiveness. I think that they can’t deal with using the right amount of force.
I have recently done a survey and it shows that men are higher rated than women in the workplace. Seven out twelve people agreed that women give direct orders, but the statement: men are valued higher than women in the workplace, only one disagreed, all the rest of the males and females either agreed or strongly agreed. My survey is limited because I only gave the survey to six people of each sex. Six out of the twelve people agreed that men take peoples feelings into account and four of the six were women.
The rest of the statements I did not expect the answers I got so we must be doing something right together. This is just an example of how the workplace is. Pamela Kruger writes "in the 1970’s...it wasn’t surprising that many women, when surveyed, consistently said they would rather work for a man (40)." I do believe that we can both achieve the communication skills needed for the workplace. Men and women out there in the workplace have the ability to become as equal as possible at jobs, I believe. If males and females can look at situations from each others point of view there will be much better teamwork at jobs.

Men are more assertive than females in the workplace. Some women are assertive and men work better with them, but the women working with assertive females don’t like them according to Loraine O’Connel. From my communication’s professor, I learned that most women don’t want to be taught the interworkings of a job by a female. O’Connell believes females say that women bosses don’t tell you what you need to know, and the ones that do are taken offense to. I just want to show you that women and men need to find a midpoint with each other.

Men are brought up not to show emotion and to be forceful whenever they have to be, while women are brought up to be more caring, emotional, and loving. All this effects the way we communicate in the workplace. If men can look at how women communicate and learn some of their ways, like discussing problems, and the ways to solve the problem, will better each other. From my own experience if I make a mistake at work, the approach to this problem is direct, while the manager explains more to my female coworker. I believe we both messed up on signing up a customer and little more understanding with her. This is an example of how females are viewed in the workplace. If the manger took the same approach to both of us she might have had a different reaction, but I don’t think so.

This has brought problems for males and females in the workplace. Sexual harassment cases have gone up considerly, and my have been going on for a long time, without being reported. Beuchesne writes that “in the StatsCan survey, conducted last year, 23 percent of respondents reported that they were victims of workplace-related sexual harassment at some time in their careers.” I believe that men are just using their power to take control over womens’ lives. The report also said that people at workplaces did not try to get rid of sexual harassment that much. I think that bosses and coworkers feel they can still get away with it, maybe they know somebody higher up or they know nothing will be done.

The reason we are treated so differently is because the workplace has been dominated by the male standards. Recently though we have been trying to close the gap, so the workplace will become more productive. The problem is that “the male is trained not to show emotion and the female is trained to show emotion and when either reacts, they react to a situation the way they were trained (Pitt). Pitt explains that when our
society is in a process; since about the beginning of time, it is hard to change and we will stay in that frame of mind for years to come.

I do believe that men and women communicate differently, and if we didn’t life wouldn’t be as exciting. If men say one thing we don’t mean another. “To be truly successful in the ‘90s, you must be fluent in Femalespeak and Malespeak.” What she means is that women will explain a problem in various ways while most men give you one solution. Men are direct and straight to the point while women are more passive, and take people’s feelings into account. There are few women who are direct, but the ones that are; are criticized for it from the women. Most women won’t speak of their ideas unless they are sure about it.

The way we can adopt each others ways of communicating is by the way we raise our children. If we learn to let males show some emotion and teach females to be less passive then and only then will we be able to understand each other. But with the way it is the standard ideas are embedded in our heads, and will take quite a while to work them out.

“Either style can work well with others who share that style. But neither works well in every situation (O’Connel).” So together we can make the job workplace run better, and communicate with each other without harming each sexes feelings. There will always be something that we can’t change about each other and don’t like.

Sexual harassment is another problem we need to address. I think since mens’ ways of communicating are so different this happens allot. Although there are some cases where it really happens, I think it has gotten out of hand. If males can learn to communicate on the same level as females this might not happen as much. We need to put the differences aside and learn from each other. We may not get rid of all the problems but the workplace can be better for both sexes. People high up on the corporate ladder should look at and change how we communicate, it would make the workplace more productive.

Works Cited

O’Connell, Loraine. “Can we (really) talk? For sucess at work, bone up on genders’ chat styles.” Orlando Sentinel 8 NOVEMBER 1994, 3 Star:Page E1


The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:

RATING: P “low”
Picasso and Cubism

Pablo Picasso lived amid a clutter of accumulated things. He felt that certain objects and forms would impose themselves on his consciousness. It was from among the piles of clutter that he conceived the ideas for his still life paintings. He was an inconsistent and unpredictable individual and not beyond borrowing or stealing ideas from other painters. This man seemed to have little respect for inanimate objects, yet inanimate objects appeared frequently in his paintings. The meaning of Picasso’s paintings was so private that only a few of his closest friends could understand them. In Cubism, his greatest works were still lifes. He transformed things into metaphors which left one with feelings of uncertainties. He had developed more imagination than most artists of his time (Boggs 99-103).

In 1907 Iberian and Negro sculptures had become major influences on Picasso’s art. From this influence, he went to abstract which presented a change to modern art. He used distorted outlines and bold flat patterns.
Primitive and exotic arts were now his inspiration. His painted figures were massive and totally unconventional as far as beauty. Picasso's figures appeared flat, angular, and violently distorted. His influence with African Negro sculptures was found in his paintings of Cubism. He has been attacked, slandered, honored, defended, and explained probably more than any other painter in history. Yet most people have agreed he was a brilliant artist. His way was take it or leave it, since he was responsible only to himself. His works were synonymous with Cubism, an introduction to modern art. One had to look beyond the mass and bulk of his figures for the true meaning. The pictures were of cubes, cones, spheres, and musical instruments brought together on his canvas. These works represented his moods. One may not have understood his Cubist works of art, yet one could not have helped but admire his great accomplishments (Barr 9-60).

According to Foster (69-102), Pablo Picasso was greatly influenced by primitivism, as painted in his famous Les Demoiselles d'Avignon, 1907. The fantasies regarding the origin of gender and sexuality played a part of this primitive scene. The scene depicted sexual differences and oppositions of female and male, black and white, nature and culture, passive and active, and homosexual and heterosexual. These both attracted and repelled the artist. This particular painting spoke of the savagery in the midst of civilization and was also an expression of masculinist mastery. He visited the ethnographic museum in Paris, 1907. This visit, a traumatic racial encounter for him, and a visit to a bordello, a traumatic sexual encounter, caused Picasso to rethink his Cubist painting, Les Demoiselles d'Avignon. He crossed primitive and prostitutes, which were most delirious to him, and thus his painting had been created. You could say he had become possessed by these two visits. He found the intimacy of the sacred and the defiled, and the potency of dirt and disorder in the primitive. But, he hated the dirt, smell, and eroticism. He was caught up in it, but reacted against it.

Wilkin's article points out sensuality, aggression, and lust were all reflected in Pablo Picasso's paintings. Les Demoiselles d'Avignon, 1906-1907, has been regarded as the first identifiable Cubist picture. This painting still has the capacity to shock individuals. The human figures depicted violence and a reinvented anatomy in cubes. This style destroyed old values and introduced new possibilities. Nudes continued to be dominant subjects in his works. These works were very daring and exciting. The figures had angles and planes instead of curves, which represented geometric forms that later defined his style as modern art or Cubism. This style represented that nature should be treated in terms of a cylinder, cone, and sphere. The object was the starting point. From the object, elements were abstracted and compositions created of imagined rather than observed forms and relationships. The paintings depicted the shattering of forms and penetration of masses by space. Picasso's female nudes were recognizable and believable. He went from classical reference,
to archaic mask, to primitive diety in the hands of the heads of the five figures in Les Demoiselles d'Avignon (195-299).

Cubism developed from the great changes occurring in Europe in 1907. It provided examples of all modern design, townplanning, and architecture. This period of time was a moment lasting six to seven years that was experienced by a certain number of people. The promises of the future were more substantial than the present. Great changes were taking place and man took over the territory in space and time where God had been presumed to exist. In Europe, this was a period of poverty, fear, and desperation that was coming to an end. This modern art expressed a new relationship between man and reality. There was a space, in a Cubist painting, in that one form could be assumed to be behind another. There have been many viewpoints in a Cubist painting. Anything was painted in cubes; trees, landscapes, people, musical instruments, tables, and chairs. The artist arrived at a more complex image of reality than ever before. As stated earlier, these forms were reduced to cubes, cones, and cylinders, and these forms were interchangeable with one another. The space between objects was part of the same structure as the objects themselves. In the Cubist picture, the conclusions and connections were given. They were the picture (Berber 9-23).

Pablo Picasso’s Les Demoiselles d’Avignon was one of the first defined Cubist paintings. The Cubist paintings depicted cubes or erratic blocks. These artists painted from memory and Picasso had such force that his works appeared brutal. His figures had razor-like sharpness of face and limbs. This violence had been traced to Negro sculpture which held fascination for many painters. The paintings included space and time, as well as mass. One had to study the object to see the picture as a whole. The painters were freed from reality in these paintings. Partial impressions rushed together, overlapped, and overlaid each other. One was aware of certain disorderliness. It was not unusual for a painting to consist of nothing but interruptions. The origin of the term, Cubist, has remained unknown (Schmeller 5-26).

According to Miller’s article, Picasso used musical instruments in his Cubist paintings to represent human form. It was difficult to decide where the human figure stopped and the instrument began. They were interchangeable. The paintings represented sex, love, and desire. Picasso would give a title to a painting as a private reference to his lover at the time. He would write his desire and love through his art works (443-461).

Pablo Picasso developed still lifes with more imagination than any other artist in history. He treated objects as material things. Cubism was totally objective and did not represent symbolism or sentiment. This artist thought of still lifes as a way to express disagreements, confrontations, and sex. He would represent himself as a bottle to express his feelings or as a release of emotion. His still lifes represented each new love affair and reflected his moods (Philadelphia Museum of Art, Philadelphia, Pa. 91-92).
Even thought Picasso was an extremely creative artist, feminists today have said he was cruel to his lady friends and have removed him from study for female artists. Critics said the person in real life must be separated from the artist. His works represented his love-hate feelings toward women. Some critics felt Picasso had a love for violence. Others say he was inventive, fearless, and playful. He gave us the motivation for modern art. Cubism was successful because it was many different things to different people. In the Cubist painting, Les Demoiselles d’Avignon, one critic felt Picasso had suffered a breakdown. This are work was consuming and overwhelming (Gardner, Rubin, Halley, Murray, and Varnedoe (116-119). This great artist died April 8, 1973, at the age of ninety one. He had his sketching materials by his bedside as he often had the urge to draw in the middle of the night. He opened all doors with his art works and his works have remained very controversial. These range from radical feminists who said he was mean to his girlfriends and refused to study his works, to the critics who said he was the greatest painter of the century. He had initiated much controversy over his paintings throughout his career.

For over seventy years, Picasso gave us still lifes which no one has equaled in our century. His works have often not been understood since they reflected the man and his many moods. He was married several times and had many love affairs. His development of Cubism in 1907 was a language all its own. Most individuals who have been privileged to view his works are in wonder of the painter and have often been shocked at what they saw. His paintings were contrasts and contradictions, savagery and aggressiveness, social responsiveness and tenderness. Even thought he stole and borrowed ideas from other painters, his art works were very unique (O’Donovan 86-88). Pablo Picasso will live forever through his paintings.

Works Cited
O’Donovan, Leo. 'All the Things I Like:' Picasso’s Still Lifes.” America 167 (1992): 86-88.

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“[N]o criticisms—met all areas 1-5, with excellence, in my opinion. This person has talent! And I know nothing of Picasso/Cubism.”

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

--Essay has no definite voice
--Also student uses intext citation[s], but reader cannot determine what is paraphrased and what is not. Note paragraph 1 page one, intext citation is used, but reader doesn’t know when the paraphrasing or summary begins. The same problem occurs throughout the essay.
--Paragraph on Picasso’s treatment of women on p. 5 needs to be more related to the content of essay.
--Great Works Cited Page!

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

Good use of metaphors and descriptive[sic] language. While the thesis statement was a little weak and disjointed, the writing was very strong and vocabulary high. The paper was insightful, descriptive[sic] and very “alive” on the subject. While the focus could have been narrowed (to just the one painting, Les Demoiselles) the reader gets a sense of what the artist was thinking and what cultural influences were important when he was painting. The reference list was extensive for this paper and the conclusion was effective and inclusive of the points made in the paper. It could have been a bit more organized—that is it could have “flowed” smoother, but a reader will understand the focus of the paper even so.

Group-Specific Essay #19 (Essay 183 of Sample)

Should Condoms Be Distributed in Schools?

Condoms should be distributed in schools. Students are sometimes afraid of buying them. If they were distributed at school, it would help out the students who are afraid of buying them or can not afford them.

There are millions of teenage girls who get pregnant every year. This is due to them having unprotected sex. Teenagers should not be having babies, they will probably never be successful in life if they do. If condoms were given to them, the pregnancy rate for teenagers would go down.
A person can get HIV or Aids from having unprotected sex. They can also get a sexually transmitted disease. The only way to prevent these diseases is to not have unprotected sex. By giving out condoms to students and teaching them about Aids and STD, the rate of people dying form these diseases will go down.

Some people believe distributing condoms in schools would be too expensive. The money used would lower the teenage pregnancy rate, then young girls would not be getting pregnant and collecting welfare.

Condoms do not promote sex at all. They promote safe sex, which is good. Many parents would disapprove of condoms being given to their teenagers in school, because they do not want them to have sex. Teenagers are going to have sex, no matter what their parents say, so why not give them condoms so they will practice safe sex.

Distributing condoms will help out teenagers in school so much. I strongly feel this should be done to prevent pregnancy, Aids, and STD.

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

1. Thesis obvious—pretty logical presentation
3. Tone and level of diction fair. Easy to read for the most part. Good points at times—but very short with no research—just opinion.
5. Grammar, sentencing[sic], spelling not good in spots. More time commitment probably needed.
Interesting paper though!

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“For an Eng.102 essay the paper lacks adequate development. Most of the dev. paragraphs consist of generalized statements with no or little examples, specifics or support. Some errors also interfere with the reading.”

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Very Poor! There is no thesis for the paper and a highly scant and inadequate conclusion. In addition, simple spelling errors are evident and broad generalizations, unfounded correlations and reasons are used in the body as evidence. There are no sources cited in text or at the end of the paper. The paper is too short to be effective as either an argument (which was intended, I think) or an informative piece.
THE TURN OF THE SCREW: A Book Review

The *Turn of the Screw* is truly the "masterpiece" it is known as. It is a masterpiece of imagination gone wild in the mind of "the governess." Nevertheless, many avid readers have been caught up in the realistic fantasies of the governess, with no clear evidence or supporting facts.

The mind of the governess was full of romance, intrigue and fantasy. "I suppose I had expected, or had dreaded, something so dreary that what greeted me was a good surprise. I remember the lawn and the bright flowers . . . the clustered tree-tops . . . in the golden sky. The scene had a greatness that made it a different affair from my own scant home . . . in the golden sky. The scene had a greatness that made it a different affair from my own scant home . . . a civil person who dropped my as decent a curtsy as if I had been the mistress or a distinguished visitor."

The existence of the apparitions was only in her vivid imagination. The governess was a poor, naive young woman who was thrown overnight into an affluent world which gave her supreme authority over the estate. The awesome responsibility that she was given was too much for her to handle. Eventually, she lost whatever sense of reality that she may have once had. "Of course I was under the spell, and the wonderful part is that, even at the time, I perfectly knew I was. But I gave myself up to it; it was an antidote to any pain, and I had more pains than one. I was in receipt in these days of disturbing letters from home, where things were not going well." She was having troubles at home, and her escape was the obvious obsession with the children. She once asked herself, "But with this job of 'my' children what things in the world mattered?" Several times she had referred to Miles and Flora as "my children."

In her first few sightings of the male apparition, the governess imagined to herself, "He was the same . . . as he had been seen before, from the waist up . . . On the spot there came to me the added shock . . . that it was not for me he had come." Later she described in more detail to Mrs. Gross the figment in her imagination, "He has red hair, very red, close-curling, and a pale face, long in shape, with straight, good features and little, rather queer whiskers that are as red as his hair, his eyebrows are somehow darker; they look particularly arched and as if they might move a good deal. His eyes are sharp strange - awfully . . ." What she described was clearly a mixture of the devil and Quint, which she had dreamed up in her mind. She possibly saw a portrait, a sculpture, or perhaps a description was given of Quint from the other servants. She was certainly caught up in a fantasy of heroism as she describes her story, and the picture of her state of mind; "But I was in these days literally able to find a joy in the extraordinary flight of heroism the occasion demanded of me." It was the demons inside her own head that danced around. She would say to herself, "They harassed me so that sometimes, . . . I shut myself up audibly to rehearse . . . in my room, I flung myself about, but I always broke down in
the monstrous utterance of names. I felt myself crimson and covered my face with my hands.”

Mrs. Gross was very skeptical but very intrigued with the convincing obsession of the governess, and at times, she possibly believed her. Mrs. Gross gave vague descriptions and short excerpts from conversations of the former servants. The governess’ curiosity, along with Mrs. Gross’ sordid tales, helped to feed the wild fire of imaginations in the governess’ mind. Due to the constant obsessive allegations of the governess, Mrs. Gross was filled with fear and confusion. The older woman never admitted to seeing the apparitions but denied them till the end. There was a time when the governess tried to convince Mrs. Gross and Flora that Miss Jessel was a reality. But Mrs. Gross exclaimed, “She isn’t there, little lady, and nobody’s there and you never see nothing, my sweet!” Even young Flora blurted out, “I don’t know what you mean. I see nobody. I see nothing. I never have. I think you’re cruel. I don’t like you!”

The boy, Miles, was a typical young lad who yearned for the companionship of a male figure. Mischievous as young boys will be, he considered himself bad on a couple of occasions. He was feeling smothered, and admitted that he wanted to leave. “When in the world, please, am I going back to school?” he questioned. The governess was starting to feel young Miles pulling away, although she tried to remain clam. Not only once did he ask, but again, “then when am I going back?” “If you’re happy here why would you want to go away?” the governess asked. Miles started to sense the fear of the governess, and replied with a more suitable answer, “Well I want to see more of life.” Miles proceeded with asking about his uncle and in response the governess made a cruel statement, “I don’t think your uncle much cares.” In desperation Miles replied, “Then don’t you think he could be made to?” The governess was using this to keep the boy. Maybe she was in fear that if she lost the children, she would lose her job and be forced to go back home and face her difficulties.

Miles tried his best to convince the governess that the apparitions were real. At times he would go along with her strange imaginations, possibly in hope that if she became completely crazy, he could somehow break away from her obsessive clutch.

Toward the end, the fear of losing Miles, after she had already lost Flora, was too much for the governess. In her desperate mental and emotional distress, she lost what little sanity she had left. Unfortunately, it was little Miles who fell victim to the governess. When they were alone with her imagined visions, the governess got her hands on him at last. “I caught him, yes, I held him – it may be imagined with what a passion;” she said. Mysteriously, Miles died at that moment.

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P “low”
1. Thesis--book report--not much intro.--difficult for the reader (who is unfamiliar with book
2. Substantive generalizations present, but awkward. So many quotes that the story did not flow well. However, some quotes were integral to the report and added to it.
3. Tone and level of diction good
4. Analytical and interpretative --hard to judge.
5. Sentence structuring good, grammar good. Not sure about punctuation “quotes within quotes”

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

This essay is one that caused me some consternation. I was unsure of whether to give it a P or NP. I decided on Proficient because of
1.) relatively good beginning paragraph with emphasis or focus on the fantasies of the governess[sic]
2.) Some developing paragraphs
3.) a conclusion that was not separate
Paper lacks clearly written structure, although it does have some structure. Intext citation[s] not correctly used with pages given.

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

First the writer assumes that the readers know of this story, the characters and the meaning. The title of the paper indicates the paper will be a book review. But the paper appears as more of a description[sic] of the book or story than a review.
The author’s writing is not clearly evident as many (too many) quotes are used to tell stories in the paper. The only thesis is in the opening paragraph (two sentences) which is ambiguous.
There is no clear conclusion and no evidence of transitions between paragraphs as new subjects are introduced. What little writing appears to be pretty good, but the point of the paper is lost early on. There were no guidelines for what the author was examining, nor what audience the paper was meant.

Group-Specific Essay #21 (Essay 099 of Sample)

Anne Frank The Diary of a Young Girl

Anne Frank The Diary of a Young Girl, was written by Anne Frank herself. This dairy started as nothing more than a book with a red and white cover and blank pages inside. This book was given to Anne Frank on her thirteenth birthday as a gift from her mother and father. Anne could express herself very well on paper, so she was delighted to receive the diary. To Anne, this diary was her closest friend and she called her diary Kitty. Anne believed she could express herself in any manner and write whatever she wanted since no one would ever read what she had written in
her diary. This is exactly what Anne did, The Diary of a Young girl portray’s Anne’s life in many different aspects (Hurwitz 3-12). In 1947 Anne’s diary was published as Het achterhus, and in 1952 was published in English as The Diary of a Young Girl (Reader’s Encyclopedia 349-350). Anne Frank The Diary of a Young Girl was also made into a play and film, which were both called The Diary of Anne Frank (World Book 484). Through Anne’s diary we have learned much about Anne herself and of what went on during World War II.

Anne Frank The Diary of a Young Girl begins it’s first entry on Sunday, 14 June, 1942. The diary begins by explaining how Anne felt on the morning of her birthday. Anne seems to be a very outgoing and eager person, the diary explains that Anne was eager to get out of bed and open her present’s, but would not because she was not allowed up at that time of the morning. Anne seems to love her family, as she talks about them often in her diary. Anne call’s her mother and father darling parent’s and seems as if she is very open and honest about everything with her parent’s. The diary makes Anne seem as though she is a girl who is very confident in herself as she talks of not having to worry about going on the next grade because she is sure that her and her girlfriends will make it through. This diary makes me feel that Anne has no problem getting along with other people, but is very shy when it comes to the boy’s in her life. This diary explains much of Anne’s life, but more of Anne’s personal feeling’s. At times in the diary Anne get’s frustrated at her mother and write’s some terrible thing’s, but then wonders why she did it. Anne feel’s that she should not write letter’s of hate about anyone. Anne and her sister Margot are very close, they get along very well but Anne also feel’s a sense of piece when everyone is away. When the Frank’s received the call-up notice Anne thought it was for her father and was very scared, but when she found out that it was actually for her sister it became worse. Anne showed how frightening it would bee to lose a sixteen year old sister and wondered why would someone take a girl of this age away all alone. The diary shows how the family stuck together and would never allow a member of their family to get hurt, instead they would all take a risk for each other and go into hiding (Frank 1-241).

The diary has become very popular for this section of the Frank family in hiding. In the diary Anne explains how “The Secret Annex”, the place where the Frank family hid would never feel at home, but that it was a comfortable place for hiding. Anne was a very bored person while in hiding, but she managed by talking with a boy named Peter who was also in hiding and also went on studying her lessons for school. When some one would knock on the door or ring the door bell to the Annex Anne would become a very nervous and frightened little girl as she believed it was probably the German police coming for them. The diary explains how life went on in hiding for Anne up until Tuesday, 1 August, 1944. Anne was a very brave girl through this time in her life, just waiting to see if she would be captured and killed or would she not be found in her hiding
place. This diary also shows how Anne is stuck in this hiding place through her teenage years and starts to like Peter. In the diary Anne shows how worried of a person she is by being concerned when her mother or father is the least bit ill. As I read the diary I got the impression that Anne is somewhat a daddy's girl, by the way she explains herself in the diary as not being able to speak with her mother as she can with her father. Anne seem's to be a people person since she get's so excited when new people come into hiding with them, although the Annex is no big house Anne is willing to welcome each person who needs to go into hiding. The diary portray's Anne as being a thoughtful person who is willing to share, as food get's scarce Anne never seems to mind sharing and never complains about what she doesn't have (Frank 1-241). Anne’s diary continues up until August 4, 1944 when the german police invaded the Annex.

When the Frank family was arrested Anne’s diary got left behind, as the police searched the house the pages of her diary were scattered everywhere. Miep Giles the woman who worked for Anne’s father found the pages ad kept them to give to Anne. When Anne passed away Miep then gave the diary to Anne’s father. As Anne’s father read the diary he himself could not believe what his daughter had written, Otto then began allowing other people to read the diary. The people who read the diary agreed that it should be published and so this is how Anne’s diary was published (Rol and Verhoeven). Though Anne passed away she is still remembered today.

When Anne’s diary ended Willy Lindwer went on the write about the last seven months of Anne’s life. Six Jewish women who survived during this time, unlike Anne were with Anne after she was captured. These women witnessed everything that went on between the German police and the Frank family. Willy Lindwer traced these women to get their stories so that he could make a documentary film of Anne’s ordeal. After tracing these women and getting their stories he was able to make the film. This film was first shown on public television as a tribute to her Sixtieth birthday, and won an Emmy Award (Lindwer 9).

Anne Frank is now the best known symbol for the Jews who were murdered in World War II. The diary which she wrote has been published in more than fifty countries, and is now a very popular book to us all (Lindwer -11). Many people find Anne’s diary a legend.

I myself first remember hearing of Anne Frank in middle school. Watching the movie and reading her diary make me realize how much I take for granted of what I have today. This diary is very good, yet sad. I wish Anne would have lived to see that her race, the Jews should not be discriminated against. Anne should have had her chance then to live her life a Jews today are doing, and all though she’s not I’m sure many Jews feel how lucky they are today not having to go through what Anne went through.

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P “low”

1. Thesis Anne Frank--easy to read for the most part
2. Substantive generalizations--good description in most areas/easy to follow. Some characters not introduced, but most are.
3. Tone and level of diction good.
4. Analytical and interpretative good
5. Weak areas--
   --most plurals are written’s
   --tense changes
   --sentences run on and are not punctuated correctly in some areas
   --a few typos. Editing would help.

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

--Structure fairly solid
--Errors are quite noticeable and almost resulted in a failing grade of NP for essay.
Errors, such as apostrophe in simple verb form throughout essay, were a real problem to me. Yet I realized that this was one problem in writing. Also lack of underlining books also[sic] was a problem.
Yet paper has
   1.) structure w/ I, D, C.
      a.) fairly good introduction
      b.) clear development of book’s parts
      c.) appraisal of work.

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

The writing and vocabulary is[sic] not of a college freshman level in this paper. It needs transitional sentences, shorter paragraphs and more action verbs. The conclusion is not compelling, but rather simple and obvious.
The thesis is questionable at best and does nothing for setting up the paper and forcasting[sic] the story. There were no sources cited at the end--although some were cited in the text. The audience is a level or two below college and would be bored with the language use, short choppy sentences and lack of the paper “coming alive” on such a moving subject.

Group-Specific Essay #22 (Essay 063 of Sample)

Lifemates is a self help book written by Harold Bloomfield md. And Sirah Vettese PhD. Dr Bloomfield is a well know psychiatrist and his wife, Dr. Vettese, is an experienced counselor, and both specialize in couples therapy. Their book is designed to provide married couples with the skills necessary to a successful marriage. They use many personal
example from their own relationship to illustrate many of the difficulties couples can face. The first third of the book is filled with their experiences. The program they advocate in the text is what they call “the love fitness program.”

- Their fitness program has many steps that lead to a successful relationship. The one thing that many of those steps have in common is the importance of communication. According to Bloomfield and Vettese, good communication is one of the linch pins that a relationship is based on. Without proper communication on both sides, a caring and lasting relationship is near to impossible.

- One important facet of communication that is stressed is honesty in conflict. Many people find it difficult to be honest while arguing. They do not accept responsibility for their actions and become very defensive. The ability to step back in the middle of a fight and look at your actions objectively is definitely not instinctual. It takes a lot of self control and effort to do it on a consistent basis. One tactic suggested in to stop an argument before it turns into a blaming match is to ask yourself a set of questions. Ask yourself what the argument is really about, and ask yourself what you are actually being accused of. Ask yourself why you have become angry. This simple exercise can reduce a great deal of stress in the relationship by itself.

- Bloomfield and Vettese also advocate bringing in a third party, if necessary. Marital therapy can allow the couple to be in a neutral setting and take an objective look at their relationship. The counselor or psychiatrist can observe the couple interact and point out possible problems with their communication and problem solving skills. Since both of the partners typically have to agree to seek counseling for it to be effective, both tend to be much more willing to be objective and listen to the counselor.

- A third component of a healthy and lasting relationship and marriage is a successful sex life. This is yet another area that good communication can influence. For the majority of couples, one partner’s idea of a fun sexual evening does not necessarily correspond with the other partner’s idea. One suggestion offered by Lifemates is alternating turns. Taking turns being in charge in the bed can lead to a very exciting sex life as well as a fulfilling one. Another idea put forth by Vettese and Bloomfield is setting aside one night for the purpose of sex. This can be one night a week, one night a month, or whatever the couple’s schedule permits. This night can be used to explore each other’s fantasies or reenact ones already experienced.

- Overall, this is an excellent instruction manual for a rewarding and enduring relationship. Both my wife and I have read Lifemates, and both of us applied the lessons learned to our marriage. As a result, we have grown closer, and our relationship has grown. I definitely recommend this book for anyone having problems with their spouse or significant other, and for those that wish to avoid many of the pitfalls of a relationship.
The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP “or P if documentation was necessary. Authors are referenced, but no specific info”

1. Thesis--description of a book--very well stated
2. Good generalizations/synopsis clearly stated
3. Tone and level of diction good
4. Analytical, interpretative? Yes!
5. Very well written. Awfully short? Is this OK?
Gammar excellent for the most part
Presented well--Interesting!

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

Fairly direct book review. Has a few errors.
   a.) states kind of text or book and point of book
   b.) components of book
   c.) overall appraisal

The Communications Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

There is no thesis statement to this piece and no transitional sentences as well. The vocabulary is OK--average for freshman students, however[sic], there are a few grammatical errors. The subject is easily understandable, however[sic], the paper is disorganized. The last part of the first paragraph discusses the “first third of the book is filled with their [author’s] experiences.” Then the subsequent paragraphs discuss different parts-- “one important facet,” “Bringing in a third party,” “a third component,” and a conclusion. These need to be coordinated and introduced in the thesis and flow to the conclusion. The conclusion is an appraisal of the usefulness of the book to the author of this paper. But the conclusion assumes a “problem with their spouse” rather than a book to help a “relationship” as the paper is introduced.
Finally--the paper is really too short, no resources, use of “bullets” (...) and a short conclusion.

Group Three Results

The members of Group Three were a faculty member from the Physical Therapy Program, a faculty from the Business Division, and a member of the English Program.

Here are their ratings and responses, first in the form of a chart:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essay Number</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

153
Figure 6. Group Three Ratings

Complete agreement appears in one case, an NP essay. In this case, perhaps consensus between respondents and teacher exists; the teacher’s C- is just a friendlier D. Partial agreement among respondents is reached in seven cases, numbers 217, 028, 156, 043, 262, 021, and 219. But it is difficult to determine a consensus between respondents and teachers for 217 and 219 because of data that the teacher failed to submit, in the case of 219, and a missing paper grade due to a teacher’s nongraded portfolio approach for 217. For the remaining essays, there is little consensus between respondents and teachers, except for 156 with two respondents assigning a P and the teacher assigning a C. Another consensus exists in the case of 021, with two respondents assigning an HP and the teacher assigning an A. 028 and 021 provoke the greatest split among respondents; for 028 one rates the essay HP and two NP, and for 021 there are two HPs and one NP.

The respondents split three ways in three cases, numbers 129, 100, and 097, so no consensus occurs among respondents here. We can claim no agreement among respondents and teachers in the case of 129 and 100, and only possible agreement in the case of 097— if we “average” respondents’ three-way split as a P, which, we could say, agrees with the teacher’s grade of C.
The term ageism, discriminating due to age, was created in 1968 to describe a set of myths, prejudices, and practices of a society to isolate the elderly, solely due to their age (Nanayakkara 12). Ageism has become a growing problem in American society today. In underdeveloped countries, the old are looked up to. They are thought to be the wise and the knowledgeable ones. It is too bad that all societies cannot be like this. If people would just realize that the elderly are good people and not discriminate against them, then ageism would not be such a big problem. Instead, in America, ageism is perpetuated by the media. It is on the television programs and movies where they give the wrong idea about the elderly. It always seems that they are viewing the elderly in nursing homes, like all the elderly people live in nursing homes. In fact, a majority of the elderly are living in their own homes and are still as vibrant and aware as they were forty years ago. If they were to show television programs where the old are looked up to then it might give people a more positive way to look at the elderly. For instance, the television program The Golden Girls is about four older women, ranging from ages fifty five to the oldest being probably almost eighty, who live together and the way they live their lives. The television program is a positive way of looking at the old because they live on their own and did not need others to help them with getting around. The show also shows that the women are happy, that they do not just sit around, as some people see old people doing and they do have a social life. They also are fashionable and worry about what they look like just as young people would do. If everyone looked at the old in that way we might not have such a big problem in America today. Instead, most people think of the old as slow, senile mean people. Even I have said, while driving behind an elderly person, that they should not be allowed to drive. But the fact is they have every right that I have to be driving.

What people do not realize is “everyone who lives long enough becomes old” (Franck). The people who are young see themselves as young forever and even when they do realize that they will get old some day they think they will never be mean, senile or be put into nursing homes. I am sure that the old people today said the same thing when they were young but some still ended up the way that they did not want to. People just need to be more realistic and know that they cannot see the future and say that they will not be a certain way. They need to look at the elderly and say I hope to be that certain way, which is a more positive way of looking at the elderly.

There is little doubt that society negatively values old age. In fact, "prejudice stems in part from fear of a perceived threat. People fear
getting old and dying, so it is not surprising that there is prejudice against the elderly. But the public’s view of older people as physically and intellectually deficient, inactive, lonely, asexual and rigid in their opinion is totally incorrect” according the James Mold, a professor of family medicine. Job discrimination is an example of ageism that is widely spreading. This can be a real big problem because the elderly need jobs. Having a job when you are old is real important because it gives them something to do. The elderly are usually more experienced in their job if they have been doing the same work for many years. If they are deprived of a job, or fired in other words, it can have a dramatic effect on their life. For example, my grandfather, who is age sixty-three, had worked at Pepsi-Cola for twenty-five years. Although he only had a high school education, he knew his job well. He had a relatively high position at Pepsi-Cola. Two years ago he was fired and replaced by a man who was twenty-eight years old. It had to be because of his age because he knew his work better than the new person would since he had been there so long. My grandfather said, “It was discrimination. I was the best one for the job twenty-five years ago and I still am the best one for the job. It would not matter if I had a college degree or not because what I knew was from what I experienced not from reading and studying out of a book like the new guy did.” The bad thing about it was they did not inform him that he needed a college degree before they decided to fire him. My aunt, age thirty-one, also works at Pepsi-Cola and does not have a college degree, but the company just recently told her she would have to have some computer classes for her job and they were even willing to pay for her to take the classes. If they would have given this opportunity to my grandfather he would have taken it and they would have had an experienced worker and some what educated. In fact, after he was fired, he attended class at Sullivan College.

“Young people tend to see old people as wise and good. It is only once they grow up that some of them come to view old people as passive, as burdens and as people who need more and more of their attention and resources” (Franck). Another interesting note is that as people get older they take on the beliefs of ageism (Mold 3). In other words, as people get older they start to think that they need to stay young looking. People even do things such as having plastic surgery to get rid of wrinkles and aged skin, coloring their hair, and dressing younger. If they are active then they think they are uncommon because most people their age are in the stereotype of being “old” (Mold 3). This is a wrong way to think. It is these things mentioned why ageism is such a bad problem. The point I am trying to make is that people do not need to be like this, trying to stay young because of being afraid of aging. People just need to realize that they are old or will get old and look at it in a good way. The people who discriminate against the aged should see getting older as exciting. They get to look back on their life and see their achievements. If people must continue to look young then all they need to do is eat healthy and get a
regular exercise. It is like when we were children the elderly, being younger then, took care of us and it is our responsibility we were children the elderly, being younger then, took care of us and it is our responsibility to help them out whether it is helping them fight for their job or helping them find a new one. If in our society the elderly are even discriminated against by other elderly people that should be a sign that we have a definite problem on our hands.

I also interviewed a lady named Carol, who is seventy years old. She is one of my co-workers at JC Penney. I asked her if she has ever experienced ageism and she replied, “Yes. There are many times that I have noticed that the customers will asked the opinions of the younger salesclerk. They are probably thinking that since I am old that I will not know what is in style.” I have noticed it myself. She will be standing there and customers will walk around her to ask me or the other younger salesclerks a question. The thing is she does know what is in style. She dresses very stylishly and there is no reason for the discrimination.

“A pervasive lack of knowledge and the media stereotyping are the biggest problems of ageism” (Mold 3). If people were more knowledgeable about the elderly and knew that they are just as good as the young, that they have just been around longer, then we might not have as big of a problem as we have with ageism. The popular belief is that a much larger number of older people require nursing home care. But many people will be shocked to find out that only five percent of individuals over sixty-five years of age live in nursing homes (Mold 3). While the percentages of persons age sixty and over now ranges from thirteen percent to twenty percent in industrialized nations and four percent to eight percent in nonindustrialized nations, these percentages or actual numbers they represent are expected to increase dramatically in the next decades (Nanayakkara 1994). This says if people continue to be agist then it will be an even larger problem in the next decades. The society should start now changing their way of thinking about the elderly. “There is nothing to prepare you for the experience of growing old. Living is a process, and irreversible progression toward old age and eventual death (Curtin 99). No one should be afraid to grow old. The old are so much wiser and have lived through many more incidences than the young. When the old run into issues such as ageism it can bring them down as it did my grandfather. “A lessening of ageism should occur when the baby boom generation, which is much more accustomed to activism, reaches old age and says “STOP” (Mold 3).

I hope that after people this essay, they will realize ageism is a big issue that needs to be stopped. I hope the people who discriminate against the elderly can realize there is no need to do so. Everyone eventually grows old I do not think someone would want to be discriminated against, so those doing it should put themselves in the older peoples shoes. This might make people think about what it can do to a person.
Works Cited

Schwartz, Susan. “A prejudice that cannot last; As we age, feelings about old people are bound to change.” Montreal Gazette 14 Feb. 1994, Final ed:A14.


The Physical Therapist’s Responses:
RATING: P
--run-on sentences, inconsistent with idea in a paragraph, rambled and repeated thoughts
--grammar OK, not great
--but did have consistent Noun/Verb agreement
--knew what he/she wanted to say but not “sophisticated” writer

The Business Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP
Six paragraphs for a five-page research paper.
Content--sentences very awkward
run-on sentence
weak writing style, very repetitive
numerous punctuation errors
incorrect format for references

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP
Valid topic--current, not wooled-to-death
Strong thesis
Good sentence, paragraph structure
Strong support, examples
Sense of presence of writer
Good overall organization
Clear writing style
Effective conclusion
Also interesting

Group-Specific Essay #24 (Essay 228 of Sample)
The Turn of the Screw by Henry James is a short story, within a short story, within a short story. Reading this story by Henry James, I noticed my mind getting really involved. It is similar to entering a state of mind, such as the novel We Have Always Lived In The Castle by Shirley Jackson has to offer. This is a novel with a very complex and vivid language with very splendid characters.

In The Turn of the Screw there are very interesting characters. The character I am going to focus on is the infamous governess. The governess is a character that is haunted by apparitions of evil that are unexplainable. The evil is a strong force that takes over the governess in every way. The governess is haunted by these evil spirits throughout the story, and eventually the governess becomes controlled.

The evil in this novel seems to haunt the governess wherever she is. The evil in the novel, I saw as a force that was in the mind of the governess, but at times the governess actually seemed as if the ghosts were real, due to the complex language used in the novel by Henry James. The spirits of evil were obviously in her head to me, because of how they seemed to change their individuality. If the spirits were real I don’t believe the novel would have had the same character it had. The Turn of the Screw by Henry James is a novel that has a character haunted by evil and if read closely, can haunt the reader as well. It is pretty amazing how evil can lurk in the mind of someone such as the governess in this novel.....

The Physical Therapist’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“evil” used in almost every sentence.

doesn’t say much else

grammar/sentence structure limited

The Business Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Incorrectly written sentences
Words, phrases should be omitted
Incorrect punctuation or lack thereof
Awkward and difficult to read
Limited substantive generalizations
Weak analysis
No title

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP
“Goes nowhere.”

Group-Specific Essay #25 (Essay 217 of Sample)

Looking at a Hero

Our life is full of problems, hardships, and disappointment. To help us cope with these we create heroes. We have books and movies about them and our imagination makes them bigger than life. One of the best examples of this is Roy Hobbs in the movie version of The Natural.

In the movie, Roy is the all-American boy. He is good to his fans, loves his girlfriend, honest, always wins out over evil and adversity, and ends up as a loving father. People look for and need heroes to rescue them from real life. The problem is that people are human and not perfect. When they are given hero status their life becomes known to the world and the hero image is tarnished or destroyed. In the past heroes like Babe Ruth, Clark Gable, and J. Edgar Hoover could control the news media. Now if a hero falls we know it right away.

One of the worst things about the modern news media is that it seems to enjoy destroying heroes, even old ones. As a child many of us grew up dreaming of being a G man. Hoover was our pride and joy and our hero. If there was a bad guy out there we knew that Hoover and his boys would get him. Now we find out that he had files on everyone, good and bad, and that under his leadership the FBI may have killed or had killed many important people. A hero dies.

Babe Ruth was the same way. The press didn’t say much about his bad habits until much later. If the Babe did something wrong the news might have covered it, but it was not exploited. If Babe Ruth was around today his hero status would be badly damaged. The press would tell every little detail of every thing he did.

If Roy Hobbs had been a real person in today’s world the book version of The Natural is what you would expect to hear from the news media. No matter how good a player he was the press would exploit his every deed.

Modern heroes like O.J. Simpson, Pete Rose, and Burt Reynolds have their whole life known to the world along with a few falsehoods added for spice. As soon as a person becomes famous or of hero status everyone knows everything about them.

To a child their parents are most often their biggest heroes, but as a child grows up they find that their parents, like all humans have faults and the parents lose their hero status. Modern heroes die fast and people do not have the luxury of everlasting heroes. Without the role models that heroes give us we are destined to grope in a dark, disillusioned world. To overcome this we must realize from the beginning that real heroes are real people and real people make mistakes.
"spelling, grammar errors but able to express a thought"

The Business Professor's Responses:
RATING: NP

The paper has a good thesis with substantive generalizations. In fact, I believe the criteria for 1-4 for ENG 102 has [sic] been met. The paper loses its credibility and readability because criteria [sic] number 5 has not been satisfied. There are numerous spelling errors, omission of punctuation (commas), and omission of text.

The English Professor's Responses:
RATING: NP

Grammar problems
Poor, unrestricted thesis
Not specific
Ideas have no substance
Weak logic
Some annoying assumptions

Group-Specific Essay #26 (Essay 100 of Sample)

Monet: The True Impressionist

The French painter Claude Monet was a true impressionist. His paintings gave birth to the term impressionism. He achieved the effects that greatly influenced the course of artistic development, yet he offended the art critics of his time.

Monet dedicated his final years to his series of Water Lillies paintings which he began in 1899 and regretfully ended in 1926. In a closer view, I invite you to witness his devotion, obsession, and profound achievements in his vast scale of Water Lillies paintings which respectfully, yet slowly, gained acceptance to the world.

Claude Monet did not want to impose onto others his own concept of the world. He simply was trying to explore reality the way he perceived it. He painted for the sake of painting itself and not because the subject might appeal to a buyer (Swinglehurst 53). Painting was a language for the interpretation of visual reality and Monet's series paintings are a language for the exploration of that language (Swinglehurst 53).

Monet was determined to capture a more modern expression in his style of painting. He organized his property at Giverny as a huge painting in order to fulfill this expectation with the new Water Lillies series. He diverted a river planted trees, exotic flowers, weeping-willows, bamboo, and rhododendrons. He seeded the pond and added enclosures with white chickens, ducks and pheasants. Nature was composed by the artist in order
to complete his Water Lilies series. The water, earth, and light combined together at the Giverny pond inspired Monet’s work which opened a path to abstract painting (Huyghe 88).

Monet’s lily pond was a constant source of inspiration. “The basic element of the motif is the mirror of water, which changes its appearances every moment,” he said. A passing cloud, a breeze, or a change in light, “unnoticed by the untrained eye” transformed the pond for him. His water lily pictures vary greatly: some are pale and delicate; others contain an aggressive sense of energy (Welton 56).

This impressionist believed the painters had never before captured the great brilliance of sunlight on nature. To achieve this medium, Monet used many strokes of pure bright color next to each other. He was totally dedicated to the language of color, to finding the exact brushstroke which would harmonize or contrast with other brushstrokes and create a perfect balance. The forms of an object were lightly and rapidly sketched and emphasis was placed on painting out of doors (Welton 57).

Monet worked on large canvases, painting the vaporous clouds and unions of sky and water. This atmosphere no longer draws attention to a specific object but penetrates sensibility (Huyghe 50). He often used violet, green, and pink to create pretty pastel combinations. For a restricted palette he used much darker and more powerful effective colors. The pigments of canvas color chosen for the bank was a yellow ochre, an earth color. The lily pad contours are drawn with rapidly executed broken lines of deep red (Welton 56).

Monet discovered that color has its own reasons just as drawing has, and that they are opposing forces: too much drawing inhibits color, and color breaks the clear demands of line. Monet sought for the true reality behind an apparent reality of visual appearance by stretching color to its limits and looking for those significant nuances of color which express the reality of the world in nature itself (Swinglehurst 5).

Monet’s discoveries with color versus drawing have left me solely heartedly believing that color is the true reality behind capturing the expressions of the natural moments of visual art. Color itself expresses an individual definition, that in reality, projects to the human eye the actual true likeness of the present form. Color stands one step above all other forms in visual perception. Capturing the exact color, the right amount of shade variation in color can be expressed through painting in such a way that line definition need not be necessary. The color itself becomes transformation of the image. Perception of the image is vividly brought to life and perceived by the human eye as the “picture of perfection”.

Capturing the true essence within color can open our eyes and minds, bring joy within our hearts, and beauty to our lives. Monet achieved these results in his Water Lilies series.

There is something mesmerizing and mystical about Monet’s Water Lillies murals. In a closer look, the composition is slashed in half by the dark vertical band of weeping-willow leaves: As the weeping-willow
leaves brush the water, they become almost indistinguishable from their reflection. The trail of leaves that passes through the surface of the water creates a dynamic tension. It defines the sense of receding space implied by the way the lily pads become smaller and bluer. Monet painted the water without a horizon or shore, creating “the illusion of an endless whole.” Only the triangle of bank in the bottom corner provides a visual reference point (Levine 56). The reflection of passing clouds on the mirrorlike surface of this “enchanted pond” had always fascinated Monet (Levine 72).

In describing the influences on these paintings Monet referred to Japanese aesthetic “that evokes presence by means of a shadow” (Welton 54). Monet had acquired a deep admiration for Japan and liked to express this in his paintings.

The implications in these paintings gives one the illusions of free, disembodied, spiritual vision as if you were floating like the flowers on the pond’s surface. Not only do the demensional perceptions project mirror images and provide calming effects, the colors unite and perform an equilibrium of serine tranquility—which in combination is the perfect antidote for physical and mental fatigue. According to a newspaper account of a record-setting auction held at the Plaza Hotel in New York, “this picture caused a sensation when hung, for the reason of the mirage and the reflection of the water it appeared as if it were upside down” (Stucky 16).

Monet was often overwhelmed by his devotion to his work. He wrote to his friend Gustave Geffroy:

“You know that I am absorbed by work. These landscapes of water and reflections have become an obsession. It is beyond my old man’s powers and I want nonetheless to succeed in rendering what I feel. I destroy some of them...I start them over again...and I hope that with so many efforts something will emerge” (Patin 130).

There was a misunderstanding about Monet’s suggestive style of painting. It seemed, his style of art, was moving too fast for the period of time with history and science. Nevertheless, even hostile critics found it necessary to seek explanations for his work. Frederic Chevalier denounced Monet’s impressionism as:

“an effervescence of color, a phantasmagoria of effects, a bacchanal of lines, a fury of brushstrokes, an orgy of impastos, and explosion of light, of audacities of composition, of unprecedented dissonances and insolent harmonies...A savage, irreverent, disorder, heretical art...

He tried, however, to establish a correlation between our contemporary customs and the revolution attempted by the new pioneers:

Their brutal handling, the ordinariness of the objects they prefer, the appearance of spontaneity...the wilful incoherence, boldness of color, mistrust of form, this
disturbing combination of qualities and faults is not without analogy with the chaos of antagonistic forces which trouble our era.

The uncompromising, he concluded, need not be condemned, but could be evaluated, even if the audience’s education was not sufficiently advanced to allow this (Spate 124).

Society did not recognize this new style of painting which expressed a different reality in the changes of the world. People were fixed to their old styles and ideals of life and impressionism was a style that startled the world with a plague of unexceptionance. People could not relate to an unusual visual reality seen through the eyes of an artist such as Monet.

As time went on and life progressed, new phenomena of history and science movement were accepted – and so was Monet’s impressionism style of painting. When Monet exhibited 14 paintings of the Water Lilly pool, the symbolist poet, Verhaeven claimed that they evoked:

the whole of nature. One intuits the entire garden in this simple display of water and grasses. One senses the subterranean life at the bottom of the pool; the thick growth of roots; the intertwining of the stems, of which the flowers, massed on the surface, are only the continuation. Monet will never succeed in restricting himself to the motif, because his strength will always push him beyond it (Spate 240).

Verhaeren said that Monet could be called a “great poet”.

Such a one is condemned to remain grave, sincere and anguished before nature. Little by little he comes alive in it, and, in its turn, nature comes alive in those parts of the brain which observe, study, admire, and reproduce it. In hours when work is fruitful, the union is complete. Individual life and universal life fuse. The poet becomes the universe which he translates (Spate 241).

“Monet is only an eye – but what an eye!” exclaimed Cezanne, praising his impressionist colleague with faint damnation.

In examining Monet’s series paintings, the public had been correct in finding Monet’s forms fuzzy, vague, his colors unnatural; but wrong in assuming at first those assumptions were a denial of art, and later, in theory of explanations about light and vision these assumptions were proven to be wrong. Monet was and artist as well as an eye, having, perhaps helped liberate form and color from visual facts. Monet’s eye was a painter’s eye, an eye with a creative mind behind it, interpreting reality and putting it into the context of the thoughts in painter’s mind, thus creating a new vision for the spectator (Swinglehurst 1).

Even though Monet’s paintings were thought to be critical by certain interpreters throughout various times in his life, one can not truly say his form of work was hideous and unexceptable.
Theoretically speaking, the viewers individual interpretation is greatly influenced by a momental experience, thought, or event in life within the progress of that era, relating or conflicting with scientific and political views. Monet was creating his Water Lillies paintings when France was celebrating the centennial of the revolution marked by a universal exposition. This exposition was meant to celebrate progress, scientific and political, and visitors world wide witnessed the progress within a nation. It is my belief that Monet was anxious to be taken seriously as an artist and thus created a body of work that was impressionistic and scientific. He had every belief to think of himself as behaving scientifically in noting the effects of light on appearance and color at a time when the world was witnessing this progress.

It seemed as if Monet had been incredibly ahead of his time and had discovered abstract expressionism painting before anyone else understood or accepted it. This was perhaps why he, at first, offended the art critics of his time.

There is something immensely moving in the image of Monet narrowing his world to the boundaries of his water garden as he captures the aspects of nature as revealed by light. Even though Monet’s final years of life were filled with grief from personal loss, war, and eyesight, he was able to separate his own environment from these powerful forces and produce a series of paintings universally recognized as one step toward abstract expressionism art.

Monet caused uproar among conservative art critics and a revolution in painting. Through his expressionism – his shadowy corners, mirror-like reflections, dream-like spaces, endless horizons and shores, he introduced a new style of painting – perhaps when the world was ready to view it.

Monet depicts the true reality lying behind superficial visual appearances and captures the natural essence of beauty. Monet’s Water Lillies interpretations depend on how we mirror ourselves in his reflective art before our gaze goes blank. His work is genuinely appreciated as a true impressionist in my eyes.

Works Cited

The Physical Therapist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

--good organization

--spelling and grammatical errors not overriding the paper

--difficult subject handled relatively well

The Business Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

The content of the paper may be classified as proficient or perhaps highly efficient. The writer has produced a beautiful narrative--picture--of Monet. The supportive documentation is poetic, and flows smoothly, especially with so many long quotations. This paper does not fit my definition of proficient, however; nor does it meet the ENG 102 criteria for acceptability. The paper contains a minimum of 14 spelling errors, some comma errors, and some formatting errors. The readability and credibility of an otherwise exceptional paper is [sic] diminished!

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

“Some grammar weaknesses, but a passing paper. Could improve with condensing, rewriting, but basically a standard college essay.”

**Group-Specific Essay #27 (Essay 028 of Sample)**

**Nathaniel Hawthorne: The Scarlet Letter’s Scaffolds**

Outline

Thesis: Nathaniel Hawthorne uses the scaffold structure in The Scarlet Letter to reveal the central message.

I. Symbolism and structure
   A. Hawthorne’s use of symbolism
   B. Hawthorne’s use of structure
      1. Four part division
      2. Scaffold structure
   C. The scaffold as a symbol
   D. The structure of thesis

II. First scaffold scene

166
A. Recognition of sin (p. 91 D.H.L. says, ‘The act is sin. Let’s hide.
We’ve sinned.)
B. Midday acknowledgment
C. Puritan decree of punishment
D. Hester’s punishment

III. Second scaffold scene
A. Concealment of sin
B. Midnight vigil
C. Dimmesdale, Hester, and Pearl unite
D. Revealing light

IV. Third scaffold scene
A. Revelation of sin
B. Dimmesdale ascends the scaffold
C. Midday sun
D. Dimmesdale’s confession

V. Message of the scaffolds
A. Midday and midnight principle
B. Hester’s position

VI. The public scaffold
A. In The S.L. (thesis & summary)
B. Writing as Hawthorne’s scaffold
C. In contemporary life

Nathaniel Hawthorne was born in 1804 in Salem, Massachusetts. D. H. Lawrence says in *Studies in Classic American Literature*, “American authors use symbolism and Hawthorne used it diviously.” Symbolism is the representation of things by association, resemblance, or convention. Hawthorne’s use of symbolism in *The Scarlet Letter* is depicted throughout the novel, in his landscapes, lights, settings, and characters. Hawthorne also used structure thought his novel. Structure is defined as recurring elements, the scaffold scenes, of a plot that creates a meaningful pattern of narration from which the major implications of the novel may be determined. Robert E. Spiller says is, *The Cycle of American Literature*, “Hawthorne was obsess with the goodness and evil hidden in men’s souls.” His father burned Indian villages in King Phillips War. His grandfather whipped Quakers through the streets of Salem. His great-grandfather was the non-repentant judge of the Salem Witch Trails. Spiller says, “Hawthorne used the Puritan method of publicly confessing sin, and Hawthorne did this through his writing to absolve himself of it. His writings are symbolic, with the most being allegory. Allegory is a symbolic tale in which elements, the scaffold scenes, the scarlet letter and the time of day, may represent other things and tell a hidden story beneath the surface. The first scaffold scene focuses on the recognition of Hester’s sin. The second scaffold scene switches the focus of Hester’s guilt to Dimmesdale’s. The third scaffold scene provides the revelation of the scarlet letter and reunites the characters. The four part division separates
the novel according to segments of movement. Clearly, Hawthorne uses the scaffold structure in *The Scarlet Letter* to reveal the central message.

The first scaffold scene focuses on the recognition of Hester’s sin. Hawthorne used the Puritan method of openly confessing sins. The scaffold provided the setting for the act of public discipline. Through the oak laden doors walks Hester Prynne, the letter ‘A’ is embroidered on the front of her gown. A Massachusetts law required adulterers to be whipped and wear a capital ‘A’. Spiller says “Hawthorne does not share the absolute morality of the Puritan community which demands perpetual penance in the wearing of the scarlet letter ‘A’. The magistrates were considered merciful overmuch in that they did not require the whippings. It is thought that sins must be revealed in the daylight before the eyes of Go. The Puritans thought the night was a time for evil and witches. The Puritan degree of punishment was a degree of atonement and forgiveness of the sin and must be openly avowed and man’s natural relationship with his fellowman be re-established through public confession. Due to this, Hester is put on the scaffold to confess in public her sin.

The second scaffold scene switches the guilt from Hester to Dimmesdale. Chillingworth has found out, by constant probing into Dimmesdale’s soul, Dimmesdale is the source of his hatred. While napping one afternoon, Chillingworth walked in on Dimmesdale and discovered the brand, the scarlet letter, on Dimmesdale’s chest, that he has been concealing by always wearing a vest. From this moment on, Chillingworth torments his victim, without the victim’s knowledge. It has been said Chillingworth was poisoning Dimmesdale, and possibly giving Dimmesdale hallucinogenic drugs. An article in the Courier-Journal says:

> For years literary scholars have said the death was a result of his burning sense of remorse and guilt over fathering the child of Hester Prynne, but according to a new theory, he was murdered by Chillingworth.³

After years of self torture, he used to hide in a closet and whip himself, Dimmesdale comes upon the revelation that he can absolve himself of his guilt:

> Walking in the shadow of a dream, as it were, and perhaps actually under the influence of somnambulism, sleep waling [my words], Mr. Dimmesdale reached the spot, now so long since Hester Prynne had lived through her first hour of public ignominy.⁴

Dimmesdale speculated, if he were there until dawn, the townspeople would eventually see him and recognize his guilt. Instead, the townspeople slept on, only evil doings went on at night. During his midnight vigil, Hester and Pearl happen upon him. They had been at Governor Winthrop’s side until he passed away. Hester made measurements for his
burial robe. Dimmesdale recognizes Pearl by her childish laughter. Dimmesdale, Hester and Pearl are now united on the scaffold together holding hands. Pearl tries to convince her father to come together at midday tomorrow with her mother on the scaffold. Dimmesdale denies her this several times, and when Dimmesdale has done speaking, a light gleamed far and wide across the sky. Natural phenomena is considered a revelation from the supernatural. Dimmesdale, in his frail distorted mental state, stared at the light caused by the meteor. In his mind he beheld the appearance of a letter—the letter ‘A’.

The third scaffold scene provides the revelation of sin, Dimmesdale on the scaffold at midday and Dimmesdale’s confession. Dimmesdale has just delivered a speech for the new Governor. At the conclusion, he had the foreboding of timely death upon him. It was if an angel had shaken his bright wing over him. He bowed his head forward and decided to make his revelation on the scaffold. Dimmesdale calls to Hester and Pearl and requires of Hester to support him up the scaffold. Chillingworth tells Dimmesdale, there is no place on earth he could have escaped him, “save on this very scaffold!” The midday sun now looked down on the occupiers of the scaffold, ready to witness Dimmesdale confession of sin. With one swift movement he tears away the band and reveals his own scarlet letter. The crowd gazed in horror at the sight as Dimmesdale sinks down upon the scaffold, with Hester and Chillingworth. Clearly, Dimmesdale has openly confessed his sin on the scaffold before the crowd and the eyes of God.

The message of the scaffold during the midday was to provide open confession of guilt before God and everyone. The nighttime scaffold scene was a concealment of guilt since only evil happenings went on at night. This is so, because the Puritans would not be out at night with evil, and God and the people would not be able to witness the guilty one.

Nathaniel Hawthorne uses the scaffold structure in The Scarlet Letter to reveal the central message. The public scaffold in The Scarlet Letter was a place for openly confessing your guilt as did Hester. Hawthorne believed the only way to be true to yourself was to Be True, show freely to the world your worst. In contemporary life, people confess their guilt in courtrooms where they are required to tell the truth by swearing to, under the eyes of God. This is so, due to being required to swear to tell the truth with their right hand on the Bible.

NOTES
The Physical Therapist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“few errors=mostly typos. good sentence structure. able to organize thoughts.”

The Business Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

The decision for the rating on this one is very difficult! In my opinion, the writer has done a beautiful job in the composition of this paper. Although some effort is required to get to the thesis, the writer does a great job with supportive documentation and with the conclusion. The paper is interesting!
I find it difficult, however, to say and ENG 102 paper is proficient when such little attention has been given to presentation. Examples:

1. Handwritten text in the outline
2. Short quotations which have not been documented
3. Four footnote reference numbers appear in the paper. Only three numbers are included in the notes.
4. Incorrect spelling
5. Incorrect word usage
6. Words which should have been deleted

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

No. Sorry. Although this paper makes stabs at being literary, organized and insightful, it is basically garbled. There are huge leaps of logic, grand incoherencies, maddening mix of the elementary (definitions of “symbolism” and allegory”) and the effort to be profound.

Off the top of my head, I’d say this poor student has tried to cut and paste class notes, some library-located (or instructor generated) literary criticism, and his/her own feeble words and has wound up with a great big confusing mess. We don’t use footnotes anymore.

Group-Specific Essay #28 (Essay 156 of Sample)

The New Welfare System

The welfare system has been in existence for over 30 years. It has been changed several times but this year on March 10, 1995, the U.S. House of Representatives passed a $17 billion package of budget cuts which targets public housing, welfare and other assistance programs that help the poor. I believe the government should help those who cannot help themselves at least for a limited time.

I am against the changes that Congress has proposed to end the welfare system. This system has been a way of life for poor families and should
not be changed without thinking about the consequences of not having enough jobs for everyone.

I have been on welfare for about seven years now, the death of my husband and the lack of good job skills led me to depend on the system for help. For the last three years I worked at a daycare to earn extra money for living expenses. I am currently enrolled at JCC to pursue a career in education. I would like to become a Elementary Teacher.

I disagree with the governments decision to reform the welfare system. The government has stated before that the system is too expensive but it is only 11% of the federal spending. The real reason is the increase in young, unwed mothers having babies and not being able to provide for them and asking the government for assistance. I disagree that the welfare system is expensive. The Defense Budget and the salaries of the members of Congress cost more than all the programs combined.

The taxpayers and the government also think that the welfare system is being abused and misused by able-bodied individuals who do not want to work, resulting in a welfare nation. I disagree with this statement because of a program called JOBS that offers job opportunities, education and child care for the recipients. This program has provided hope that everyone does not have to rely on welfare to survive. A large number of individuals are taking advantage of this program and that includes me.

The House of Representatives has proposed that after two years, welfare recipients would be required to work in order to continue receiving cash assistance. Secondly, welfare benefits would be cut off after five years, whether or not the recipient was working. Consequently, mothers already on welfare would receive NO additional cash assistance should they have another child. Finally, the amount of monies given to the states would be a fixed amount, with no allowance for increase in prices, population or need. The welfare system also includes the food stamp program, WIC and school lunches. Congress has proposed that over the next five years $16.5 billion from the food stamp program would be cut. Secondly, individuals aged 18 to 50, who are not disabled or have children to care for, would be required to work at least 20 hours a week. If they do not their food stamp benefits would be permanently cut off after 90 days. Finally, food stamp benefits would rise only two percent each year, regardless of the rise in food prices. The school lunch program and WIC would be replaced by “block grants” – cash payments directly to the states. This program would be cut by $7 billion over the next five years. States would get a fixed amount of money for the year for food programs, which would NOT rise if the number of poor children increased. The deepest cuts are in the Summer Food Program, which continues the school lunch program in poor areas during the summer months. Sadly, the school lunches would no longer be required to provide one-third of the RDA for basic nutrients.

I still disagree with the way the House is mishandling the lives of others. These budget cuts will cause a very large number of families to suffer. The
transition period after the benefits are terminated should be the real issue and not the need to save at the expense of children.

The Physical Therapist's Responses:
RATING: HP

"--no real errors. good organization, personal interjections"

The Business Professor's Responses:
RATING: P "C-"

"The writer of this paper makes a good argument to support the thesis statement. A strong conclusion is also stated at the end of the paper. Some mechanical errors occur in the early stages of the paper."

The English Professor's Responses:
RATING: P

"Standard, adequate. a little boring. Just plain old solid okay, nothing hot."

**Group-Specific Essay #29 (Essay 043 of Sample)**

**The Leatherstocking Tales: A Mixing of the Races**

Outline

Thesis: Cooper's Leatherstocking novels show that Pierce, Hazard, and Lawrence are mistaken about the "Red" and "White" man's ability to mingle in a human relationship.

I. Biography
   A. Cooper, author of the Leatherstocking tales
   B. Knowledge of Indians
      1. Critic's views
      2. Cooper's response
   C. No "Red" and "White" mix
      1. Civilized (Pearce)
      2. Superiority (Hazard)
      3. No mix of race (Lawrence)
   D. New human relationship
      1. Love of fellow man
      2. Lawrence's and other critics' error (Thesis)

II. Race relations in the Leatherstockings novels
   A. Interest in each other
      1. Calling each other friend
      2. Conversation about parents and past
      3. Uncas' death
B. Respecting each other
   1. Listening to each other's opinions
   2. Giving each other advice
C. Working as a team
   1. Tracking Magua
   2. Rescuing Cora and Alice
D. Risking each other's life
   1. Carrying Chingagook from the fire (Pioneers)
   2. Hawkeye saving Uncas (Mohicans)
   3. Uncas saving Heyward (Mohicans)
   4. Rescue of Alice, Cora, and Heyward (Mohicans)
   5. Uncas saving Alice and dying in an attempt to save Cora (Mohicans)

III. Justification of race relations in the Leatherstocking novels
   A. Lawrence's and other critics' error (Thesis restated)
   B. Race relations in the Leatherstocking novels
   C. Race relations today

James Fenimore Cooper lived from 1789-1851. He was from Cooperstown, New York. Cooper began writing at age thirty to prove to his wife that he could write a better novel than the one he was reading to her. He wrote five novels that make up The Leatherstocking Tales, The Pioneers, The Last of the Mohicans, The Prairie, The Pathfinder, and The Deerslayer. Cooper has been criticized for his portrayal of American Indians in his Leatherstocking Tales. "Although his knowledge was much more extensive than that of many writers dealing with aboriginal life, Cooper had, contrary to general opinion, little first hand acquaintance with the American Indian." In his "Preface" to the Leatherstocking Tales, "Cooper responds by saying that the critics do not know the Indians either." Some critics say that Indians and white society could never mingle in a new relationship. "These were Indians, living in a state of what was termed savagism; and they were in the path of civilization, of progress. If that civilization was to progress to its glorious destiny, that destiny would have to take into account these savages and their savagism." "No one holds more dogmatically than Hawkeye that red man and white man are fundamentally different, with the superiority decidedly in favor of the white." In the actual flesh, it seems to me the white man and the red man cause a feeling of oppression, the one to the other, no matter what the good will." Other critic's, however see a new human relationship in Cooper's books. "Natty Bumppo, the hunter and enemy of cities; and Chingachgook, nature's nobleman and Vanishing American. Two lonely men, one dark skinned, one white, bend together over a carefully guarded fire in the virgin heart of the American wilderness; they have forsaken all others for the sake of the austere, almost inarticulate, but unquestioned love which binds them to each other and to the world of nature which they have preferred to civilization."
Cooper’s Leatherstocking novels show that Pierce, Hazard, and Lawrence are mistaken about the “Red” and “White” man’s ability to mingle in a new human relationship.

Their interest in each other clearly shows the red and white man’s ability to mingle in a new human relationship. “Hawkeye” and “Chingachgook” call each other friends. “Your fathers came from the setting sun, crossed the big river, fought the people of the country, and took the land; and mine came from the red sky of the morning, over the salt lake, and did their work much after the fashion that had been set them by yours; then let God judge the matter between us, and friends spare their words!” Their ability to discuss their ancestors and compare their family history shows their ability to mingle. “What say your old men? Do they tell the young warriors, that the pale-faces met the redmen, painted for war and armed with the stone hatchet and wooden gun?” “Hawkeye” responds by telling “Chingagook” about books. “It is one of their customs to write in books what they have done and seen, instead of telling them in their villages, where the lie can be given to the face of a cowardly boaster, and the brave soldier can call on his comrades to witness for the truth of his words.” “Chingagook” tells “Hawkeye” about his bloodline and the result of “Uncas” death. My tribe is the grandfather of nations, but I am an unmixed man. The blood of chiefs is in my veins, where it must stay forever.” “I am on the hill-top, and must go down to the valley; and when Uncas follows me in my foot steps, there will no longer be any of the blood of the sagamores, for my boy is the last of the Mohicans.” Their interest in their past certainly shows the ability to mingle in a human relationship.

Respecting each other shows their ability to mingle in a new human relationship. When “Hawkeye”, “Chingagook”, and “Uncas” meet “Heywood”, “Cora”, and “Alice” in the woods they decide the fate of the party by listening to each other. “It was evident that they debated on the propriety of some measure that nearly concerned the welfare of the travelers.” They gave each other advice on which course of action to take when confronted with a problem. “Uncas is right! It would not be the act of men to leave such harmless things to their fate, even though it breaks up the harboring place forever.” When they confront “Magua” they decide as a team how best to deal with him. “They spoke together earnestly in the Delaware language, though in an undertone; and by the gestures of the white man, which were frequently directed towards the top of a sapling, it was evident he pointed out the situation of their hidden enemy.” These reactions clearly show their ability to mingle in a human relationship.

Working as a team shows their ability to mingle in a human relationship. “Hawkeye”, “Chingagook”, and “Uncas” work as a team tracking “Magua” and his captives. “Ay! There we were thrown off the scent, and might, indeed have lost the trail, had it not been for Uncas; we took the path, however that led into the wilderness; for we judged, and judged rightly.
that the savages would hold that course with their prisoners. "Uncas" continues to help decide how best to track "Magua" with his comrades. "Uncas was bold enough to say, that the beasts ridden by the gentle ones planted the legs of one side on the ground at the same time, which is contrary to the movements of all trotting four-footed animals of my knowledge except the bear." While rescuing "Cora" and "Alice" they continue to work as a team. "But the conflict was soon decided; the tomahawk of Heyward and the rifle of Hawkeye descended on the skull of the Huron, at the same moment that the knife of Uncas reached his heart." Clearly, using teamwork shows their ability to mingle in a human relationship.

The risking of each others lives shows their ability to mingle in a human relationship. "Hawkeye", "Chingagook", and "Uncas" regularly risk each others lives to help each other in The Leatherstocking Tales. "Hawkeye" saves "Chingagook" from a forest fire by carrying him to safety. "Tis useless to talk to an Indian with the death-fit on him, lad," interrupted Natty, who seized the strips of the blanket, and with wonderful dexterity strapped the passive chieftain to his own back; when he turned, and with a strength that seemed to bid defiance, not only to his years, but to his load, he led the way to the point whence he had issued." "Hawkeye" after helping rescue "Alice" returns to help rescue "Uncas" risking his life in the process. "The Hurons hold the pride of the Delawares; the last of the high blood of the Mohicans is in their power." returned the scout; "I shall go see what can be done in his favor." "Uncas" saves "Duncan" from certain death risking his life to do so. "At the instant of extreme danger, a dark hand and a glancing knife appeared before him; the Indian released his hold, as the blood flowed freely from around the severed tendons of the wrist; Duncan was drawn backward by the saving arm of Uncas." "Uncas" risks his life to save "Cora" and both are killed in the process. "Magua recoiled a step; and one of his assistants, profiting by the chance, sheathed his own knife in the bosom of Cora." "Diverted from his object by this interruption, and maddened by the murder he had just witnessed, Magua buried his weapon in the back of the prostrate Delaware, uttering an unearthly shout as he committed the dastardly deed." By continually risking their lives to help each other they clearly show their ability to mingle in a human relationship.

Clearly, Cooper’s Leatherstocking novels show that the "Red and "White" man are able to mingle in a human relationship. Cooper’s characters live together in the same environment sharing the same hardships. His characters call each other friend and share an interest in each others past and family history. They share opinions about situations as they arise and act accordingly. Their actions show them giving each other advice on how to overcome problems as they encounter them. The ability to work as a team to accomplish the various tasks shows they have overcome any problem of racial differences. His characters are constantly risking their lives to help each other and other people in his novels.
Cooper’s scene at the grave of “Uncas” shows that they have been able to overcome racial barriers. “Chingagook grasped the hand that, in the warmth of feeling, the scout had stretched across the fresh earth, and in that attitude of friendship these two sturdy and intrepid woodsmen bowed their heads together, while scalding tears fell to their feet, watering the grave of Uncas like drops of falling rain.”19 Later, at the grave of “Chingagook”. “Natty Bummpo” has the headstone read to him. “He was the last of his people who continued to inhabit this country; and it may be said of him, that his faults were those of an Indian, and his virtues those of a man.”20 Cooper’s novels clearly show that the “Red and “White” men are capable of interacting in a human relationship. His novels could be used as an example of what could be possible in race relations. Even though Cooper’s novels were romance they show what could be possible. Race relations today prove Cooper was right to a certain degree there is a large amount of mingling of the races.

Notes

1Albert Keiser, The Indian in American Literature (New York: Oxford UP, 1933) 102.
8Cooper, Mohicans, 23.
9Cooper, Mohicans, 25.
10Cooper, Mohicans, 26.
11Cooper, Mohicans, 40.
12Cooper, Mohicans, 33.
13Cooper, Mohicans, 121.
14Cooper, Mohicans, 122.
15Cooper, Mohicans, 113.
16Cooper, Mohicans, 280.
17Cooper, Mohicans, 68.
18Cooper, Mohicans, 359.
19Cooper, Mohicans, 373.
The Physical Therapist’s Responses:
RATING: P

“--too many direct quotes

--little actual thought from the writer”

The Business Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P “C-

The paper included a title page, outline, body, and Notes. The footnote reference numbers should have been done on the computer.

The writer does a good job supporting the thesis statement. I would have liked more of the writer’s own opinions and comments. The phrase “...man’s ability to mingle in a new human relationship” was overused.

I think it is interesting that the outlines for 400-96-1081 and 421-92-2063 are almost identical! The body of each document appears to use different documentation.

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Paper is 85% quoted material--items strung together with no discussion. Thesis is not original (see paper number 421-92-2063). Another student or the instructor must have provided thesis and outline. So very little in this paper is the student’s work, and that work is poor.

Footnotes not used since 1986.

Group-Specific Essay #30 (Essay 262 of Sample)

Gun Control
Outline
Thesis: We should be stricter about gun-control because guns are harmful to American society.
I. Introduction
   A. Stating the problem of gun control
      1. Gun control is a serious problem
      2. Gun control became complicated
   B. Stating the opposing viewpoints
      1. Some people agree with gun control
      2. Some people don’t agree with gun control
   C. Thesis Statement
      1. We should stricter about gun control
      2. Guns are harmful to American society
II. General background
A. The increasing amount of handguns
   1. Crimes involving handguns rose to 1 million in 1992
   2. Handguns murders rose 24% to a total # of 13,2000 in 1992
B. Guns threatening American society
   1. Guns threatening to American education
   2. Guns are the most efficient tool for robbers or criminals
C. Guns also threatening to American education
   1. A student of Greenwood High School opened fire with a .32 caliber handgun.
   2. Student used gun to solve their problem

III. Opposing argument
A. The ideas that gun-control is false
   1. Guns are used for people own protection
   2. People are more likely to kill a violent attacker than kill themselves.
B. The result of the protestion of gun-control
   1. The rate of student dropping out of school increase
   2. The living standard of American might go down
C. Facts to prove
   1. Youngsters are getting their hands on guns
   2. 270,000 guns are brought to school every day

IV. Argument to support thesis
A. How guns threaten education
   1. Students brought in school to protect themselves
   2. Teachers are also afraid to stay in school
B. The cost of guns
   1. Guns cost American government a lot of money
   2. Guns take away the lives of American
C. The effectiveness of selling guns freely
   1. Criminals can get their guns easily
   2. Crime rate increase

V. Summary the essay
A. Summerize the thesis
   1. It's good to keep the gun law
   2. Gun control might reduce crime rate
B. Summerize the body
   1. Criminals can not get guns easy if there are some gun law
   2. Violence might be less if there is gun control law
C. Final thought or feeling about the essay
   1. Guns are better used for protecting a country
   2. To reduce crime rate, every body need not to commit crime

GUN CONTROL
Today, one of the most serious problems that we are still arguing about is gun control. Gun control has become complicated because of many
different ideas that are given by many people who are stereotypes. Some people say that we need to be harder about gun control, but other people still oppose gun control. We should be stricter about gun control because guns are harmful to American society.

According to the Courier-Journal, “crimes involving handguns rose to nearly 1 million in 1992, a record level. Handguns are used in 13 percent of violent accidents - a 50 percent increase from five years ago. Also, handguns murders rose 24 percent to a total number of 13,200 in 1992” (Howlette 1). Gun problems are also threatening American society. For instance, this problem is threatening education and public safety. Similar to this, guns are the most efficient tool for criminals or robbers to use. All of these signal a bad sign for the place where we live.

Some people blindly think that gun control is not a good idea. For instance, the people who are against gun control believe that guns are needed for their own protection in response to violent crime (Foster, Siegel, Jacobs 103). But people don’t realize that the goal of protection can sometimes turn into harmful results. It is very easy to commit a crime if a person has a gun in his hand. For example, humans cannot always control their temper or anger, so if they have a gun in their hands, then they would use it to satisfy how they feel at that blinding moment. To prove this, there is the case of a student of Greenwood High School who was shot by another student with a .32 caliber handgun as he stood in the hallway of his school (Harrington, Lueker 37). This happened because of the result of an argument between this student and other students who were involved in the case. As a result, people accidentally turn into criminals even though they were just protecting themselves. In contrast to the idea that gun control is right, some people thought the opposite. According to a U.S. News and World Report Kates stated that people are more likely to kill a violent attacker than to kill themselves in a gun accident (30). This idea somehow is reasonable, but what will happen if all people are having this opinion. The answer is of course not gonna to good. The reason is if people carry this idea in their mind then guns will be easier to obtain. So the criminals will get their guns easily. And then innocent people are protecting themselves and criminals are committing their crimes; therefore both side are shooting at each other. After all the world might become an awful graveyard. Of course nobody likes our world to become like this.

Guns are seriously threatening the education of America. At the age of high school students or below, people seem to be immature. Unfortunately, at this age, people are having many more troubles than ever. When people are in trouble, such as somebody else threatens them or they argue with other people, they may use guns to solve their problems. According to the U.S. News and World Report, an estimated 270,000 guns are brought to school every day (Toch 31). Another example is form the U.S. News and World Report. On August 31 a ninth grader was killed and a tenth grader was wounded by another student who opened fire on a
crowd in the cafeteria of Atlanta Harper High School (Toch 32). It even more dangerous that kids are getting their hands on guns. In the article Kid and Gun Bill Walsh shows that youngster not old enough to drive are getting their hands on and using some of the most dangerous killing machines on the market- and often their targets are each other(3). This brilliant idea proves that against gun control is wrong.

Students are afraid of a lot of violence that is happening in their school. Also, they are afraid to go to school because their safety is weakened. The teachers are not different from the students. Teachers are so frightened due to the violence that they cannot think of teaching anymore. When students believe that school is a dangerous place, then they might bring weapons or be absent from school. Due to this problem, the rate of student dropping out of school might increase. These problems have occurred because guns are sold freely in America.

Guns cost people and the government of America a lot of money in the economy and in the loss of lives. Since guns are sold widely in the United States, the result may be the increasing violence. Guns are not only leading to violence, but they also cost the government to run many systems in order to keep track of criminals to buy guns. Related to this, guns sometimes might be the cause of killing and people getting hurt or dying. Afterward, crimes breed another crimes. In other words, when a person get killed, then his or her relatives might think of revenge. So when a person thinks of killing somebody, what is the easiest way to do it? The answer is guns. After all, the more easily someone can get guns, the easier it is for violence to happen.

Furthermore, in most accidents, handguns seem to be the most popular weapon that criminals are using. In the book Crime and Criminal the author stated that handguns are the most popular weapon(Bender 192-194). Why handguns are so popular? The answer is its effectiveness. One reason that handgun is popular is it easy for criminal to hide in their pockets. Another reason is handguns are used in surprise purpose so it very fit for criminals to apply. Also, it is very cheap to buy. In consideration, handguns seem to be the most weapon that need to eliminate.

We think that the government has to give out some rules that would stop the gun sellers from selling weapons freely. As weapons are so easy to buy in the United States, the effectiveness might be terrible. In a small crime like a robbery, the criminal could use the guns to do their job. As a result, they could do their jobs successfully and someone's else property is more likely to be lost. Sometimes, a lesser crime such as robbery could become as a deadly crime as murder. To explain this, while the robbers are doing the robbing in a bank or some other place, if some people attack or are against them then they might open fire to force the people who against them. Besides that, there is a big crime like terrorism. If guns are sold widely in America, then the terrorists would have more possibilities to obtain their guns. If terrorists got their guns, then they might kill other
people, damage property, or be a threat to politics. What happens next is that America might become a harder country to live in or its living standard may go down.

Furthermore, keeping guns as a protection might cause suicide. Guns are weapons that people can use to kill themselves the most easily. For example, if a person gets very depressed he may end up with the crazy idea of ending his life. Then what do a better job of this than a gun? Thus, owning a gun may increase the possibilities of suicide in American society.

Finally, we think that guns are better used to protect a country rather than a small thing as self-protection. However, because it is so easy to get guns, it’s really tempting criminals or robbers to get them, the crime rate gets bigger and bigger. If there are no gun laws and anybody can buy them, people have to protect themselves more seriously. In contrast to this, if there are some gun laws then the violence may be less than it was before. In order to reduce the crime rate, each and every body needed to have the same idea to reduce crime. In the other words, the crime rate will not decrease if there are people still committing crimes. If we are together and have the idea to approve gun-control, we think that the crime rate may decrease. Then people don’t have to worry much about violence and protecting themselves and everyone can live in peace and harmony.

WORKS CITED
Carold, Foster and Siegel, A. Mark and Jacobs, R. Nancy. Gun Control
Kates, Don. “ Should You Own a Gun For Protection.” U.S. News and
Lueker, Billey and Donna, Harrington. “Blown Away.” American School
Mar 1993): 30+
Walsh, Bill. “ Kids and Guns.” Times-Picayune(New Orleans, La.) (25
July 1993): A1+

The Physical Therapist’s Responses:
RATING: P

spelling errors, grammatical errors
incomplete sentence
awkward, but thought is conveyed in parts of paper
inconsistent noun/verb agreement
barely proficient
The Business Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

The writer of this paper has written a clear, unified thesis statement from which generalizations have been made. There is sufficient documentation to support the generalizations. The writer, however, has paid little or no attention to proofreading, spelling, grammar, and noun/pronoun agreement. Several run-on sentences and faulty composition are present.

The spell feature of word processing programs would eliminate many of the spelling errors!

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Over-generalized
Not focused, specific
Serious grammar problems
Illogical (I’d hate for this one to own a gun!)
Weak thesis, support, organization (even though there are words on the page...)

Group-Specific Essay #31 (Essay 021 of Sample)

Choose “Janus”

Both the story “Janus” by Ann Beattie and the story “Say Yes” by Tobias Wolff explore the theme of relationships which are going through a passage and both stories describe human emotional detachment, however, I feel Beattie does a better job of communicating this theme through her use of symbolism.

Both stories develop the theme of a marriage relationship which is going through a passage. Wolff’s short story “Say Yes” begins with a husband and wife washing dishes. Ann, his wife asks her husband how he feels about black and white people being married. He responds by saying “that all things considered, he thought it was a bad idea.” “Why?” she asks. This conversation is the beginning of a major shift in the relationship between Ann and her husband. Ann strongly disagrees with her husband, and believes that race is irrelevant. Her husband argues that two people who come from different backgrounds can never really know each other. As the argument intensifies Ann and her husband both work hard to “demonstrate their indifference” toward one another. At this point in the story it is obvious that Ann and her husband are failing to connect emotionally. Her husband seems to fear getting emotionally close to Ann and fights to keep things on a superficial level. When he goes outside he realizes the shortness of life and the love he feels for his wife. This is when the passage in their marriage begins to take place.

He felt ashamed that he had let his wife get him into a fight. In another thirty years or so
they would both be dead. What would all that stuff matter then? He thought of the years they (Ann and him) had spent together, and how close they were, and how well they knew each other, and his throat tightened so that he could hardly breathe. His face and neck began to tingle. Warmth flooded his chest.

After this point Ann’s husband starts to value his relationship with his wife over always having to be right, and the couple start to become closer. This is indicated when Ann’s husband proposes to her again. “Ann I’m really sorry,” he says. “I’ll make it up to you, I promise.” “How?” she asks “I’ll marry you,” he whispers. This marks the new beginning of their marriage, a passage.

Although “Say Yes” shows a relationship going through a positive passage “Janus” shows a relationship which is ending. The title “Janus” symbolizes passages because it refers to a Roman god who is identified with doors, gates and other places of passage. In “Janus” the main character Andrea is having to give up a relationship with a lover. This relationship is going through a passage, indicated by the change in Andrea’s relationship to the bowl.

Before, Andrea had the choice between a lover who fulfilled her dreams, and a comfortable marriage, but when her lover forces her to make a decision she clearly chooses to honor her marriage commitment. It’s as if she has been stuck in the middle, looking both ways. Much of the story is about her having to accept the end of her relationship with her lover, which is described as a “vanishing point on the horizon”.

Both stories also describe characters who are emotionally detached from one another in their marriages. Ann’s husband in “Say Yes” speaks in a logical manner towards his wife, always insisting on taking a rational position in their arguments. Throughout the story Wolff never refers to Ann’s husband by name, which seems to be a metaphor for the lack of personal connection he has with his wife. Wolff makes us aware of the husband’s habit of detaching himself from people in the following conversation when he and his wife are discussing marriage between blacks and whites:

‘They don’t come from the same culture that we do. Listen to them sometime--they even have their own language. That’s okay with me. I like hearing them talk--he did; for some reason it always made him feel happy--‘bit it’s different. A person from their culture and a person from our culture could never really know each other.’ ‘Like you know me?’ his wife asked.

Another way Wolff shows the husband’s emotional detachment is the way he describes the husband’s concern for his wife. The husband shows his
concern in quiet ways, like helping with the dishes, but fails to demonstrate his love for his wife in an overt way. Another indication of the husband’s detachment is the fact that he was once on the debate team. In order to debate, people use logical arguments, and separate themselves from emotional appeal. Is Ann’s husband more interested in being right than in being close to his wife?

Beattie also develops a main character who is emotionally detached. There are many ways that Beattie shows the emotional detachment between Andrea and her husband. One example of that is the fact that Beattie never refers to Andrea’s husband by name. Again the author, like Wolff, suggests personal detachment. Andrea’s husband is obviously detached from his wife since he says that he is, “fortunate to be married to a woman who had such a fine aesthetic sense and yet could also function in the real world.” Like the husband in “Say Yes” he does not show real love for his wife, but almost seems to view her as an object.

Andrea is also emotionally detached, not only from her husband but from other people as well. This is apparent by the fact that she has replaced her human relationships with a bowl. Andrea’s job is also a metaphor for her lack of human connection and warmth. As a realtor, she is an outsider finding homes for other people who are in relationships. She is a master of illusion, able to give the homes she shows the impression that they are already filled with families, when in fact, they are empty.

Each author uses symbolism in different, but unique ways to communicate their themes. In “Say Yes” symbolism is used frequently throughout the story. Wolff uses the dish water, the dog, and the stranger to symbolize different parts of Ann and her husband’s relationship. The dish water is described as being “flat and gray”. Ann and her husband’s relationship in the beginning seems to be described in much the same way. Wolff describes their relationship as being shallow and on a superficial level. Ann is struggling to go beyond the surface as her husband struggles to stay on top.

She stared down at it, her lips pressed tight together, then plunged her hands under the surface. “Oh!” she cried, and jumped back. She took her right hand by the wrist and held it up. Her thumb was bleeding.

This passage shows the pain that the relationship is experiencing. When Ann took the risk to go beyond the surface she immediately drew back in pain.

In another section where Wolff describes the water he uses the word “hot”. Does this symbolize the depth and intensity of Ann and her husband’s disagreement? Wolff also uses the word “hot” right before the argument reaches the climax. The dogs are also a symbol of Ann’s relationship with her husband. While the passage in their marriage begins to take place Ann’s husband walks outside and sees two “mutts” playing. The female dog is in charge and the male dog is submissive. This
symbolizes the part of the story where Ann’s husband makes a new commitment to her to be emotionally responsive. He has allowed Ann to gain the control in the new relationship, just as the female dog was in control.

The last use of symbolism is the end of the story. “His heart pounded the way it had on their first night together, the way it still did when he work at a noise in the darkness and waited to hear it again—the sound of someone moving through the house a stranger.” How ironic that the word “stranger” be used to describe his wife, the person whom he should have the closest bond with. I believe Wolff chooses to compare this night to Ann and her husband’s first night together, because this is the start of a new commitment for her husband. A fresh start for the two of them. The word “stranger” could possibly symbolize the different dimensions people have as individuals, and that there are always new things to learn about one another. Together Ann and her husband have planted a new seed and started a new dimension of their relationship.

Although Beattie also uses symbolism she chose to only use one object throughout the entire story, allowing her to communicate her theme in a much more powerful way then Wolff. The symbol Beattie chose was a bowl. The bowl is set up to be both “subtle and noticeable”. Throughout the story the bowl seems to take place of human relationships for Andrea. At first the bowl is compared to a close friend. Beattie writes that, “It was like leaving a friend at an outing”. The bowl is also compared to a child, “Sometimes there were stories in the paper about families forgetting a child somewhere and driving to the next city. Andrea had only gone a mile down the road before she remembered.” Later in the story the bowl takes on even more significance as Andrea becomes obsessed with it. “What she believed was that it was something that she loved.” At this point in the story the bowl seems to take the place of her lover.

The bowl also has other symbolic meaning. It is a symbol for life, growth, and movement, which is indicated when Beattie compares it to “cells under a microscope”. The bowl is also described as a strong, useful object which is not illusionary, unlike Andrea’s relationship with her husband and her lover. The bowl could also symbolize nourishment, since bowls are generally used to hold food. Throughout the story the bowl is empty, much the same way Andrea’s relationships are devoid of emotional nourishment.

Although both “Say Yes” and “Janus” deal with the theme of relationships going through a change and human emotional detachment, I find Beattie’s “Janus” to be more enjoyable and powerful through her use of symbols. I found Andrea’s obsession with the bowl to be very realistic. Almost all people at one time have been obsessed with something, not necessarily a bowl, but maybe personal weight, or another person, or maybe even a type of food. Most people have their own individual securities like Andrea’s bowl—maybe a blanket or a teddy bear. I found it very easy to relate to Andrea and enjoyed reading the story.
The Physical Therapist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

INTERESTING, ENJOYABLE READING
good analogies, few grammatical mistakes
no spelling mistakes (that I found)
well presented arguments
“sophisticated” writer

The Business Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

In my opinion, the student is proficient in comparing and contrasting the two stories. The paper, however, does contain two run-on sentences, omission of text, and numerous punctuation errors. It appears the student is using long quotations throughout the paper; however, there are no internal citations or references. (Critical error).

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

Clear writing
Clear thesis idea
Good textual support
Effective comparison/contrast structure
Sense of writer’s own attitude
Well organized

Group-Specific Essay #32 (Essay 097 of Sample)

In the opening pages of Edgar Allen Poe’s Gothic tale “The Fall of the House of Usher,” the unnamed narrator, traveling on horseback, approaches the dilapidated Usher mansion, the sight of the house afflicts him with the profoundest melancholy. So overcome with morbity, he is compelled to dismount his horse and reposition himself before the house, hoping by rearranging the “particulars of the scene” to “annihilate its capacity for sorrowful impression.” What happens, however, is that from the “precipitous brink” where he stands, the house’s image, now “remodeled” and “inverted” in the “black and lurid tam” below, suddenly produces in him “a shudder even more thrilling than before.” The rearrangement of the narrator’s position does nothing in the way of winning mastery over the house; the attempt to reconstruct it – put it in right order – results in failure (Hoffman, 302-303).

The commentary that suggest the story is about the loss of self or the regaining of self tends to argue that the house is the site of the narrator’s own madness, a place through which he must pass in order to confront –
and later either resign himself to or overcome – his alienated self (May, 24).

It is perhaps in the passage already alluded to, the opening lake scene, that we may begin to see how Poe’s story problematizes the self. Here the narrator sees in the “tarn” the inverted image of the house; but a closer examination of the particular details of the scene reveals a further complication. Poe strategically situates the narrator at the edge of the cliff, “the precipitous brink,” so that he narrator’s gaze can be directed down, straight down – at his own reflection. In other words, the house, described in human terms with its “eye-like windows,” merges with the image of the narrator, becomes his double. Later, the “haunted palace” of the character Roderick’s song, which seems to double with the House of Usher, is said to stand in the “monarch Thoughts dominion;” it is described as a “head” complete with luxuriant blonde hair. The logic of this imagery suggest that the House of Usher is supposed to represent a human skull, but one that is “haunted” or falling apart. We can assume then, that the disintegrating house is but a portrait of the narrator’s own disintegrating mind, a mind perhaps once firmly rooted in rationalist thought (Pahl, 17).

Though the reader is clearly given the impression that the house duplicates the narrator’s face, if not his mind, the narrator nevertheless recognizes only the image of the house. This misrecognition is doubly achieved, since the house, even were the narrator to “recognize” his own reflection, offers a self-image that is both distorted and impenetrable. The “eye-like windows” are vacant or visually incomprehensible, thus precluding the possibility of self-recognition or identification. The vacancy of the “eyes,” taken in another sense – meaning “abandoned” or “not occupied” as opposed to “expressionless” – becomes significant if one considers the traditionally valued position of the eyes as the body’s chief means of access to the soul, that is, as the proverbial windows to the soul. In this case, the center of the narrator’s being could be said to be missing, absent, having vacated the premises as it were. Witnessing an empty space where a soul once was, the narrator must necessarily fail to obtain an accurate vision of himself (Bloom 83).

The lake scene may stand as paradigmatic for the way “doubling” operates throughout the story, the mirror images continually marking differences, not identities. That the narrator’s double, the house, is a distortion or misrepresentation of himself has already been demonstrated. But the way in which the character Roderick doubles with the house and with the narrator is a matter that, though already suggested, requires some elucidation; for it is precisely the way Poeformulates this doubling that we may begin to understand the exact nature of the Usher family and of the affliction it suffers (Pohl 19).

The obvious parallel between Roderick Usher and the house is their physical deterioration, worsening with each day; and of course the same could be said for Madeline, Roderick’s twin sister, whose medical diagnosis indicates “a gradual wasting away of the person.” The general
gloom and melancholy that pervades the atmosphere of the house also
cervades the spirit of its inhabitants. The specific language Poe employs to
describe both Roderick and the house is in no way accidental. Just as in
the house there appears to be a “wild inconsistency between its still perfect
adaptation of parts, and the crumbling condition of the individual stones,”
in the narrator’s friend there appears to be an incoherence symptomatic of
his “nervous agitation”. The “molded” destinies of the House of Usher
echo Roderick’s eyes become “vacant” when finally, his illness taking
over, “the luminous of his eye had utterly gone out.” Towards the end of
the story, Roderick’s face is marked with a “stony rigidity,” calling up the
stones of the house; the fungi on the dilapidated house hang in a “fine
tangled web-work from the eaves,” suggestive of Roderick’s hair with its
“web-like softness and tenuity” (Buranelli 67).

The loss of spiritual identity is naturally the final human danger, and
Roderick lives in its shadow. The approach to the climax of the story,
through the entombment of Madeline, her riding from the coffin and her
return to her brother just before her real death, is controlled by Poe with a
skill of which his earlier stories of premature burial had given promise.
The madness of Roderick, the flight of the visitor, and the rending of the
house into ruin are portrayed with that economy of which Poe alone
among writers of the short story was at that time possessed (Quinn 284-
285).

I believe “The Fall of the House of Usher,” was written by Poe under the
influence of drugs and alcohol. Poe was an opium and alcohol addict. Poe
wrote the story describing the deterioration of the self, which I believe he
was suffering from. Through the use of drugs, Poe’s body was
deteriorating just as the house’s body was failing apart. Through his use of
drugs, Poe’s mind was deteriorating just as Roderick’s were. In the end of
the story, the house crumbles. Poe eventually deteriorates until he finally
crumbles leading to his death.

The Physical Therapist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

good grammar, sentence construction varied
able to convey meaning
parallels are obvious
noun/verb agreement!

The Business Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P “C-”
"The student’s writing is highly proficient; however, more attention is needed in proofreading for content (p. 4) and format (spacing after commas, etc). No title. No references."

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Troubling paper.
Brilliant connections, observations, but unclear references to scholars.
And then--very basic writing/grammar problems--
* Subject/Verb agreement
* Comma Splices
* garbled sentences
* verb tense
* fragments
I think this could be an example of one of the following:
* student unable to integrate sources
* student thinks more brilliantly than he/she writes
* partly (and poorly) plagiarized
* a rush job which would benefit from rewriting
No Works Cited
Internal documentation form incorrect

Group-Specific Essay #33 (Essay 219 of Sample)

SHOELESS JOE JACKSON
(power of Dreams)

We all have dreams, some of us even work hard to help them along & come true, as Ray Kinsella did. This is a dream about base ball, although it reflects how we live life. If people look to their dreams and hold on, work hard it can come true.

Ray heard a voice one day out in the corn fields, it said “Build it and they will come”. Ray knew what it was he had to do, build a base ball field. He loved 3 things family, base ball, & land. Rays father loved base ball too, Ray missed his dad & was sorry that his dad did not have his dream, playing Major League Ball. Although his father played some in the Minor Leagues.

Ray had finished left field and Shoeless Joe Jackson came, his fathers hero, Rays too. The farmers that lived around Ray thought he was crazy for plowing up his corn to build a base ball field. This is Ray’s dream and he was going for it no matter what. Ray’s wife and daughter stood by him the whole time, like family

Shoeless Joe told Ray if he would finish the field that the other’s would come, he did not really understand, but did it anyways.
This dream of Ray Kinsella’s is a lot like our own dreams. The truth of the matter is, Power, money, greed stop us from achieving our goals. The rich, the government, the Ball club owners, they all want to take and give very little in return, just enough to keep us hanging on. We as a people keep fighting for our dreams to come true, in time they will come true.

When Ray went to New Hampshire to find the writer “Salinger” his journey had just begun. The two men were on the same journey, now with moonlight Graham in the picture. This was all a big mystery when they found him he was a ghost like the rest of the players. They made it back to Iowa, Ray was about to lose his farm but his wife & little girl stood by his side. He also had a famous writer that believed in his dream. This is magic, and that’s what dreams are made of, magic.

Shoeless Joe Jackson thrown out of base ball to never play again, it was like having an arm or leg cut off. The thing we love the most gone. This is where dreams or hopes come in too play. If we lose our dream we may spend the rest of our life trying to get it back. I know from my own life about dreams. I would have gave everything up just for some land to build a home on for my family, I have lost that, but I will spend the rest of my life to get that back at any cost.

The field that Ray Kinsella built was for his father who died, his father never got to play major league ball. Like the eight men of the White Sox that got thrown out of base ball forever; “lots of pain” Ray Kinsella built this field for his dad & his dreams. Our dreams are all we have some times. I feel we should act on them.

Ray Kinsella’s family stood by him no matter how crazy his dreams were, loyalty, unconditional love this is what it’s all about. Love, loyalty and dreams they go together it’s life. This is the kind of life people want. Family, team mates it’s all the same, a passion we all share.

Dreams do come true if you believe, life is short, show your family and loved one’s team mates alike unconditional loyalty. We can die then it’s too late. Always give your best. We all long for our past, so remember when your looking at the future. Hold on to your dreams make them a reality.

The Physical Therapist’s Responses:
RATING: P

“grammatical mistakes
spelling errors
good gathering of thoughts, pursuing story line”

The Business Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Very poorly written
Sentence fragments
Run-on sentences
Incomplete thoughts

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“Severe grammar problems
Below college level (and high school)
Nothing adequate here.”

Group Four Results

Group Four consisted of a former English professor who had been appointed Chair of
the Allied Health Division, a sociologist, and a member of the Reading and Study Skills
Program, who later became a member of the English Program. Thus, Group Four’s
responses provide the opportunity to examine in great detail how a former English
professor and a future English professor respond to the same essays. How would their
responses affect the group’s consensus, if at all? A chart presenting the group’s ratings
and how they compare to teachers’ grades follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essay Number</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>047</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B-</td>
<td>C-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>250</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>027</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>215</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A-</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>007</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>065</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>180</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>241</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>C-/A-</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>173</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>260</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>141</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>A-</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 7. Group Four Ratings

Figure 7 shows that respondents agree completely in three cases: a P, an HP, and an
NP. They agree with teachers clearly in two of the three cases, a teacher having assigned
a B- to the essay the respondents rated a P and another assigning an A- to the essay the respondents rated an HP.

Partial agreement among respondents occurs in five instances: 250, 065, 180, 173, and 141. Partial agreement with one respondent greatly disagreeing occurs when respondents rate 007 and 260. For 250, 065, 180, 173, and 141, agreement between two respondents and the teacher occurs in the case of 065 and 141, with respondents assigning HPs to both essays and teachers assigning an A and an A-. There is no agreement among respondents and teachers for 250, 180, and 173, with teachers assigning significantly higher ratings in all three cases. Likewise, essays 007 and 260-- for which two respondents’ ratings were NPs and one respondent’s rating an HP--receive ratings that significantly disagree with teachers’ grades in both cases. Again, teachers’ grades are much higher than respondents’ grades.

The respondents split three ways in assigning a rating to Essay 027, which received a grade of C from the teacher. There is no consensus among respondents here and, consensus between teacher and respondents appears only if we “average” the respondents’ ratings.

**Group Four Essays and Comments**

The eleven essays the respondents rated follow. Following each essay, I include the rating from each respondent as well as his or her reasons for assigning a particular rating.

**Group-Specific Essay #34 (Essay 047 of Sample)**

**Poe’s Tales of Deathly Love**

Outline

Thesis: Many of Poe’s tales are love stories, tales of a “profane love”, a love so great that it brings death to the lovers.

I. Poe’s obsession with dead women
   A. Death of the women in Poe’s life
Edgar Allan Poe was an American writer who lived a brief life from 1809-1849. Poe wrote gothic literature with some short stories and a few poems. When he was two years old his father left, when he was three his mother died of tuberculosis. He was then raised by foster parents. Poe, at the age twenty-seven, married his thirteen year old cousin, Virginia Clemm, whom later died at age fourteen of unknown causes. Poe experienced loneliness and loss of loved ones often in the early stages of his life. The gloom and despair of an unhappy life are reflected in Poe’s mournful poems and grotesque laden short stories. His imagination created his own world where death ruled. Poe doesn’t talk much of the death of his mother, but her death was the start of contributing factors that led to Poe’s creation of beautiful, young, and intellectual women in his stories. In these stories, which are love stories, the love is so great and profane that it brings death to the lovers.

Poe possessed an unquenchable thirst to explore and evaluate the subconscious of others, as well as that of his own. In “Berenice”, Egaeus proclaims that, “...his feelings had never been of the heart, and my passions were always of the mind...I had seen her...not as a thing to admire, but to analyze.” “Berenice” is also an example of the irrational psychology. It studies the terrible power of the fixed idea of monomania, which leads to insanity and crime when the mind is overcome by unreasonable thoughts.” Berenice and Egaeus are cousins and he very much wants to marry her, yet as time goes on, he grows afraid of her. One evening she approached him, not the once beautiful and vibrant Berenice, but the ill-stricken Berenice. She glances a peculiar smile at the frightened...
Egaeus. It is at that moment he becomes highly obsessed with her teeth. We go on to learn that Berenice seems to pass away, but was in reality buried alive, only to be awakened by the insanely mad and confused Egaeus, who digs up her grave to retrieve her teeth for his own keeping. This is the type of subconscious fear and madness that is evident with Poe characters.

In “The Fall of the House of Usher”, Roderick Usher experiences this madness and his disease of fear. Roderick lives with his sister Madeline, whom is his twin. They live in the family mansion where they are shut off from the outside world. The only intervention is when Roderick sends for the narrator whom is a friend. Roderick feels that he must talk about the conditions he has been living under with his sister Madeline. Critic, D.H. Lawrence says that, “The brother and sister love each other passionately and exclusively.” It is believed that the Usher’s were incestual, and that the fear Roderick was suffering from was a fear of anyone knowing about their relationship. Lady Madeline is also dying from origin unknown, the demise of her is also the demise of Roderick and the family estate. Madeline died and was entombed, only to be brought back a few days later, as the narrator is trying to comfort Roderick with a reading of “Mad Trist” of Sir Hauncelot Canning. Lady Madeline somehow struggles free, makes her way upstairs to her brother Roderick and she falls upon him now bringing death to them and the family house as it crumbles to the ground and the narrator flees. “Ligeia” and “The Fall of the House of Usher” mark the highest reach of the romantic elements in Poe’s genius...

In “Eleonora” the narrator states:

“Men have called me mad, but the question is not yet settled, whether madness is or is not of the loftiest intelligence—whether much that is glorious—whether all that is profound—does not spring from disease of thought—from the moods of mind exalted at the expense of the general intellect. We will say then that I am mad.”

The narrator very much loves Eleonora. They lived in the beautiful Valley of the Many-Colored Grass. The narrator describes many walks he and Eleonora take, as all the while he is seeking to get to know her deeper and deeper. The narrator makes several comparisons of her beauty to that of nature which was overwhelmingly breathtaking, but the gorgeous glories from the Valley of the Many-Colored grass were to be no more, just as Eleonora was to be no more. Eleonora talked at length one day of her dying, and that she wanted the narrator to still be at peace and happy with the valley that they had grown to know and love. The narrator at that moment, makes a vow to never marry another woman of earth. Eleonora, in return, accepted the vow and promised to give the narrator frequent indications of her presence. The pain did become so great for the narrator...
that he swept himself away to the city to suffice his pain, and in doing so, meets Ermengardel who is, seemingly so, a reincarnation of Eleonora.

Poe also deals with reincarnation in another one of his tales, "Morella". This story poses the problem of identity. In this story Morella has a deep and abiding affection for the narrator, while his intrigue lay mostly with dreams and wonderings of what could be with someone so intensely obsessed with her studies as Morella was, as he never spoke of passion or a love for her. Fate bound them together. Eventually the narrator is drawn to love her studies, only by mere habit and the examples Morella had set forth leaving lasting impressions upon him—So lasting that it brought the narrator terror. Morella was obsessed with psychological studies, those dealing with personal identity. This she saw as beautiful and pondered the question of being altered at death or being lost forever with death. This realm of identity gave considerable interest to the narrator, as he saw Morella as deep as an abyss. He longed for her to be deceased and grew bitter and furious as waited out the grueling days. Upon Morella’s last day, she reminds the narrator that he had not loved her passionately in life but that he would love her in death, as she would leave behind a child brought into this world as a cause of her death. Upon the first breath of the child, Morella took her last. The narrator is sickened by the resemblance the nameless child has to her mother, every feature so definite and reminding. He was to adore her but did not. She was her mother and her mother was she. The child was sullen. "My daughter remained nameless upon earth.” This the narrator wrote. In baptism the narrator finally has deliverance from his fears. The child’s name was to be “…Morella.” At this moment the child was overcome by death. Now, remembering as he watched the earth grow dark, the narrator listened as the sea murmured evermore-Morella. But she had died and as the narrator laughed a long and bitter laugh, he saw no traces of the first Morella in the charnel where the second was laid to rest. There was peace ‘alas.

Clearly, the stories that Poe write are morbid and profane love stories that always seem to bring death. “Poe is a writer who is all nerves, and even something more.” Poe’s attitude and actions are bore out from the deaths of his mother and his first wife. The stories that he writes usually contains characters that are cousins or such relation. In all of his love stories, the women are overcome with a sudden illness and then death. With his works, Poe also ties in hints of incestuous relationships. Poe’s lack of nurturing love has driven him to write about this in a profane manner. He seeks to know and love to a point that it suffocates and does not allow for healthy and nurturing love that allows one to grow.


The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: P “C+”

I’m a little unsure of my rating here. I suspect I would be more appreciative if I was [sic] familiar with Poe. However, really high proficiency should have made this content more accessible to the reader regardless of knowledge.

In my class I would have come down on statements made without footnoting or more solid reasons for making them.

Writer sounds knowledgeable but points don’t always tie together. Needs more connective narrative to explain points.

The Reading and Study Skills Professor:
RATING: P

Some good ideas
Outline reasonable
Thesis reasonable, but not clearly developed
Essay doesn’t maintain clear focus--meanders
Insanity more important in body than in thesis.
Writer seduced by “sound” of thoughts, which interferes with clear expression--lack of voice.
Mechanical skills need polishing. Generally dont[sic] interfere with meaning but do detract from authority.
Purpose incompletely achieved--organization good, development OK, tone inconsistent.
Proficiency with mechanics is fair.
Tough topic. This is borderline, but it passes on effort with challenging material.

The Allied Health Division Chair’s Responses:
RATING: P

adequate/average
minimal surface errors
not enough analysis
not enough use of details
too much summary
Group-Specific Essay #35 (Essay 250 of Sample)

**Competition: A Necessity for Everyone**

David Stanley Eitzen states competition is a “strong motivator and it pushes everyone to strive for excellence” (397). Even if we fail against the competition, it is still beneficial because the thrill of competing is thrill enough. Competition is without a doubt a positive force that drives people to set and accomplish their goals. It is necessary in every aspect of life because it forces us to set goals and try to achieve them.

In the United States we have an economic system called capitalism, based solely on the fact that people can compete with other people. Without this competition, we would create a system called communism which has proven not to work by what was former Russia. This type of system is presently intact in the People’s Republic of China, where people cannot compete against each other economically because the government controls virtually everything. This creates people who lack importance in their jobs and seem very unmotivated. Tom Peters is quoted as saying people “need a lot more positive reinforcement, and a lot less of the negative kind” (412) in order to obtain their highest potential. The absence of competition also results in no chance of upward mobility in their jobs. The people in American industries thrive on competition to produce better work. This generally does not mean that people are cut-throat and will do anything to get ahead. People are pushed by the competition around them and, ultimately, will produce better in their jobs. Also, as Ross Wetzsteon remarks, male and female “competitiveness in our professional lives is often a way to show our mutual respect” (371).

The importance of competition in the business world is apparent through the economy of Japan and our American economy. As Peter states America today faces “enormous business problems-- a consequence of the virtual absence of competition from World War II until about 1965” (412). America has been the economic superpower, especially in the automobile business, until the Japanese rebuilt their automobile industries and eventually surpassed ours. Because we were without any global competition, Japan was able to excel and overtake our abilities. We became lazy, and the quality of our cars dramatically declined because there was no competition to keep us on our toes. If we had had global competition at that time, we would have stayed motivated and not slacked off. As a result, competition could have prevented us from losing hold on one of our major industries.

Besides competition being important in the business world, it is also important in the sports atmosphere. People who are not advocates of competition believe that it could, as Katherine Martin says, “destroy a child’s self esteem, turn him away from a lifelong involvement in physical activity, foster negative attitudes toward authority figures, and encourage...
hostile, aggressive behavior” (375). This seems very extreme and has never been apparent to me especially during the fifteen years that I have been playing competitive soccer. Actually, it seems that many of the kids with whom I play soccer have positive attitudes, high self esteem, and a calm behavior. Competition in sports teaches a person many valuable lessons that help later on in life. I know that through sports I have learned how to deal with authority figures. I have dealt with referees being against me because of my temperament. They are always watching me to see if I will curse at them or try to hurt another player. Therefore, not only am I in competition with the opposing team but also with the referees. People against competition would testify that sports competitiveness will harm a child, but I am a case product that this type of competition does, in fact, positively affect life. I can honestly say that from playing soccer I have learned more life-surviving skills, such as cooperation, than I learned in all my years in school. If one does not have this type of competitiveness when young, it will be hard for him/her to deal with the demanding pressure of being competitive that he/she will encounter in the real world.

There are many reasons why competition is good, but the two most familiar reasons, as Eitzen states, “are that it is a strong motivator and it pushes everyone to strive for excellence” (397). Eitzen further asserts, “these qualities have led American society to greater societal achievements in productivity than found in less competitive societies” (397). Without competition we would lose the economic freedom of capitalism, and without it we would have a economic communist society. Competition is also an essential part of an individual’s life. Economic and individual competition reveal the essential part of an individual’s life. Economic and individual competition reveal the necessity for competition in every aspect of life.


The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

Well written (grammar correct, etc)
Supports position and stays on track
Good footnoting
As [a] sociologist [I] am critical that writer did not anticipate and react to other
explanations. [I] would not accept personal examples as "proof."

The Reading and Study Skills Professor's Responses:
RATING: P

Thesis works
*Generalizations, support weakly developed, particularly on economic side.
Mechanical skills adequate
Tone appropriate
Ideas not well developed. Biggest problem is lack of command of subject matter in
economic discussion. But author deserves credit tackling--and somewhat succeeding
with--a difficult subject.

The Allied Health Division Chair's Responses:
RATING: P "Could be HP?"

well organized
good use of source information
uses only quotations; should paraphrase and summarize sources too
nice voice--good evidence
few surface errors

Group-Specific Essay #36 (Essay 027 of Sample)

The Mix of Races
Outline
Thesis: Lawrence is mistaken about the "Red and White" man's ability to
mingle in a new human relationship. Cooper's novel The Last of the
Mohicans shows that.
I. Biography
   A. Growing up
   B. Knowledge of Indians
II. No "Red and White" mix
   1. Civilized (Pearce)
   2. Thieves and peasants (Keiser)
   3. No mix of race (Lawrence)
   4. Lawrence and other critics' error (Thesis)
III. Race Relations in The Last of the Mohicans shows them coming
together as a team
   A. Coming near French outpost
      1. Heywards fools the French
      2. Chingachgook sneaks to scalp the sentinel
      3. Discussing plans around campfire
B. Develop interest
1. Uncas and Cora fall in love
2. Attention to Cora
3. Attention to Uncas
4. Rescuing Cora
5. Giving his life for Cora
C. Risking life for each other
1. Indians risk their life
2. Hawkeye and Gamuet saving Uncas
3. Hawkeye saving his friends
4. Uncas saves Cora
5. Uncas dying while trying to save Cora

IV. Justification of race relations in The Last of the Mohicans
A. Lawrence’s error
B. Race relations in The Last of the Mohicans
C. Race relations today

James Fenimore Cooper, a great American novelist, who was born in Burlington, New Jersey, in 1789. After his birth, his father purchased land of unsettled territory in upper New York State. Growing up here taught Cooper both knowledge of nature and civilization. At the age of thirteen, he attended Yale University. At seventeen he joined the navy. After his father’s death he returned home to begin writing his novels until his death in 1851.

Cooper’s Leatherstocking Tales prove that races can interact, however; several critics believe “Red and White” skins cannot interact. Roy Harvey Pearce believes savages are not civilized enough to belong in American society.

For in The Leatherstocking Tales, as in the society out of which they rise the savage is taken at once as /92/ anterior and inferior to the civilized, not, as in our society, merely a different, somewhat less complex order of the civilized Indeed, the nineteenth-century American was obsessed with his knowledge of the terrible gulf between the civilized and the noncivilized.¹

Albert Keiser mocks Cooper by pointing out that Indians are thieves lower than European peasantry: To him they
Seemed stunted, dirty, and degraded descendants of the ancient warlike possessors of the country. Those near the coast appeared to be civilization, comforts, and character, about on a level with the lowest classes of European peasantry. Some of these Indians he characterizes as thieves, “though in common
they are rigidly honest; nearly always so, unless corrupted by much intercourse with the whites.\textsuperscript{2}

D.H. Lawrence says races are not made to mix: Evidently Cooper—or the artist in him—has decided that there can be no blood-mixing of the two races, white and red. He kills ‘em off.\textsuperscript{3}

Lawrence is mistaken about the “Red and White” man’s ability to mingle in a new human relationship. Cooper’s novel \textit{The Last of the Mohican} shows that.

Race relation in \textit{The Last of the Mohicans} shows the Indians and white man coming together as a team. While coming near a French outpost the Indians and the white men encounter a French sentineel. Major Heyward fools the French by speaking in his language. While detaining the French this gives Chingachgook a chance to sneak up to kill and scalp the sentinel. “…the form of the Indian was seen gliding out of the thicket. As the chief rejoined them, with one hand he attached the reeking scalp of the unfortunate young Frenchman to his girdle, and with the other he replaced the knife and tomahawk that had drunk his blood. (161) Another incident on how they work together is when they sit around a campfire smoking a peace pipe to discuss their next plan of action in order to save Cora. Clearly, the Indians and the white man prove that they could cooperate together.

They develop interest in each other. Cooper proves this by having Uncas and Cora fall in love. It starts when Uncas gives more attention to Cora than Alice, while in their secret hide out. Cora also shows Uncas attention when she asked him to become her personal messenger. When Cora was captured Uncas gathered a small army of about forty men to help rescue Cora. Uncas gave his life for Cora when he was brutally stabbed to death by Magua, while trying to rescue her. Clearly, Cooper proves that even different races can develop interest in one another.

They risk their life for one another. The Indians risked their life in order for Alice and Cora to reunite with her father. Hawkeye and Gamut helped Uncas escape capture by disguising themselves among the Indians. Hawkeye sticks his neck out to help his friends escape down river in a canoe by shooting and wounding a Huron with his rifle “Killdeer.” While indulged in battle, Uncas saved Cora by jumping in front of her and saving her by killing an Indian those tomahawk has cut her bonds. Uncas loses his life when he tries to save Cora by jumping in between her Magua. Clearly, evidence proves that they risk their life for each other.

Clearly, justification of race relations in \textit{The Last of the Mohicans} proves different races can interact together Lawrence is wrong when he says their is no “blood-mixing.” Cooper proves that races can mingle peacefully together in all situations. Race relations have grown quite a bite over the century. In present day American people are slowly but surely closing the mix relations gap.

201
NOTES

Roy Harvey Pearce, “Civilization and Savagism: The World of the
Leatherstocking Tales”, Leatherstocking and the Critics, Ed Warren S.
Walker (Chicago: Scott, Foresmen, 1965) 60.

Albert Keiser, The Indian in American Literature (New York: Oxford
UP, 1933) 102.

D.H. Lawrence Studies in Classic American Literature, (1923, Dallas:
Penquin, 1961) 57.

James Fenimore cooper, The Last of the Mohicans, (New York:

The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP “B”

Overall a good paper but has some problems with writing issues that cause the value to be hidden:
1. First paragraph has several grammatical errors that immediately tells[sic] reader to be ware[sic]--this maybe[sic] a problematic paper. Students should be very aware of importance of first impressions.
2. Choices of words surrounding main thesis are not equal and would mean different things to a sociologist. The “mixing,” “mingling,” and “interacting” of races give different connotations and cause a problem with the point to be made.
This could have been an excellent paper.

The Reading and Study Skills Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Thesis not clearly stated. Debate about race relations or about Cooper’s view of race relations?
Evidence doesn’t support thesis
Generalizations vague
Organization shaky
--new element added in last sentence
Does not demonstrate clear thinking or command of material
Mechanics barely adequate; development poor.

The Allied Health Division Chair’s Responses:
RATING: P

Just average
Claims it “proves” but it doesn’t
Assumes reader knows who characters are
Not enough skill with using source information
Attachment Disorders: The Next Social Dilemma

Abstract

The violence of today is taking a new turn. Children are becoming violent offenders at a much faster rate than any other social group. Among the causes of violent and deadly children are abuse, neglect, witnessing violence, and now attachment disorders. Attachment disorders occur at such an early stage of a person’s life that these orders often go unnoticed until they become a dangerous problem. Therapy for attachment disorders is in its infancy, and the therapy practiced is often controversial. Needless to say, the therapy is also very limited. Attachment disorders occur when an infant does not receive the appropriate care and affection necessary for them to learn trust in others. The infant first learns to trust only itself and becomes defensive and apathetic toward others as it matures. The importance of this problem lies in the fact that this disorder has led sufferers of this affliction to violence and even murder.

In Liverpool, England two ten year olds abduct and murder two year old Ralph Bulger (Keogh, 1993). In Washington DC an eight year old boy swings a 12 week old infant by the ankle while he plays “Robocop”; the infant dies three days later from the injuries received as his head bounced off the floor (Greenspan & Cunningham, 1993). In Shelbyville a 15 year old boy rapes and murders an elderly woman. In Louisville a 15 year old boy shoots and kills a cab driver in a scuffle (Yetter, 1995).

Although news of violent children is certainly abhorrent, it is not nearly as shocking as it once was. The dilemma of violence by children is one of the fastest growing public concerns in today’s society (Timnick, 1989). These are multiple schools of thought concerning the causes behind a child’s violence which is justified by the fact that there are a multitude of confirmed afflictions. Chemical imbalances, brain damage, and allergic reactions are all known to contribute to the violent tendencies of some children.

There are also a number of emotional disorders that are to blame. These emotional disorders are caused by sexual abuse, substance abuse, witnessed violence or numerous other trauma creating situations. One of the newest schools of thought in the area of emotional disorders stems from a time before any of these problems fared a chance to do damage. This new theory is known as an attachment disorder (Keogh, 1993).

Angela is a six year old foster child of Jean and Mike Walsh. Children in new settings can be expected to act up or misbehave occasionally but Angela proved a challenge even to her experienced parents. “She would have three to four hour temper tantrums every day. She flung herself against walls, tore wallpaper down, couldn’t function at school or get along with classmates. She nearly strangled our cat, kicked and tormented the dog. She had no friends. She was cruel to her brother and periodically
threatened to kill me.” (Keogh, 1993, p D5). Just the brief quote by Angela’s foster mother paints a grim picture of the family’s relationship with their disturbed daughter. In addition, Angela repeatedly threatened to kill the family by burning down the house, and attempted to kill a family cat with matches (Keogh, 1993).

A sympathetic case worker helped Angela’s parents peek into her past to help find a possible key to help open the girl up. What was discovered was a pattern of neglect and abuse. Angela was not fed well or consistently as an infant. She was frequently filthy and left unattended. She was passed between friends to family members for weeks at a time. More than once along the way, she was sexually abused (Keogh, 1993).

Angela was finally taken to a therapist who specialized in children with early childhood histories of abuse or neglect and begin to show signs of anti-social behavior. Angela was seen by Dr. Michael Pines of Glastonburg, Connecticut. After a considerable amount of time conducting a psychological profile of Angela, Dr. Pines diagnosed her as a severely unattached child whose condition was steadily worsening (Keogh, 1993).

An attachment disorder occurs when the normal bonding process between and infant and its primary caretaker does not properly occur (Keogh, 1993). These children do not receive an initial human experience that builds trust and love for others. The normal newborn cries out in hunger, pain or discomfort. The parent takes care of the need immediately by touching, holding, feeding and making eye contact with the child. This process eventually develops a core of trust in the child which allows them to perceive the world as a safe and loving place. Unattached infants do not receive this immediate attention. They learn to trust only themselves, they become inwardly isolated and emotionally unapproachable. An infant suffering from an attachment disorder may actually stiffen up when physically touched (Keogh, 1993).

As the child matures, all of their emotion and internal emotion evolves around these feelings of mistrust. They begin to develop sociopathic behavior at an early age which usually begins with the mistreatment of animals, children or siblings. These children lack any empathy to establish healthy relationships. As described by Ken Magid in his book High Risk: Children Without A Conscience, these children are literally without a conscience (Keogh, 1993). They never learned the concept of caring and loving therefore, can not possibly comprehend the meaning of a conscience.

There are many reasons this trust may break down at such an early stage. Among the main causes are child abuse, neglect, low quality child care and molestation. War and poverty can also intrude on the normal process of trust building between the parent and child. One fact is known about attachment disorders; the younger the child the worse the consequences. Dr. Foster Cline, an attachment therapy pioneer, claims that “if a kid has a good first three years of life, and assuming he has good genetics, then he’s not going go out and kill people” (Keogh, 1993 p D6).
The whole basis of an attachment syndrome is that of learned mistrust and is not a medical or psychiatric problem. The key word is “learned”. An attachment syndrome can affect a child of any physical make up, any race or any social standing. The attachment disorder can not be the result of a wayward virus or genetic foul up. The disorder is a direct result of the child’s treatment immediately following birth. The disorder does not even have to be the result of physical abuse or physically detrimental neglect. The disorder can result from emotional neglect that keeps the infant from learning trust before it learns to fend for itself (Keogh, 1993).

There are a series of symptoms child psychologists look for when considering an attachment disorder. Victims of an attachment disorder are often initially charming, especially to strangers. They keep their own defense up as they lower the stranger’s by appealing to them. The victim will continue to build the stranger’s trust until they feel they have the upper hand, this is when the victim will let his other side come out (Greenspan & Cunningham, 1993). A fine example of this action can be seen in convicted child murderer John Wayne Gacy who posed as a clown when luring children to his home. Once at his home his victims were brutally raped and killed then disposed of in his crawlspace (Norris, 1992).

Victims of an attachment disorder will often torture pets and small animals. This arises from the victim’s need to control others. At a young age, the victims find they can easily control and punish their trusting pets. This practice is very common in clearly defined cases of unattachment disorders as can be seen by case studies cited in this text (Keogh, 1993). Convicted serial killer Jeffrey Dahmer was known to torture and kill small animals and keep parts of them when he was a child (Norris, 1992).

Victims of an attachment disorder have the tendency to start fires. Starting a fire represents the control to destroy and can be seen at any level as a form of control. Once again, this tendency can be seen in the text’s cited samples (Keogh, 1993). Son of Sam killer, David Berkowitz, had a fascination for fire from his early childhood and eventually fell into a cult that placed a high emphasis on the power of fire (Norris, 1992).

The physical abuse of siblings and other children is common for victims of an attachment disorder. Victims find gaining control over others their age quite easy. Other children are basically trusting and are easily duped into a victim’s game plan (Keogh, 1993). Charles Manson was known to be a child molester and rapist as child himself in various institutions (Norris, 1992).

Unattached victims habitually lie. This is understandable when one considers their attempts to break down the defenses and trusts of others to suit their own needs. They can not risk letting someone else get to know them emotionally so they seldom bare the truth. Victims can become so use to lying that they actually believe themselves and often have difficulty separating truth from fiction (Keogh, 1993). Convicted murderer Henry Lee Lucas made his own confession overly difficult for the police by
fabricating the confession of several murders that never happened (Norris, 1992).

Unattached victims often exhibit self-destructive behavior. This behavior can range from suicide to substance abuse to self-mutilation. This behavior arises once again from the need to control even if the control gained is only over one’s own body (Keogh, 1993). Jeffrey Dahmer was a chronic alcoholic. Henry Lee Lucas decorated his body with self-inflicted tattoos and body carvings. Numerous killers have made themselves their last victim (Norris, 1992).

After Angela was diagnosed, she was referred to Dr. Foster Cline in Evergreen, Colorado. Soon after Angela and her new family began a series of controversial rage reduction exercises with the unattached therapy treatment pioneer. The goal of the treatment is to “disturb the disturbed” (Keogh, 1993, p. D7). This is done by having the therapist stage control battles with the victim. The therapist will set tight limits on these battles always ensuring the therapist will win. Once the therapist wins the control battle, the victim’s defenses are down and there a chance to communicate with the child’s hidden self. This stage is the most critical; this point determines the victim’s potential for recovery. This method is very controversial because an inexperienced therapist may actually push a victim the wrong way causing greater harm (Keogh, 1993).

At the end of her rigorous two week therapy session, ground finally began to give. Angela actually became ready to love after she realized the Walsh family were there for her. There is still rocky road ahead of the family but at least they now know which road to take (Keogh, 1993).

A major key to understanding attachment disorders is in realizing they are a social problem and not a medical problem. Victims of an attachment disorder are perfectly sane. This is not to say insane people can not develop attachment disorders, but it can be said that the attachment disorder did not result in the victim’s insanity. An attachment disorder is learned behavioral problem that may occur in varying degrees. Extreme cases can lead to psychopathic behavior.

Jeffrey Dahmer can once again be used as an example. Dahmer killed and cannibalized his victims with no regret or compassion. At trial he was found legally sane because he knew what he was doing was wrong because he attempted to cover up the evidence (Norris, 1992).

In conclusion, attachment disorders are going to be one of the most significant social problems of years to come. This dilemma occurs at such an early stage of a person’s development it is difficult to identify before permanent damage has been done. Once the damage has been done, the treatment is still experimental and very limited. The best defense our society has against this developing problem is education. Potential parents must understand the effects of their neglect. Teachers and doctors need to be trained to determine signs of emotional trauma as well as physical. Progressive treatment must be developed for identified victims. We must
realize as a whole that this must not only be done to care for the unattachment victim, but to also limit their potential victims.

References


The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP “A”

“Excellent paper! Nearly error free. Took a difficult subject, narrowed it appropriately.

Explained issue and research findings in a clear understandable manner.”

The Reading and Study Skills Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

Strong command of generalizations and specifics on a complicated topic.
Sophisticated level of thought, writing.
Some mechanical problems, but that’s[sic] not unusual when author is stretching herself.
Thesis not clearly articulated until end.
Overall, level of thought involved compensates for problems.

The Allied Health Division Chair’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“Good use of sources
Effective proof
Good organization”

Group-Specific Essay #38 (Essay 007 of Sample)

The Effects of Moderation and Retribution Denoted in Mythological Tales

In the movie “Legend,” starring Tom Cruise and Mia Sara, the actors portray the forces that generate an eternal balance of the universe. This balance can only be known as good and evil. The balance of good and evil
are significantly influenced with the practice of moderation in our daily lives. “Legend” is a myth that is told before the onset of time. Before the earth knew time, there was total darkness. And in this total darkness dwelled the evil “Lord of Dark.” His powers were overthrown with the creation of light. “Legend” is a story that proves the importance of considering the consequences of our actions. These consequences are signified in mythological stories. No matter how supernatural some myths appear, there are truth and logic that can be applied to our lives. The respect for truth and logic can be found in the movie “Legend” as well as the story of “Daedalus and Icarus.”

The “Lord of the Dark” plans him dominion by capturing the sacred “Harbor of Light.” The sacred “Harbor of Light” are the “Unicorns,” which are one of the mythological creatures that can only be touched by the purest of mortals. The purest of mortals is “Jack” who lives alone with the animals of the forest. A beautiful woman named “Lilly” is in love with “Jack.” This innocent couple believes that the world consist of only goodness. Together they discover that there is no good without evil, no heaven without hell, and no light without dark.

The moral of the story in “Legend” also has a similarity that can be found in the story of “Daedalus and Icarus,” written by Publius Ovidius (340). Daedalus and his son Icarus are in exile in the city of Crete. To escape the bounds of exile, Daedalus invents wings made of feathers and wax. To his son Icarus, he warns him to not fly too close to the sun or it will melt his wings, and do not fly too low or it will sog his wings. The young child with “giddy eyes” did not listen, and he fell to death into the sea. The relationship between the two myths is to take life in moderation, or to suffer the consequences of wrongdoing. Icarus failed to heed to the warning and lost his life.

In the movie “Legend,” the theme of moderation is also a point worthy of discussion. For the soul of the “Unicorn” is also stolen through “Lilly’s” excessive desires. “Lilly’s” lover “Jack” warned “Lilly” he cried “NO!” and he turned away at the moment of touch between human and the sacred “Unicorn.” If “Lilly” had paid heed to the warning and considered the consequences, the “Unicorn” would not have lost his soul to the “Lord of the Dark.”

In the story of Daedalus and Icarus,” Daedalus is in exile for trying to push his nephew from the top of a tower (Ovid 342). Daedalus’s attempt to commit murder to his nephew was brought about by jealousy of his nephew’s accomplishments (342). But the nephew was saved by the “Goddess Minerva” through metamorphosis into a partridge (342). Daedalus loses his son due to his actions and pays the cost of retribution:

The Father now no more a Father, cries
Ho! Icarus! Where are you Boy? As he flies
Where shall I seek my Boy? He cries again (341).

The movie “Legend” also shows a strong trait of retribution. The “Lord of Dark” sends his demons to bring the horn of the “Unicorn” to him. The
demons watch and wait for “Lilly’s” desire to touch the “Unicorn.” Within the forbidden touch is the perfect set-up for the demons to shoot the poison stinger. After the poison stinger lays the “Unicorn” down, “Lilly” has to make things right in the world. “Lilly” has to find the “Lord of the Dark” and correct her sinful ways. “Lilly’s” dues to retribution are an extremely desperate challenge with life and death. The movie “Legend” speaks about moderation and retribution in the soundtrack. Moderation is denoted in “seeing the mystic flavors once or twice,” which means that once we might get by but the second time we are caught. Retribution is denoted in “enchantment playing its cards all right” which means that by having the feeling to gamble or take a risk and knowing at the same time you could blow it all away. Some of the lyrics are as follows:

I’ve seen the mystic flavors once or twice
Well I knew they had a reason.
Enchantment plays its cards all right.
Hand in hand with the workings of the seasons.
Legends can be now and forever
Teaching us to love for goodness sake.
Legends can be now and forever
Loved by the sun
Loved by the sun...

The theme of both stories is to use good judgment in moderation with consideration for the effects of retribution. In our daily lives we face the challenges of moderation. How much is enough, or how much is too much or too little? “Lilly’s” desire for touch of the “Unicorn” is excessive in that she is not filled up with just the sense of sight. Her desires carry her to the point of forbidden touch. In the Greek myth of Daedalus and Icarus” Daedalus carries his flight of manmade wings too far when Icarus his son fell to his death into the sea. The effects of retribution are felt when Daedalus sees his son’s feathers scattered below.

Works Cited

The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“I feel incompetent to judge the content of this paper as I am not familiar with either work. But it “sounds” good. The student writes well in terms[sic] of grammar and clarity, and has organized the presentation well.”
The Reading and Study Skills Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“Essay never establishes clear thesis or explains itself. Author doesn’t explain stories as sources. Mechanically OK, but fails to communicate on a basic level. Too many unclear references. Needs development. Much too obscure!”

The Allied Health Division Chair’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“No resources used

Syntax

‘Proof’ lacking”

Group-Specific Essay #39 (Essay 065 of Sample)

**Pornography in the United States**

Pornography is a burning issue and has been for many decades. It has caused people from all walks of life to be divided. Some social scientists insist pornography leads to sex-related crimes, while others maintain it does not. Some scholars say pornography leads to violent sexual acts, while others say to regulate pornography is to infringe on the basic right to freedom of speech and personal choice. Perhaps one of the biggest issues associated with regulating pornography is who decides what is obscene.

A case called Miller vs. California in 1973 set the standards by which obscenity was defined by the United States Supreme Court. That ruling states that, “Something is obscene if the average person applying contemporary community standards, would find it so, and if, the work taken as a whole lacks serious literary, artistic, political or scientific value (Gilbert 232).” However, these points can be considered weak when we apply them to questions such as, who is the common person? Which community decides? Who are the people who will decide whether or not certain materials have a serious artistic value?

For example, the Mapplethorpe art collection met with different responses in different communities. When the collection was first scheduled to open at the Corcoran Gallery in Washington, D.C. it met with opposition from Senator Jesse Helms, who argued that this exhibit should not be allowed to be displayed (Gilbert 232). He felt that this exhibit was “obscene” and that any form of art that could be considered obscene should not be allowed to be put on display with federal funds provided for the arts and humanities. With all of the negative publicity that the collection was receiving, the Corcoran gallery decided not to display the
collection. However, the collection was displayed later at Berkley, California and Hartford, Connecticut without any further problems.

When the Mapplethorpe collection reached Cincinnati, the display was shut down so the authorities could videotape its contents, and they later pressed obscenity charges against the gallery and its director. After the investigation was over the display was allowed to reopen without any more problems. Six months later a jury of local citizens found the gallery and its director not guilty of the charges. The reason for one juror's decision was, "We thought that the pictures were lewd, grotesque, disgusting, but like the defense said, art doesn't have to be beautiful or pretty (Gilbert 233)." The jury that decided that the two that were charged with obscenity were not guilty deemed that Mapplethorpe's collection did have serious artistic value (Gilbert 233).

There is also the belief that pornography is linked to social behavior and sexual crimes committed by sex offenders, but some researchers refute this. Professor Joseph E. Scott states that, "X-rated movies have less violence in them than g, pg, and r-rated movies. The average number of violent acts per movies was 20.3 for the r-rated, 16.2 for the g-rated, 15.3 for the pg movies, and 4.4 for the x-rated movies (Hefner 537)." Professor Scott also conducted a research project that subjected married couples to violent pornographic themes over a three month period and concluded that it had no significant effect on their behavior (Hefner 537). Professor Neil M. Malamuth of U. C. L. A., also known as the "professor of porn," has been conducting research that includes the exposure to violent pornographic films for many years. It has been said by other researchers that long term exposure to these types of films could lead to people committing sexual crimes such as rape, but professor Malamuth has yet to be charged with any type of sex crimes (Hefner 537). Following these arguments, it would be difficult to maintain that pornography actually leads to violent sexual behavior, but other professionals offer different arguments.

Dr. Edward Donnerstein, a psychologist in the Center for Communication Research at the communication arts department for the University of Wisconsin, maintains that pornography leads to desensitization of men to the role of women in pornographic movies. According to Donnerstein, who had a group of men watch a series of movies depicting violence against women, the men rated the movies less severe after they watched them several times in different order (Donnerstein 48.) In addition, Catherine A. Mackinnon, in her essay, "Linking Pornography to Sex Crimes," writes that pornography leads to the subordination of women to men. "There are studies showing increasingly firm connections between exposure to pornography and increases in abusive attitudes and behaviors towards women. So long as pornography exists, there will be no equality, and the idea that we live in an equal society will be a vicious illusion (Mackinnon 40.)" Of course, not everyone agrees with that view. Nadine Strossen is quoted as taking a
paragraph from a piece by Carol Vance, Lisa Duggan and Nan Hunter
called, “False Promises; Feminist Anti-Porn Legislation,” published in
Caught Looking. In this passage it states that, "Pornography has served to
flout conventional sexual mores, to ridicule sexual hypocrisy and to
underscore the importance of sexual needs. Pornography carries many
messages other than women hating. It advocates sexual adventure, sex
outside the marriage, sex for no reason other than pleasure, casual sex,
anonymous sex, group sex, voyeuristic sex, illegal sex, public sex. Some
of these ideas appeal to women reading or seeing pornography, who may
interpret some images as legitimating their own sense of sexual urgency or
desire to be more sexually aggressive (de Grazia 244)."

It has even been argued that pornography can be used to treat some
sexual offenders. Barry W. Lynn, author of, “Pornography’s Many forms:
Not All Bad,” quoted therapist John Money of the John Hopkins Institute
Of Research as saying, “Patients who request treatment in a sex offender
clinic commonly disclose that pornography helps them contain their
abnormal sexuality within imagination, as a fantasy, instead of having to
act it out in real life with an unconsenting, resentful partner, or by force
(Lynn 546).” When we examine pornography we wonder if it can be a
successful tool that would prevent sex offenders from committing sex
crimes. Berl Kutchinsky states that, “Pornography can be considered a
’safety valve’ that allows potential sex offenders to release their sexual
desires through masturbation. The purpose of a sex crime offender
committing a sex crime is to obtain sexual satisfaction usually in the form
of orgasm (Kutchinsky 44). “However, Gebhard, Gagnon, Pomeroy, and
Christenson disagree with this theory, stating, “Sexual offenders are not,
as a rule, more sexually aroused by pornography than noncriminal males
(Kutchinsky 44).” Berl Kutchinsky also states that, “Many psychiatrists
and psychologists believe that potential sex offenders use pornography to
obtain a noncriminal sexual outlet, that is, fantasy and masturbation
(Kutchinsky 103). It is therefore hypothesized that the greater the
opportunity offenders have to obtain pornography, the more they will be
diverted away from committing sexual offenses (Kutchinsky 103).”

Whether pornography actually leads to sexual violence is not the only
issue to consider. There have also been many different people that have
been associated with pornography that have argued that people’s personal
choices, privacy and freedom of speech should be protected under the First
Amendment. Where do we draw the boundary lines to what is to be
protected by the First Amendment and what isn’t? Joel Feinberg states
that, “If legislatures are free to bar individuals from wholly private and
harmless indulgence just on the grounds that they are ‘obscene’ (sexually
stimulating), then the exercise of that legislative freedom in many cases
will lead to invasion of the privacy of individuals, or, avoiding that
troublesome word, of their liberty to control their own sexual experiences
in any way they like short of harming or offending others (Feinberg 114).”
In the past there have been court rulings that have upheld people’s rights
to privacy. Joel Feinberg states an example in his essay that states that, “In Griswold vs. Connecticut, the court discovered in the interstices of the First, Fourth, Fifth, Ninth, and Fourteenth Amendments a hitherto unnoticed ‘right to privacy,’ which would perhaps be less misleadingly described as a right to personal autonomy in self regarding and peculiarly intimate affairs. In Griswold the ‘right to privacy’ was invoked to defend the sanctity of the marriage bed against laws that would prohibit the use of contraceptives. The same right was extended to unmarried persons in Eisenstadt v. Baird, and to the viewing of pornographic films in one’s own home in Stanley v. Georgia (Feinberg 115).” Nadine Strossen, author of Defending Pornography: Free speech, Sex, and the Fight for Women’s Rights, is quoted in an article in The Nation by Edward de Grazia that states, “I want full constitutional protection of a right to create, exhibit and audit the sexually oriented expression of one’s choice including hard core movies (de Grazia 246).”

Pornography should not be censored in any form, with the exception of kiddie porn. Why should there be a group of people that can be allowed to tell others what’s right or wrong for them to read or view? If we, as consenting adults, should decide that we want to take home a pornographic movie and enjoy it with another consenting adult, then that is our own personal choice. Susan Wendell states that, “If we value freedom of expression at all we must not allow expression to be restricted unless the harm it does outweighs the harm of restriction and cannot be prevented by other acceptable means(Wendell 182).”

Works Cited
The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“This paper makes my sociologist-heart happy! The author writes well and is able to clearly get[sic] across his/her research. The research is well done, well documented and the subject well covered. Excellent in all aspects!”

The Reading and Study Skills Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

Generally well written, relatively few mechanical errors. Comes to its thesis late in essay. Writer should have revised his first page to reflect his position. Lack of thesis damages focus of an otherwise strong paper. Tone OK. Generalizations OK. Command of material OK.

The Allied Health Division Chair’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“Excellent in all areas.”

Group-Specific Essay #40 (Essay 180 of Sample)

**PAYCHECKS OR WELFARE CHECKS?**

Recently, welfare reform is a hot topic that people are talking about. Nearly everyone agrees that America’s welfare system has failed to lift people out of poverty, but how to fix the system is the focus of a bitter debate.

Begun in 1935 to assist widowed mothers, AFDC (aid for families with dependence childrens) now serves about 5 million poor families headed by single mothers and spent $325 billion last year. The program has helped many people escape poverty. But since inception, it its also been attacked for being wasteful and ineffective, and for encouraging people to live off government handouts rather than getting jobs and bettering themselves.

Welfare recipients are branded as lazy for not working, immoral for having babies outside of marriage, and irresponsible for having babies just to get more benefits. Welfare, as it now exits, doesn’t work. It must be changed before another generation follows its mothers into the cycle of poverty, dependence, and despair.

The Clinton administration has imposed time restriction on recipients of AFDC. The two-year limit on AFDC support is aimed at encouraging
young parents to find employment. The Clinton’s “welfare to work” idea may sound promising, but the great challenge is how to move 5 million poor, mostly uneducated, unskilled mothers into an economy that already has 9 million people looking for jobs. To help those unskilled mothers ready for work, job training, and child care needs to be provided, and it could cost billions of dollars. President Clinton says the government could create “community service jobs”, but figuring out what kinds of jobs to create and how to pay for them will cause a tremendous battle in Congress.

Republican party proposes “block money”. The federal government will divide the aid money among states and let states due with their own AFDC reform. It may cause problems when states try to balance their budgets and are cutting AFDC and other assistance programs. Many of these cut are forcing recipients to go to public shelters or become homeless. Also, the disparities in the state-supervised AFDC program may cause welfare families to concentrate in states providing the most generous benefits.

To fix the welfare mess, we have to start form the root of problem. As president Herbert Hoover said, “If we could have but one generation of properly born, trained, educated, and healthy children, a thousand other problems of government would vanish”.

Teenager pregnancy is part of a vicious circle of poverty, child neglect and welfare dependency. Teenager pregnancies need to be stopped through education. Children need information about sex, disease and pregnancy. Also, the father of those neglected children, the irresponsible man, needs to be punished heavily. Government should develop a more efficient child support collection agency, and track down the fathers by their social security numbers. Government should impose a uniform child support standard, automatic wage withholding, and minimum child support benefits.

The AFDC should retain the time restrictions and provide rewards to recipients who find good jobs such as other supports to uplift their standards of living. Also, states need to adopt some programs to impose that recipients stay in school. For example, they should cut benefits to families whose children repeatedly miss school; deny additional benefits to welfare mothers who have more children; and deny benefits to mothers who drop out school.

These changes should be instituted and practiced. Only with strong measures can we hope to win the battle of welfare reform.

The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: NP

I am assuming this is supposed to be a research paper. Although completely undocumented, a few facts and quotes are inserted that one wouldn’t know for an opinion paper.
Writing is extremely uneven. I suspect outside sources helped straighten out a few paragraphs.
A lot of grammatical mechanics errors. Serious basic problems that writer should know
(What AFDC really stands for).

The Reading and Study Skills Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

Thesis not strongly stated, supported in depth.
Appealing style.
This paper demonstrates proficiency, but the writer must be more specific to be “highly proficient.”
Mechanics--adequate.

The Allied Health Division Chair’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“Problems: No documentation, not enough proof, organization.”

Group-Specific Essay #41 (Essay 241 of Sample)

Imagine yourself as an adventurous seventh grader. A young person with many dreams that change from day to day. Dreams of Playing football, tennis, track, or any other team sport your dreams may desire. Imagine being told that you can be anything you want if you work hard for it. Imagine yourself knowing that you have always received good grades, never needed discipline action, always trying your best and just wanting to find out if you are capable of accomplishing a little more. Imagine being this average student, at an average school, when you decide you would like to try out for the middle-school football team. The coach hands you a piece of paper and tells you to take it home to have your parents sign, then bring it back to him. No problem, when you are in the seventh grade this happens. But this is not just any piece of paper your parents tell you, this is not just a release from the school being liable for injuries and such. This piece of paper is for you to accept a drug test. A test your parents feel violates your constitutional rights. A test the school says is mandatory for you to participate in a team sport. A test that will need to be heard in court. Not just any court, but the U.S. Supreme Court.

Now that you have imagined yourself as an adventurous seventh grader, try to imagine being James Action. As Reported in the Washington Post By Joan Biskupic, James Acton is this seventh grader who attends school in Oregon. James Acton did have a dream of playing football for his school (all). But a midst all the problems of being a teenager in today’s society, yet comes another one that could change his life forever, as well as many other students who will follow him. I’m sure when James went home with the piece of paper his parents were to sign, he didn’t think
much about it. He just wanted to play football. But if he only could have realized what was about to take place. Do you think he could have comprehended that fact that this piece of paper could possibly infringe on his constitutional rights as a citizen of the United States? I doubt at the time he did, but I bet now he does. I’ll bet he now understands more about his rights than most adventurous seventh graders. I’ll bet he never thought his dream of playing football in middle-school would become such an enormous issue to all, but it has.

Peter Grier, a staff writer for The Christian Science Monitor, reports the parents of James Acton decided that their son did not have to be subjected to the mandatory drug testing policy the Veronia School District in Oregon had adopted (3). The school district felt that drugs had become increasingly popular. They felt that mandatory drug testing of student-athletes would become the best way to stop the infection that was destroying their children. The policy included middle-school as well as high schools. They suspected that some of their popular athletes were using drugs and becoming a sort of influence on those younger (3). The school district also felt that the drug educational programs had not discouraged enough students from experimenting with drugs. The school district believes that mandatory drug testing was the best deterrent to keep drug use among its students-athletes from spreading further into the school district (3). So, when the Veronia School District tries to protect their students, tries to maintain a drug free atmosphere, tries to relieve parents of their worst nightmare that their children are being exposed to drugs at school, possibly becoming engrossed with the worst enemy. The enemy that takes away adventurous dreams, drugs. So when the school district feels it’s doing what is in the best interest to protect all students. The question still remains, do they have the right to mandatory drug test a student with no probable cause?

The parents of James Acton do not believe that the Veronia School District has a right to drug test their child. They feel that their son has nothing to prove. They think that his in classroom and out of classroom conduct should be enough proof that he should not be subjected to such a test. His parents decided to fight the school district and take their case to the court (3). According to Mark Walsh, an author for Education Week, the Acton’s received help from the American Civil Liberties Union (1+). The American Civil Liberties Union provided the Acton’s with a lawyer, the union does not condone drug testing without a reasonable cause, his parents filed a law suit (2). Arguing the fact that the mandatory drug testing policy violates the Fourth Amendment. Which simply states that we are free from unreasonable searches (2). We are all aware that many colleges and universities have drug testing policies, but not many high schools do. This is why the James Acton case could have a lasting impact on many students to come.

When the case was heard in trial court, the court sided with the school district(3). But when the case was appealed, the court sided with the
Actons. The appeals court ruled that his right to privacy could not be invaded by participating in team sports at the school (1). As reported by Laurie Asseo in the Courier Journal, the next ruling will be by the United States Supreme Court (2a).

This will decide in a landmark case, whether mandatory drug testing will be allowed in middle and high schools. The Supreme Court will give its verdict sometime this summer.

Now imagine that all this took place when you were in the seventh grade. Do you think you would feel cheated out of participating with your friends? Do you think you could possibly understand what all the fuss is about? Could you possibly comprehend the attention that you have received because you refuse to be drug tested at such an early age, without ever having been a problem to your peers? James Acton is in high school now, and this summer he will learn his fate of wanting to play football. James will learn that he “tested the waters” and probably will have a better understanding of law and other types of court proceedings. Is this what the message is? That your constitutional rights as a middle-school student could differ than that of when you are an adult. That in this country you are innocent until proven guilty. That in this country you are free from unreasonable searches. Or is the message that even when you are trying to be an example of a model teen to your parents, teachers, and friends, you can still be subjected to unfair policies of a well meaning school board. Imagine that?

Works Cited
Asseo, Laurie. “Court To Decide If Schools Can Test Athletes For Drugs.” The Courier Journal 29 Nov. 1994: 42.
Biskupic, Joan. “Justice To Decide If Middle And High Schools Can Test Athletes For Drug Use.” Washington Post 29 Nov. 1994: sec. A.

The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: NP “D”

Basically, I liked parts of this paper. The writer has given the subject some thought and makes excellent points. It is well thought out. However, the writer does not have the tools to clearly express[sic] those ideas.
The opening narrative is interesting and attention getting but doesn’t shift gears into a factual research paper. I would send it back for better documentation. Mechanical grammar [sic] problems. The writing style of the opening first [sic] page differs significantly in my opinion from the remaining pages. Interesting?

The Reading and Study Skills Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Entertaining, although unconventional, lede. Strong personal voice. Then it gets sidetracked, fails to come together. No real thesis statement of any variety. Sentence fragment[s] actually work, stylistically, in places. Becomes apparent later that student does not have full command of sentence structure. Another close call. Finally, I decided that the student doesn’t have enough command of grammar, structure and rhetorical conventions, though s/he does have an engaging style.

The Allied Health Division Chair’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“Problems with documentation, voice, organization, transition[s], proof.”

**Group-Specific Essay #42 (Essay 173 of Sample)**

**Disabled Employees**

Fridays for many Americans is the end of the work week. Millions pour out of their offices, factories, restaurants, or wherever we call our place of employment, to breathe a sigh of relief. Wow! The weekend is upon us, and we are going to let our hair down, and enjoy our time off. However, many Americans do not have the luxury of working to enjoy the weekend off. Who are these people, and why are they not apart of this weekly ritual of celebration? They are grandparents, mothers, fathers, sister, and brothers, the disabled persons across the country.

Forty-three million people are said by the Census Bureau (Johnson, 1991) to have some sort of physical or mental disability. The ADA, Americans with Disabilities Act, prohibits employers with fifteen or more employees from discriminating against persons disabled (Allen, 1994). In order for disabled persons to have a voice in the work force, the ADA should be vigorously enforced. Three obstacles that can be attributed to the lack of employment opportunities for a disabled employee are transportation, access to work sites, and acceptance from co-workers. Complying with the ADA can rid our society of two of these obstacles.

Some steps taken by The Department of transportation have removed many surface obstacles. Since 1978 in Kentucky, mass transportation facilities and services have been handicapped accessible (Advocacy, 1993, p.22). Transportation is the only obstacle that Employers can not under ADA guidelines be accountable for disabled employees. Kentucky
Revised Statutes (KRS) 186.042, provides handicapped license plates to disabled individuals at no cost, other than the regular fee for annual registration, for the issuance of the registration plate or renewal decal (KRS, 1993, p.260).” The University of Louisville has surpassed the ADA guidelines”, according to Mark Jump, Field Operations Supervisor in the Department of Public Safety. Jump states, “any new parking or updated lots have stalls designated for handicapped vehicles 13ft x 5ft, for parking, and they have installed concrete pads to accommodate wheelchairs”. Although transportation is an obstacle the disabled person encounters, it is not as blatantly disregarded by business and building owners as access to work sites.

One case in Florida, pertaining to access to hotels according to Johnson(1991), demonstrates the need to enforce ADA guidelines. Florida has a law requiring wheelchair access to big new hotels. But that didn’t stop the architects of the Cocoa Beach Hilton from providing virtually none. And when local building officials refused to okay the blueprints, the Hilton chain simply got a waiver form the city attorney. Five years and thousands of dollars in legal costs later, hotel and disability groups have settled out of court, with Hilton agreeing to only a few changes. In cases like the Florida Hilton, many disability groups give up the fight and settle out of court. This is primarily why ADA guidelines are not regularly enforced. Large corporations have more resources “money” to tie up proceedings in courts across the nation for many years. Building ramps and installing elevators to existing buildings is costly, and many corporations will not spend money to make the necessary changes. One building owner is quoted saying, “If building owners are required to spend a large portion of their remodeling budget to install accessibility features, they may forgo renovation entirely. Better to have gradual progress toward accessibility than reduce the remodeling done”(Johnson). Attitudes from business owners and building owners reduces the chances of disabled employees finding jobs where they have access to their work sites. Without access to work sites, disabled employees do not have any alternatives but to stay home. According to the Associated Press News Service Survey (1994), Two out three American adults with disabilities have no jobs, but nearly 80 percent of them would like to work. The reasons they cite include:

1. Employers won’t recognize their capability to work full time.
2. They think no full time work is available in their line or they can’t find it.

The responsibility of employment falls to social workers, friends, and family members to assist disabled people in locating a job that they can perform at their own skill level. While it is clear that there are limitations on what employees with disabilities can do, in many instances they are capable of carrying out the tasks required for a particular position (Resources for Rehabilitation, 1991). Social attitudes toward people with disabilities contribute to the high unemployment rate among this group.
According to American Press News Service Survey (1994), the most common unfavorable attitudes are supervisors or co-workers who are afraid that the disabled employee can’t do the job.

Tony Norris’s story in the Washington Post (1994, October 4) is one of those in which co-workers attitudes were based on preconceptions. He was a buyer for Sears for 16 years when a back operation in 1984 suddenly left him a quadriplegic. Norris lacks any movement in his hands and legs; therefore, he uses a voice-activated telephone and a voice-activated computer. “Once in a while I get to visit the stores,” says Norris. “They have a image of me on the phone and then when they see me it’s always kind of a shock.” Mr. Norris’s name may be substituted for any disabled employee who has faced discrimination in the work place. The ADA has provides strict guidelines to employers to cease this obstacle. The guidelines, according to Janet Tully, director of community employment training initiatives for Marriott International, “employers can create their own monsters by hiring somebody with a disability and then giving them special treatment” (Washington Post, 1994, October 4). This could open the door for co-workers to disassociate themselves from their disabled co-workers and reinforce negative practices in hiring disabled persons.

Employers should be fair to all employees and practice sensitivity towards all employees.

From early childhood, my great-grandmother has been in a wheelchair and she has been denied many opportunities to join the work force. She could not go to several restaurants because they were not accessible to the disabled. Since 1988, I have been involved in the Special Olympics and I am a member of the Kentucky Colonels Association. I have seen first hand how the disabled are treated and why we need laws like the ADA. The ADA was enacted to allow disabled citizens a chance to become productive in our society, to open their own doors, to live an independent life, to be like everyone else. When it is not enforced, we as a society as well the disabled lose all our voices. It tells us that it’s okay to discriminate against others, and there will be no price to pay for our deeds.

References

The Sociologist's Responses:
RATING: P "C+"

As a sociology paper I[sic] might give this a B. The facts are there and are supported. The student has done his/her work. Writing wise, however, it is weaker. The writing style does not flow well and makes the reader have to read very carefully to get the points. Needs some help with footnoting and paragraph organization.

The Reading and Study Skills Professor's Responses:
RATING: P

Thesis not clearly stated--Lede is misleading (no pun intended) Not clear where focus is--Kentucky? National? Mechanically OK, although plenty of errors - No serious pattern Borderline between P and NP.

The Allied Health Division Chair's Responses:
RATING: HP

"Excellent in all areas: organization, proof, documentation, coherence."

Group-Specific Essay #43 (Essay 260 of Sample)

VIOLENCE AND GUNS CONTROL

Outline.

Thesis: Violence is a big problem in this country, but gun control is a big part of solving this problem.

I. Cause of violence.
   a. Drugs
   b. Action movie
II. Guns are in society and in activities
   a. Guns are dangerous to people
   b. Love affairs with guns
III. Guns are harder to interpret
   a. Americans have the right “To keep and bear arms”.
      1. Statistical data of incident of violent crimes is increasing.
      2. Guns are dangerous to keep
   b. The criminals are increasing yearly.
IV. Guns control should be “better change” of keeping guns out of the hands of potential criminals.
   a. Guns are directly related to violence crimes and other social problems.
   b. Gun makes everything so terrible

V. People are thinking about ways to improve gun control.
   a. People are looking for new laws
   b. People believe parents should have more responsibility for their children’s action.
   c. People believe society should have more responsibility for the young generation.

Finding solutions to violence in the Community is on the minds of many people in America. Where did violence come from and what causes violence? Why is violence such a problem in this country? Gun control is a big part of solving the problem of violence because there is so much violence from guns. And people can do so many things more easily than in other countries. People have a right to do many thinks, such as buying guns which they use normally in activities. However, the other side of the gun issue is very dangerous. Guns are causing a lot of crime in society, so gun control is very important and people’s competence in using guns is very important also.

Furthermore, there are many reasons America has a big problem with violence. It affects Americans because here is a free country, so people have free thought and action. However, the most important contribution to violence is drugs, people usually kill each other because they are in drug in one form or another. That’s the cause of violence, and action movies influence people, especially our youth. Many people become more violent after certain movies. They may even do the things that they saw in an action movie. An example is the effect of the movie The Deer Hunter. After it appeared on TV in the United States, twenty-nine people tried to kill themselves in a way similar event in the film (Kim, E. & Hartmann p.111). According to Stephens, “Nearly 3,000,000 incidents of crime and violence are reported on U.S. Kindergarten through 12th grade campuses each year” (72). Violence from guns is increasing every year in this country between 1960-1985. The use of guns accounts for anywhere between fifty percent to sixty percent of these crimes (Wright 264). Every day in the news, in magazines, on TV and in the movies, people can see so much violence. Thus, the media influences people especially teenagers. They want to be heroes; they want to do the same thing they see in the movies. In their opinion, guns are the best way to accomplish this. On the other hand, some interview results from teenagers say that many of them would rather work than sell drugs or use guns and that youth have said that television, movies and music don’t have any affect on them if they have been given a strong moral foundation (Metrol 4).
What happened to them? They really need to get in the right direction with a good education and help to get far away from drugs, guns... They really need help from society because they are very important for society. Robert Tinker, Direction of the City’s Youth Alliance, says: “It is important not to write off a generation of youngsters on the assumption that it’s too difficult to save them. If we lose and entire generation, who will care for us and run this society when we get older?” (4).

In this country it is very easy to get a gun. According to some estimates in the 1980, “One in every four families in the United States owns a gun. And many citizens express increased unwillingness to give up their guns” (Sugarmann 264). Beside this point, some people believe that guns are always threatened from guns. Guns give the criminal many advantages. A criminal can stay far away from his target and very easily kill the target. Therefore, crimes are caused from guns and many people have died from guns. A lot of murders are done with guns, from many magazines reporting (Newbank). What will happen in this country if every body gets a hand gun? And what will happen if people use guns to solve any problem? What will be in the future? It may be very terrible.

As proof, Americans have a right “to keep and bear arms”. This right is protected by the Second Amendment to the Constitution. Those who are gun owners are not bad people; they are hard working, law abiding, tax payers. They have never been nor will they ever be, a threat to law and order. According to Rams Clark, “The number of firearms in private ownership range from 50 million to 200 million. Survey indicate more than 340 million own guns” (101). But beside that as a result of such measures, violent crime like assault and robbery with firearms, osha Gay Davidson says “Guns are used in 181,000 robberies each year, 164,651 aggravated assaults, and 2,759 assaults on law enforcement officers” (121). We see proof that levels of firearms ownership cannot be associated with levels of criminal violence, except for their deterrent value. Clearly firearms are involved in a great number of the most serious crimes, including murder and some hundreds of thousands of violent crimes yearly. It has again focused public interest on gun control issue, that Stephens in his article “Life in America” has handily defeated almost every significant legislature attempt to regulate firearms (87). Many want strict control of hand guns, meaning the outlaw of handguns, except for the police and related service units because “nearly 3,000,000 incidents of crime and violence are reported on U.S. Kindergarten through 12th grade campuses each year” (Stephens 72). Scarcely a day goes by without a newspaper in any large city reporting that a child himself has found a gun, kept by the child’s parents for self-protection, and has playing with a new found toy, killed himself or herself or a playmate (Collier). That killer is not in any reasonable sense of the word a criminal. He or she is just people who happen to kill people. So according to Aguilar tries to lay emphasis on the fact that guns are too dangerous to keep.
Likewise, in under fire Davidson says “In the United States today, one person dies by gunshot every eighteen minutes, twenty four hours a day. In a year, the adds up to nearly 30,000 deaths. In two years, more Americans are killed by guns here at home than died in the entire Vietnam War.” (121). The list of casualties from the country’s gun violence does, indeed read like the body count of a major war.

For the most part the victims of hand guns know their assailants well. These victims are women killed by husbands or they are the women’s lovers or they are drinking buddies who get into a violent argument or they are innocent people who get shot by disgruntled employees or fellow workers who have a grudge. The criminals are increasing yearly, the statistic shown by Rams Clark are 3.8 million index crimes reported to the police in 1967, and 4.5 million in 1968, approximately 12 percent are classified crime of violence, 494,000 in 1967 and 589,000 in 1968 (Clark 48). There is a big number of violent crime reported.

Of course this is not the whole story. Hardened criminals also have guns, and they use them. The murders committed by robbers or rapists cause a crime problem too. Because crime is defined by communities and nation, very few types of human behavior have been deemed criminal in all times by all social groupings. Many acts are considered criminal by most modern societies, such as individual murder, theft and arson. It would be helpful in tracking down criminals to have registry of bullets fired by each gun, since police do find bullets they can not trace. “Guns don’t kill people, people kill people” (Bassman 36). This version, though less effective is much nearer to the whole truth. Although accurate statistics are hard to come by and even harder to interpret, it seems indisputable.

In addition, people look for good laws and expect and hope for new laws so peace will stay forever in this country. Another statement for this point is parent responsibility of the children’s actions to help teenagers understand clearly about guns, drugs and alcohol, the parents need to guide them to get on in the right direction with a good education that help youth keep far away from violence. Especially, need to help them and encourage them to join in public activities or any good activities programs.

Moreover, people should look for some program to control guns, such as the shock incarceration programs and developing a need for cost_effective methods reducing over growing in prisons (Thomas interview). Many addresses the common problem of offenders and will, therefore, have rehabilitative that the short_term, demanding and rigorous boot camp component of the programs will be rehabilitative and deter future criminal behavior (Mackenzie 247).

How does the problem of gun control? the problem is far more complex than most of us have been willing to admit. Guns shouldn’t be kept in schools, on the street or everywhere (Phipps). Hopefully in the future, the government will have better laws for using guns. As result, crimes will decrease, people will live in peace, and the serious threat will disappear from our lives.
Works Cited
Bassman, Robert. "letter from America": owning guns in Europe."Europe: 
Kirk, E. and Hartmann. Interactions I " Television Media. USA: 
Publisher 1990: 111-115.
Mackenzie, Doris Layton. Schock Incarceration." New paper, March 24 , 
1989: B3.
120. 2556 (Sept. 1991): 70-100
Wright, Jame D. Second thought about gun control. Washington: 
publisher 1987.

The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: NP "F"

Most confusing paper I’ve read yet. Moves back and forth arguing against self.
Thesis is stated but paper wanders around going many directions and makes no attempt to 
focus on thesis. Student doesn’t seem to understand what he/she is writing about.
Writing mechanics problematic.

The Reading and Study Skills Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

Outline poorly worded, unclear, redundent[sic]
Thesis unclear. Guns and violence, but, specifically, what about them? Solution?
String of anecdotes, opinions, maybe even some plagiarism.
No apparent organization that works.
Mechanics very shaky.
Good start, needs help.

The Allied Health Division Chair’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“Good sources
Good integration of sources
Good use of evidence to support claims”

Group-Specific Essay #44 (Essay 141 of Sample)
Concept of Poverty in Appalachia

Thesis Statement: In a world in which people are judged by materialistic wealth Appalachia is behind, but if people were judged by their inner beauty and spirituality Appalachia is far ahead.

I. Appalachian people put a high emphasis on family, children, and religion.
   A. The families of Appalachia are very close knit, and are emotionally dependent on each other.
   B. The children of Appalachia are highly valued because the people do not have many possessions; therefore, the children give meaning to their parents lives.
   C. Religion is something that gives the people of Appalachia hope to escape their hard life.
      1. Most Appalachian people are Christians who practice Baptism, yet few go to the extreme as emerging their whole body in ponds, lakes, and rivers.
      2. “Footwashing,” is something distinctive to Appalachia in which they reenact Christ at the Last Supper.
      3. Like footwashing, snakehandling and arsenic drinking is something particular to Appalachia in which the people feel they are under the influence of Christ.

II. The culture of Appalachia is rich with folklore, music, and community life.
   A. Folklore is an oral tradition that has been passed down for many generations.
      1. Folk medicine is largely traditional and is a treatment that is followed in the home.
      2. Almost every person living in Appalachia is superstitious in some way.
   B. Music in Appalachia is much like folklore, it is from England or Ireland, and has not changed much because of the isolation of the area.
   C. Each Appalachia community has its own distinct characteristics, from coal mining camps to rural farm communities.

III. The main reason for such poor education in Appalachia is the laxness of the parents in regards to helping the children with learning.

IV. Appalachia had a thriving economy when coal mining and unions were strong, but since the mining companies have left there is little work for the people.

In a world in which people are judged by materialistic wealth Appalachia is behind, but if people were judged by their inner beauty and spirituality Appalachia is far ahead. Appalachia indeed is an economically poverty stricken region. Eastern Kentucky has six counties that rank in the nation’s lowest per capita income and the illiteracy rate is among the nation’s highest. Even though Appalachia’s economy and education are
not as high as the rest of the country, it is the people and their culture which make Appalachia so special.

Webster’s II New Riverside University Dictionary defines poverty as: “the lack of enough income or resources to satisfy a person’s minimum needs” (922). Although poverty can be found in all countries and regions, the minimum needs of the people are not the same. The people of Appalachia have been stereotyped as being backward, illiterate, and poor. Despite this stereotyping they are some of the most dignified people on the earth. Although the Appalachian people do not own large homes or fine cars, they are still very proud individuals. Then the question would be, is the concept of poverty true for the people of Appalachia?

While much of American culture has weakened within the last one-hundred years, Appalachian people have preserved their old traditions and ideas. The Appalachian people are very individualistic. Each household lives separately and provides for themselves. The Appalachians think in a backward way. Their thoughts often drift back in time to when things were better for them, as Weller states, “The good old days” (69). Appalachians work toward achieving the essential needs for survival: food, clothing, shelter, and minimum comfort. In a study conducted by the University of North Carolina, a contrast was found between the middle-class americans thinking and the people of Appalachia’s mind set. Middle-class americans want something better for themselves; they want to be more modern. Improvement is a great motivating force in their lives. However, the people of Appalachia feel the tomorrow of life holds sorrow, fear, or disappointment. “The outlook of the mountain man’s thinking is regressive” (Weller 28).

The families of Appalachia are very close knit and are emotionally dependent on one another. “Sons and daughters want to settle near their parents, so they usually don’t move far away from home” (Weller 59). Families live very close together. Each valley is sometimes a domain for a single family. “Usually only two or three family names are in a valley” (Miles 136). The death of a family member brings great, and what seems to the casual observer, an exaggerated grief. Graveyards, which are often family plots, are always clean and are almost always covered with flowers.

Social planning is rare and most social events are spontaneous. However, the family reunion is a large planned social effort, sometimes attended by several hundred members. “The reunion is a once-a-year occasion when all the scattered members of the family gather and have a large feast” (Bell 102). Having roots from Appalachia myself, it is hard to remember when there were fewer than one-hundred people at our reunion. “Since families are so large, the reunion is a time for everybody to see everybody” (Bell 100).

The children of Appalachia are highly valued because the people do not have many possessions. Therefore, the children give meaning to the parents’ lives. “Children are always welcome into the family no matter how large or poor the family may be” (Weller 61). Families having eight
or more children are not uncommon. Many people believe that the more children you have the more the family is blessed, because there will be more help to make a living. Even though the parents love all of their children equally, it is the babies that get the most attention. “The parents love to play with them, fondle them, and carry them around” (Weller 61).

Religion is something that gives the people of Appalachia hope to escape their hard life. Appalachian religion has been stereotyped as having ignorant preachers, holy rollers, snake handlers, and barefoot believers, worshiping in log churches. However, the isolation of Appalachia has helped develop its own unique qualities, and help insulate the churches from social or theological change. “The isolation of churches and individualism of people help create a spirit of independence in the churches” (Gillespie 17). The main religious denominations in Appalachia include Baptist, Catholics, Church of Christ, Episcopalians, Jehovah’s Witnesses, Methodists, Pentecostals, and Presbyterians.

The people of Appalachia are individualistic, rough, and sometimes heavy drinkers, so the strongly emotional services appeal to them. “Preaching in churches is loud, dramatic, earnest, lengthy, and spontaneous” (Watson 38). An Appalachian church is not very fancy. Going into a church, there is not much décor. There are rough straight back pews and during services, organ music is playing. The preacher yells out such words as “lost, saved, Heaven, trust-Jesus, and the Holy Ghost.” While the preacher gives his sermon, members of the church yell out such words as “Yes Lord!”, “Thank you Jesus!”, and “Hallelujah!” It is the folk ways and traditions of the mountains that have influenced the religion.

Most Christians practice Baptism, yet few go to the extreme as emerging their whole bodies in ponds, lakes, and rivers. Baptism is the symbolic reenactment of Jesus’ immersion in the River Jordan by John the Baptist. Baptism may take the form of pouring water on one’s head or total immersion. “Today churches have small pools five to six feet in length and three to four feet in depth used of Baptism, but is was no more than twenty years ago there were large crowd watching a Baptism performed in a lake or river” (Gillespie 26).

“Footwashing” is something distinctive to Appalachia in which they reenact Christ at the Last Supper. During the service, the members have large bowls filled with water that they dip their feet in. Like footwashing, snakehandling and arsenic drinking is something individual to Appalachia. Snakehandling is when the church members handle live rattlesnakes and copperheads. “The members feel they are under the influence of the holy Ghost and the serpent will not harm them” (Gillespie 31). The church members may also drink arsenic because they feel Christ will protect them. Though some of these religious practices may seem odd and crazy, they are genuine and still go on today.

The culture of Appalachia is rich with folklore, music, and community life. Folklore is an oral tradition that has been passed down for many generations. Many mountain folk are Scotch-Irish; therefore, most of the
folktales in Appalachia are of Irish origin. “Stories place emotional value upon the home, family, respect for the dead, love of children, and animals” (Roberts 209). Most folk stories paint a picture of a hero going back home, either to find security again or to find it gone.

Folk medicine is largely traditional treatments that are practiced in the home. “People usually treated themselves with home remedies only when it seemed essential for life would they get a doctor” (Watson 94). Folk remedies were handed down family to family. One such remedy is blackberry cordial taken with whisky for intestinal disorders. Another example is crushed wild cherry bark in cold water. This is a treatment for yellow jaundice. Rosin from shortleaf pines was applied to sores and corns and sarsaparilla was used for a tonic. The amazing thing about such remedies is the fact they actually worked. Most of these home remedies contain real chemicals and enzymes used in prescription medicine today.

Almost every person in Appalachia is superstitious in some way. Some examples of superstition are, if you do not curse you will not raise your gourds, or if you have hair under you arms and on your chest you will have good luck with the hogs. They believed in planting their fields by the signs of the moon and that they can foretell the weather conditions by the signs of the insects.

Music in Appalachia is much like the folklore. It is from England or Ireland and has not changed much because of its isolation. “Much of mountain music is nostalgic and melancholy, even to the forms of harmony, which give a certain feeling of loneliness and yearning” (Weller 87). Most mountain ballads covered subjects such as: romances involving knights and ladies, gold seekers, trips to America, battles of the Civil War, and mining. Music is usually played at social functions, such as reunions or dances. The three main instruments in mountain music is the banjo, fiddle, and harmonica. Some Baptist churches frowned upon music because they thought it brought sin. “Most churches didn’t like the music at social events because it was righteous living” (Watson 95). However, the Church’s view on music did not bother the majority of people.

Each Appalachia community has its own distinct characteristics, from coal mining camps to rural farm communities. “Journeys through Appalachia travelers will see rows of coal-camp houses with paint peeling off; elsewhere unpainted, weather stained homes set on blocks, with chickens or house pets in the yard. Homes perched on hillsides with rotting wood” (Caudill 243). The people that live in the hollows do not have much contact with any one. The coal campus existence depended entirely on the mine. The camp was completely owned by the coal company. The coal company owned the church and paid the preacher. The school house and general store was owned by the company. Water, electricity, and garbage collection was provided by the company. When mining became more mechanical and did not need as many workers the camps became scarce. When the coal companies finally left a local newspaper headlined “BOOM TOWN TO GHOST TOWN.”
The main reason for such poor education in Appalachia is the laxness of the parents in regard to helping the children with learning. However, the parents’ laxness toward their children’s education is the same as they were brought up; they saw nothing wrong with it. In the past children went to school as early as allowed. Whenever they were old enough to be helpful at home, on the farm, or in the mine they were taken out for good. School always seemed to be secondary to something else. For example, a boy was being dismissed from school early, when asked if he had to go to the doctor or emergency he replied, “no, he had to help his father dig potatoes.” Since it was a Friday he was asked why not do it tomorrow, he replied, “Why no, tomorrow’s the start of hunting season.” “A person was thought to be well educated if he or she could read, write, and count, too much schooling was unnecessary” (Weller 107). Now every child has the opportunity to attend school. School busses pick all children up often on long, rough, and dangerous routes. Parents have come to the understanding that it is necessary to be educated, however there is still a fear of separation. “To be educated means to be snobbish, or feel you’re better than everyone else” (Stephenson 184). A young person on vacation from college may often hear the question “Do you think you’re better than we are now?” However, Appalachia is getting better teachers, motivated students, and a gradual improvement in their education system.

Appalachia had a thriving economy when coal mining and unions were mighty. However, since the mining companies have left, there is little work for the people. “Appalachia has become synonymous with destitution and poverty” (Brown 204). With the mining boom, the Unions rose up and became strong. “The miners unions were well organized and efficient representing the men to the company adequately” (Caudill 48). The unions gained real power when they started to take roles from the company. They started to determine the salaries, pensions, and the working conditions of the miners. The people relied heavily on coal and mining, but since its disappearance, there are few employment opportunities. “There are 3,140 counties in the United States, six Eastern Kentucky counties are among the nations twenty-five poorest” (Brown 413).

It is the concept of poverty in Appalachia which makes it unique. The people know they do not have much and that if they moved away they could find employment and make money. It is the fact that they love the mountains too much and cannot leave. The Appalachian’s culture and tradition have rare qualities that cannot be found anywhere else in the world. It is the Appalachian’s way of thinking; they know they live in poverty, yet they do not pity themselves. Unlike the average United States citizen whose whole life revolves around wealth, the Appalachia people are concerned with their family and fiends, and upholding their traditions. It is fair to say that the American citizen is concerned with materialistic wealth, lacking in spirituality and family bonding. However the people of
Appalachia view such things as material wealth as secondary compared to their wealth of family, and religion.

WORK CITED

Garrett, Robert T. “The mountains are level Let’s work on the Playing Field.” Courier Journal 31 July 1994: 1D.
Kentucky. Lieutenant Governor and Secretary, Cabinet for Economic Development. 1992 Kentucky Deskbook of Economic Statistics. Frankfort, Ky: Division of Research and Planning.

The Sociologist’s Responses:
RATING: HP “B”

The writing skills of this student are excellent and rate an A. The paper is almost error free in that respect. It reads easily and clearly.
In terms of research there are a few areas of concern. The paper lacks objectivity. The writer supports his/her position by using far too many out-dated references which are known to romanticize the mountain people. As the writer mentions in one quote the area is changing rapidly and references 10-40 years old are not appropriate for this type of research paper. This would be considered a major problem in my class.

The Reading and Study Skills Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP
Borderline between P and HP
Strong personal voice
Good thesis, well organized development
Some mechanical problems; not many
Entertaining, although a little light for a research paper.

The Allied Health Division Chair's Responses:
RATING: P
No comments.

Group Five Results

A professor from the Education Transfer Program, another from Allied Health, and an English Professor made up Group Five. In addition to the seven calibration essays which were read by all respondents, these three read the enclosed eleven essays--their group-specific essays--in the order in which I present them herein. But first, here is a chart that shows ratings, paper grades, and course grades.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essay Number</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>117</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>042</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>066</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>A+</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>056</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>026</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>A+</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>196</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>B+</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>253</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>131</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>B+</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>216</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>C+</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>206</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>086</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>E</td>
<td>E</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 8. Group Five Ratings

The respondents reach a complete agreement in two instances: Essay 117 and Essay 253. Interestingly, respondents rate 117 an HP and 253 an NP, and the teachers assign an A to both essays. So, there is a consensus between respondents and teacher in the case of 117, but not for 253. Partial agreement, with two respondents agreeing, appears in all
other cases but two: Essay 196 and 131. Here respondents’ ratings are split three ways. In these two cases, we cannot claim a consensus between respondents and teachers either.

Partial agreement with an anomalous third reading occurs twice for Group Five: First for Essay 026, two respondents agree on an HP rating, and the third rates the essay NP. The teacher agrees with the respondents who assign an HP, giving the essay an A-. For Essay 206, a different anomaly occurs, and the teacher assigns an A.

In two of the seven cases in which a partial agreement occurs, two respondents agree that the essays are non-proficient, and one assigns a P. For Essay 216, the teacher’s grade, a C+, is significantly higher than the respondents’ grades, perhaps indicating grade inflation. More significant in terms of grade inflation is Essay 253, however. All respondents assign an NP, and the teacher gives the essay an A. For Essay 086, we can claim a consensus between respondents and teacher in that two respondents assign an NP, and the teacher rates the essay an E.

There is significant consensus among the respondents in Group Five. They reach at least partial agreement for seven of eleven essays, and complete agreement twice. These data show a consensus among respondents of about 88%. The respondents disagree completely in only two cases.

In addition, the respondents and the teachers agree on six of the eleven essays. They disagree in four cases, and agreement between respondents and teachers cannot be determined for one essay, 056, because the teacher failed to include a paper grade and a course grade.

Group Five Essays and Comments

Group-Specific Essay #45 (Essay 117 of Sample)
WITHDRAWAL OF CONSENT TO ADOPTION
NATURAL PARENTS’ RIGHTS AND LIMITATIONS

Outline

I. Introduction
   a. Background
   b. Comparisons
   c. Reasoning
II. History of Withdrawal Cases
   a. Green v. Paul
   b. Mayfield v. Braund
   c. People v. Shepsky
III. Statutory Comparisons - Current
   a. In re Timothy W.
   b. Hindman v. Bischoff
   c. In Re Adoption of Hoffman
   d. In re the Adoption of P.R. McD and J.T. McD., minors
IV. Conclusion
   a. Special amendments
   b. Suggested “cooling-off” period
   c. Solution

Adoption cases in which the natural parent or parents attempts to withdraw consent to place the child for adoption are extremely sensitive. A typical case involves at least one natural parent relinquishing an infant at birth to prospective parents. The adoptive parents then begin fulfilling the necessary requirements to adopt the child, but, in the meantime, the natural parent or parents changes his/her minds and attempts to revoke consent.

In the past, the courts paid little attention to the child’s emotional well-being. For example, in Warner v. Ward, the court’s decision was based solely on contractual considerations rather than the child’s interest. The fact that the natural mother was only sixteen when she executed the consent was “enough in itself to establish a right of disaffirmance,” (Warner v. Ward 401 S.W.2d 62) held in the court.

Currently, questions of consent withdrawal are largely governed by statute in most jurisdictions and reflect an improvement in the consideration of the child’s well-being; however, many laws are still too uncertain and weak. These weaknesses in the law concerning natural parents’ revocation of consent only discourage qualified, prospective parents from adopting. The court adopted this view in Rhodes v. Shirley and held:

...there seems little doubt that if natural parents were given the right to arbitrarily revoke a consent for adoption once voluntarily and deliberately given, this would greatly discourage qualified prospective parents from seeking children through adoption... A ruling which would make this possible would place a penalty rather than a reward
upon adoptive parents...(Rhodes v. Shirley, 129 N.E.2d 60)

Most early cases held that consent was absolutely revocable until a final decree of adoption. In fact, many courts held that a mere change of mind on the part of the natural parents who previously had consented to adoption of their children was sufficient grounds for revocation of consent. “Because consent is a requirement to adoption, such consent must be of a continuing nature, and withdrawal of consent prior to the final decree of adoption is as effective in preventing the adoption as though consent had never been given. (Green v. Paul, 31 So.2d 819) The facts of the case are as follows:

Mr. and Mrs. Green petitioned to adopt Patricia Paul, the seven-year-old daughter of Charles Paul. (Patricia Paul’s mother is deceased.) Mrs. Green is the half-sister of Charles Paul. The petitioners had cared for the child (with the consent of the child’s father) for some time prior to the petition for adoption. The child’s father originally gave his consent to the proposed in writing, which they attached to their petition. The trial judge entered an interlocutory decree of adoption on May 28, 1945 and awarded the petitioners temporary custody of the child. On February 28, 1946, Charles Paul appeared and moved for the revocation of the interlocutory decree of adoption. The judge dismissed the motion, and Paul appealed.

The appellate court held that the primary question was whether a final degree of adoption could be granted without the continuing consent of the child’s natural parent(s). The court gave a negative answer, stating in part:

...[I]t is obvious that...an adoption proceeding cannot survive in the absence of the parents’ consent which must continue until the rendition of the final decree...

[T]here is no adoption at common law and, in the United States, it exists only by statute. It has been firmly settled by this court that adoption is a creature of statute; that, this being so, it is only what the law makes it and that, to establish the relation, the statutory requirements must be strictly carried out, otherwise, the adoption is an absolute nullity...

Since the act of judgment of adoption has the effect of transferring the legal relation from the natural parents to the adoptive parents, it is generally made requisite in adoption statutes that the consent of the natural parents be had in order that the adoption be valid. And it has been held that statutes which do not provide for the consent of the natural parent are unconstitutional...

Therefore, since consent is essential, it would seem to follow that it must be of a continuing nature and that the withdrawal of consent prior to rendition of a final decree is just as effective a bar to the adoption as
though the consent had never been given...}[Emphasis added] *Green v. Paul*, 31 So.2d 819)
The issues of abandonment and of the child’s best interest were raised in *Mayfield v. Braund*. The court noted it was not empowered to allow the adoption of a child when the parents object before the final decree of adoption, unless the evidence shows that parents had abandoned their child.
In cases involving the question of abandonment, the burden of proof is on the petitioners. In this case the petitioners sought to adopt three minor children who were in their care and custody, and all alleged that the defendant had abandoned the children. The natural father was made defendant to the petition and filed an answer denying such allegation and requesting custody of the children, since the mother had died. The petitioners argued that “considering the welfare of the children, the granting of the prayer of this petition will best serve their interest.” (*Mayfield v. Braund*, 64 So.2d 713)

While a few jurisdictions still allow natural parents the absolute right to revoke consent to adoption until a court has issued a final decree of adoption, a substantial number will permit withdrawal of consent in an adoption case only if the court determines that revocation is in the best interests of the child. Studies have proven that an infant’s psychological development occurs much more rapidly than previously known, and therefore many jurisdictions have established a reasonable time period in which a natural mother can refuse to consent to an independent adoption within the specified reasonable time, as occurred in *In Re Timothy W.*, the court may not even consider the issue of the child’s best interest. (*In Re Timothy W.*, 272 Cal.Rptr. 906)

Other jurisdictions have no waiting periods, and the courts consider the welfare of the child to be the primary issue. For example, in *Hindman v. Bischoff*, the child was placed with the adoptive parents immediately after birth. The natural mother petitioned to set aside her consent to adoption shortly thereafter. The lower court denied said petition, and the appellate court affirmed the lower court’s decision. The appellate held that the natural mother’s allegations of emotional immaturity and unawareness of alternatives to adoption were not adequately shown by the testimony. It was shown, however, that all available options had been explained to her prior to consent, and the state case workers had interviewed her and determined her consent was informed and voluntary. The appellate court, however, did offer its opinion on the lack of a “cooling-off” period:

...Our compassion causes us to suggest...that the legislature reassess the current adoption statutes and consider the wisdom of a “cooling-off” period, common in several states, during which the actual adoption remains in abeyance... An opportunity for reflection might avoid the seemingly harsh result that has occurred here. We are
without choice in a matter of this kind, however, and must follow the law as it is ordained by the legislature.

*In Re Adoption of Hoffman* addressed the issue of fraud in adoption cases. The appellate court held that the evidence supported the existence of fraud and therefore reversed the lower court’s decision which had denied the natural parents’ petition to vacate the decree of adoption. The adoptive parents in this case were the child’s paternal grandparents. The parents consented to the adoption, but contended that they did so only for the purpose of providing arrangements for the child in the event of both parent’s deaths. The parents alleged, as a result of their communication with the grandparents, they believed this to be the only method by which guardianship for the child could be effected in the event of their death. They further contended that “their love for their daughter and a deep desire to see that she was taken care of in the event of their untimely demise prompted them to give their consent to adoption.” (*In Re Adoption of Hoffman*, 321 N.E.2d 174) The natural father explained that, at the time of the adoption, he was confident that his parents would never deprive him and his wife of the care and custody of their daughter.

The appellate court accepted the parents’ theory and held that the parents were dependent upon the grandparents for guidance and advise, and that the grandparents owed the parents a “fiduciary duty” which precluded them from taking advantage of their vulnerable situation. The court further explained its rationale by stating, in part:

> It is apparent from the record that this duty was breached by the grandparents in their efforts to secure custody of their grandchild...Grandparents compromised their responsibilities and chose to gain custody of their granddaughter through less than candid methods. Even if the grandparents sincerely believed the infant was neglected and the parents were unfit, their method of securing custody was inexcusable and unorthodox...
>
> It is apparent from the record that originally the best interest of the infant was a secondary factor, and that all parties involved were more concerned with their own best interest. (*In Re Adoption of Hoffman*).

Closely related to the issue of fraud, *In Re the Adoption of P.R. McD. and J.T. McD.*, addressed the issue of duress. The facts of the case are as follows.

A petition for adoption of two minor children was filed, and the natural father of the children filed an objection to the petition, but later executed a written consent to the adoption, followed by the notice of intention to withdraw consent. At a final hearing on the matter, the trial court entered an involuntary dismissal against the natural father and later issued a final judgment of adoption. The natural father appealed. Evidence was submitted by the appellant that, at the time he signed consent, he was a part-time resident in a halfway house suffering from emotional problems
and understood that he could get the child back later. Furthermore, he alleged that he signed consent only to prevent the children from ending up on welfare. The Court of Appeals found that a prima facie case of duress was established with respect to the natural father’s execution of the written consent to adoption, and stated:

Consent to adoption can not be withdrawn on a mere whim or because of a change of heart... Consent may only be withdrawn when the court finds that the consent was obtained by fraud or duress. Based upon the aforementioned evidence, we believe that appellant made a prima facie case of duress. Thus, an involuntary dismissal was not indicated. For that reason we reverse the judgment appealed from and remand the cause for further proceedings. (In re the Adoption of P.R. McD and J.T. McD., minors, 440 So.2d 57).

It is unfortunate that some states still allow natural parents to arbitrarily withdraw their consent prior to the entry of a final decree of adoption without considering the child’s welfare. This law not only discourages adoptions, but it has the real potential for damaging a child’s psychological well-being. These jurisdictions need to amend their laws to focus more on the children’s best interests.

On the other hand, there are also states which prohibit revocation except in cases of fraud or duress. These states could perhaps have a bit more compassion for the natural parents who very often find it extremely difficult to consent to adoption and thus experience mixed feelings. One possible solution would be to enact a brief “cooling-off” period in which the natural parents could revoke consent. This time period would necessarily be very short in order to prevent the child from forming bonds with the adoptive parents, and after such time period, the consent would be irrevocable absent fraud or duress.

In any event, courts should make the child’s best interest their primary consideration, but still balance the rights and needs of the natural and adoptive parents. Obviously, this is a tall order, and the states should continue to strive for the best possible solution.

WORK CITED

Mayfield v. Braund, 64 So.2d 713 (Miss. 1953).
In Re Timothy W., 272 Cal.Rptr. 906 (Cal.App 4 Dist. 1990).
In re the Adoption of P.R. McD and J.T. McD., minors, 440 So.2d 57 (Fla. App. 4 Dist. 1983).

WORK CONSULTED
Sorosky, Authur D., *The Adoption Triangle: Sealed or Opened Records*, 1984
“Irreconcilable Differences”. *Newsweek* 120:84-90 S21 1992
“Baby Emily Reversal; Adoptive Parents Retain Custody,” *ABA Journal*, February 1995

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

It’s hard to believe that this paper was written by a student in ENG 102. Content was organized, ideas were expressed coherently and there were very few errors. The fluency with legal language and the length and complexity of the sentences lead me to wonder about the educational level of the writer.

The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“As a case review, this paper is well written. I’m not sure I would consider it a research paper as I don’t see a strong thesis statement. Also the conclusions in the paper don’t match recent legal decisions.”

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

This paper is excellent and eloquent: Tightly reasoned and of nearly graduate-level accomplishment. The outline promises and the paper delivers.
My nits: It’s not Humanities--MLA style is inappropriate.
Reminder: This is a teaching problem exclusively.

**Group-Specific Essay #46 (Essay 042 of Sample)**

**The Scarlet Letter:**
A Puritan Tabloid

Outline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Thesis: The Scarlet Letter is structured around the scaffold scenes; a close look at each of those scenes reveals the central messages in the novel.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Hawthrone’s internal scaffold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Symbolism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Hawthorns Writing as public confession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Hawthorns use of symbolism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The symbolism of the scaffold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. The recognition: the first scaffold scene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Midday</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

240
B. The Puritan punishment  
C. Hester's sin  
D. Chillingworth's sin  
E. Dimmesdale's sin  
F. The meaning of the first scaffold scene  

III. The concealment: the second scaffold scene  
A. Midnight  
B. Hester and Pearl join Dimmesdale  
C. Chillingworth's vengeance  
D. The meaning of the second scaffold scene  

IV. The revelation: the third scaffold scene  
A. Midday  
B. Dimmesdale on the scaffold  
C. Dimmesdale's acknowledgment of Hester and Pearl  
D. Chillingworth's growing revenge  
E. The meaning of the third scaffold scene  

V. The message of sin  
A. Acknowledgment of sin  
B. Demise of the Puritans  
C. Current popularity of sin (need for public confession)  

Famous American author, Nathaniel Hawthorne, lived from 1804 to 1864, in Salem, Massachusetts. Hawthorne was obsessed with the goodness or evil hidden in men's souls, perhaps due to the evil deeds of his Puritan ancestors'. His father burned Indian Villages during King Philip's war. His grandfather whipped Quakers through the streets of Salem. His great-grandfather was the only non-repenting judge of the Salem witch trials. Hawthorne was so ashamed of his ancestors' that he added the W to his name. Famous British critic D.H. Lawrence, says "American writers use symbolism, and Hawthorne used it deviously".1 His most famous book is The Scarlet Letter. Its central symbol is the scaffold, which is symbolic of public confession as a way to cleanse himself of his ancestors' sins. Therefore, it is not surprising that The Scarlet Letter is structured around the scaffold scenes; a close look at each of those scenes reveals the central messages in the novel.

The first scaffold scene takes place at midday. Hester Prynne is led from the jail, carrying three-month old Pearl through a crowded market place to the scaffold. The Puritans' most popular form of punishment is to have the offenders publicly confess their sins on the scaffold in the middle of the market place. Hawthorne's use of "The prison and the scaffold located in accordance with the actual topography of early Boston, are also understood as extensions of the Puritans' care fare for lawful authority and punishment."2 Hester's sin is adultery resulting in the birth of a child, Pearl. While Hester is on the scaffold she is repeatedly asked who her accomplice was. She refuses to reveal his name saying "I will not speak!" "And my child must seek a heavenly father; she shall never know an
As Hester’s punishment she must wear a scarlet letter A on her breast at all times. “The Scarlet Letter is a symbol of the original sin, by which no man is untouched.” As Hester stood on the scaffold she recognized a man in the crowd, her husband, Roger Chillingworth. He did not acknowledge her publicly as his wife. Instead he met with her privately after she stood three hours on the scaffold. He asked Hester to take an oath that she would not reveal his true identity to anyone. She gave her work. Chillingworth’s sin is, not revealing who he is. The Reverend Mr. Dimmesdale is present during Hester’s confinement on the scaffold. At one point he is asked by Mr. Wilson to obtain a confession and repentance from her. Dimmesdale’s sin is not admitting he is Pearl’s father and sharing Hester’s public confession and punishment. Clearly, the meaning of the first scaffold scene is recognition of each of their sins to themselves.

The second scaffold scene deals with concealment and takes place at midnight under the cover of darkness. Dimmesdale is standing on the scaffold where seven years ago Hester stood. He holds his hand over his heart and cries out into the darkness expecting to awaken the town and be discovered on the scaffold of shame. Then he would be forced to confess to the town’s people, but no one came. Hester and Pearl came upon him on their way home from watching over a death-bed. He asks Hester and Pearl to join him on the scaffold. When asked by Pearl if he will join them at noon tomorrow on the scaffold he replies that it would not be tomorrow but another day. He can admit under the cover of darkness his sin, but not in daylight for everyone to see. Chillingworth appears out of the darkness for he also was on his way home from the deathbed. Dimmesdale asks Hester if she knows Chillingworth. “she remembered her oath and was silent”(162). Chillingworth had for sometime been Dimmesdale’s physician and roommate so that when he asked Dimmesdale to go home before he become ill, he was willing to go.

“Roger Chillingworth, is made the real villain of the piece in that he commits Hawthorne’s sin of sins the violation of the human heart, by exerting his almost hypnotic control over the young minister and deliberately causing his ruin.” Clearly, the meaning of the second scene is concealment of their sin.

The third scaffold scene takes place at midday, during the town’s election celebration. As the Reverend Mr. Dimmesdale is leading the procession, he hesitates in front of the scaffold. All his renewed energy and spiritual strength he has regained in the last few days, carries him in front of the scaffold. He calls for Hester and Pearl to join him for his public confession saying, “I withheld myself from doing seven years ago, come hither now and twine thy strength about me!” (265). “The minister’s open confession on the pillory is an admirable scene... It is an explosion of craving and of repressed passion.” While on the scaffold making his confession, Dimmesdale pulls off his ministerial band to reveal his heart, where his hand usually rests to reveal a red A stigma on his chest. “The
which the young minister finds imprinted upon his breast and eating into his flesh, in sympathy with the embroidered badge that Hester is condemned to wear. Chillingworth finds out about Hester and Dimmesdale’s plans to escape Salem on the ship leaving the next day and he books passage on the same ship telling the captain that as Dimmesdale’s physician he will be going with him. This is yet another act of vengeance. Chillingworth’s intense desire is to prevent him from acknowledging Hester and Pearl, to which Dimmesdale replies, “Thy power is not what it was! With God’s help, I shall escape thee now!” (265) Chillingworth’s private rage to expose, control and accuse... comes to an end when Dimmesdale’s confession is made. “Chillingworth repeated several times “Thou hast escaped me.” (268) Clearly, the meaning of the third scaffold scene is they reveal to themselves and others their secrets and sin.

Clearly, The Scarlet Letter is structured around the scaffold scenes; a close look at each of those scenes reveals the central messages in the novel. The recognition, concealment, and the revelation of the three scaffold scenes show the control message of the novel. The message of The Scarlet Letter, is that sin can only be forgiven and guilt erased if the sinner confesses. Otherwise the guilt will eat away at the person’s soul as it did to Dimmesdale and Chillingworth. Once a person admits to the sin and can forgive from within can life go on as it did for Hester. “Though the novel shows us good coming out of evil, it shows it coming only at a tragic loss.”

Puritans came to America and brought with them strict moral beliefs with violent punishments when Queen Elizabeth made it illegal to be Puritan. Their demise came several years after the Salem witch trials. When the girls admitted they had lied, all the judges recanted (except Hawthorne’s grandfather). D.H. Lawrence is wrong when he says “even sin becomes stale.” The popularity of T.V. talk shows and tabloid magazines proves Lawrence wrong. Sin is big business today because, ‘Inquiring minds want to know.’ The public is interested in the sins and confessions of everyone else.

Notes


3Nathaniel Hawthorne, The Scarlet Letter (1994; New York: Pocket Books) 69. All Subsequent references to this work appear in the text.

4Richard Harter Fogle, Hawthorne’s Fiction; The Light and the Dark (Norman, Oklahoma U.P., 1975) 133.


Lawrence 107.

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

This paper was well-organized and fairly well-written (but I suspect it wasn’t very original). There has been analysis, interpretation and evaluation of The Scarlet Letter, but the student may have just reported someone else’s work. The skills demonstrated in this paper may be more related to paraphrasing than to analysis and interpretation.

The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“Some mechanical errors, but the thoughts are clear? Footnotes?

The last paragraph appears tacked on. No relevance.”

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

This is a good synthesis of reading and critical sources--showing a good command of the aims of 102. However, I can’t resist mentioning the inconsistencies of our documentation instruction. This requires MLA documentation and a Works Cited page. There are citations here; end-notes are inappropriate!

Group-Specific Essay #47 (Essay 066 of Sample)

Should The United States Adopt Population Control Laws?

In recent years, the issue of population control has been talked about with more diligence than ever before. The need for a global approach to population planning is beginning to be recognized. However, many people tend to construct their own goals and to act them out independently. The
realization of a nation-wide cooperation in population planning would be no small achievement. Only recently has the United States government begun to recognize its role in the problem and to experience some of the effects of overpopulation. Some of these include the shortages of food, adequate housing, natural resources, and energy. Air, water, and noise pollution are also effects of the expanding population. Could a decrease in the number of potential consumers be a favorable solution to this problem?

This issue is made even more controversial by considering some of the areas of behavior affected by legal action to control population. Aside from the issue of abortion, which is controversial on its own, the use of contraceptives and sterilization also stir up debate. Access to contraceptive devices poses some of the same questions as does the question of the availability of abortion. For example, should there be restrictions which distinguish between married and unmarried persons, or minors and adults? Who should be the judge of quality and safety of commercially sold contraceptives? Could anyone guarantee inexpensive and adequate distribution of and education about these devices to those who need them?

Although the use of contraceptives is essentially a matter of individual choice, sterilization is a technique for birth control that has focused on the use of force. George B. Simmons, professor of population studies at the University of Michigan, claims that, “for couples that are sure they have had all the children they want, sterilization is an optimal method of family planning” (181). However, it could be possible for a government to legally impose sterilization on its citizens to prevent population growth. If this were to happen, could the government use this to decrease the population of people with an undesirable genetic trait? How could sterilization be prevented from being used to control certain races, religious groups, minority groups, and the poor?

Population planning is not limited to pre-natal controls. As a result of recent advances in medicine and science, people are living longer than ever before. The future may bring even greater extensions of the average life span and more questions about the meaning of life and when it should be terminated. The law is already being asked to define the point at which a person is “legally” dead. Should the government remove any prohibitions on suicide? How should the law deal with euthanasia and who should have the final decision as to when a person may be allowed to die?

One of the first people to offer a theory on population was Thomas Robert Malthus. In his essays, Malthus describes “the constant tendency in all animate life to increase beyond the nourishment prepared for it” (7). He explains how in plants and animals their numbers are restricted only by lack of food and space. Humans, however, have the ability to rationally control their numbers. He suggests that if man does not choose to set up checks for their own numbers, nature would dictate more drastic checks of its own. Most modern theories have stemmed from or are related to Malthus’ theory.
An example of a society that is currently dealing with population control laws is China. In 1971, China’s Communist government changed its policies to strongly encourage the use of birth control. In 1979 the government decided that the voluntary birth control campaign had not done enough to limit population growth so they implemented the current policy. Couples are allowed to have only one child except in the case of multiple births (ex. twins, triplets). Women who get pregnant after having their one child are encouraged to get abortions and if they decide to have the child they could face fines of up to several years’ salary. In Stan Sesser’s article about China, Judith Banister, of the U.S. Bureau of the Census, says that “No other country in the world limits the number of children people are allowed to have” (80).

Although it seems as if this type of policy would lend itself to abuse by officials, Stan Sesser states that “stories of physical coercion are relatively rare in China because the day-to-day psychological pressure is so intense it’s usually not necessary to use pressure” (85). This psychological pressure centers around a sweeping campaign to educate people about subordinating their own short-term needs to the long-term interests of society. There are also special groups in the factories and other large employers that exist only to monitor the reproduction of their employees.

Another way that the Chinese government has successfully encouraged its people to cooperate with the population laws is to offer rewards for single-child households. These rewards include subsidized schooling and medical care for authorized children. Better prospects for housing is also offered to one-child families who live in cities.

Could population policy like China’s work in the United States? Many of us would instantly say no. Although there are no present laws protecting the right of Americans to choose how many children to have, it is believed by many of us that this is one of our basic rights as humans. Shirley Foster Hartley suggests that “A government sponsored approach to population control would undermine the already weak relationship that most people have with the government” (94). On the other hand, David E. Bell describes that if something is not done by the government, “the consequences could range from revolution to wide spread famine” (213).

Although China’s policies on population control seem drastic to many of us, it could prove to be beneficial to us to at least use some of their ideas to form our own population laws. Stan Sesser says that, “much of China’s family planning program could serve as a model for developing nations” (78). Some of the parts of China’s policy could be directly transferred to use in the United States. These areas would include widespread distribution and education about contraceptives, incentive programs for small families, and government funded abortion and sterilization clinics.

As Dr. Warren S. Thompson states in his study of population, “It seems to be more human for man to use the reasoning powers he possesses to attain what he judges to be a good life than to limit his achievement of
such a life by the uncontrolled use of his ability to reproduce”(571). The need for America to begin to look at this issue is becoming painfully obvious. Cities are approaching gridlock. Natural resources are being used up at an alarming rate, and the contribution of all of these people to the pollution problem is staggering. I feel that the United States should adopt some form of population control laws. As Stephen D. Mumford states in his book, “The hard fact is that unchecked population growth alone creates problems so difficult and so costly to solve that the United States would benefit greatly from action being take now, before the rights of the people have to be infringed upon”(198).

Naturally, as concern over the issue of population grows, more demands will be placed on the laws of the United States and the world community in general to provide solutions to the questions at hand. How these issues will be resolved may prove to be a crucial factor in determining the future of man’s role on this planet.

Works Cited

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

“While there are some errors in this paper, it is generally well-written and organized in a ‘cohesive manner.’”

The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“Very nice paper. Maybe too much passive voice.”

The English Professor’s Responses:
I recognize proficiency here, but I would encourage this student to nail down a thesis earlier on to enhance rhetorical effectiveness. Up until his first-person declaration 3/4 through the essay, I thought ‘The importance of the issue’ was the thesis. When it turned on an argument for controls, I felt misled. This may be a small nit to pick in a very proficient essay, but that’s how I would encourage this person to improve. Rare glitches on the surface here are overshadowed by clear, precise, logical control of language.

Group-Specific Essay #48 (Essay 056 of Sample)

Review of *Lighten Up*

The book *Lighten Up*, describes survival skills for people under pressure. This book shows how to become a more relaxed and productive person by using humor and laughter to help handle even the toughest situations. In his book, Metcalf explains to the reader that life is indeed, very serious and often times tragic, but humor and laughter can be a great help to glide through the rocky times. Metcalf has taken his ideas and not only written a book, but he also travels around the world giving motivating and inspirational lectures, He believes that keeping one’s “humor” healthy is as important as keeping physically or spiritually healthy. *Lighten Up* demonstrates how to utilize some of Metcalf’s techniques in everyday life.

Metcalf uses many broad examples to illustrate his techniques. From tragic stories about crash landings, to his own personal experiences with children that were cancer victims, the author shows the reader that humor can help to keep these truly somber situations in a positive perspective. In order to help the reader along, Metcalf has developed a set oh humor skills for the basis of his book. He believes that by mastering these skills we will begin to understand the type of “fluidity, creativity, and flexibility I’m here trying to sell” (21).

- **The first humor skill**: The ability to see the absurdity in difficult situations.
- **The second humor skill**: The ability to take yourself lightly while taking your work seriously.
- **The third humor skill**: A disciplined sense of joy in being alive. (32)

Through many different exercises and techniques, Metcalf explains how to use these skills, and apply them to our life situations. Metcalf states that most of us believe that happiness is something that should fall at our feet. His advise is to dismiss this idea immediately. A sense of joy in our lives is in our own hands. Our actions let us discover the things that enrich our sense of fun, laughter and humor. He believes that those of us possessing this ability, draw strength from these experiences, and those who do not always feel defeated.
The book goes on to discuss rules for healthy humor to avoid abusing others. “Etiquette for the humor impaired” (68), is what Metcalf calls this. He uses the following etiquette table for his humor:

**HEALING HUMOR**
- Bonds us in understanding or accepting difficulty and responsibility.
- Laughs at itself.
- Illuminates solutions.
- Decreases tension.
- Builds confidence.
- Involves others in enjoyment.

**HARMFUL HUMOR**
- Divides us from one another and places blame on others.
- Laughs only at others.
- Obscures solutions.
- Increases tension.
- Destroys someone’s self worth.
- Excludes others from enjoyment.

This book helps us to see that dealing with normal reactions such as bad days, bad news, loss and sadness are a part of every day life. Metcalf states that, “humor does not alleviate clinical depression or other types of mental illness, but when humor reappears, it usually signals the beginning of recovery” (91). We are allowed to have bad days, be in bad moods, or be just plain down in the dumps. Metcalf suggests that we use some of his techniques to get out of these normal negative patterns.

Reading this book opens up the door to new ways to view life in all aspects. Metcalf opens himself up to his audience in ways that let us know he has had some seriously rough times to get through. By recounting his experiences, I knew he wasn’t sitting behind a desk in a clinical setting analyzing new ways of dealing with stress. This book is easy to read, and has realistic techniques for dealing with life and the stress everyday brings. Anyone could pick up Metcalf’s book and “lighten up”.

**Works Cited**


The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:

RATING: P “marginally”

“Part of this paper reads like a paraphrased book cover. There didn’t seem to be any original ideas, but it was pretty well-written in terms of grammar, sentence structure, spelling, etc.”
The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“Nice review. Makes me want to read the book.”

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“This student has mastered appropriate tone of voice. To critique a book about humor in tough situations requires humor, not silliness or heaviness, but the ‘light touch.’” Well done.”

Group-Specific Essay #49 (Essay 024 of Sample)

NOT QUITE WHAT IT SEEMS
In Tobias Wolff’s “Say yes” and Ann Beattie’s “Janus”, the titles speak volumes about their content. Each title more than adequately describes the central female character in the stories. In “Say Yes” the wife was very confrontational and demanding with her husband, almost to the point of being manipulative. In “Janus” the wife was almost the complete opposite, never making any waves, or demands on her husband. Both women sought security in their lives in some form or another and each found it, or so they thought.

In “Janus” Andrea seemed to have found something the female character in “Say Yes” hadn’t, something to bring excitement to her life that didn’t include her husband.

Both stories at first appear interestingly simple, with the main focus in “Janus” being the bowl and in “Say Yes” a simple argument between husband and wife. Neither story as it turns out is very simple at all, but rather much like life itself, quite complex. Both stories involve the right of adult persons being able to make a choice, but not without consequence.

The title “Janus” adequately describes Andrea. Janus, who was a Roman god and the spirit of all beginnings, was identified with doors, gates and other places of passage. Janus is usually depicted as a figure with two faces looking in opposite directions.

Andrea is much like Janus the god in the sense that she had to look in both directions, while trying to decide between her lover and her husband. I’m sure at times she felt as thought she were involved in an emotional tug-a-war. Her lover once accused her of being two-faced and not being able to decide what she really loved. I think Andrea’s having had the affair signaled a passage in which she wasn’t quite ready.

In “Say Yes” the title describes the wife’s desire to control the husband. She wants him to agree with her regardless of how he feels as an individual. She seems at times almost immature with her efforts to get the
husband to abandon his own ideas and rationale in order to agree with her. When he took a stance and refused to “Say yes”, his wife became angry and disagreeable.

The wife in “Say Yes’ was very confrontational with her husband. She wasn’t afraid to press an unpopular issue or discussion. She probably felt that if she insisted long and hard enough the husband would “Say Yes”. She seemed to be complaining when she said, “Different, not the same like us.” It seems as if she were trying to say she was bored with her life and it’s predictability. I think perhaps, deep down, and for once she wanted him to not be the perfect assisting husband, but maybe she liked the attention she got when they argued, and he realized he had said too much.

In “Janus” the wife wasn’t confrontational at all. She was unable or unwilling to tell her husband about the bowl, though she desperately wanted to. They were always able to talk about things, even their differences. Though he never mentions wanting to tell her husband about the lover, I believe when referring to the bowl, to her they were one in the same. It was easier for her to choose the calm, safe existence with her husband, than to trouble the waters by choosing her lover.

So in a sense, by choosing the way she did, she was able to have her cake and eat it too. She transferred all her feelings for her lover into the bowl, and secretly continued her affair with an inanimate object. For her this was much safer, since the bowl couldn’t talk or make any demands on her, unlike the lover.

Both the women in “Janus” and “Say Yes” needed to feel secure about their lives and they each found it in a different way. Andrea felt safe and secure in her rather routine marriage to her stockbroker husband. The only time she ever took chances, was when she would display the bowl in the homes of clients, becoming frantic when she forgot and left it behind. She also took a chance by having an affair with her lover, but quickly backed away when asked to make a choice that might threaten her security.

In “Say Yes” the wife found her security in her husband and by being able to count on and even control him to some extent. It seems to me that she wanted and maybe needed to have him say he would marry her under any circumstances. It was almost as if her security was threatened by their discussion and his refusal to just “Say Yes”.

In Janus the first sentence says, “The bowl was perfect.” I think the writer is setting the tome for the story. The bowl seems to represent Andrea’s life as she would have it, or a significant aspect of it. She was unable to find perfection in herself, so she looked for it and found it in the bowl. She built a secret and almost separate life for herself around the bowl. I’m not sure if she was at all sorry about having lost her lover; because in actuality she gained something more important, besides the bowl, she found herself or a part of her she was unwilling to give up.

There is so much more to each of these stories, than I was able to gather on the first reading. I’m beginning to understand the attraction to literature.
I liked Ann Beattie’s “Janus” better, because it seemed as though Andrea grew in the story and found what she needed, which didn’t necessarily include the aid of someone else.

Most of us are faced with decisions at some time in our lives, where we are unwilling to confront all the necessary issues in order to be able to simply “Say Yes”.

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“This student’s language skills made the paper a relief to read after wading through so many that were so poorly written. Unfortunately, it wasn’t very well organized.

‘Adequate and substantive documented support’ wasn’t incorporated into this paper.”

The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“Basically well-written. Confusing for an audience unfamiliar with the stories.”

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

This is a highly competent, nearly-excellent paper. The writer’s literary analysis is contextualized, clear, and focused. I have read neither story, but found this discussion easy to follow. The language was appropriate, and the writer shared the stories’ impact upon the reader as a new reader of literature. There were some errors, the confusion of ‘its’ and ‘it’s,’ but there were too few to be distracting.

Group-Specific Essay #50 (Essay 196 of Sample)

God Has a Place in Our Public Schools

Christian faith is the basis of our national Government and our public school system. The beliefs and principles of the Christian faith are essential in developing moral, well disciplined citizens with the ability and desire to overcome the pitfalls of our modern sinking society. This faith still remains the best way to prepare our young people, the future leaders of our country, for the real world.

The religious principles formerly taught in our nation’s public schools provided students with the knowledge needed to live a live of peace, happiness, and responsibility on a daily basis. Not every day does a person encounter the need for plane geometry or is asked to remember who the inhabitants of the Yellow River Valley were. But every day people interact with each other. Every day we must rely on some religious or moral beliefs to dictate how we are to interact with others around us, the
encounter with the unfortunate fellow you passed on the side walk asking for a few dollars to buy food, or the unlucky motorist with the flat tire, you drove by on the highway; or the hurried student who stumbled and dropped his books in front of you in the hallway. How do you respond to these situations? Do you stop and take the time from you busy schedule to help that person along, and let that person know that they are important in this world; or perhaps you simply walk on by like you never noticed, portraying the idea that the unfortunate fellow isn’t worthy of your help?

On the Radio, the Television, and even in most major newspapers, someone always seems to be putting down our concern for the earth, our fellowman, even our own health. No one seems to know how to solve this constant downgrading of values. The lack of Christian principles in our public schools has hidden the answers to these and other problems which continue to plague our country.

Students are no longer taught to have sympathy for those misfortunate souls who must humble themselves and accept charity to keep from hungry. Even such once popular childhood lessons as that of the “Good Samaritan” have been denied to our children, our nation’s most valuable national resource. If you have ever waited in traffic for hours with a dysfunctional automobile you know first-hand the importance of this and other moral lessons.

Even when our country was young its leaders knew the importance of the Christian faith in public affairs. Our first President, George Washington, in his farewell address emphasized the importance of religion and morality and warned against subversion from these “pillars of human happiness.” He went on the say that “reason and experience both forbid us to expect, that national morality can prevail in exclusion of religious principle.” How a wise a prediction this is. Just look around you, one of America’s biggest sports role models is on trial for he dismemberment of his ex-wife, another is about to be released from prison where has served time since his recent rape conviction. Many citizen have bought fire arms to protect themselves and their property. Even our children feel the need to carry weapons to school to be safe, or to be just plain cool.

The opponents of the acceptance of prayer in schools may appear to have valid support for their beliefs, however, one can easily recognize their distorted logic. To begin with, many argue that prayer in school is a violation of Separation of Church and State. This term does not even exist in our nation’s Constitution, nor in the Bill of Rights. It was a phrase coined by Thomas Jefferson who described it as follows. “Separation of Church and State is to be like a one way wall protecting the church from taxation and corruption by the government, but in no way releasing the church from taxation and corruption by the government, but in no way releasing the government from the influence and practices of the Church.”

Others argue that the practicing of Christianity in our public schools is an invasion of minority rights, however, the rights of the minority only exist up until they begin to condemn the rights of the majority. For
example, if a minority group such as the Amish, oppose the practice of traveling in an automobile, should the Federal Government thus not allow automobiles on public highways because it is in disagreement with the beliefs of certain minority groups. Of course not. The majority of the inhabitants of the United States enjoy the comfort and ease of traveling our nation’s highways in automobiles. Why should the Majority suffer because a few organized groups of citizens disagree with our society’s norms.

Finally, the opposition is contradictory in one of its most widely accepted theories. They claim that it is a violation of the first amendment to allow Christian principles to be taught in this country’s public schools. They further insist that our school systems should not influence a students belief in any religion whatsoever. To contradict this argument to school could simply make the students presence during prayer times optional.

Judge for yourselves. What harm has ever come from attempting to live a righteous life? Is it really all that horrible to be exposed to people who truly love the Lord. How awful is it to have our children taught such time honored moral values as, “Thou Shall Not Kill” and all of the other nine commandments? I ask you as parents, or future parents, what would you rather say to your precious children? “Remember Leviticus 18:1-23, the Bible forbids sexual immorality” or, “here is a dollar, remember to use a condom.” In the word of our sixteenth President Abraham Lincoln, “The philosophy of the school room in one generation will be the philosophy of government in the next.” Look around you and witness first hand the truth of this statement. We must all recognize the wisdom and guidance in our forefather’s words, and bring the Lord back into our lives and prayer back into the schools. Above all, pray for this change.

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“The thesis was poorly substantiated but the writing had few spelling and grammar errors. Arguments were based on opinion and religious beliefs.”

The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“punctuation few”
“possessives--few”
“I don’t accept the students’ [sic] arguments, but the paper is written in a logical fashion.”

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P
While I think many would argue this paper is an ‘HP,’ I would not. I strongly disagree with its premises, but I concede the writer is proficient. I would say that arguing for school prayer is a ‘straw man’ technique, and that the writer confuses the Constitutional principle of separation of church and state with explicit First Amendment prohibitions against establishment of religion. Also, Christianity is not claimed as a foundational principle anywhere in the Constitution or Declaration. I also note marginal control of surface features.

Group-Specific Essay #51 (Essay 253 of Sample)

RESEARCH PAPER: WOMEN AND WORK
OUTLINE

THESIS: Working women in the new society should dismantle the myths and misconceptions about themselves in the workplace from the past to the present, and in the men’s views.

I. Women and work are the topic of men’s views.
   A. Working women from the past are the people who had no rights and less freedom.
      1. Women usually support the family and raise children.
      2. Women usually stay close to home and have no rights to work outside the home.
   B. Working women do not resolve the myths and misconceptions about themselves in the men’s world.

II. Working women in the workplace are the topic of major research from the past.
   A. Women and work are the number of minorities in the workforce
      1. Women have less chances and opportunities to prove their skill.
      2. Women’s work is considered peripheral to and of less value than men’s.
   B. In the men’s views, women are the people who could not qualify for the job they carry.
      1. Women and their temperaments are too unstable for occupational ability in the workplace.
      2. Women are the people who have no order and lack knowledge.
   C. Working women have fewer benefits than men.
      1. Women use to work for long hours and get low pay.
      2. Women and their experience are more prejudiced against and face discrimination.

III. Women and work are the topic of major research in the workplace today.
   A. Working women still arrive and enter the labor force in droves.
      1. Women as mothers can support the family beside working outside the home.
      2. Women get past the myths and move forward to the labor force in drove.
B. Women’s knowledge and their willingness to share in the workforce make them more successful and perform better.
   1. Working women are the people who can manage their job.
   2. Working women are the people who can promote their work.
C. Women either in the female or male traditional jobs have fewer benefits than men.
   1. Working women have the most unemployment.
   2. Working women still get lower pay than men.

IV. Women and work are the topic of major research in the future.
   A. Working women have a powerful status in the workplace.
   B. Working women destroy the deep biggest myths about themselves and make it equal in the workforce.
   C. Women can transform the face of the society into the human world rights and equality.

Working women in the world today have become most representative for 45 percent of the labor force in droves, and are the people who play the most major profession in the work place (Field 96-98). The overriding concern with the question for most expectant American workers, particularly the male—is haven’t women finally made it in the “postfeminist” world? Soon after this concern, we will look at back and put the question to the people who are skeptical about how women made an improvement. Actually, to be successful in the workplace, women properly struggle for their rights and equalities. Therefore, working women in the new society should dismantle the myths and misconceptions about themselves in the workplace from the past to the present, and in the men’s views.

At first, looking back from the previous days, we have seen women under the men’s views are the people who have no rights and less freedom. In their inclinations men have made women less preeminent. In the study of Culture and History, Paul Moen analyzes gender roles are varies and more across the culture overtime (135-150). By using a perfect perspective picture in the agriculture society, Moen proves that women usually stay close to home, working in the field and rearing their children while men have considerably more freedom (135-150). Even in the other source of speaking for women’s rights, Beth Paulin says, “women always work of course, but in the agriculture and the pre-industrial, the family was the basic producing unit of the society, and the work of women was an integral part of this unit”(Marshall 1-36). He continues, “It is means that married women’s work in the family generally involved cloth production and sewing, the making of soap and bedding, the growing of food in family plots, and service to the family as slaves, cooks, and nurses”(Marshall 1-36). Is this opinion true? To answer this question, Santrock in his book of the Life-Span Development traces another piece of evidence and proves it. Because of the household operations have become more efficient and the family size has become more important, working
women as mothers do not have the right to work outside the home (Santrock, Life-Span 263-265). Children are also one of the other reasons that make women have no rights to work outside the home and stay close at home. In the men’s views, women as mothers usually have the better affect on the children. So it is certainly worse for the children whose mothers as women are working outside the home actually receive less attention than those children whose mothers are not employed (Santrock 263-265).

What causes problems when comparing the work of women still does not resolve the myths and misconception about themselves in the men’s world? According to men’s and women’s sex-roles, Nina L. Colwill states,” Sex-roles are rooted in our history; they’re defined by our religions; they’re delineated by our legal systems; They’re reinforced by our cultures” (Colwill 97-114). With the logic behind our sex-roles, people believe and treat sex-roles as moral lessons such as: ladies must go first; women belong in home, eg.,. Unintentionally, this moral lesson has become a symbol of discrimination between men and women, and reveals women who are socially define as the nurturer, supportive care give at home does not have power like men although the sex-roles have varied from time to time, and from place to place. Women’s sex-roles and all things feminine have been seen as inferior and as some race barriers to men (99).

What about women in the workplace? Do they have the right place to stand? The answers have proved working women in the workplace are the people who have no rights and no equality. Based on the findings of a consequence of prejudice and discrimination in the United States, women are one of the three groups of America’s largest minorities in the workplace although there are more women than men in the society (Hebding 270). The evidence also affirms the causes of this happening because of work, income and education. However, people do believe that women have less chances and opportunities to prove their skill because they have less education and training than men; Though they do have the same education as men in the average of 12 years plus (Hebding 271). In the relationship between work training and education, Nina L. Colwill in her research analyzes the people’s views about what women played in the workplace were some kind of work which performed a job of isolation and low mobility (99).

Consequently, other problems for working women in the workplace are how to go through the process of proving their competency to qualify for the job they carry if their boss is a professional male. Beth Milwid narrates a woman’s story who she has interviewed for her book reports, “The part for women to gain credibility is a stereotypes” (42). She also states, “Between the years of 1960-1970s stereotypes were the first thing in the workplace use to against women” (42). In the men thought, they assume that women [female] generalization temperaments, by nature, are “too emotional,” “too nice,” or “too unstable” for business; and they believe
those subject such as finance, electronics, plumbing are inherently beyond the scope of a woman’s intelligence (44). Beth Milwid also mentions about the work of understanding in other women’s story. Any women in the workplace acknowledge that any professional’s [female] first tasks are having to prove their ability to control and handle their job, and try to fit in. But, the difference as the women perceive is – if the male co-workers were expected to succeed, and the females were expected to fail. Because the works challenges were something far more demandingly and women couldn’t perform it perfectly (40). Therefore, in the men’s thoughts, women are the people who lack of knowledge and have no order in their jobs.

Women do work hard in the society. As wives, as mothers, and as members of the paid work force, they never have any good benefits for themselves. Daniel E. Hebding and Leronard Glick in their book analyze that working women beside doing the works at home usually work almost 100 hours a week, or an average of more than 14 hours a day, 7 days a week (150). As in the survey by the Office of Technology Assessment 1985, the authors also find that American women workers in general receive lower salaries, have a smaller chance of promotion than men in every employment sector, and at comparable levels of experience (271). Today, working women are still a topic of major research in the workplace. People concern with the questions of how women try to prove themselves and move forward into the labor force in droves? In the speaking of women’s improvement, Santrock states, “The changing role of women is the evident in the increasing rate of women’s employment” (481). It is means women today can support their family beside working outside the home. With the new effect from the new society, the task demands between men and women are vastly different and have changed from those of the past. Men are no longer gain appreciable advantages from superior physical strength, no longer a breadwinner’s performing instrumental duties outside the home; and women are no longer confine solely to bearing, rearing children and performing domestic tasks (481). So like its say, today working women have arrived and they are now represent 45 percent of the labor force in droves (Field 96). With the growing number of women in the workplace and the increasing women’s production; Anne Field in her article states, “They’d rather have a high pressure job offering advancement than a low-pressure one with a little chance for promotion” (96). As a member of working women, she also says, “The more women who work and hold positions of influence, the better of we’ll all be” (97). It means, our women- like men- the personal satisfaction was an important reason for working and we can get a profound sense of fulfillment from functioning as productive workers in the workplace.

Although working women have tried to work hard and prove themselves as professionals in the workplace, they couldn’t earn as much money and as many benefits than men in the same jobs. According to Anne Field,
women in the traditional jobs such as teaching, nursing, and others occupations still make just only 72 cents for every dollar a man earns (97). On the other hand, women are never going to achieve full equality with men until they reach parity in their pay checks. Also, Dawn Bradley Berry in her book of *Equal Compensation For Women* says, “Presently, women are paid 74 cents for every dollar a man is paid – and women are earned as much as men in only seven of 33 major occupations after graduation” (36). So it is estimates that women would not be at an even footing with men until the year of 1999 although today women’s contributions account for almost half of those workers in the workplace. But overall, women are the group of people stills have the largest unemployment than men.

Finally, because the changing work force is an important component of the economy, then the women’s movements in the workplace are more easily successful. With this change, women will establish the equal job opportunities, equal pay for equal work, and Equal Rights Amendment (ERA) to the United States Constitution (Layng A6). The success of the women’s movement can dismantle the myths and misconceptions about themselves that if women were not unable to support themselves economically and liberation in other areas of life, they would not be able to achieve it easily (Layng A6). And so, what we can expect in the future is letting women have a chance for success and establishing such ideas as enhanced opportunities, career aspirations, supportive services, and contributing to the participation of women in our economy’s work force to help transform the face of our society into the human’s world right and equality.

WORKS CITED


The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

This student has demonstrated problems with inappropriate word usage, poor sentence structure and frequently incoherent writing. Generalizations were not well-supported although there is evidence of effort to reference “authorities.” There was some good information cited but it wasn’t well-organized and integrated. The outline was not well-organized. Quotations have errors in them.
Is English the second language for this student?

The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“I only skimmed the last few pages of this paper. It is unusable. The sentences don’t make sense and the logic is arguable. Student has obviously spent a lot of time on the research, but can’t express results.”

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

This writer is not proficient because this writer has no sense of language, no clear thesis, no organization of supporting material. Why is this written in MLA Documentation style?
In a word, this essay is solypsic--that is, it is a very writerly piece, with so much static and misperception between writer and reader as to be incomprehensible.

Group-Specific Essay #52 (Essay 131 of Sample)

How would you feel about living thirty or forty years past retirement? I would think that anyone would love to live that long. I think that it would be great to see my great-grandchildren grow up. However, what would be the consequences to us all by living longer? According to Peter Gorner and Robert Kotulak, “Extending life raises fears as well as hope.” My grandmother, Flora Mae Sloan, stated “I’m outliving my children, it’s supposed to be the other way around.” When we think of living longer, we have to think about all of the problems this can cause. Some examples are making enough money to live a few decades longer, or living years longer with a debilitating disease such as Alzheimer’s Disease. I believe that this country is having enough problems trying to figure out these problems to day.
Richard Cutler believes that, “What we really need is to declare a war on aging like we did on cancer” (Gomer). Why help people live longer when we haven’t found cures for diseases like AIDS, cancer, and Alzheimers Disease. The money that is being spent on stopping the aging process should be spent, in my opinion, on children who suffer from these life-threatening diseases. I feel that children should have a chance at life. Cutler goes on the say, “Our goal should be to cure aging” (Gomer). I’m worried that scientist are concentrating more on curing the aging process and not giving diseases the research time that is needed for curing them.

Believing that we should declare war on aging scares a lot of people including the Government planners. The Editors of Notre Dame Magazine ask, “At what age will retirement come --70? 80? with four or more additional decades of leisure living? And what will those extra years do to retirement accounts, Social Security or companies that want to move out senior executives to make room for younger employees advancing up the ladder?” (Promise 33). Government planners are worried about what living longer will do to the nation’s economic status. People like my grandmother are worried about what they are to do with their time if they live decades longer. Flora Mae Sloan stated that she had enough problems figuring out what she could do with her time. She didn’t want to try to figure it out for another ten years or longer. She stated, “I’m 75 years old, I don’t want to live forever.” I don’t want to live forever either. Scientists need to think about what we, as a nation, want to happen to us.

Robert Butler of Mt. Sinai Hospital in New York states, “Let your mind run wild” (Gomer). I believe that he wants us, as individuals, to think about what would happen if through gene manipulations, we end up having teenage crisis go on for twenty years or the “terrible twos” go on for fifteen years. I believe that this would be devistating for all mankind. When my daughter went through the “terrible twos” stage, she kicked and screamed all of the time because she didn’t get her way. I was very relieved when she grew out of that stage. Even the most patient of moms wouldn’t be able to handle the “terrible twos” stage for as long as fifteen years. I also believe that if my daughter was still going through the “terrible twos” stage, I would break one of my most precious promises that I made to her when she was born, that I would never abuse her like I was abused.

Cutler states that the institute on aging’s real goal, is going to reduce the cost of the elderly on the young working class. It’s an economic incentive” (Gomer). I disagree that living longer is going to make it easier on the young. My grandmother stated that she was tired of the young paying for her medical cost. She also stated that her Social Security only paid for part of the cost of her medical bills. She said, “The young are taking up the slack.” I believe that people living longer can mean that they are healthier and can work longer. With the population growth as bad as it is today, then the cost to the younger population would be higher than the cost of taking care of the elderly now. I don’t believe that the young could find
employment, at least gainful employment. All of the good paying jobs would be taken by the elderly. I believe that companies would think of the high cost to them if they had to hire someone young to do a job that a healthy older person already had and is more than capable of still doing. Then we would have to think about the elderly who decide not to work. With the threat of major over population in this country in a few years, then I believe the population problem would be a lot worse if scientists cured aging. I don't know how scientists believe that this is not going to be a problem. They need to answer the questions of how we are to support millions and millions of people who decide to quit working or those who can't work because of job shortages. What would be the economic consequences on pension funds, the Social Security system, and the other resources like Medicaid and Medicare?

Stopping or slowing down the aging process may be a lot closer than we believe it is. Researchers have discovered genes "that play a role in reversing aging, depending on whether the genes are switched on or off," according to Gorner. Scientists are able to turn genes on or off like a light switch. If they are on then the body uses them and if they are off then the body doesn't use them. Thomas Maciag of the American Red Cross, has caused the life span of skin to double. He turned off a gene called interleukin 1. Interleukin 1 is a protein in the body and if it is not regulated properly, it can cause the skin to age very rapidly. It can also cause the aging process of skin to slow down (Gorner). Scientists believe that if they keep working with the different genes in the body, they will be able to stop or slow down the aging process.

I don't think that they have thought about what we, as individuals, want to happen to us in our lives. My grandmother is one of the most important people in my life. I hate the thought of her passing away, but death is a part of life. We can't afford to pay for people to live forever. I, for one, want to give my child a chance to know what it is like to have a job that she wants. I don't want to think of only myself, I want to think of others. We, as human beings, need to start thinking of others more often.

**Works Cited**


The Allied Health Professor's Responses:
RATING: NP

The essay lacked a clearly stated thesis with organized, cohesive support. It was predominately based on opinion, and opinions were repeated throughout. There were several spelling and grammar errors.
(Although the paper was not very substantive, it was at least readable which is a relief after the paper I just read.

The Education Transfer Professor's Responses:
RATING: P

paragraphing
spelling--few
capitalization--few
thought process clear, although author's personal stand seemed to switch from beginning of paper to the end.

The English Professor's Responses:
RATING: HP

I believe this is a "B to A-" paper, primarily because of the provocative way the argument is delivered and attributed. This is despite my philosophical belief that life "per se" is precious and that aging presents as many opportunities for growth as youth. However, despite a handful of surface errors, and inconsistent documentation (Why MLA style here?) it is thoughtful. And if it is MLA, page reference is omitted in most places. Student may not have been taught fine distinctions in documentation style. This student is proficient, however[sic] first person references are inappropriate.

Group-Specific Essay #53 (Essay 216 of Sample)

The American Disabilities Act: Why was it necessary, and how was it implemented?

Americans with disabilities are now protected by the law so that they may have as many opportunities in life as do others without disabilities. The 1990 signing of the American Disabilities Act by, then, President Bush provided a beginning, a legal victory, which in reality was the turning point for people with disabilities.

In retrospect one can see how the rights of a disabled person were denied in the past. However heavily these issues may have weighed on the minds of the disabled it seemed, in the past, nothing was done to help them. It took many years for something to be done about this injustice, but finally improvements were made.

The ADA, at it's acceptance in 1990, was an extension of Title V of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973. The difference, between Title V and the A.D.A. was that the American Disabilities Act extended protection to disabled persons working in the private sector as well as persons working in the governmental sector. The previous law, Title V, was exclusive to federal facilities and the private companies that were hired through federal contracts. It is not difficult to imagine the personal pride experienced by those individuals that once lobbied for changes to meet the needs of the handicapable person after this victory was won.
Today the majority of private buildings, and corporately owned buildings, have undergone reconstruction to include widened doorways, lowered restroom seats, and audio or visual compensation where applicable. Other improvements are sidewalks that recede at the cross walk which are now as commonly seen as handicap parking is. Although often one may notice the reserved parking places may be occupied by one for whom it was not intended. These provisions, however, do exist which is a great improvement.

These adjustments, by which the good intentions of the general public might be measured, are without a doubt a good example of progress. As for the unresolved problems of, who will fix it, what is broken, and how it will be fixed, the answers remain difficult to find.

On one hand rests the controversy that is in regard to employment, and on the other hand are the complaints that are heard demanding accessability to all areas a person may wish to go. Enforcing the laws addressing employment is the responsibility of the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, (E.E.O.C.). The Department of Justice, (D.O.J.), is the body that oversees the laws relative to all physically restrictive barriers which add to the hardship realized daily in the life of the physically disadvantaged individual. While the questions of what is broken, and who can fix it seem to have been well addressed, the last question is more difficult to answer. At the core of the problem, who fixes it, the problem is not so much who will fix it, but how can the transition be made with the least amount of problems.

At some point during each courtroom battle, the head butting line, common to Title V and now to the A.D.A., is found when the debate hinges on the question, “What is fair”. “Despite the disabled communities best efforts to make the A.D.A.’s language clear and prescriptive, the inturpritation of this law is still confusing. This confusion has been commented on by many. Title V states, “that undue hardship line wormed it’s way into the A.D.A. too. But, say lobbyist, the A.D.A. would not have passed without it so they compromised in order to have a law at all” (Johnson, 101). In reference to access McKee cites “as long as the adjustments would not cause undue burden for the business or fundamentally alter the nature of the firms product or service” (19). These statements in the law are vague and confusing to many. There is also a likewise unclear inclusion concerning the law’s employment rights. The A.D.A. states “as long as the candidate is able to perform the essential functions of the job and the accomadations cause no undue hardship to the company (McKee 19). One can see that the abstraction is similar to the statement found concerning building structure changes. The party for which the laws were written, however, appear to instead leave loop holes for employers instead of protecting the disabled person.

All things considered the apparent slant in the A.D.A. law is not without due cause. Neither is it all about the monies needed to accomplish the necessary tasks. One acknowledges that it is regretably normal for human
beings with no physical shortcomings to take for granted even the smallest part of their daily routine. There are, simply, negative side effects of structures that are not openly visible to them.

One may think that the law seems to have been written on behalf of employers because they are apparently under attack. The longtime standard work place environment has now become scrutinized. When one considers the language of the laws more carefully one can see that the laws were written in a way so that the potential employer of handicapped persons can gradually make the changes called for under the new laws. It seems that all but maybe a few active complaints regarding these changes will, in time, be documented as an issue no longer needing to be addressed. Companies are realizing an increase in the positive effect found by complying with the regulations set forth by the A.D.A. Businesses gain foremost with the contributions provided by a more self reliant, fulfilled, responsible employee who before may not have been productive in any way.

Incentives are increasing for companies hiring the physically disadvantaged. There are tax adjustments which encourage this specific type of hiring. These adjustments also refer to physical modifications such as hired interpreters or other assistance the employee may require. If the employee is a veteran the employer further benefits. The uphill struggle is unveiling the fact that there is more to gain than there is to lose for business. It should be noted that had the wording of the A.D.A. law been as clear as it should have been the changes made may have occurred more readily. The incentives have made the changes more justifiable to business. It has made the consumption of a bitter pill possible. The passage of the law means, "this isn't just an experiment" (McKee Quoted Weaver, 1993). While the Equal Employment Opportunities Commission channels it's legal strategies that serve to chip away at the vague language of the A.D.A., the Department of Justice does the same for accessibility concerns of the disabled.

The resistance of these changes assumes many forms. This battle is much like one fought during the early ninties when the D.O.J. waged legal rounds with opponents of fair housing, such as the religious industry, and resturants. The emphasis for architectural changes appears most recently to be focused on the theatre business. In the attempt to incorporate the concerns of manufactures, designers, contractors, building officials, owners, and users of these various facilities the Justice Department has forged ahead using a framework known as the A.D.A.A.G. This is a guideline for buildings set forth by the government. "Now, a congressional mandate has deprived A.D.A.A.G. of the benefit of the consesus process" (Conner 1993, 58). Of course this was no surprise to those with experience in politics. This is merely an example of how legal battles are fought. The adversaries to these changes have never faced such problems like being denied access to buildings in their daily lives. "The courts are not without bias in this situation" says Patricia Wright, governmental affairs for the
Disability Rights Education and Defense Fund, Johnson (quoted Wright, 1993).

One can only hope that these battles still being fought will soon end and that these disabled citizens will, finally, be completely protected and served instead hindered by the law.

References

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“There were many spelling errors, grammar errors, inappropriate usage errors and incomplete sentences. The paper was not well-organized or cohesive.”

The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

wordy
unclear sentences
possessives
verb agreement
Did not deal with “why needed”
More appropriately titled--problems--criticisms of implementation

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

“This student is conscientious and literal--documenting everything in sight to cover the basics. Yet, this student has basic language problems unresolved since ENG 101.”

Group-Specific Essay #54 (Essay 206 of Sample)

No Smoking In Public Places
An old proverb says, your rights and your freedoms stop at the end of my nose. Norman Daniels evaluates this proverb by saying, “In the case of environmental tobacco smoke, your smoke obviously transgresses the privacy of my nasal passages. Just as my bodily integrity is violated by a punch in the nose, so too is it threatened by toxins and carcinogens others place in the environment... Just as I have a right claim against those who would punch me in the nose, so too I have one against those who would batter my lungs. (Daniels, 1985, p.151).
The argument for restricting smoking in public places is questioned by the rights of the nonsmokers to breathe clean air, and the smokers right not to pollute the atmosphere that others must breathe. The surgeon general has rightly concluded, "The right of smokers to smoke ends where their behavior affects the health and well-being of others;...the choice to smoke cannot interfere with the non-smoker’s right to breathe air free of tobacco smoke" (U.S. DHHS 1986, p xi2) The nonsmoker merely wishes to breathe unpolluted air.

Environmental tobacco smoke is blamed for poor indoor air quality and its associated effects primarily because it is one of the few indoor pollutants that we can see and smell. Tobacco smoke can be an irritant to some people. Sore eyes, nose irritation, coughing, itching skin, nausea, headaches and respiratory problems often are reactions caused by inhaling this smoke. Poor air circulation may be a factor; however, tobacco smoke has been a major contributing factor to air quality problems inside a building. If the American people want to improve the air quality of the environment around them and place restrictions on factories that produce air pollutants why not improve the air quality inside as well as outside. Placing restriction on smoking in public places can improve the air quality inside a building and eliminate health problems.

The most effective way to prevent non-smokers from being exposed to second hand smoke is simply to legislate bans or restrictions on smoking in public places. Everyone deserves the right to a healthy and smoke-free environment.

The separation of smokers and non-smokers within the same area does not eliminate the problem for non-smokers exposure to polluted smoke filled air. If a designated room is not available for smokers to light up then a total ban on smoking in the whole area might be required. "Such bans or restrictions on smoking in public places are now in force in four-fifths of the American states and in forty-seven countries of the world.” (Roemer 1986, p.17)

Carol Browner, head of the Environmental Protection Agency, said the EPA “firmly believes that the scientific evidence is sufficient to warrant actions to protect non-smokers from involuntary exposure to secondhand smoke.” The EPA also has issued a report that found secondhand smoke was killing an estimated 3,000 non-smokers a year and causing other health problems. (Green, 1994)

The Clinton administration endorsed legislation to ban or restrict smoking in virtually all commercial and public building because of the health hazard to non-smokers, especially children. (Green) The bill would require all non-residential buildings used or visited by at least 10 people a week would have specially ventilated smoking areas. (Green)

It seems only important to diminish smoking in certain places, for instances: (Goodin, 1989, p.87)
1. Confined spaces that are poorly ventilated and increase the effects of environmental tobacco smoke, both on the health and on the comfort of nonsmokers in the area.
2. Places where the service is provided directly by the government; example, city buses, public jails, or where it operates under license for the government: example, hotels, restaurants, airlines.
3. Places where people cannot reasonably be expected to avoid going.

To take public smoking a step further, the state of California signed into law the nation’s toughest anti-tobacco legislation banning smoking in restaurants, bowling alleys and billiard halls as well as work places with more than five employees. (Moreno, 1994) The law went into effect January 1, 1995 for California’s law for a Smoke-Free Work place. Fines will range from $100 for a first offense to $500 for a third within a year. The California Division of Occupational Safety and Hazard can fine businesses $7,000. (Moreno)

Smokers will still be able to light up in bars, bingo halls and card rooms at least until January 1, 1997. That is if they comply with federal ventilation standard that are to be in place by that time. If not, bars and halls will also be smoke-free. (Moreno)

Tobacco giant Philip Morris USA campaigned to reverse Proposition 188, and return California restaurants and other businesses the right to permit smoking in ventilated sections. “We’ve got a business interest in ensuring that our customer are treated equitably,” said David Laufer, a Philip Morris executive in Sacramento. (Morain, 1994)

Proposition 188, that Morris is trying to reverse would erase local smoking bans from Los Angeles to Redding, and prevent cities from regulating tobacco use in the future. The initiative also collides head-on with a bill passed by the legislature that would be the nation’s strongest statewide smoking restrictions.” (Morain)

The Tobacco Industry said the bill the Clinton Administration was preparing way too extreme and not justified by scientific evidence. They also stated that the bill does not consider the rights and interests of the 50 million adult Americans who smoke. (Green)

In defense for smoke environments, an argument is raised by Machan’s (1986) libertarian lament, “tracing the right to allow smoking to rights of private property. Few people now advocate banning smoking in people’s homes. Why do they believe that they are entitled to non-smoking sections in restaurants or aeroplanes, when these do not belong to them?....Whoever owns the area... ought to have the right to say whether smoking is permitted in it.” (p. 51) In other words if you own it, you make the rules
To refute his view, if you open your establishment to the public, and profit from trade with the public, then the public has a right to determine certain conditions upon which you may conduct that trade (Berle, 1952, p. 943).

To minimize the harm to nonsmokers through passive smoking, legislation banning smoking in confined areas will have to be contained, especially those which people have no choice to go elsewhere. The rights of nonsmokers should prevail over the right of smokers to light up and smoke. Nonsmokers should have the right to tell smokers that their airspace is being violated and that they must share their airspace. The preference of non-smokers and smokers should be respected, but when these conflict, the preference of the non-smoker should be respected.

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“Content is not well-organized. Grammar, mechanics, and usage errors are common.”

The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

“well written”

“few mechanical errors”

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: HP

This is truly excellent, and though there is no references page included here, I recognize correct APA Documentation.
This is a particularly good synthesis of attribution and analysis--the writing is clear and persuasive.

Group-Specific Essay #55 (Essay 086 of Sample)

Should Capital Punishment be Abolished?

Capital Punishment is a very serious punishment for any criminal, know matter what they might have done. Capital punishment is the execution of a person. The main ways of execution are the gas chamber, electocution, and lethal injection.

In the gas chamber, a person is strapped down to a chair and hydrogen cyanide is pumped into the chamber. Hydrogen cyanide is a very deadly gas to humans and it causes the person to go into cardiac arrest.

Another way of execution is electrocution. “The prisoner is securely fastened to a chair by his chest groin, arms and legs to prevent violent
movements and to keep the electrodes in place. These are moistened copper terminals attached to one calf and a band around the head. "Jolts" of four to eight amperes at voltages between 500 and 2000 volts are applied for half a minute at a time. "(Baumgart 22) After these volts have passed through the persons body, a doctor enters the room to see if the prisoner is dead or if he or she needs another dose of electricity.

The last, of the most common ways of execution, is lethal injection. The way that this is done is by injecting the prisoner with three injections. The first injection renders the prisoner unconscious. The second shot is given to stop the prisoners breathing. Finally a shot is given to stop the heart from beating, hence making the prisoner legally dead.

Now is this a crime that a man or women should receive for committing a serious crime? Many people are split on this question, but it does need to be answered. As a survey on death row sentence in Capital Punishment, between 1977 and 1992 their were 4,361 people in America on death row. Only 188 people or Four point three percent were actually executed. This is a very stunning discovery. If a person is sentenced to death row, why isn’t their execution cared out. If we decide that the death penalty should be used, then we need to use it and stop letting the criminal keep appealing.

People say that the death penalty is cruel and unusual. The means of execution are to primitive for our society. People look at the concept that nobody should suffer in today’s society, but they do not think about the people that died or was brutally murdered because of these criminals. Should the people that commit these crimes be put to death or should they be sentenced to life in prison?

One of the first thing that people think of when somebody is sentenced to death is if they really are guilty. This is a major concern and in the “New York Times” on 9 Jan. 1995 that a Congressional staff report cited that 52 recent cases in which defendants had barely escaped execution. The only reason why they escaped was because the civil right lawyers and friends were able to step in and find evidence that the people were innocent. Now this was a close case in the legal system and it should not happen if the court hearings are true and to the point. Now this is one reason why people think that the capital punishment should be abolished.

However, what if the criminal is guilty, without a doubt. They take their punishment and normally live until they die of old age. If a person is on death row they can appeal their case as many times as they want. People have been known to wait until the day before the date with the electric chair and call an appeal. Every time this happens a person has to go back to the court and got through another trial. This not only causes the person to live longer, it also causes our tax money to pay for their court, lawyer, and a place to stay with three meals a day. Now is this right for the people of the United States to pay for the criminals of the States. On the flip side of paying the prisoner, which is worse, knowing that you are going to die
or living a life of confinement. This question will probably never be answered.

Prolife groups strongly disagree with the death penalty. They think that every person, no matter what the crime, should not deserve to die. This information comes from Kassie Humpkey, a friend of mine that is for prolife. She also says that she believes that people can be turned around so they can be released back into society.

However, what kind of shape are the people that have to suffer for the criminals doing. I have had a personal experience with the justice system and how people feel. Two of my friends were in a drunk driving accident and one of them died. The mother of the deceased want my mother to write to the judge to say that they want the person that did this to her son to go to jail for life. The sad part about this that she knew the boy that did it to her son and they were like family. This only shows that to ease the mind people want the most serve punishment they can get.

Another reason why people want the death penalty is because they believe that it will bring the crime rate down. In a study dating to the 1960’s, there were 82 convicted felons that were put to death because of murders. In that same year the study was taken place there were 7,020 criminal homicides. A decade later, there were 56 executions and the number of homicides were 9,140. The most recent survey taken was in 1980 when there was 22,958 criminal homicides and out of those homicides there were only a hand full of people executed, most are spending their life in prison. (Baumgart 67) This is a factual statistic and people wonder if the homicides would drop if the death penalty were to be used more frequently.

At the same time people argue that this fear of the death penalty does not work. “It is a fact that a large percentage of murders are committed in the heat of passion, when the murderer is not in a position to reason; fear of the law plays no part at all. (Osborne)

In Conclusion, people can see the pros and cons of the death penalty. This is a very highly discussed issue and we need to find a solution with it. I believe that we should use the death penalty more and more.I do believe that people can be scared by the law. I think that people are getting out of control and we are starting to run wild around the law. People are finding loop holes in the system and saying that they are insane. I say that we need to put a stop on this and cut down. Capital punishment may not be the right answer, but we can try.

I am also sick of letting the state use my money to pay for appeals and paying for a man to live, when he/she is guilty of murder. I do not care which punishment is worse, life in prison or the chair, but I do think if someone was killed on purpose, that I know, then I would want that person to die.

The other thing that I forgot to mention is that The Bible agrees with me. In Genesis 9:8 it states, “If anyone sheds the blood of a man, by man shall his blood be shed. This is only one example of many that are in The Bible.
So if it was up to me, capital punishment would be used as often as possible, but only for homicides.

Work Cited
The Bible. Revised Standard Version.

The Allied Health Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

“This paper was not organized in a ‘logical, cohesive manner.’ Generalizations were not substantiated with documented support. There were many grammar, spelling, usage, and mechanical errors.”

The Education Transfer Professor’s Responses:
RATING: P

possessives
capitalizations
some very unclear sentences
conclusion doesn’t follow the references quoted

The English Professor’s Responses:
RATING: NP

This is a weak essay. There is no thesis here; a thesis cannot be a question. There is very poor control of pronoun agreement, and the personal pronoun needed is “who,” not “that.”
More importantly, the final justification for capital punishment, when it is finally announced, is “The Bible.” This is not a good source--Old Testament: “An eye for an eye”; New Testament: “Vengeance is mine.” Also, arguments and supporting details are left hanging--there is uncontextualized attribution, but little or no analysis.
Conclusions

In Chapter Two, I was looking for “consistency in evaluation criteria and judgments” (Blues 3) among fourteen faculty reading the same calibration essays. I found such consistency in that there was a clearly predominant rating to six of seven essays (See Chapter Two, Figure 1). Chapter Three shows in much greater detail a consensus of judgments among the same respondents, here arranged in five interdisciplinary groups (See Chapter Three, Figures 4-8). They rated and responded in writing to eleven additional randomly selected “group-specific” essays. Chapter Three shows complete agreement among group members to twelve of 55 essays, or 20% of the sample. Respondents reached partial agreement, in which a majority of readers agreed on a rating, in an additional 30 of 55 cases, more than half the group-specific essays. I conclude, then, that the respondents reached consensus, either a complete agreement or partial agreement, in 70% of their ratings.

Because I had asked teachers to provide paper grades for calibration and group-specific essays, I am able to determine whether a consensus existed between the respondents and the teachers. However, I must assume that teachers’ reported grades are accurate, and I must disregard the minuses and pluses the teachers seemed so fond of, along with the “low” and “marginal” passes a few of the respondents assigned consistently. The latter provide too many additional variables. To review, the data I report in Chapter Two predict the absence of a respondent-teacher consensus in Chapter Three by showing
agreement between respondents and teachers in only three of seven cases, or less than half the time. Chapter Three adds a considerable amount of data to support Chapter Two, showing a clear agreement between respondents and teachers in only 20 of 55 group-specific responses. Adding Chapter Two’s data to Chapter Three’s, I arrive at a consensus between respondents and teachers in 23 of 58 reported cases [teachers failed to report paper grades for four group-specific essays]. Therefore, I am forced to conclude that reaching an agreement less than 50% of the time is no consensus at all.

An inquisitive reader might ask, “The fourteen respondents succeeded in reaching a consensus among themselves but failed in reaching a consensus with the English teachers?” I am afraid so. Furthermore, in all cases in which disagreement occurred but one, the teachers’ grades were significantly higher than the respondents’ ratings. These discrepancies point to a number of possible explanations. First, there are differing criteria between English professors and their colleagues in other disciplines. But this generalization seems to contradict the consistency located in the preceding chapters, in which I show that (1) faculty across the disciplines, including English, mentioned style, purpose, grammar, and audience consistently in defining and describing writing proficiency; (2) faculty returned to these terms consistently as they responded to a random sample of student essays; and (3) faculty added similar terms consistently as they elaborated on their reasons for assigning ratings. These included thesis statement, substantive generalizations, punctuation, and sentence structure, among others. Second, and more likely, the English teachers’ grades are more subjective than the respondents’. After all, they knew the students whose papers they were evaluating.
The next question, of course, is "Whose grades or ratings do we value, then, the respondents’ or the teachers’?" Additional data indicate we should value the responses of an interdisciplinary group of professors more than a single English teacher in a majority of cases. First, we must remember that each essay was read by three respondents, except for Group One, comprised of only a philosopher and a psychologist. Adding the 22 responses from Group One to 33 from each of the four additional groups, we reach a total of 154 ratings. Of these 154, respondents assigned 49 HPs, 55 Ps, and 50 NPs. If we call an HP the equivalent of an A or B, a P the equivalent of a C, and an NP a D or E, roughly a third--30%-- of our students earned As and Bs, a third--36%-- earned Cs, and a third--34%--earned Ds and Es. The grade distribution based on respondents’ ratings seems fair and reasonable.

The teachers’ grades tell a different story. Again, if we use only data in Chapter Three, they assigned As and Bs in 37 of 51 cases, or 72% of the time. Eleven essays received Cs, or 22% of the essays, and 6% earned Ds (1) and Es (2). If we read all essays in this chapter, clearly, 72% of them are not highly proficient. According to teachers’ grades for both calibration and group-specific essays, 94% of JCC’s ENG 102 students were proficient or above in the Spring of 1995. According to respondents’ ratings and comments, that number was about 66%. I hate to disappoint the English Program, but it simply makes sense to side with the respondents.

As for consistency among respondents’ evaluation criteria, I have shown—first by summarizing and paraphrasing their reasons for assigning a rating in Chapter Two, and second by presenting the “raw data” in Chapter Three—that respondents used the same language throughout the workshop to support their ratings. Their language included the
same Key Proficiency Indicators that emerged in their freewritings (see Chapter One), along with the additional terms that they used throughout Chapter Two (See “Conclusions”). Some respondents, particularly in Allied Health, borrowed terms from the 102 Syllabus we reviewed early in the workshop. The term “substantive generalizations” comes to mind. Then they incorporated these terms throughout their responses.

In a future workshop, the English Program might want to ask for clarification, or provide clarification, for a few terms. These include “grammar,” “mechanics,” “grammar mechanics,” “a case review,” “contextualized attributions,” “uncontextualized attributions,” and lede, an Anglo-Saxon term for leader or nation, that one respondent used instead of introduction. Clearly, respondents from other disciplines are not as aware of or concerned about rules for punctuation as the English faculty. Commas are missing in their writing in places where most English teachers would put them: after long introductory phrases, before the third item in a series, before a coordinating conjunction that joins two independent clauses. An interdisciplinary gathering to discuss punctuation seems warranted if our faculty agree that consistent punctuation should be stressed in all classes involving writing.
CHAPTER FOUR

Moving Forward a Decade Later:
General Conclusions and Recommendations

“Early 1980’s”: Another segment of faculty knows some terminology, recognizes the value of students writing in disciplines, assigns anywhere from a little to a lot, but hasn’t applied writing-to-learn techniques nor writing as revision to their own teaching.

Chris Thaiss. “Reliving the History of WAC--Every Day.” 11

The freewriting exercise I “assigned” at the beginning of the 102 Assessment Workshop indicated the language fourteen respondents from different disciplines used to define and describe proficient writing. From this exercise, I was able to locate four global characteristics used by more than 50% of the respondents: style, grammar, audience, and purpose. Along with twenty-one additional characteristics, each used by at least one respondent, I compiled a list of twenty-five “key proficiency indicators” that I suggested we would need to include in a local definition of writing proficiency. I argued that before we set out to evaluate our students’ work in a local constructivist model of program assessment, we needed a sense of what we were looking for. The freewriting exercise indicated much more than I anticipated. Not only did a common vocabulary emerge, despite much confusion of terms, but the freewritings suggested faculty’s attitudes about their own writing, their notions of correctness, and knowledge or lack of knowledge of process approaches to writing, including using writing to discover ideas.
Most faculty respondents missed the point of the freewriting exercise, not only failing to freewrite, but questioning an exercise that seemed to reinforce bad writing and apologizing for listing characteristics rather than writing sentences and paragraphs, when listing was actually one of their options. These responses suggest little knowledge of process approaches to writing and using writing to invent material. Even though most respondents produced something other than freewriting, they lost their focus on occasion, commenting on how to dispel myths that students bring to writing classes and advising other teachers to employ reading aloud to help students hear errors in their work. Like our students when they are denied opportunities to revise and edit their work, my colleagues produced spelling errors, comma splices, unidiomatic expressions, and mixed metaphors.

As I suggested in Chapter One, all faculty need to allow students the opportunity to produce multiple drafts before we assign grades or make generalizations about their lack of ability. When time does not allow for multiple drafts, such as essay examinations, students should be encouraged to write one draft carefully and take time to make small-scale revisions, edit, and proofread their work before submitting it. The grammar handbook required in all ENG 101 and 102 classes should be at least an optional text in all courses across the curriculum that include writing. Finally, to combat further the prevalent notion that writing correctly matters only in writing classes, the Writing Program should sponsor a series of workshops to discuss the confusion and misuse of terms that appeared in the freewritings. For example, regionalisms are not really grammatical concerns but matters of style. Grammar is one area of writing; mechanics is another. "Grammar mechanics" do not exist. The word *grammar* ends in *ar* not *er*. If we are going to use these terms in discussing writing with students, we can help the students
much more by using them correctly and consistently in all classes. No wonder, as Lucille McCarthy has reported, students see little connection between the writing assigned in writing classes and similar assignments in other courses. No wonder, their solution is to try to write for a given teacher in each context, as if we all have completely different expectations ("A Stranger" 233-264).

In Chapter Two, I analyzed the same respondents’ explanations of and ratings for seven randomly selected “calibration essays” to determine the “degree of consistency in evaluation criteria and judgments” among the faculty readers (Blues 2). Also, I wanted to determine the degree to which JCC respondents returned to their freewriting definitions and descriptions of writing proficiency as they explained their ratings in writing. JCC faculty representing three disciplines reached substantial agreement, specifically a predominant reading in six of seven cases. I concluded that JCC faculty are as capable of evaluating student writing as UK faculty, although they should be encouraged to employ process approaches to writing in their courses, including using writing to discover ideas. Again, much work awaits us in the area of clarifying terms. Respondents did return to their freewriting definitions in evaluating essays, but a large number of new terms appeared in their written evaluations, suggesting that the twenty-five “key proficiency indicators” I located in their freewritings are incomplete. According to their evaluations in Chapter Two, the respondents were familiar with run-on sentences, sentence fragments, and subject/verb agreement errors. They pointed out papers that lacked organization, included punctuation errors, and demonstrated problems with sentence structure. While the Natural Science respondents rarely referred to the global characteristics context, audience, and purpose, these characteristics did appear in the
responses of the Social Science and Humanities faculty. The terms *thesis, thesis statement*, or *thesis and support* were the most commonly used terms not listed with the “key proficiency indicators” in Chapter One. These indicate that faculty understand that proficient academic writing is thesis-driven. Of course, follow-up discussion might address the characteristics of an effective thesis statement. Quite a few of the thesis statements in the sample fail to meet the criteria included in most handbooks. They are too broad, too factual, or too vague. Here are a few examples from Chapter Three: “I have a strong belief that in today’s society young people need to reach out to the elderly”; “Very few works of art, even among the greatest and most widely appreciated masterpieces, have entered into the general consciousness and become, in certain sense, the spiritual possession of the whole world, Leonardo da Vinci’s The Last Supper is among the exact few that stands supreme among them,” and “The reflections in mirrors in the Scarlet Letter serve an important purpose: To reveal what is hidden within.” These are acceptable tentative thesis statements, but they should have been revised before they appeared in final drafts submitted for a grade.

As a way of checking the validity of the generalizations I made in Chapter Two, I divided 55 remaining essays among the respondents, whom I had arranged without their knowledge in five interdisciplinary groups. Each group member read eleven “group-specific essays” in addition to the seven “calibration essays,” rated the essays, and provided written reasons for assigning a rating. My analysis of these data comprises Chapter Three. I found that respondents reached complete agreement in twelve of 55 essays, or 20% of the sample. They reached partial agreement, in which a majority of readers agreed on a rating, in an additional 30 cases, or about 50%. Thus, the respondents
reached a consensus, either a complete agreement or partial agreement, in 70% of their ratings.

Chapter Two showed agreement between respondents and teachers in three of seven cases, and Chapter Three showed clear agreement in only 20 of 55 group-specific responses. So, an agreement between respondents and teachers was reached in 23 of 58 reported cases [teachers failed to report grades for four group-specific essays]. Because 23 of 58 is less than 50%, I concluded that no consensus was reached between respondents and teachers. In all cases but one, the teachers’ grades were significantly higher than respondents’ grades. Possible explanations for these inconsistencies are that (1) there are differing criteria between Writing professors and their colleagues in other disciplines and (2) the Writing teachers’ grades were more subjective than the respondents’. The second seems more likely because the teachers knew the students they were evaluating, and the first explanation seems to contradict the consistency I located in Chapters One and Two. Of course, a third possibility is a combination of one and two.

After participating in, designing, and evaluating an assessment project, I am convinced of the benefits of qualitative assessment in a culture that increasingly “truncates and supplants genuine, holistic writing and undermines progress” (Shafer 242). At JCC, we are using the Collegiate Assessment of Academic Proficiency (CAAP) test to demonstrate that our students at the end of ENG 102 and 105 have met the objectives of our 101-102 sequence. It is a test that clearly “reduce[s] composition to quantitative terms [and] becomes more disquieting and deleterious” (Shafer 238). We know it is far from an accurate reading of our students’ abilities. We teach process and multiple drafts in our classes, yet the CAAP requires a student to compose two arguments in 40 minutes. There
is simply no way “to allow writing to evolve, to develop, and to grow as a living organism” (238). In 2002, the DT Campus Writing Program’s CAAP data showed that a third of our students were rated “weak” and 55% of the total of 379, or 207, were rated “adequate.” According to CAAP, 90% of our students were C-level and below. Only 10% of the students were rated “competent.” I believe we come out looking a little letter in my study, despite the grade inflation and confusion of terms.

Along with answering “yes” to a question about whether an interdisciplinary group of community college faculty can reach a consensus definition of writing proficiency and apply that definition to evaluating a random sample of ENG 102 essays, I suggest that the faculty who require writing in courses across the curriculum continue to do so. They expressed clearly understandable ideas about what proficient college writing looks like, were able to locate its characteristics in a sample of essays, and noticed when these characteristics were missing. Certainly, the respondents who participated in this study demonstrated the ability to assign writing and to evaluate it in accordance with their own and their disciplines’ expectations. Likewise, the commonality of experience provided in the workshop allows us to examine further our disciplinary similarities and distinctions. Although all Natural Science respondents have since left the College, all Social Science respondents and five of six Humanities respondents remain. I recommend, then, that the Writing Program invite them and others to repeat this study with more recent data. A committee could divide its tasks—collecting data, analyzing data, reporting data—among its members and reach conclusions and report them in a more timely manner than I was able to achieve herein. Data such as those produced in this study are invaluable to a Writing Program that understands the advantages of a qualitative strand in an ongoing
assessment project. At JCC we already have quantitative data provided by ACT's analysis of student essays produced in the mandatory Collegiate Assessment of Academic Proficiency (CAAP) test, which we introduced several years after I held my assessment workshop. As Brian Huot suggests, "if we want to evaluate the efficacy of a WAC program, it is more sensitive to use writing being written by students in that program, rather than using writing samples produced specifically for [program] evaluation" ("Beyond Accountability" 72). Eventually, we might abandon the expensive ($10.50 per student, I believe) and unwieldy quantitative strand altogether in favor of an equally efficacious local model of assessment such as the one I present herein.

One of the advantages of local studies like this is that the teacher-researcher has long-term access to the essays that students wrote. More “objective” assessment instruments performed by people outside his or her institution allow the teacher-researcher or Program Coordinator very little time to analyze the data. Soon after—even immediately after—the students write them, the essays are sent into cyberspace or boxed up and FedExed to some uninvolved group of readers. The essays vanish, and boxes of data return months later separated from the essays. At this point, students are long gone and cannot benefit or learn from the results.

Another advantage of this type of study is that it is constructivist in nature. By that term, WAC scholars like Brian Huot, Kathleen Blake Yancey, Lucille McCarthy, and Edward White who advocate “learning-based assessment,” mean that the student essays are samples of work that require the students, their teachers, and the faculty respondents to become “stakeholders” in creating and implementing the assessment project. Here, the students became stakeholders in the project; they had something at stake, namely a grade,
when they wrote the essays. I think we can assume that all ENG 102 students want to pass the course. Some of them may have even realized that by permitting me to publish their work they had the reputation of JCC’s Writing Program in their hands. In contrast, essays tacked on at the end of the semester are less reliable in that students do not really need to take them seriously. At JCC, we are encouraged to give the CAAP test significant weight when we determine course grades (five to ten percent of the course grade); however, some faculty object so completely to its product-bias that they disregard it, giving students credit simply for showing up to take it. Because tests must be returned to the Assessment Office by the end of finals week, very few of us have time to evaluate them properly.

The respondents are stakeholders as well, because they are evaluating their own students’ or future students’ writing, and in evaluating their writing, they are also evaluating the College’s Writing Program. The teacher-researcher is evaluating the respondents’ writing, so, again, the respondents are stakeholders. So is the Writing Program. We know that our colleagues will be evaluating the fruits of our labor, our students’ work. These colleagues will communicate their assessment experiences with others at home in their own disciplines. I fear that one member of Allied Health, the Communications Professor, and the Professor from Business left this workshop with a bad taste in their mouths that was not from the coffee. I was shocked, as well as colleagues in the study, at several of the essays passing as end-of-semester 102 papers: one- to two-page book reports on The Turn of the Screw, with no sources, handwritten; short two-page “arguments” that respondents agreed lacked “substantive generalizations” and contained weak thesis statements; a handwritten, unimaginative essay called
“Imagination” that, though mechanically competent, lacked imagination. As they left the workshop, two other respondents, an English teacher and the Sociologist, energetically discussed whether a quantitative evaluation of writing was even possible. The Sociologist thought it was, so long as respondents knew nothing about the students who produced the essays. The English teacher “strongly suggested” that the Sociologist read Joseph Williams’ “The Phenomenology of Error,” which posits error as a “flawed transaction between reader and writer, signaling something about readers’ and writers’ expectations.” It forces teachers into “self-reflective considerations of the act of evaluating itself” (Gleason 68). I wondered if that exchange made a positive or negative impression on the Sociologist. Not only had she objected to the freewriting exercise that seemed to encourage lack of revision and editing, faults she saw in her students’ writing, but now her belief in scientific objectivity was being challenged. She seemed genuinely bewildered as she left the workshop, shaking her head.

A third advantage of a local, constructivist model of assessment is that it allows for the data to be used more easily in a formative way to locate areas that need program attention and improvement. Again, expensive studies by outside sources like ACT often deprive a program of this opportunity. Two areas that clearly needed work a decade ago in JCC’s Program were documentation and grade inflation. As for documentation, the English Professor in Group Five was right to raise so many objections about APA and MLA styles and their inconsistent use among the students in the sample. Throughout Chapters Two and Three, we encountered MLA Works Cited pages in essays with no in-text citations, MLA in-text citations in essays that contained no Works Cited pages. We wondered about MLA Documentation in essays on topics in the Social Sciences. Why
weren’t we requiring APA Documentation for these essays? I suspect that these inconsistencies still exist, perhaps even more now with all the sources available via computer and the Internet and the myriad rules for citing and listing them. I recommend that we writing teachers spend more time in class with the documentation sections of the handbook required of all 101 and 102 classes.

In 1993 at UK, Tom Blues found significant grade inflation among the graduate students and part-time lecturers who taught ENG 102. My study indicates possible grade inflation in 43% of the essays. I arrived at this conclusion by counting the number of essays from the entire sample that received higher grades from the teacher than the respondents. 25 essays comprise this group. 25 inflated essay grades over 58 total essays for which teachers supplied grades equal 43%. I consider this percentage significant, and if it had not taken me a decade to reach this conclusion, I certainly would have addressed it when I served as Department Chair from 1993 until 1999. Subsequent studies should determine the possibility of grade inflation as well, keeping in mind that some inflation is to be expected because teachers’ grades are understandably based on a student’s effort, improvement over previous work, and attitude, as well as the essay itself.

Recent research shows that we have a national problem with grade inflation. An article from the Washington Post reports that the administration at Princeton is trying to limit the number of A’s a professor may assign (Dobbs A03). At a local high school, a teacher I know was told to assign passing grades to three of six students she had failed for sleeping in class consistently. If grade inflation still exists at JCC—and I suspect it does—I hope we can avoid such measures.
One disadvantage of this study, and Blues’ study before it, is that one cannot determine how many of the essays contained plagiarized passages. We know that teachers assigned A’s and B’s 71% of the time at JCC. How many of these essays, in fact, should have failed? These days we have computer programs that check for plagiarism. Ten years ago, the only way I could think of to check for it was to ask students to photocopy their sources and submit them to the Program along with their essays. I decided to live with this shortcoming, knowing I would require even more department paper and cause even more chaos at the library’s photocopying machines, if I made such a request. But now, with advances in technology, checking a paper for plagiarism is as simple as typing a few suspicious phrases. The computer does the work. Therefore, future researchers might want to run a quick plagiarism check on all essays they select.

Another weakness, as the English professor in Group Five pointed out, is that essays are difficult to evaluate without knowing the teacher’s assignment. He makes a good point. I suggest that if our Program replicates this study—perhaps as a future measure of Institutional Effectiveness—we should ask teachers to submit copies of their end-of-semester assignments along with their students’ essays. I am sure many of the essays in this sample were marked down because respondents assumed they would be reading research papers that were arguments. The ENG 102 course description they had reviewed led them to this assumption. If they had had access to the teachers’ assignments, their ratings on essays that clearly did not fit the 102 course description might have been different.
Final Thoughts

Ten years ago, I began this dissertation as a teacher-researcher claiming that local community colleges were well-suited to housing Writing Across the Curriculum programs because in order for WAC to work the faculty must form a community. Indeed, the word community is included in the phrase community college. Because the faculty of community colleges are more closely knit than the faculty of research institutions—at JCC the Humanities faculty still share office space with the Social Sciences—communication among our faculty would be more convenient, more prolific and more enduring. Likewise, our students, increasingly more underprepared than those at four-year institutions, would benefit greatly from courses that required writing and teachers from all areas of the curriculum who collaborated on assignments stressing commonalities rather than differences in the writing they required.

Coincidentally, as WAC itself split into related factions—Language Across the Curriculum (LAC), Electronic Communication Across the Curriculum (ECAC), and Assessment—I became the head of our Downtown Campus Writing Program and added the broader, program perspective to my original teacherly concerns. I began to see how WAC might benefit our Writing Program, especially as mandates from SACS and our administration pushed us toward accountability and assessment. I realized that Blues was a couple years ahead of his time in initiating his own “very preliminary step toward establishing an undergraduate writing assessment mechanism...to discover whether
students who complete the ENG 101-102 sequence...have developed the reading-
thinking-writing skills adequate to the University’s academic environment” (1).

Now that these two perspectives have converged in a ten-year dissertation project, I see
no need to alter either my initial argument expressed in the introduction to this
dissertation or the argument implied in Chapters One, Two, and Three—that there are
great benefits to be gained in initiating local, constructivist models of assessment that not
only satisfy accrediting agencies but serve a formative function as well, in suggesting
where a program might focus its attention on improvement. If we are mandated—or
choose—to use an outside testing agency like ACT as a measure of Institutional
Effectiveness, I suggest that we initiate our own qualitative strand by producing a local
study such as this one every five years to determine if the quantitative and qualitative
data correlate. If they do, then we might consider saving the College money and rely
solely on a periodic qualitative evaluation. This, along with rejuvenating a dying WAC
Committee and Program, would not only prove us accountable but silence our critics, or
at least allow them to speak to us directly and in a formative way. We would also provide
for our students the best general education, one based on a commonality of experience
and consistently applied pedagogy and use of language among the members of its
interdisciplinary community.
At the turn of the century, colleges and schools found themselves faced with the dilemma of educating students in specialized areas, due to urbanization and industrialization, and, at the same time, promoting social cohesiveness which formed the basis of urban-industrial America's stability (Russell 135). A “general education” became the means by which educators enforced community. Russell writes that although there were three approaches to “general education,” language instruction and essay examinations became the common denominators for reformers to “weave together the disparate threads of an increasingly complex polity” (136). The Cooperation Movement, because of an increasing need for remediation, eventually abandoned the essay examination in favor of “more efficient” objective tests.


4 It is interesting to note the similarities between these competencies and the recommendations of a committee of the Association of American Colleges, who in 1985 studied “widespread skepticism about the quality of higher education” and the “loss of integrity in the bachelor’s degree” (White Developing 3). This report suggested in all courses an emphasis on inquiry, abstract logical thought, and literacy, defined as “writing, reading, speaking, and listening” (White 3).

REFERENCES


McCartan, Anne M. “Helping Students Learn.” EDRS (198810: EJ379127.


Raines, Helon H. “Is There a Writing Program in This College? Two Hundred and Thirty-Six Schools Respond.” College Composition and Communication. 41 (1990): 151-65.

Rose, Mike. “The Language of Exclusion: Writing Instruction at the University.”


Shafer, Gregory. “Standardized Testing and the College Composition Instructor.”


Smithson, Isaiah and Paul Sorrentino. Writing Across the Curriculum: An Assessment.”

Soven, Margot. “The Future of Writing Across the Curriculum: Will There Be One?”


University of Kentucky Community College System General Education Report, 1992.


Young, Art. Writing Across and Against the Curriculum.” College Composition and Communication. 54 (2003): 473-85.
APPENDIX A

FACULTY READER EVALUATION FORM

NAME__________________________

PAPER NUMBER (Student's Social Security Number)__________________________

RATING: HP_____ P_____ NP_____

REASONS FOR RATING:
APPENDIX B

Jefferson Community College - Downtown Campus

ENGLISH 101 SYLLABUS

I. Course Objectives:

See "Introductory Statement" of English 101 Competencies. Also see "Applications" of English 101 Competencies.

English 101 teaches students the conventions of academic writing. Students will analyze and respond to written texts; generate and revise their own texts so that the finished products are clear, well organized, and grammatically correct; and begin to develop library and research skills. Students will learn to make rhetorical decisions concerning audience, tone, purpose, thesis support and organization as they compose academic essays. Emphasis will be placed on critical thinking and skills of analysis and persuasion.

Course Competencies:
1. read a text and identify its essential elements
2. work with library research tools and resources
3. analyze information, form and articulate a thesis about it
4. support a thesis with sound reasoning and sufficient, relevant evidence, including personal experience.
5. develop a persuasive essay with reference to audience requirements
6. arrange ideas and information using a variety of modes
7. prepare an outline
8. make effective transitions from one stage to the next
9. summarize, paraphrase, and quote from a text
10. document sources honestly and correctly, both informally and formally

II. write in clear, functional standard English—syntactically coherent, grammatically, and mechanically correct
12. revise, edit, and proofread effectively

Applications:
1. Students will read a variety of texts (essays, newspaper articles, short stories, for example) by both professional and student writers.
2. Students will write essays in response to a variety of writing situations that allow them to experiment with various kinds of thesis and support.
3. Students will write summaries and paraphrases.
4. Students will be introduced to revision at the global, sentence, and word levels.
5. Students will attend a library orientation and complete a library exercise.

See English 101 Competencies for detailed explanations of objectives.

II. Recommended Texts:

A. A Basic Handbook of Writing Skills by Pam Besser
B. A College Dictionary
C. A Reader of Your Choice
APPENDIX B

III. Course Requirements:

A. Writing Sample:
On the first day the teacher should ask the students to write a theme on a topic chosen by
the instructor. This theme should serve to determine whether the students should remain in
English 101. The decision should be made immediately since "drop/add" closely follows the
first day of class. For the student whose writing is inadequate for English 101, the teacher
may suggest the following:

1. transfer to English 101 with lab (ENC 092)
2. transfer to ENC 090
3. transfer to ENC 091
4. intensive tutoring in the Study Skills Center or the Writing Center

B. Number of Themes:
Students should write the equivalent of six to eight themes (exclusive of writing sample).
Variations of approaches should be submitted to the English Program Coordinator for
approval. Revision of drafts should be in addition to the above, unless the revision is
structured in such a way as to be a different cognitive exercise and not merely editing
and correcting surface errors. It is departmental policy to give a post-test to all
English 101 students the 14th week of each semester and the 13th weekend for weekend
classes. This is a mandatory writing experience although teachers have discretion in
weighing the post-test results.

C. Length of Themes:
Length of themes should be left to the discretion of the instructor. Themes of about 500
words seem to be the minimum.

D. Types of Themes:
A teacher may use any creative approach he or she feels comfortable with, as long as the
objectives of ENG 101 are achieved. Every paper should reflect careful planning and
organization, making use of formal or informal outlines.

Included in the essays assigned should be a formally documented paper. This paper should
be assigned concurrently with or immediately after the library orientation.

In all writing assignments, logical thinking, thesis formulation, outlining, and logical
development of the paper should be stressed.

E. Library Unit:
To prepare students for the library project in English 101 and the research paper in English
102, students will be given training in the library. The teacher must make arrangements
with the librarian, who will be responsible for the introduction to the library.

F. Dictionary Usage:
Instructors should consider teaching a unit on dictionary usage if time permits.
APPENDIX B

G. Sequence of instruction:
Sequence of instruction is left to the instructor. However, it is important to move the students to more complex, analytical and abstract levels of thought and writing as the semester goes along so that they are prepared for argument in 102.

IV. Policies and Procedures:

A. Syllabi:
At the beginning of the semester, ENG 101 instructors must distribute written statements of course requirements, policies and procedures. The twelve objectives listed above must be included in the student's syllabus.

B. Evaluations:
At least 75% of a student's grade should be based upon evaluation of themes he/she has submitted. (See Section III. "Course Requirements.") Students must complete all assigned themes in order to pass the course.

C. Themes:
1. By assigning a theme well in advance, the instructor will provide students with ample opportunity to plan for and write an effective paper.
2. Themes should be returned within three (3) class periods after being submitted. Certainly, one assigned paper should be returned before students write another.
3. Students should receive consistent detailed feedback on each writing assignment so that they are not surprised by the post-test or by their final grades.
4. To practice writing under pressure and to provide a check on possible plagiarism, students should have in-class writing experience.
5. Written hand-outs detailing teachers' expectations for assignments should be given.
6. Copies of syllabi and writing assignments must be placed on file with the English Program Coordinator. It is also helpful to place these on file with the Writing Center so that the staff can give better help to students.
APPENDIX B

Detailed Description of English 101 Competencies

Introductory Statement

English 101 teaches students the conventions of academic writing. Students will analyze and respond to written texts; generate and revise their own texts so that the finished products are clear, well organized, and grammatically correct; and begin to develop library and research skills. Students will learn to make rhetorical decisions concerning audience, tone, purpose, thesis support and organization as they compose academic essays. Emphasis will be placed on critical thinking and skills of analysis and persuasion.

Course Competencies

Upon completion of English 101, the student can successfully accomplish these reading, writing, and researching activities:

1. read a text and identify its essential elements

   Concepts:
   
   Is the thesis implied or stated?
   Where is the thesis placed within the text?
   What rhetorical pattern(s) provides the text’s organization?
   How logical is the text’s organizational structure?
   What question does the thesis answer?
   What question(s) does it raise?
   What is an issue?
   What kinds of evidence are used to support the thesis?
   How logical (reasonable) is the support?
   What, if any, weaknesses in reasoning (logical fallacies) exist?

2. work with library research tools and resources

   Concepts:
   
   What is research?
   How do writers begin researching a topic?
   How does one determine whether a topic is too broad or too narrow?
   What resources are available?
   What is a periodical index and how is it used?
   How does one determine the scope of a periodical index?
   What is the difference between a biography and a bibliography?
   How do professional journals and magazines differ?
   How does one determine how the library stores research materials?
   How is the microfiche machine used? Microfilm?
   Why would anyone use the Library of Congress Subject Headings?
   How are computer data bases used? Advantages? Disadvantages?
   What is a call number? Where is it? Why is it there?
APPENDIX B

3. analyze information, form and articulate a thesis about it

Concepts:
How well does the writer support the thesis?
Is the support for the thesis sufficient? appropriate?
How credible is the writer?
What is a “critical” (evaluative) thesis?
(See also concepts for competency #1)

4. support a thesis with sound reasoning and sufficient, relevant evidence, including personal experience

Concepts:
What is a thesis?
How does a writer generate a thesis?
What strategies are available to support a thesis (personal experience, illustration, anecdote, expert testimony, logic, facts, statistics)?
Why must a writer support a thesis?
How does a writer decide what kinds/how much support is needed to develop a thesis?

5. develop a persuasive essay with reference to audience requirements (providing essential information, defining issues and terms, for example)

Concepts:
What kinds of claims are appropriate for theses in a persuasive essay?
What is the relationship between argument and persuasion?
What tone is appropriate for a persuasive essay?
What must readers be told to understand/accept the argument being made?
How does a writer analyze readers’ needs/expectations?
Is the issue timely/appropriate?
What kinds/how much support will be appropriate/effective for these particular readers?

6. arrange ideas and information using a variety of modes

Concepts:
What modes are available as writing tools?
What are the conventions of each?
Why are some (causation, definition, comparison, argumentation) emphasized more than others?
How does writing as a process lend itself to a writer’s discovery of appropriate, logical (effective?) modes?

7. prepare an outline

Concepts:
What is the difference between a formal and informal outline?
What is a topical outline?
What is a sentence outline?
APPENDIX B

8. make effective transitions from one stage to the next

Concepts:

What are transitions?
Why do writers use them?
How are they used?
How does one decide which transition is appropriate?
How many transitions are needed in a piece of writing?
What is a one-sentence transitional paragraph?

9. summarize, paraphrase, and quote from a text

Concepts:

What is a summary? A paraphrase? A quotation?
How do they differ?
Why choose one over another form?
How do writers blend summary, paraphrase, and quotation into a piece of writing?

10. document sources honestly and correctly, both informally and formally

Concepts:

Why do academic writers document?
How do attribution and formal documentation differ?
What determines the kind of documentation used? What is plagiarism?
How do writers avoid plagiarism?
What is MLA (or APA) documentation?
What are MLA (or APA) requirements for documenting sources within an essay?
What are requirements for a Works Cited (or References) page?

11. write in clear, functional standard English—syntactically coherent, grammatically, and mechanically correct

Concepts:

How can we identify clarity in writing?
What is standard English?
What is coherence?
How do writers achieve coherence in a piece of writing?
What can writers do to correct syntax, grammar, and mechanical errors in writing?

12. revise, edit, and proofread effectively

Concepts:

What is revision? Editing? Proofreading?
How do these reviewing behaviors differ?
At what stage of the writing process does each behavior occur?
What tools are needed to revise, edit, and proofread?
What role might computers and/or peer readers play in the reviewing process?
APPENDIX B

Applications

1. Students will read a variety of texts (essays, newspaper articles, short stories, for example) by both professional and student writers.

   They will identify and evaluate the following elements: thesis; major supporting ideas; types of evidence; rhetorical patterns; introduction, body, and conclusion paragraphs; audience considerations; documentation practices (both informal and MLA); quotation, paraphrase, and summary.

   They will practice paraphrasing thesis statements in the texts they read.

   They will write summaries of texts they read.

   They will develop their own critical theses about the texts they read.

   They will complete formal sentence outlines of texts they read.

2. Students will write essays in response to a variety of writing situations that allow them to experiment with various kinds of theses and support.

   At least one essay will include informal documentation.

   At least one essay will include formal MLA (or APA) documentation and a Works Cited (or References) page (one or two library sources).

   At least one essay will support an argumentative thesis.

   All essays will require formal or informal outlines.

   Students will practice writing a variety of introductory and concluding strategies.

3. Students will write summaries and paraphrases.

4. Students will be introduced to revision at the global, sentence, and word levels.

   Students will revise, edit, and proofread their own and their classmates' drafts, assuming responsibility for the correctness of their final drafts.

   Students will practice strategies for achieving unity and completeness in their essays.

5. Students will attend a library orientation and complete a library exercise.
English 102 Objectives:

Writing:

The purpose of English 102 is to provide study and practice in response to written texts. This course will provide instruction in library research methods and instruction in the conventions of academic writing. During the semester, students learn how to determine the appropriate information, tone, and organization for a particular audience in a particular writing situation. Students who complete English 102 should be capable of writing for an academic audience (i.e. Humanities, Social Science, and Natural Science) a formal essay that incorporates a variety of rhetorical strategies, particularly persuasion/argumentation, into a substantive piece of discourse which includes documentation. Students who have completed English 102 should already have the following skills:

1. to use the various forms of invention (brainstorming, free-writing, problem solving, etc.) as well as note taking.
2. to write clear, restricted, unified thesis statements.
3. to use a thesis to generate generalizations that are substantive.
4. to provide documented support for these generalizations.
5. to use a thesis as the basis for organizing information for an academic essay.
6. to use effectively one or more prewriting techniques (outlining, mapping, etc.) for organizing ideas and developing a plan for writing an essay.
7. to produce a piece of discourse that has substantive content, using a method of development appropriate for the audience and the rhetorical situation (a long research project, or several short research projects).
8. to use logical thinking to clarify positions, to make comparisons, to identify/understand cause-effect to analyze, and to synthesize information.
9. to produce a logical, cohesive piece of discourse that smoothly integrates research.
10. to use a variety of styles and levels of diction appropriate for the audience and the rhetorical situation.
11. to understand the difference between revising and editing, and to be able to revise at the discourse level, at the paragraph level, and at the sentence level as well as to be able to edit for grammatical and mechanical errors.
12. to write substantive prose that is completely free of common errors that interfere with the readability of the discourse (appropriate sentence structure free of boundary errors, comma splices, subject-verb disagreement, noun-pronoun disagreement, and incorrect or faulty modification).
APPENDIX B

Criteria For Grading--English 102

English 102 is a skills-development course in which students are required to attain a high degree of competency in their writing including an understanding of the rules and conventions of a particular discipline. Therefore, upon completion of English 102 the student should be able to produce an essay that satisfies the following criteria:

1. the essay must have a thesis that organizes the discourse in a logical, cohesive manner.
2. the essay must have substantive generalizations with adequate and substantive documented support.
3. the essay must have the tone and level of diction consistent with and appropriate for the specific audience within the given rhetorical situation.
4. the essay must illustrate that the student has the ability to analyze, interpret, evaluate, and respond appropriately to the rhetorical context given.
5. the essay must be free to sentence-boundary errors, subject-verb or noun-pronoun agreement errors, comma errors, modification errors, spelling errors, or other grammar, mechanics, and usage errors which interfere with the readability of the discourse.
APPENDIX C

To: Professor Rick Butsch
From: Tom Blues
Date: 29 July 1994
Subject: ENG 101-102 Assessment Project

Here is a copy of the report I sent to Lou Swift a few days ago, long after the reading session itself has slipped into the dim recesses of time and memory. I apologize for taking ages to put this thing together; it took much longer than I thought it would to work through all the comments and to try to catalogue them in some reasonably sensible--albeit admittedly unscientific--order.

I hope you find this information useful. Lou and I would welcome your comments on this report.

---

While I was working on the new prospectus, Carol Learner at JCC sent me a note expressing interest in the results of this study. While I thought that, if for no other reason than to allow me to view that there might be an easier solution to my prospects problem, this study in an attempt to begin answering some of the questions I posed in the former prospectus, what I want to know is if I duplicate the study at JCC and expand it on it is the approach I am 

While I was working on the new prospectus, Carol Learner at JCC sent me a note expressing interest in the results of this study. While I thought that, if for no other reason than to allow me to view that there might be an easier solution to my prospects problem, this study in an attempt to begin answering some of the questions I posed in the former prospectus, what I want to know is if I duplicate the study at JCC and expand it on if is the approach I am 

While I was working on the new prospectus, Carol Learner at JCC sent me a note expressing interest in the results of this study. While I thought that, if for no other reason than to allow me to view that there might be an easier solution to my prospects problem, this study in an attempt to begin answering some of the questions I posed in the former prospectus, what I want to know is if I duplicate the study at JCC and expand it on if is the approach I am 

While I was working on the new prospectus, Carol Learner at JCC sent me a note expressing interest in the results of this study. While I thought that, if for no other reason than to allow me to view that there might be an easier solution to my prospects problem, this study in an attempt to begin answering some of the questions I posed in the former prospectus, what I want to know is if I duplicate the study at JCC and expand it on if is the approach I am 

While I was working on the new prospectus, Carol Learner at JCC sent me a note expressing interest in the results of this study. While I thought that, if for no other reason than to allow me to view that there might be an easier solution to my prospects problem, this study in an attempt to begin answering some of the questions I posed in the former prospectus, what I want to know is if I duplicate the study at JCC and expand it on if is the approach I am 

While I was working on the new prospectus, Carol Learner at JCC sent me a note expressing interest in the results of this study. While I thought that, if for no other reason than to allow me to view that there might be an easier solution to my prospects problem, this study in an attempt to begin answering some of the questions I poses in the former prospectus, what I want to know is if I duplicate the study at JCC and expand it on if is the approach I am
APPENDIX C

To: Louis J. Swift
Dean of Undergraduate Studies

From: Thomas Blues
Writing Program Director
Department of English

Date: 26 July 1994

Subject: ENG 101-102 Assessment Project

(Note: The following report contains information, some of it updated, originally presented in the preliminary project report dated 23 May 1993 and sent to the Office of Planning and Assessment with a copy to your office.)

BACKGROUND

As a very preliminary step toward establishing an undergraduate writing assessment mechanism, you and I developed a procedure by which we could gain some idea of how the University faculty--describes-writing proficiency (is there a consensus across the disciplines?) and how the judgments of Department of English writing instructors (comprised almost entirely of teaching assistants and part-time instructors) compare to those of the larger faculty community. More specifically, we wanted to see if the judgments of Department of English writing instructors (comprised almost entirely of teaching assistants and part-time instructors) compare to those of the larger faculty community. More specifically, we wanted to discover whether students who complete the ENG 101-102 sequence--the only all-University course requirement--have developed the reading-thinking-writing skills adequate to the University's academic environment. We thought that the project described and reported on here would mark a starting point, providing useful guidance for subsequent steps.

On 17 May 1993 thirty faculty members representing a wide range of disciplines and drawn from the Lexington and Community Colleges campuses (See Appendix I) Faculty Readers and Group Assignments) assembled at Carthage House to read essays written by students in ENG 102, spring semester 1993. The essays were products of the course's last major writing assignment. Students in ninety sections turned in the last essay in duplicate; instructors submitted the duplicates to the Writing Program Office, where two essays were selected at random from each section (ninety sections: 180 essays), and seven additional "calibration" essays were selected at random from the total number of sections. The essays were identified by social security numbers, not by names. After the essays were selected, instructors were asked to provide the Writing Program with the grade for each essay and with the course grade for the author of each essay. I asked each instructor to do this for all essays submitted.
APPENDIX C

Readers were organized into ten groups of three (Appendix I). The members of each group read twenty-five essays: eighteen specific to the group, seven "calibration" essays read by all thirty readers. The purpose of the calibration essays was to determine the extent to which all readers agreed on their ratings and on their criteria of judgment.

By way of orientation, readers were asked to read the detailed syllabus descriptions of ENG 101 and 102. They were informed that the essay assignment required students to write a proposal—either a practical proposal addressing some local or immediate problem, or a policy proposal setting forth a broad plan addressed to a major social, economic, or political problem affecting the public welfare. Whether of a practical or policy nature, the subject matter and approach were to include significant ethical considerations. Faculty readers were also informed that students were expected to make their arguments accessible to the audience and to provide all necessary information and definitions.

Readers were not asked to grade the essays, but to judge them non-proficient, proficient, or highly proficient, and to cite reasons. They were specifically instructed to make their assessments according to their own criteria of judgment; not to try to put themselves in the place of an English instructor; not to evaluate the material from any other perspective and set of standards than their own. There were to be no consultations: judgments were to be made independently.

I determined instructors' grades A, B, or C the general equivalent of faculty readers' HF or P, instructors' grades D and E the general equivalent of faculty readers' NP. It could be plausibly argued that, because the D grade indicates a minimal level of competence, it should be designated the equivalent of the proficient rating; my own experience with the grading practices in the Writing Program persuades me that the D grade is used to designate incompetent writing; therefore, I equated it with the non-proficient rating. Also, I recorded the majority reading on each paper; for example, responses HF, P, and NP to a paper graded B are recorded as "agreement." (For raw data see "Appendix III: Individual Evaluations.")
### RESULTS: CALIBRATION ESSAYS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essay #</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Expressed in percentages, these are the calibration essay results:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Essay #</th>
<th>HP</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>NP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Ratings of and comments on the calibration essays suggest a considerable degree of consistency in evaluation criteria and judgments among the 30 faculty readers.

We see in these figures substantial agreement; specifically, in each case a clearly predominant reading, exceeding the next highest percentage by at least 20% and in three cases by more than 50%.

For each paper read, the faculty reader briefly noted on a comment sheet the reasons informing the HP, P, or NP rating. Comments on the two calibration essays for which there is the clearest consensus, essays 1 and 7, describe consensus evaluation criteria. Consensus rating for essay #7 (87% P or HP): clearly stated problem, purpose, thesis; argument supported with evidence; author considers and responds to alternative viewpoints; research adequate to argument in quantity and quality; argument logically developed; introductory paragraph effectively orients the reader to information and issues; sources integrated; competently written; few sentence level errors not distracting.
APPENDIX C

Consensus reading for essay #1 (83% NP): uncertain purpose, overbroad topic, unclear thesis; author ill-informed on subject, ignorant of key concepts, unable to define key terms; research inadequate in quantity and quality; sources not examined critically, not adequately integrated and documented; assertions unsupported with evidence; argument not focused, does not develop logically, is incoherently organized; grammatical and mechanical errors distract from and impede reading of text.

RESULTS: CALIBRATION AND GROUP-SPECIFIC ESSAYS

The figures set forth below do not include those papers which were read by only two faculty readers, if the judgments were divided between HP or P and NP. (A few readers did not read their entire allotment of essays).

Results of readings of group-specific and calibration essays together:

- **Number of essays**: 181
- **Agreement (A, B, or C to "HP" or "P")**: 111 (61%)
- **Agreement (D or E to "NP")**: 18 (10%)
- **TOTAL AGREEMENT**: 129 (71%)
- **Disagreement (A, B, or C to "NP")**: 40 (22%)
- **Disagreement (D or E to "P" or "HP")**: 12 (7%)
- **TOTAL DISAGREEMENT**: 52 (29%)

Analysis of the readers' comments suggests that faculty members made clearly discernible distinctions between papers rated HP, P, and NP—although P papers are seen as having more in common with NP than HP essays. Readers showed substantial agreement in defining the following key evaluation criteria:

- **INFORMATION/IDEAS**: HP papers are well informed (readers gave high priority to quality and quantity of research) and supported with reasons and evidence; contextual information orients readers to subject and argument.

- **P essays**: may lack an adequate information and support base, project an uncertain sense of the problem or its solution. Sources are likely to be limited and dated.
APPENDIX C

NP essays are characterized by ignorance of subject, little or no research, inadequately defined or undefined terms, insufficient support.

SUBJECT MATTER

HP and P papers are addressed to significant and arguable subject matter.

NP essays are likely to be addressed to non-controversial questions.

APPROACH

HP essays take a reasoned yet original approach to the subject. They are balanced, in that alternate views and arguments are considered and responded to.

HP essays take a reasoned yet original approach to the subject. They are balanced, in that alternate views and arguments are considered and responded to.

P papers superficially consider or ignore different positions.

NP arguments lack balance and objectivity; they are based more in emotion and unanalyzed opinions than in reasoned consideration of the subject.

AUDIENCE

HP papers orient readers to the subject and argument by providing contextual information.

In P papers problem and/or major claim often vaguely or confusingly set forth

NP papers even more apt to feature fuzziness of presentation.

ORGANIZATION

HP papers logically, consistently, and thoroughly developed; thesis clearly stated at outset.

HP papers logically, consistently, and thoroughly developed; thesis clearly stated at outset.

P papers unstably developed--unfocused, digressive.

NP essays lack logical order, tend to be repetitious and to stray from the subject.

STYLE

HP papers written in standard English--clearly, efficiently, fluently--with few grammatical and mechanical faults.

HP papers written in standard English--clearly, efficiently, fluently--with few grammatical and mechanical faults.

In P papers language more likely to be inexact, inflated, colloquial, even inflammatory. Sentences may be awkward and wordy.
APPENDIX C

Style of NP papers characterized by non-standard language, or wording that is trite, cliched, imprecise, wrong. Sentences likely to be over-simple, incoherent, disconnected.

GRAMMAR/MECHANICS

In HP papers few grammatical and mechanical faults; carefully presented, with few typographical errors.

Grammar, spelling, punctuation problems considerably more noticeable in P papers; careless proofreading a factor.

In NP essays grammatical and mechanical faults seriously distract and impede readers.

(For detailed survey of readers' comments, see Appendix II: Readers' Comments.)

CONCLUDING COMMENTS

To the extent that readers represent the university faculty across the disciplines, I think we can say that there exists a general agreement as to what constitutes proficient student writing. In fact, evaluation criteria and the weighting of criteria were consistent with those of ENG 101 and 102.

Faculty readers made judgments based on the extent to which writers presented informed, reasoned, substantiated, logically organized, and clearly written arguments in response to significant issues. It should be noted that faculty readers were alert to grammatical and mechanical faults, particularly to the extent that they distracted the reader, and/or in combination with other factors reinforced the impression of careless, indifferent, and hasty presentation. But good writing was not equated with "correct" writing solely. On the contrary, readers valued thoughtful, reasoned writing; they placed a high priority on essays in which the writer was doing the thinking, not merely anthologizing sources or echoing popular and conventional opinions. Furthermore, readers saw little merit in arguments that, however original, were not also well-researched and substantially supported. Bearing in mind that participating readers came from more than twenty disciplines and/or departments, I think this consistency suggests that

(a) Future writing assessment initiatives can be based on the consensus definition of proficient writing that emerged from this exercise.

(b) ENG 101-102 are courses that attempt to teach the reasoning-reading-writing skills valued by UK faculty.
APPENDIX C

(c) UK faculty members have no reason to doubt their capacities to assess and hold students accountable for the quality of their written work, with reference both to content and presentation.

(d) Faculty members across the disciplines should build upon the foundation set in ENG 101-102 in designing writing assignments for their courses.

How proficient as writers, as judged by faculty readers, are those students whose essays were selected randomly from the ENG 102 sections? The faculty rated 13% of the essays HP, 53% P, 34% NP. Only 66% are rated proficient or higher, a troubling figure if one takes into consideration the fact that papers designated proficient tended to have more in common, according to the comments, with the NP than the HP essays.

And if it is true that the faculty readers and Writing Program instructors evaluate written work by essentially the same criteria, it is also true that the composition instructors' evaluations were considerably higher than those of the faculty readers. The ENG 102 instructors graded 84% of the project essays A, B, or C; 16% were graded D or E.
APPENDIX C

Appendix I: Faculty Readers and Group Assignments

#1
Anna Bosch (English)
Jim Holmes (Accountancy)
Joe Wilson (Chemistry)

#2
Lance DeLong (Physics)
Larry Swingle (English)
Jane Wells (Accountancy)

#3
Denny Harris (Biology)
Tom Schrodt (Chemical Engineering)
Steve Weisenburger (English)

#4
Stan Brunn (Geography)
Linda Løvstik (Curriculum & Instruction)
Bob Rabel (Classics)

#5
H. Holcomb (Philosophy)
Betty Lorch (Psychology)
Angene Wilson (Curriculum & Instruction)

#6
Len Baird (Educational Policy)
Joy Pamularo (English, LCC)
Beth Rompf (Social Work)

#7
Jo Anne Gabbard (English, Hopkinsville CC)
Kathy Liptak (Curriculum & Instruction)
Jane Peters (Art History)

#8
Charles Lord (Music)
Donna Quick (Family Studies)
Bruce Walcott (Electrical Engineering)

#9
Rick Butsch (English, Jefferson CC)
Ralph Christensen (Allied Health)
Geri Maschio (Theatre)

#10
Lynn Crabtree (English, Southeast CC)
David Hamilton (History)
Mathew Pelkki (Forestry)
APPENDIX C

APPENDIX II: READERS' COMMENTS

To the greatest extent possible, I categorized the comments according to the readers' vocabulary, thus established the evaluation criteria which are listed at the left margin. Then I made a summary transcription of the comments in each category at each rating level--HP, P, and NP. What follows, then, is my description of the readers' responses. I use slash marks (/) to list words that readers typically employed to express their responses.

### The Highly Proficient (HP) Essay

#### Content

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Significant/Timely/Controversial</td>
<td>Problem/subject clearly stated. Background information, context provided. Thesis or claim clearly stated. Terms defined.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Ideas

| Major claim ingenious/creative/original/interesting. Argument balanced--presents pros and cons; anticipates and addresses opposing views; qualifies thesis as needed. Mentally engaged with subject. |

#### Support

| Argument supported with evidence, reasons. |

#### Knowledge

| Problem well researched. Variety of sources presented. Sources up to date. Sources thoroughly documented. Examples actual rather than hypothetical. Writer's own experience applied. |

#### Organization

| Beginning, middle, and convey appropriate information. Beginning states thesis, provides key information, engages reader's attention. |

| Argument developed logically, consistently; focuses on main issues. Paragraphs functional, well organized. Transitions effective. |
## APPENDIX C

### Style

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Language</th>
<th>Wording concise, precise. Correct, standard written English.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sentences</td>
<td>Fluent, connected. Examples, quotations, summaries effectively integrated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grammar</td>
<td>Few sentence-level errors.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spelling</td>
<td>Correct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punctuation</td>
<td>Correct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finish</td>
<td>Ms. proofread. Very few typographical errors.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### THE PROFICIENT (P) ESSAY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Significant/Timely/Controversial.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information</td>
<td>Problems/subject clearly stated. Background information, context provided. Thesis or claim clearly stated. Terms defined. Argument supported. Problems and/or thesis unclearly, confusingly, or partially stated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ideas</td>
<td>Argument acknowledges alternative views. Quality of thought, approach to subject shallow/superficial/simplistic/unimaginative/opinionated/; unoriginal--anthologizes information from sources; logically inconsistent; over-generalized. Alternative possibilities, counter-arguments ignored or inadequately considered. Argument under-developed, incomplete, unsustainable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Support</td>
<td>Limited or insufficient.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## APPENDIX C

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Knowledge</th>
<th>Under-researched. Limited and/or outdated sources.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BME</td>
<td>Effective or relatively effective introduction and/or conclusion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development</td>
<td>Defective introduction: thesis not stated or incomplete, contextual information incomplete.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unfocused--rambling, digressive, unaware of or inconsiderate of audience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mechanical/inconsistent/repetitious/incoherent.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Transitions weak.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Style</td>
<td>Concise, exact wording.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Efficient/Fluent/Careful.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sentences</td>
<td>Concise, exact wording.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Imprecise/Inflated/Colloquial/Unidiomatic/Sexist/Inflammatory.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spelling</td>
<td>Incorrect spelling frequently noted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punctuation</td>
<td>Frequently noted, esp. comma, apostrophe faults.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finish</td>
<td>Typographical errors, careless proofreading or failure to proofread frequently noted.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Non-Proficient (NP) Essay

Content

Subject

Significant/Timely/Controversial.
Non-controversial/Non-arguable.

Information

Problem and/or solution (thesis) inadequately defined or not defined. Argument seen as vague/confusing/incoherent.

Ideas

Approach to subject simplistic/naive/uninformed/superficial.
Lack of original thinking. Tendency to parrot popular views, rely on unfounded, unexamined assumptions.
Treatment of subject lacks thoroughness. Problem not thought through. Argument not sustained. Counter-arguments not considered.
Quality of thinking labelled silly/ludicrous/ juvenile/immature/senseless.

Support

Claims unsubstantiated. Evidence, factual data lacking. Mistakes narrative for support, confuses telling story or relating incident with providing evidence or reasons.
APPENDIX C

Knowledge  Inadequate research. Sources limited, lack variety (all from encyclopedia or popular magazines), outdated. Documentation incomplete/improperly handled.

Writer ignorant of subject. Uncertain of meanings of key terms.

Essay seen as hastily/carelessly prepared.

Organization

BME  Problem not stated at outset. Confusing introduction.

Solution to problem introduced too late/final paragraph or sentence.


Paragraphs unfocused/nonfunctional.

 Transitions ineffective/lacking.

Style

Language  Non-standard/colloquial/slang/trite/clichéd.

Word choice imprecise/wrong.

Sentences  Over-simple/confusing/meaningless/mangled/senseless.

Disconnected.

Grammar/Mechanics

Grammar  Distracting errors impede reading.

Spelling  Excessive/severe spelling errors of rudimentary and other words.

Punctuation  Severe, pervasive errors.

Finish  Inadequate proofreading.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Security</th>
<th>Course Grade</th>
<th>Paper Grade</th>
<th>Highly Proficient</th>
<th>Proficient</th>
<th>Non-Proficient</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>000-10-4711</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>000-10-5047</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>000-10-68246</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>000-10-6460</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>000-10-6619</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>003-58-6020</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>042-83-7345</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>2/3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>101-66-5499</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>104-60-8732</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2/3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>170-58-6635</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>192-66-3556</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>194-52-6774</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>196-54-6228</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>213-68-1927</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>213-83-5228</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>215-06-6768</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>221-56-9117</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>222-54-1910</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>225-31-2900</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>228-39-6211</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>234-04-7541</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Security</td>
<td>Course Grade</td>
<td>Paper Grade</td>
<td>Highly Proficient</td>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Non-Proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>236-25-8125</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>247-31-6299</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>256-55-0224</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>259-43-1190</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>260-31-6935</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>270-66-3580</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>274-90-5426</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>275-88-0276</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>276-74-6939</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>277-86-7466</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>278-86-5402</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>279-94-1142</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>280-88-1503</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>286-78-4130</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>287-70-7504</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>287-76-9097</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>290-88-3253</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>297-64-1439</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>298-86-4086</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>299-68-6265</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>299-72-0437</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Security</td>
<td>Course Grade</td>
<td>Paper Grade</td>
<td>Highly Proficient</td>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Non-Proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>311-74-3504</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>313-84-6529</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>314-74-2476</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>321-72-2514</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>326-82-1641</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>330-80-0450</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>335-78-0443</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>359-74-4826</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>360-70-3291</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>372-72-8385</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>389-78-2248</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-02-9394</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-04-3310</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-04-3705</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-04-5063</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-06-3932</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-08-5948</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-11-3498</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-19-6903</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-25-5787</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-27-4352</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Security</td>
<td>Course Grade</td>
<td>Paper Grade</td>
<td>Highly Proficient</td>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Non-Proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-27-5105</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-31-5428</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-33-1777</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-33-4318</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-33-5542</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-33-5776</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-35-6623</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-62-0017</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-96-2312</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-96-5873</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400-98-0160</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-04-0043</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-11-6354</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-15-7231</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-27-3713</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-27-7020</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-29-4256</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-31-4387</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-35-0248</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-35-0766</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-96-7774</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Security</td>
<td>Course Grade</td>
<td>Paper Grade</td>
<td>Highly Proficient</td>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Non-Proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>401-96-9198</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-06-9400</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-11-6099</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-13-0881</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-17-1627</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-25-6669</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-31-1701</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-33-5631</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-35-1591</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-92-7481</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>402-98-7798</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-02-6358</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-11-5848</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-17-1992</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-17-4461</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-23-5070</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-23-6420</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-27-6534</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-29-2128</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-31-4055</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-33-1240</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student ID</td>
<td>Course Grade</td>
<td>Paper Grade</td>
<td>Proficiency</td>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Non-Proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-33-1379</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-33-3492</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-33-5215</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>403-33-8674</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-04-9137</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-08-5866</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-13-7180</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-15-0769</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-15-4398</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-23-1602</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-25-4645</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-27-2412</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-27-3533</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-27-8587</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-31-5689</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-31-8140</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-33-1936</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-33-4311</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-33-8381</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-96-0311</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>404-98-0848</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Security</td>
<td>Course Grade</td>
<td>Paper Grade</td>
<td>Highly Proficient</td>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Non-Proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-04-5704</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-06-7057</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-06-8520</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-08-4399</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-17-6271</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-25-1747</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-25-8062</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-33-3691</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-35-2048</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-98-1455</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>405-98-3506</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-06-6136</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-11-4959</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-11-6629</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-13-2395</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-17-0614</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-19-8064</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-23-3976</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-27-7008</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-27-9919</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-31-1143</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student ID</td>
<td>Course Grade</td>
<td>Paper Grade</td>
<td>Proficiency Level</td>
<td>Proficiency</td>
<td>Non-Profit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-31-8355</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-33-0984</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-39-8498</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-92-0065</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-96-0350</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>406-98-8156</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-02-0102</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-02-1283</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-02-7649</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-13-1298</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-15-1282</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-19-5913</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-23-2076</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-23-2955</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-23-3387</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-25-6740</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-29-0377</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-29-6689</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-29-9016</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-31-8351</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-31-9510</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Security</td>
<td>Course Grade</td>
<td>Paper Grade</td>
<td>Highly Proficient</td>
<td>Proficient</td>
<td>Non-Proficient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-33-4054</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-43-0750</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-43-2360</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-96-7784</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>407-98-7137</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>411-06-9400</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>429-67-9405</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>431-25-6063</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>433-53-5552</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>456-15-9388</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>480-96-9567</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>491-96-2598</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>493-86-4415</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>E</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>502-98-5809</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>504-80-9555</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>507-17-0790</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>513-76-2300</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>544-90-2463</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>556-23-8667</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>576-39-8004</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
March 23, 1995

Dear Student:

I am writing to ask for your help. I'd like your permission to use your final 102 essay in a writing assessment workshop on May 12. I will be selecting at random 2 or 3 essays from each section of 102 and asking a group of JCC faculty to comment on them. Please sign and date the attached permission slip, and attach it to a photocopy of your essay when you submit your essay to your teacher. On the photocopy, write your social security number instead of your name, and remove your teacher's name. Doing so will ensure anonymity during the workshop. Your social security number will allow me to contact you, if necessary, later.

If you find the cost of photocopying your essay a financial burden, let me know. I'm sure we can work something out. You can reach me or my voice-mail at extension 2239. Thank you for your cooperation.

Sincerely,

Rick Butsch,
English Program Coordinator

UK
JCC is an equal opportunity institution
APPENDIX D

Humanities Division
English Department

Jefferson Community College
109 East Broadway
Louisville, KY 40208
(502) 584-0081, 2127

JEFFERSON COMMUNITY COLLEGE

Permission Statement

Mr. Butsch,

You have my permission to use my work if it is selected.

______________________________________________
Student's signature

______________________________________________
Date

______________________________________________
For Teacher's Use Only

paper grade _______ course grade _______
APPENDIX E

FOCUSED FREEWRITING
APPENDIX E

Well-organized content
Grammatically correct
Coherent expression of ideas
Creative, original
Sound reasoning
Valid conclusions when evaluating research
Persuasive
Properly referenced
Interesting

I'm more likely to write in sentence and paragraphs when using a word processor than when using a pen and paper.
Having known ahead of time that I would be asked to write about "writing proficiency," I had formulated a simple thought: A proficient writer is able to convey his meaning in any format and is able to write specific to the situation. A physical therapist has much note writing to perform—daily reports on patients, evaluations, letters to doctors, lawyers, and insurance companies. We have to be concise, brief, yet make a point. Daily notes are usually phrases, incomplete sentences, a lot of abbreviations—letters have to be grammatically correct, spelled right, and diplomatic. My greatest concern

A personal grief is when noun/verb agreement does not exist. This destroys an entire reading experience, for me, and I, either consciously or subconsciously, dismiss the writer as not being proficient, to say the least, or as an idiot to say the most. Proficient writing occurs as a result of much work, dedication, and desire to "get it right." Now I have run out of ideas.

Minutes have flown by. The most proficient writers I personally have read in my career were raised on him and
APPENDIX E

Writing proficiency is context-specific. It refers to a writer’s ability to produce a text that will accomplish a particular goal. In other words, writing proficiency as it relates to composing a poem may differ from writing proficiency as it relates to composing an annual report. What works in each text differs. At the same time, however, there are, I believe, some “global” aspects of writing proficiency, that though primarily related to mechanics, for example, both a poem and an annual report would be properly written if the chosen penmanship did not have control of grammar and punctuation rules. In that sense, one might say writing proficiency is the ability to compose a text that meets both global and context-specific requirements. Furthermore, although mechanics & grammar skills are global proficiency—applicable to all writing contexts—a writer context may not require that these skills be used to achieve writing proficiency. For example, a finale writing a personal letter to another friend may “know” grammar & punctuation, but may not feel that the letter writing context demands following grammar & punct rules that closely. (Although I’m getting off
If, in the opinion of the company, the contract of employment is dissolved, the employee shall be entitled to compensation for all losses sustained.

APPENDIX E
APPENDIX E

Writing Proficiency

Writing proficiency includes appropriate style, format, content, and grammatical correctness. Written communication is desired as necessary for numerous purposes and a variety of audiences. Therefore, writing style and format are dependent upon the purpose and the audience.

The content of effective writing is clear, organized, accurate, logical, and courteous. The message is supported by relevant information which informs, persuades, or influences the reader to some type of action or opinion.

Credibility of the written communication is maintained when correct grammar, spelling, punctuation, etc. are present.
APPENDIX

...
Writing proficiency is the ability to achieve one's purpose(s) as a writer. Purpose's change from one text to another, from one occasion to another, from one writer to another, from one task to another. Writing proficiency is directly related to author and audience. Both components are always there, although the balance between the two may change. Also, the author is always at least one member of the audience. As such, the author, if she is proficient, will be satisfied that higher goals have been achieved. For the author, goals may include process and product, and the balance between the two may vary. For example, if I'm writing to release energy or emotions, the product of my efforts is much less important than the process. If I'm writing to discover what I'm thinking, the product is important, but my mechanical proficiency is not as important as how and what I have written. However, if my purpose involves producing a text that satisfies an external reader, the balance between process and product may change. Here, also the balance depends on the purposes/needs of the audience. On the other hand, a teacher who wants evidence that I am using writing to discover what I'm thinking; or it may be a grant, however who needs specific information in a specific style. In the first instance, process is paramount; in the second, product is paramount.
APPENDIX E

VI. Proficiency

Writing proficiency encompasses writing effectively and efficiently in different contexts for different audiences and with different writing styles in mind. For academic writing, one would use different criteria from writing for an informal magazine or for writing casually to a friend or a letter.

From the academic perspective, I would surmise that certain academic skills would encompass proficiency in writing. In a writing course, I would recognize student writing that includes clear, focused ideas, content, paragraphing, sentences that interlace with the flow of ideas. In other courses on campus, I assume that these same criteria—clear focused content, few errors, and essential points—remain essential else. In other words, not only do errors count, but the content, structure, and development of ideas (repetition)

From an informal perspective, I would conjecture that focus and clarity of content, clear ideas & errors are needed, but certain ideas seem more essential others. Informal writing usually

if a friend writes level letters, I

339
not understand, so I might need to write to ask for clarification. Because
the rows may not be important in that
context or milieu, I might even look
for possible why a first comes to
regulations. I may, or shall it mentally
suffice, it appear a casual setting, all
clergy except that, as I now said, I
might write to ask a first to clergyperson
that finds a couple needs to
work and care, to couple very little.
As I repeat I suppose
that in most contexts, clear and
distinct ideas, structure, and planning are
essential, regardless of what
work. I suppose some people with such
work to consider the environment
counter in reference.
APPENDIX E

TO TALK ABOUT WRITING PROFICIENCY, AS A WRITING INSTRUCTOR, I TALK ABOUT STUDENT EXPECTATIONS vs. THE REALITY. THE EXPECTATION IS "GREAT." CAN THE only students perceive that they are competent writers to begin
with, and by their existence, force us to VIRUS A COURSE, TRANSFER WRITING COURSE. CAN THE OTHER INSTRUCTOR'S THOSE FEW WHO EXCEL ARE RECOGNIZED AS "EXCELLENT." ASIDE FROM
WAY, AND THE REST, LIKE THE REST, VIRTUALLY UNACKNOWLEDGED AND UNTOUCHABLE, BY WRITING INSTRUCTION, BOTH ARE TRUE

AS I GAIN MORE EXPOSURE TO THE PROCESS OF WRITING INSTRUCTION, I AM
AMAZED AT BOTH THE SIMILARITY OF EVEN THE MOST PROFICIENT AND RECENTLY
WRITING STUDENT. AT THE SAME TIME, THE TRANSFER CURRICULUMS CAN BE RECOGNIZED
AS THE WRITING WORK IN A CAREER
OF LANGUAGE APPRECIATION, SKILL
BUILDING, AND WRITING PROFICIENCY. FOR
THAT, THE ROAD AND REASONS COMMUNE.
WRITER, PROFICIENCY IS A CALCULUS — RAISING THE GOALS OF APPRECIATION, SECULAR
AND ULTIMATELY PROFICIENCY, CAUSE AND C

341
CLOSED FOR VIRTUALLY EVERYONE.
APPENDIX E

Writing Proficiency

Down interesting, engaging. Don't care the topic is dorothy gigeen or just as long as their thought needs to look (in old skool graderic session) for "true sound truth" you want writing, writing that shines the means of grace, writing full of energy, harmonized, say, intelligent & humour. God fear is being. So in effort & carefulness of course, all writing should be evidently correct (as opposed to trained thinking correct), graciously referring to the hundred or two? historical linguistics which proceed today American language. People who lack serious grammar rules should be punished as criminals. Really. Think about it. Fine language structure in intelligent behavior. If we controlled - no if we emphasized their excellent language, then we wouldn't even begin to want to externalize the value created in us. All the world is sound & structure.
APPENDIX E

Vigiling the deep neurolinguistic laws permits all sorts of bizarre and dangerous behavior. If they don’t have an idea, can’t think with any creative intelligence, then don’t let them hang out in the truth. Lock ’em up for security. Breaking subject-verb agreement laws? Ten years sentence in the sentence ward. Incomplete people, not useful until they become whole. Go to Wholeness Therapy. And for specifying sentence up commas? Spend several years in the coordination ward. People who keep language laws keep harmony.
APPENDIX E

Writing proficiency is the ability to get across ideas or facts in a way that is clear and easily readable. I find myself reacting somewhat emotionally to an assignment, wondering if I am out of tune in some way. All too often, in my opinion, students will respond on papers or essays in just the way the directions say — with phrases, incomplete sentences, and no concern of grammatical correctness. This is not writing proficiency in my opinion.

If sentences are not complete, if the material does not read easily, then the main thrust of the paper or essay is lost. The reader should not have to "play" along, trying to read between the lines to see what the author is saying. Writing itself is the vehicle by which ideas are transmitted. The mechanics of writing should be so smooth and problem-free that the vehicle does not become more visible than the ideas or facts it is trying to impart.

As instructors we can teach our students how to focus on pulling out the material they need. We cannot in our classes help them build the vehicle by which to do this.
APPENDIX E

For me the concept of "good writing" most importantly entails the use of facts, data, and research to a clear and concise manner. My experiences as a student most often lack data or the general conceptual framework that is needed to study its clear, after a problem. What writing proficiency does not do is a randomly string of personal opinions being together by chance's connivances and formal strategies.

Reap for the facts and for the summary accepted rules of English grammar is at the heart of my concept of "good writing." Good student writing often seems the product of a good deal of research, an attempt to view different sides of a question and the ability to state clearly the core of a problem.
I always encourage students to read their papers aloud to themselves as a way to help them correct mistakes. This seems to help all but the regionally habitual students. Students must know that writing is a way to communicate and if the paper cannot be understood, it might as well not have been written.
CURRICULUM VITA

NAME: Richard Anthony Butsch

ADDRESS: Department of English
109 East Broadway
Jefferson Community College
Louisville, KY 40202

DOB: Louisville, Kentucky – November 3, 1956

EDUCATION & TRAINING:
B.A., English with Honors
University of Louisville
1975-1979

M.A., English
University of Louisville
1982-1984

Graduate Teaching Assistant
University of Louisville
1983-1987

Assistant Director of Composition
University of Louisville
1987

English Program Coordinator
Jefferson Community College
1993-1999

Ph.D., Rhetoric and Composition
University of Louisville
2005

AWARDS:
Metroversity Instructional Development Award
1996
PROFESSIONAL SOCIETIES:  NCTE
                          KADE
                          AFT

BOOKS:  Fields of Vision with Pamela Butsch